

THE ROLE OF RELIGIOUS DORMITORIES AND HOUSES IN ADULT
EDUCATION: A CASE STUDY

SABRİ ERGÜL

BOĞAZIÇI UNIVERSITY

2015

THE ROLE OF RELIGIOUS DORMITORIES AND HOUSES IN ADULT
EDUCATION: A CASE STUDY

Thesis submitted to the
Institute for Graduate Studies in Social Sciences
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts
in Educational Sciences

by
Sabri Ergül

Boğaziçi University

2015

Thesis Abstract
Sabri Ergül, “The Role of Religious Dormitories and Houses in Adult Education:
A Case Study ”

Many students in Turkey have been staying in religious dormitories in order to carry on with their own education. Our education system puts the knowledge needed for the Secondary Schools Selection and Placement Exam (TEOG), Student Selection Exam for University (YGS-LYS), Public Personnel Selection Exam (KPSS) in the storage of the brain but characterizing the education system to cultivate personal quality in education is not important because our education system produces only workers for capitalists. Therefore, moral reasoning capabilities, emotional qualities and empathy are not learnt in state schools. These needs have been fulfilled by Fethullah Gülen’s dormitories and houses in our country.

Tez Özeti

Dini Yurtların ve Evlerin Yetişkin Eğitimindeki Rolü: Durum Çalışması

Gülen Cemaati Türkiye’de İslami kimliğin üretilmesinde ve bu kimliklerin kamusal alana taşınmasında 70’li yıllardan başlayarak çaba gösteren Türkiye’nin en büyük cemaati. Bir çok şirketi, fabrikaları, esnaf ağları, yayın kuruluşları (TV, gazete vb.), yardım kurumları, dünyaya yayılan özel okulları ve Türkiye’deki eğitim amaçlı dershaneleri, evleri ve yurtları ile büyük bir güç. Asıl gücünü ise eğitim alanındaki faaliyetlerden almaktadır. Eğitim amacı ile kitleleri mobilize ederken, geçliği de dönüştürmektedir. Bu tezde cemaatin yurtlarında ve evlerinde kalan gençlerin günlük pratiklerini ve öznel anlatılarını dinleyerek gençlere uygulanan gizli ve açık müfredatı anlamak; sonrasında bu müfredatların hangi siyasal veya sosyal kimliklere hizmet ettiği anlaşılmaya çalışılıyor. Gençler özne olarak buralarda üretilen kimliklerin hangilerini benimserken hangi noktalarda ayrışıyor? Ortadoğu’da dini kimliğin siyasal ve sosyal alandaki muazzam gücü düşünüldüğünde İslam’ın ezilenler için Kurtuluş Teolojisi’ne dönüşmesinde Gülen Cemaati hangi alanlarda etkiye sahip, bunlar gençlerin öznel deneyimleri üzerinden açıklanıyor.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to my thesis supervisor Assoc. Prof. Fatma Nevra Seggie for her endless support in the preparation of this study. I am thankful to Prof. Fatma Gök, Assoc. Prof. Yüksel Taşkın and Assist. Prof. Alper Şahin for participating in my thesis committee. I am deeply grateful to Assist. Prof. Erol Köroğlu and Dilek Çankaya for their motivation. I am thankful to my friends İlker Arslan, Haydar Darıcı, Sezen Bayhan, Zeynep Arıkan and İnci Katırcı for their endless support.

CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	1
Background.....	1
Statement.....	1
Significance.....	2
Research Questions.....	3
Purpose.....	3
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	5
What is Religion.....	5
What is Religious Community?	7
The History of Gülen Community.....	8
Fethullah Gülen and Education.....	15
The Secular History of Turkey.....	19
Middle East and Islam.....	25
Social State in Turkey.....	28
Identity.....	31
Subjectivity.....	34
The Curriculum.....	37
The Curriculum Theory (The Social Reconstruction Ideology).....	42
Hidden Curriculum.....	48
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY.....	50
Research Design.....	50
Research Setting.....	50
Research Participants.....	51
Data Collection	52
Data Analysis.....	52
A Brief History of the Researcher.....	54
CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS	56
Identity in the Gülen Community.....	75
Curriculum in the Gülen Community.....	76
Hidden Curriculum in the Gülen Community.....	77
Patriarchy in the Gülen Community.....	78
Subjectivity in the Gülen Community.....	80
Capitalism in the Gülen Community.....	82
Teachers in the Gülen Community.....	83
Symbols in the Gülen Community.....	84

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION.....	87
Success of the Gülen Community.....	87
Subjectivity.....	91
Authoritarian Social Order.....	91
Patriarchal Sexual Identity.....	92
Curriculum and the Hidden Curriculum.....	93
Capitalism.....	95
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	98

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Background

After the military regime of 1980, religious houses and dormitories have been spreading. Many students in Turkey have been staying in religious dormitories in order to carry on with their own education in the last 34 years. This youth are an important part of the employees at all the major institutions of the state. Gülen's homes and dormitories have had a significant effect on the socialization and identity of youth in Turkey. At these dormitories, understanding Islam is the most important aim.

Statement

Fethullah Gülen established his religious community in 1970. People who grew up with the culture of the Fethullah Gülen community always want to control others and acquire things; if they lose the things they have, they lose connection with the world. As a result, they criticize the life as they control it. Freire (2006) says these people submit to powerful people or identity groups. When they symbolically join other people, they get into a mental illusion that they are active. In reality, they obey the active people and behave like a part of the group. This situation terminates the creativity of people. Şerif Mardin (1990) said that case is a controlled philosophy which formalizes itself as social engineering.

Significance

The Gülen community, which has many private training centers, private schools, dormitories and homes for students have an importance in the education system in Turkey. Many companies, tradesmen, televisions and newspapers support these educational institutions economically. For this reason, it is important to understand the Gülen community as having an assertion of creating a new generation. The students at the religious dormitories do not have the right to determine the curriculum of the religious education. Many poor students at these dormitories cannot criticize this education due to the apprehension of losing the right to accommodation in the house and nourishment. The curriculum at these dormitories or religious houses does not include the relationship between religion and the problems of the modern worlds such as unemployment, capitalism and environmental problems. There was a true regime deal discussed by Michael Foucault (2007); for this reason, students can learn only one interpretation of Islam. When they felt the need to abandon one interpretation, they have been accused of blasphemy. While many violent, terroristic and antidemocratic cases have been occurring in the country and the whole world, they have not developed any new and modern interpretations on these issues. We want to have democratic and student-centered education in which students at the dormitories can determine the curriculum of the religious houses and dormitories.

Research Questions

My research questions are “How has the curriculum been applied at Fethullah houses and dormitories, and which identities has this curriculum produced?” How do the students living in these dormitories socialize, and produce their identities and subjectivities? How was the experience of students at home and dormitories?”

The curriculum in Gülen’s houses and dormitories has been creating a discourse. This discourse determines how we think about sexuality, gender and social issues. As a result, sexuality and body are disciplined and normalized by this discourse. While the ruler ship produces the notion of normality, abnormality is connected to the mechanism of discipline. Creating the self means liberation that can only be possible if that person knows himself. We can learn about the world by learning the language. But at these points, we need to know how to create the self.

Purpose

For a long time, Religious education played an important role in establishing in the construction of identity and morality of society. In recent years, educational institutions of religious communities all over the world began to take his old job back. Turkey's largest religious community, The Gülen movement plays an important role in the education of youth by their houses, dormitories and schools. Therefore, my aim is to understand the identities of the students living in Fethullah House and Dormitories and to analyze how Fethullah community establishes these identities.

In most parts of the world, culture cannot take religion's place. Moreover, at certain places where culture is replaced with religion, religion comes back (Eagleton, 2003). According to Terry Eagleton, the idea of God is the fastest solution to the problems. People get the power of resisting against change from the religion (Öner, 1984).

According to Murat Belge (1984), leftist parties and policies suggest they are the pioneers and the society is at the bottom level. Therefore, after the military coup of 1960 in Turkey, right wing parties that came to power permitted religious orders. Religion does not compete with liberalism or the secular state, but religion contests with socialism because religion is intended for crowds. Turkish socialists and Kemalists think that monster Muslims are fogies. Hence, they do not need to find any political or sociological explanation. These words such as monster or foggy transfer the worldly to metaphysical areas.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

What is Religion?

In most parts of the world, culture cannot take religion's place. Furthermore, at certain places where culture is replaced with religion, religion comes back. (Terry Eagleton)

The Gülen community is the most important religious movement in Turkey. Before discussing the movement, then, we need to know what religion is and the meanings associated with it. In this regard, how sociologist and ideologists interpret religion comes into question. When Marx said that religion is the opium of the people, he was affirming the importance of it. Religion, like opium, takes away the pain of people when they feel helpless and hopeless. The source of all religions and the times of prophethood are equitable, egalitarian and honest. Women, slaves and the oppressed have always been the first to obey religion. From religion, people derive power to resist change (Öner, 1984).

Liberation theologian Lövy (1996) believes that the enemies of religion are not atheists but the dominant classes and the rich. Many social scientists think that religion and science are two opposite poles due to positivist justice (Aktaş, 2010). Progressive social scientists think that religion dates back to the era before modern times. However, religion is important for people. According to Karl Marx, religion was not only about the expression of real pain but also protesting against real pain. Engels stated that religion was a cultural form that had been changing through historical transformation. In fact, religion is not always dogmatic. For example,

although Protestants in England were struggling against the Stuart dynasty in the seventeenth century, materialist Thomas Hobbes advocated absolute monarchy. Antony Gramsci, argued that religion was the biggest Utopia that was reconciling the real contradictions of life (Aktaş, 2010)

Ernst Bloch (2011), who was a religious and socialist thinker, asserted that religion had a revolutionist side to it but the ruling classes were abusing religion as a drug for their own interests. In South America, Christian socialist ideas have prevailed as liberation theology. Ernest Bloch mentioned that religion anticipates the future, which means we find ideals materialized in the future by religion. Many Marxist leaders such as Lenin, Trotsky and Rosa Luxemburg supported atheism against religion (Lövy, 1996). Therefore, many leftist and socialist parties in Turkey and Middle Eastern countries accepted atheism as their ideology.

Mahmud M. Taha, who was an Islamic socialist thinker, was executed by the Sudanese government due to his ideas in 1985. He said jihad, private ownership, slavery and inequality between women and men were not the foundation of Islam. Hasan Hanafi, who is a theologian in Egypt, asserted that if we rescue religion from the influence of the ruling class, we base religion on anthropology instead of theology (Önder, 2010). According to Jung, social institutions, religion and mythology have been tools throughout centuries for understanding life.

Islam emerged against inequality and injustice in Mecca. Basic functions of Islam were charity and protection of the poor. Muslims prostrating to purge themselves of arrogance and conceit spread in Mecca (Tekin, 2010). People did not eat in Ramadan to remind themselves of the poverty of others. However, this religion was different from the one of the oil-rich men throwing stones at women. According

to Terry Eagleton (2000), the idea of God is the fastest solution to the problems because we need not think deeply.

What is Religious Community?

According to Max Weber (Özdalga, 2013), mutual benefit and the benefit of instinct have been creating solidarity among people. Emotional and conservative dependence has produced joint action in the community. Associated emotion and associated responsibility have produced associated ideals. Capitalism has produced dead space, which means space with no value. Capitalism has cut off people's ties with rural areas, and then the people in metropolis and industrial areas have been isolated. As a result, communities have been gathering these isolated people under a social umbrella and then giving new identities to these people. When social changes occur, the disrupted egos of people can be protected by producing new identities in religious communities.

These religious communities could be called organizations. According to Amitai Eitzoni (1964), organizations have been using three tools for control, such as material control: Material reward consists of goods and services. The granting of money, which allows one to acquire goods and services, is classified as material because the effect on the recipient is similar to that of material means. The use of material means for the purposes of control constitutes utilitarian power. Symbolic control: these include normative symbols, those of prestige and esteem and social symbols, those of love and acceptance. The use of symbols for the purposes of control is referred to as normative, normative – social or social – power.

Religious communities have been using selection before allowing people to participate in the community. Amitai Etzioni (1964) said selection is based on the qualities of participants as they enter the organization; organizational socialization subsequently adapts these qualities to make them similar to those required for satisfactory performance of organizational roles. In short, the more effective the organization is, the less is the need for control. Socialization itself is affected by the means of control used, since some kinds of control more than others create a relationship between higher and lower ranks that is conducive to effective socialization. Organizations, which rely heavily on normative power, are the most successful in terms of their socialization achievements. Socialization and selection can partially substitute for each other, i.e., high selectivity and a high level of organizational socialization can maintain the same level of control. Thus, the amount of control needed is lower when selectivity and socialization are both high.

The History of the Gülen Community

Nakşibendilik, which was a religious sect in the Ottoman Empire in the last periods of the Empire rose as a rebellious movement against the 2nd Constitutional Monarchy (2. Meşrutiyet) in 1909, supported by the Committee of Union and Progress (İttihat ve Terakki Cemiyeti), which was a pro-Western and nationalist party in the Ottoman Empire. The Nakşibendi religious order argued that Islamic law was destroyed by the Committee of Union and Progress (İttihat Terakki Cemiyeti) and Abdülhamid, the Sultan of the Ottoman Empire. The Nakşibendi community supported absolute monarchy against constitutional monarchy. However, Said Nursi, who was a follower of the Nakşibendi community, supported the Committee of

Union and Progress (İttihat ve Terakki Cemiyeti) and constitutional monarchy (Nursi, 1995). Said Nursi defended ideas against absolute monarchy in order to support the 2nd Constitutional Monarchy. Moreover, after World War I, Said Nursi participated in the Turkish War of Independence; but Mustafa Kemal, the leader of Turkish War of Independence, excluded Said Nursi from the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (Hür, 2010). Furthermore, all Islamic groups and communist groups were isolated from politics in the period 1923 -1950 (Zührer, 210). Said Nursi was arrested and exiled until his death but he generated many ideas and wrote many books entitled *Risale* (Hür, 2010).

Şeyh Sait revolted against the Turkish Republic in order to build an Islamic Kurdish State in 1925. Said Nursi never supported the rebellions against the state on the grounds that the state was sacred even though it acted in a barbarian way against Muslims and that this state was better than a non-Muslim one. He thought that if Greece and the imperialist states successfully invaded Turkey, people would not be able to go to mosques freely and the mosques could be closed. For these reasons, Islamic thinkers believed that Islam could not exist without the state. As a result, state has been a significant power to protect Muslims (İnsel, 2010). During the last two hundred years, Westernized politics encountered the resistance of Islamic groups and most of the time Westernized groups won these struggles. In 1925, the assassination attempt against Mustafa Kemal, the founder of modern Turkey, failed. In 1930, a young military officer was beheaded by people who were shouting that they wanted a religious law. As can be seen, struggles between secularists and Islamic groups resulted in bloodshed. But Said Nursi chose to struggle without resorting to violence. Additionally, students of Said Nursi who refrained from using violence against the state constituted the wider religious orders in Turkey. According

to Said Nursi, a rebellion started by some Muslims, whom he would call butchers, could cause many innocent Muslims to suffer (Çalışlar, 2006).

Since the instructors of the medrese and the imams of mosques in the Ottoman Empire resisted against many changes in science, the most important contribution of Said Nursi on Islamic groups was the acceptance of science (Badıllı, 1990). Said Nursi tried to interpret religion in a rational and logical way. He tried to become a political figure in the young Republic but he was exiled by the regime. In fact, Said Nursi acknowledges the importance of the republican regime. Moreover, he followed the new ideas of Western societies such as socialism, liberalism and others. However, after 1926 Said Nursi said that they had to stay away from politics and recover adherence to Islam. For this reason, the followers of Said Nursi tried to stay away from politics or engage in politics only indirectly (Çalışlar, 2006). But followers of Said Nursi supported the Democrat Party and the Justice Party (right-wing parties) indirectly and participated in anti-communist struggles (Çalışlar, 2006).

Fethullah Gülen was a student in the community of Said Nursi, who was an Islamic leader as a follower of Kadirilik, the religious order of fundamentalist Sunni Islam (Hür, 2010). Fethullah Gülen came across the ideas of Said Nursi in 1957 when he was an imam in a mosque. After 1970, Fethullah Gülen came into contact with many educational associations such as private schools, private classrooms, private dormitories and houses accommodating poor students, and these associations and groups later gained the economic support of the Gülen community (Çalışlar, 1997). Fethullah Gülen was an imam in Erzurum and made anti-communist propaganda in the mosque. After one of the talks of Fethullah Gülen in the mosque, a significant number of people destroyed a cinema in order to protest that a communist woman,

Hadi Ün, played Hz. Ayşe, who was a sahabe, which means person who believes in Islam, in the prophet of Islam and who saw its prophet by person (Çalışlar, 1997).

Fethullah Gülen departed from the religious community of Said Nursi after founding his own religious community (Çalışlar, 2006). Furthermore, even though the other religious followers of Said Nursi supported the right-center Justice Party, Fethullah Gülen supported the Islamist party, MSP, but he did not support any party explicitly (Çalışlar, Çelik, 2006). The military regime closed all the political parties in 1980. A significant number of people were killed and imprisoned, but the military regime needed the support in the referendum affirming the fundamental law of the military regime. For this reason, in order to gain the support of religious communities, the military regime considered compulsory religious courses as essential. As a result, many religious communities and Fethullah Gülen supported the fundamental law of the military regime (Çalışlar, 2006). After the military regime, the Motherland Party, which constituted the government in Turkey then, supported religious communities and opened many vocational religious high schools from which adjudicators, governors and many different government officers graduated between 1983-1990. After this time, the religious community of Fethullah Gülen was in good terms with all governments except for the Islamist Prosperity Party. Moreover, some secular parties of Turkey were interested in the regime-friendly ideas of Fethullah Gülen because many secular writers and politicians believed that the religious community of Fethullah Gülen was more liberal and moderate than other religious orders. Fethullah Gülen said “I am not interested in politics and I think of only God” in an interview conducted in 1994. A previous Minister of Education, Vehbi Dinçerler, declared that they supported and encouraged the schools of Fethullah Gülen in foreign countries. After 1980, a number of prime

ministers wrote letters of recommendation to ministers of foreign countries about these schools. In the period 1987-1993, the president of Turkey, Turgut Özal, said that he could be a guarantor for these schools (Çalışlar, 2006). The schools of this religious community provide secular education in foreign countries. Furthermore, the photographs of the founding leader of Turkey, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, are hung on the walls of these schools. Moreover, the students of these schools memorize the national anthem and many Turkish songs.

According to the interviews conducted with a number of families in foreign countries, students in the religious schools of Fethullah Gülen become honest and cultivated individuals and they avoid smoking or alcohol. Also, the children of some governors of these countries received education in these schools. The aim of education in the dormitories and houses in Turkey is to produce intellectuals integrating science with the religion of Islam (Erkin, 2010).

Ahmet Insel (1997) says that we can not criticize the community of Fethullah Gülen for founding a religious order or cult because these forms are social conformations between the state and the people. The people who participate in religious orders have the same basic rights as the people who participate in labour unions or any other association. People want to live with people like themselves. Additionally, people in these religious orders share similar notions of morality.

Ahmet Insel (1997) also mentions that the religious community of Fethullah Gülen is producing qualified staff for its movement, which is an important goal. After undergoing the education process in the Fethullah Gülen community, the lives of students have to be controlled and disciplined. According to Fethullah Gülen (2006), the discipline of the army, the politeness of dervish, and the science of medrese were being combined in his educational camps between 1970 -1980

(Doğan, 2006). Ahmet İnel states that the success of these schools does not result from the education of poor students, but instead, only the clever and capable students are preferred in these schools. Because not every poor student was accepted to these schools, they had to demonstrate in ability tests that they were clever enough. Ahmet İnel (1990) believes that using information is more important than producing information in the schools of Fethullah. Knowledge that confers power is important; but philosophy, art, history or literature are not considered to be important because they do not endow you with power. Knowledge of politics and law are more important than other kinds of knowledge.

In order to merge the religious lifestyle with a laic corporatist environment, Gülen chose the form where scientific instruction was given in the classroom and religious lifestyle was taught in the dormitories. Those who study in his schools are mostly boarding students. Students socialize mostly there. In this way, the private life of students is monitored and they are made to socialize not only by being subject to Islamic lifestyle but also to its discipline. Extra-curricular activities in dormitories affect students' worldviews and their identities. Through moral education and discipline, it is aimed to protect them from degeneration, immorality and downfall. Teachers monitor the family life of students through home visits. It is a holistic education project that permeates all areas of the student's life. Individual space where the person can choose their way to form their identity and the freedom of experiencing on one's own are not of concern in this project (Turam, 2011).

Nursi wanted to protect laic education from disbelief and religious education from zealotry, by merging faith and science. Science and the holy text have been read alongside each other, to analyze each other. Nursi was aiming at increasing individual Muslim consciousness and the application of faith in daily life. The effect

of the state pressure on Muslims could only be overcome by increasing personal awareness. Even if it is not impossible, it would be rare to see a follower of Nur while eating and drinking in fast-food places or cafes (Yavuz, 2005).

Nursi highlighted the importance of reading and interpretation in religion, instead of translation and memorisation. Hence, its proponents, including Gülen, are text-based movements. For 2nd-generation Nur followers, as well as Gülen, how to transfer Islamic consciousness to daily life was important (Yavuz, 2005). Although Gülen schools are more successful than state schools, they still emphasize memorization and conservative values rather than critical thinking. They drive forward collective consciousness rather than free individualism. The sense of duty is different and also much more important than being critical (Yavuz, 2005).

The Gülen community rejects violence and it does not aim to capture political project and power. On the other hand, his hodja, Said Nursi, had attempted to merge medrese education with modern education. There is no membership document or subscription required to be a member of the community. Even just visiting the community houses and following their publications is enough (Balci, 2005).

People in the Gülen community come together outside the lighthouses because they share the same stories. Morality translates into identity through conduct and collective action, so acting and engaging in the public and private spheres are part of building the moral self. His education project is based on three principles: the cultivation of ethics, the teaching of science, and self-discipline (Yavuz, 2003).

Members of the movement treat these houses as sacred places where private identities and convictions are built and put into practice. Gülen has always focused on the private sphere and private domain more than on the public in defining the constitution of the Muslim community and identity. These dormitories are spaces for

developing inner consciousness and are shelters against behaviours such as drug and alcohol use, premarital sex and violence (Yavuz, 2003). By living together with other members of lighthouses, students learn and internalize a new cognitive map of meaning and action that entails new schemes of perception, evaluation and a set of body practices that are meant to transform their character (Yavuz, 2003).

Fethullah Gülen and Education

The leader of the Gülen community, Fethullah Gülen, developed ideas about education and teachers. According to Fethullah Gülen, the importance of teachers today is greater than it has ever been throughout history. Teachers have a more important impact on the individual than mothers, fathers and the society. In fact, teachers shape mothers, fathers and society in many areas. Teachers have been considered as philosophers, dervishes and zahids. Teachers leave their marks on their times (Ergene, 2007).

Fethullah Gülen thinks that leftist ideologies have gained hegemony on the education system and that the left has been causing chaos in society. According to Fethullah Gülen, the wars and destruction of the world result from the materialist and positivist thinking in science because these scientists do not contemplate on the results of their own works (Ergene, 2007). According to this thinking, teaching synthesized with Islam becomes holy.

Fethullah Gülen is inspired by the ideas of Said Nursi in many areas. According to the discourse of Said Nursi, science is a necessary way to understand the existence of God. Besides, coming into contact with Western culture is not

harmful to Muslim people (Ergene, 2007). On the contrary, Muslims can benefit from the Western culture.

After 1965, Fethullah Gülen started organizing summer camps in İzmir, in order to teach Islamic principles, Islamic knowledge and the writings of Said Nursi to young students (Ergene 2007). Moreover, students who were taught how Islamic identity could be protected in secular areas (Agai, 2003). Fethullah Gülen directed help from mosques to these schools; because, in order to understand creation, first we need information produced in these schools and religious houses. Fethullah Gülen has produced the most important motivation for education in these dormitories and houses (Agai, 2003). According to Fethullah Gülen, while teachers have Islamic features in a religious order, these teachers have religious virtue. Besides, teachers in secular schools could have these virtues if they followed this religious order.

Fethullah Gülen started the Service (Hizmet) movement, which refers to educating young students in religious houses and dormitories. These young people of rural origin come from poor families in economic terms. The aim of Fethullah Gülen is to produce Islamist and modern leaders for Turkey. Before Fethullah Gülen, the leaders of other religious orders were interested in only the Islamist people in Turkey; however, Fethullah Gülen has been interested in the whole society (Ergene 2007). The discourses of the religious community of Fethullah Gülen have complied with nationalist and Islamist ideas (Agai, 2003) and they acted as a supporter of state control during the military regime which commenced in 1980.

Gülen's ideas overlap with Max Weber's worldly ascetic view, although the latter is not related to the pursuit of political power or even traditional Islam (Ergene, 2007). When compared to the zakat's (obligatory alms) unchanging rules, the concept of service in Gülen is infinite. Gülen highly values self-criticism and self-

denial. He gives advice such as never giving up reading intellectually stimulating books. The main belief among the followers of Gülen is that moral values will spread not through explicit persuasion and lessons but presenting good examples in daily actions. For this reason, what is conveyed in dormitories is important. The act and activism in his leadership adopt the method of ascetism which externalizes all types of violence and its methods. They spent their revolutionary power to open schools and dormitories (Özdalga, 2006).

Gülen compares the insane characters in psychiatry books to the disbeliever generation, which he thinks to be related. Without faith, all charities are futile and worthless. It is believed that being close friends with non-believers or people who do not perform their prayers will cause business failure or bring bad luck in all relationships. Faith and belief are indispensable characteristics of a society to be adorned with social morality (Çobanoğlu, 2012). Giving scholarships provides someone with merit as if they had gone on a jihad. Besides performing practices, conversations and behaviors in accordance with the commands and bans of Allah, essentially the religious activities in the social area are important in the concept of merit (Çobanoğlu, 2012).

Teaching manners is essential in education, and when it is disregarded, children will end up as spoilt generations. He considers education to be creating social capital and raising talented people that will shape the society (Çobanoğlu, 2012). Along with science and biology lessons, the greatness of the creator should also be taught. Other than that, the doors are closed for social sciences. The Gülen community does not encourage free will and individualism. While explaining the significance of scientific information, Gülen says that humanity suffers due to positivism and materialism that occupies science (Çobanoğlu, 2012).

Anthony Giddens refers to the hidden curriculum while explaining the results of modernity and the fact that science means respect to the technical information types rather than education and technical findings. It is more important regarding the social attitude, because the respect for the information type coming from power channels is another form of authority. In this sense, Gülen also indicates that we are in the age of discipline and order and often gives the example of Japan and South Korea (Çobanoğlu, 2012).

Gülen uses the concept of member instead of individual and individualization. Hence, member and their choices count for nothing. With the concept of member, Gülen provides opportunities for capitalization depending on community, not for individualization. He is in a position advising self-denial and preventing squandering (Çobanoğlu, 2012). In modern societies, the problems in the human sphere are drawn to the individual sphere due to the problems based on trust. Lighthouses (Işık evleri) emerged through this idea. In short, lighthouses are centres for personality and identity formation as private areas. The founding member of the social morality system, the golden generation, will emerge there (Çobanoğlu, 2012).

It attempts to balance the person in terms of internal discipline, edification of the soul and self-denial. In the texts of Gülen, the person should never be left alone. Even if the disposition comes innate, the person should not be left alone. In this way, becoming an individual in the Western sense is prevented (Çobanoğlu, 2012).

Gülen has thoroughly analyzed the world literature such as the works of Kant, Shakespeare, Victor Hugo, Dostoyevsky, Sartre and Kafka. According to Gülen, the way to create an ethical society was not to have more religion or morality lessons, but by giving the best examples as teachers, police, businessmen and journalists in daily life. New traders and small industrialists support Gülen's

missionary battle in order to create a powerful Muslim Turkey. According to Gülen, Islam is primarily related to personality and identity. The teachers of the movement believe that the way to becoming conscious involves not only religious rituals but also pedagogical activities (Yavuz, 2005).

The Secular History of Turkey

The secular history of Turkey is important in order to analyze the Gülen community. The Ottoman Empire and Republic of Turkey shaped communities and religious movements. All of the 36 sultans were members of some Islamic dervish ruler (Şapolyo, 1964). The first three sultans were Bektaşî-Alevî rather than members of Sunni Islam. Many of the other sultans were members of Sunni dervish orders. For this reason, religion was very important for the rulers and the Muslim public in the Ottoman Empire. The medrese (theological school attached to a mosque) was a very important educational school in the whole Middle East and Islamist countries.

Nakşibendilik was the most important Sunni dervish order at the end of the Ottoman Empire. When the Ottoman Empire was first established, Alevilik and Bektaşîlik were influential in the Ottoman palace. Then, came the Sufi dervish order and Mevlevilik replaced Bektaşîlik. The leader of Mevlevilik is Mevlana Celladdini (Şapolyo, 1964). The final dervish order was Nakşibendilik, based on Sunni Islam. This Islamic group opposed Western modernization in the Ottoman Empire. Nakşî religious orders that protested the 2nd Constitutionalists of the Ottoman Empire in 1909 killed many modernist leaders and wanted to replace Western laws with Islamic laws (Zührer, 2010).

Said Nursi was born in Bitlis, where the Nakşibendilik and Kadirilik religious orders were widespread (Hür, 2010). Said Nursi was different from other religious leaders because he was a modernist and he reconciled religious ideas with science while other religious leaders explained everything with Islam and opposed science and democracy. Fethullah Gülen was a student of the Nur religious order. After 1970, Fethullah Gülen established his own religious order. After the military regime, this religious order became the biggest religious order in Turkey (Çalışlar, 2006).

Before the First World War, many Middle Eastern countries were part of the Ottoman Empire. At this time, religious orders and Muslim theological schools inspired these Muslim countries. Nevertheless, at the end of the nineteenth century, secular schools were influential, but the first secular schools in Islamist societies were military schools. The Ottoman Empire had not been a theocratic state but Islamic laws and education could be used in big cities (İnsel, 1990) because the Ottoman Empire was been modernized until the end of the nineteenth century. For this reason, there were no schools in many rural areas. Nations of the Empire used their own languages in their daily lives. Moreover, people of rural areas used their own religion as an ethical and educational tool (Özbek, 2007). The Ottoman Empire was a dynastic family and not a nation-state. For this reason, nations were free in terms of education, but religion was more important than the nation for Ottoman Turks.

During the War of Independence, many Turkish people described their own identity as Muslim rather than Turkish. For example, as told by Yakup Kadri Karaosmanoğlu (1998) in the novel *Yaban*, which described the Turkish War of Independence, a Turkish person said “Mustafa Kemal said that all Turks have to engage in war but we are not Turks, we are Muslims”. After the Turkish War of

Independence, the Turkish Republic was established. Turkey was the first secular country in the Islamic world. This regime had been established by Mustafa Kemal and his friends in 1923. Mustafa Kemal and his friends were inspired by French laicism, and for this reason many religious schools were banned until 1949. (Belge, 1984). They wanted to nationalize Islam and therefore, the Islamic call to prayer called by the muezzin five times a day from a mosque's minaret, namely the azan (ezan), was done in Turkish. The Kemalist regime also wanted to control Islam in all dimensions. The Presidency of Religious Affairs (Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı) was established with this intention and it started to control imams in mosques.

In Turkey, the Presidency of Religious Affairs (Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı) has a significant hegemony on people in terms of interpreting religion (İnsel, 1990). These kinds of institutions prevent free religious training. Religious communities in Turkey want to gain economic and political power by giving religious education. For example, these communities have newspapers, private teaching institutions, manufacturing and government offices. In many religious communities, teachers have been using only one way for religious education. For instance, some communities have been teaching only the books of sheikh in this religious community. The Presidency of Religious Affairs (Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı), which was founded by the Turkish Republic, is a very centralist institution in that it does not allow plurality in religious education.

Turkish secularism was modelled after the secular anti-clericalism of the French Revolution. In Istanbul, secularism neutralized the religious groups that were Atatürk's only real competitors. Technically, what is practiced in Turkey is not secularism, or the neutral separation of the church and the state (Öner, 1984). Rather, it is laicism (laiklik), or the subordination of religion to the state. The sprawling

the Presidency of Religious Affairs (Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı) literally administers Islam in Turkey. The agency's 95,000 employees manage thousands of mosques, approve religious doctrine, organize the annual Hajj to Mecca, and oversee religious and moral education in schools. During the Second World War, the notorious Wealth Tax (Varlık Vergisi) was levied discriminatorily against non-Muslims, including merchants and businesses (Zührer, 2010).

Eastern European and the Soviet Union pro-laicism ideologies served the authoritarian regimes. Kemalism too was an authoritarian example of laicism, though not as much as Soviet communism. Kemalism only focused on the negative communitarian aspects of Islamist movements while failing to notice their pluralist and dynamic aspects (Özdalga, 2006).

Many revolutions in the Turkish Republic have been related to the superstructure (Savran, 2010). For example, the Arabic alphabet was replaced with the Latin alphabet. Nevertheless, 90 percent of the people did not know how to read or write in Turkey. Furthermore, local clothes such as turbans and chadors were replaced by modern Western clothes, but many rural people did not use turbans or chadors in daily lives. Instead, they used scarves which covered the whole hair. The turban was being used by Islamic groups in cities. Land reform did not take place because some deputies of the Republican People's Party (CHP) consisted of significant landowners (Savran, 2010). There was single-party regime between 1923 and 1950, during which the CHP ruled the state for 27 years, after the Republic of Turkey was founded in 1923. People's Party (DP) was not based on proletarian class or bourgeoisie. The bureaucratic class, which constituted the Turkish bourgeoisie, governed this party several times, (Keyder, 2005). Therefore, since the multi-party regime was established in 1950, the CHP has not been in the government as a single

party. With the multi-party regime, Islamic groups and dervish orders started to gain power.

CHP has never been able to build close relationships with the working class or rural people (Boratav, 2005). At that time, the majority of the society was living by the rules of Islam because the moral code in Turkey was mostly based on Islam. Nevertheless, traditional Islam, which was the practice of the majority of the society, was different from the practice of Islamic groups and dervish orders.

The state has been determining sermons in mosques, which is quite anti-democratic and anti-secular. People have to choose which language to employ in mosques but the Turkish state determined the language to be employed in the mosques during the single-party regime. Ahmet İnel (1990) states that the legal authority of Sunni Islam on Islam of Turkey has to be ceased. İmam-Hatip schools, which were originally religious-technical schools, were transformed into general educational schools in the 1980s (Okçabol, 2005). These schools should not be controlled by the Ministry of Education because the Presidency of Religious Affairs has been attempting to control the curriculum of these schools.

Ahmet İnel (1990) asserts that the highest motivation of the Islamic movement is the suppression they were exposed to by the statist-Kemalist regime. The Presidency of Religious Affairs, which has a bigger budget than the Ministry of Education, enjoys only one idea: That Turkish secularism is based on the radical Jacobin laicism that aimed to transform society through the power of the state and the exclusion of religion from the public sphere (Berkes, 1998).

Laicism became the identity of the ruling elite, the ideology of the national security. The neo-Nur faith-based movement focused on identity and ethics to overcome the normative conflict in Turkey. Gülen is the best religious storyteller in

Turkey. These stories play an important role in the development of the personal identity of Muslims (Yavuz, 2003).

Independent Industrialists and Businessmen's Association (MÜSİAD) was founded as a result of Özal's politics. They attempted to justify the free market system by focusing on the merchant qualities of the Prophet in the book entitled *Muslim Man (Müslüman Adam)*. This new bourgeoisie is conservative in the social and religious sense while economically liberal. It is absolutely against state intervention in the economy. It is more inclined to capital accumulation because of family and religious networks (Yavuz, 2005).

In his book *Passive Revolution*, Cihan Tuğal (2010) documents how the Islamic movement had a revolutionary tone in the 1990s, while, with the Justice and Development Party (AKP) government in the 2000s, this revolutionary Islam was articulated into neoliberalism and its revolutionary aspect was passivized (Tuğal, 2010). However, the Islamist movement in Turkey has essentially been based on petit bourgeoisie and Anatolian capitalists, and it never had an era when it was revolutionary. The National Salvation Party (MSP) movement, which was founded on 11 October 1972, was going to represent the Islamic movement in the 1970s and prepare for the experience of the Welfare Party (RP) in the 1990s. The MSP was the representative of the promise regarding the solution to two main problems. The first one was to offer a sustainable development ground for Anatolian capitalists, and medium and small capital owners. The MSP was claiming to have an alternative development method to capitalism without rejecting private ownership standing at the core of capitalism. The position that Harootunian tried to explain by referring to Slavoj Žižek's concept of 'capitalism without capitalism' was the basis of the economic program of the MSP (Gürel, 2011).

The Middle East and Islam

The rise of Islamic movements in Turkey shows parallels with other Islamic movements in the Middle East in that they were on the rise at the same time. After World War I, many Islamic societies that had been part of the Ottoman Empire started to be governed by big imperialist states. After World War II, Ba'ath parties formed the governments in many Arabian states such as Iraq, Syria, Egypt and some North African states (Dam, 2005). These Ba'ath regimes were very similar to the CHP¹, but the most radical of all in terms of religion was the CHP. Until the end-of the Cold War, these Ba'ath regimes were close to the Soviet Socialist Republic Union (USSR), but they were not based on class struggle as socialism was (Fisk, 2011). These regimes were very totalitarian and based on Arab nationalism. Therefore, after the Cold War, these regimes were opposed and challenged by Islamic groups and Islamic dervish orders, similar to what the CHP encountered, because Islam had been oppressed by both Ba'ath regimes and the CHP. These regimes had instrumentalised Islam against class struggle or non-Muslim societies, such as Greeks and others, since they had been protecting the interests of the national bourgeoisie. For example, the Wealth (Varlık) Tax enacted by the CHP destroyed the non-Muslim bourgeoisie in Turkey. Ba'ath and CHP used religion pragmatically and controlled Islam in daily life.

The Islamic Party (FİS) in Algeria was the biggest opposition group against the regime; the Muslim Brotherhood in Egypt was in opposition to Ba'ath regime; and Hamas in Palestine constituted a powerful opposition to the secular El-Fetih

¹ The Republican People's Party was the only party in the Republic of Turkey from 1923 to 1950.

regime, which was like the Ba'ath regime. Hezbollah has constituted the biggest opposition against secular and Ba'ath regimes in Jordan, Iraq and many Middle Eastern countries (Fisk, 2011). The Fethullah Gülen movement, supporting the ruling party against the CHP in Turkey, is the biggest Islamic group.

In the Middle East, socialists have been inspired by Kemalist and Leninist ideas in the way they approach religion. They think that religion acts as a restriction against the emergence of socialist movements (Öner, 1984). They give examples such as the Sivas Massacre in 1993 (37 person were killed), the Maraş Massacre in 1978 (400 persons were killed) and the great number of socialist and Alevi murders by right-wing Muslims and fascists.

According to Gilles Kepell (2006), the Soviet-Afghan war started because Soviet Russia wanted to help the socialist regime in Afghanistan in 1979. This war continued for eight years due to the fact that the USA, Saudi Arabia and Pakistan were supporting Islamist militants financially, and also the USA was providing weapons for them. Usame bin Ladin was trained by the USA and Saudi Arabia in order to fight against communists in Afghanistan. During the Cold War, Israel supported Islamic Resistance Movement in order to weaken El-Fetih, which was a national-socialist party supported by the Soviet Union (Kepell, 2002). Moreover, most Marxist groups in the Middle East took guerrilla training in the camps of El-Fetih. For example, Deniz Gezmiş (the leader of the Turkish People's Liberation Army) and Abdullah Öcalan (the leader of the Kurdistan Workers' Party) were trained in these camps (Marcus, 2009). After the Cold War, El-Fetih was subject to a rapid weakening. In addition to this, Ba'ath regimes (Pan Arabism) were moving away from socialism. In fact, although these regimes claimed to be national-socialist, they had never been based on class struggle (Fisk, 2011). For these reasons, statist

capitalist systems, which are anti-democratic and authoritarian regimes, have been prevailing in these countries. In all those Islamic movements, Islamic groups cooperate and provide economic assistance to poor people. Islamic groups have been providing nourishment, clothes and shelter for the poor.

Persia was a monarchy in 1953. The modernist-nationalist party, (The National Front of Iran), which came to power in 1951 wanted to nationalize oil. For this reason, the US-backed monarchy staged a coup against the modernist-nationalist party. As a result, many modernist-nationalists and communists were murdered or put behind bars (Wright, 2001). In Persia, before the Islamic Revolution of 1979, Shah Pehlevi had been secular and wanted to liberalize women but the regime was militarist. Therefore, Pehlevi regime killed and imprisoned the Marxists and modernist nationalists. The medrese and the Islamic revolutionists were the only significant political opposition groups during the massacre of nationalists and communists. When the whole society rioted against the regime due to the growing class conflict, modernist-nationalists and communists did not have enough power. To sum up, Islamic revolutionists came to power. After the Islamic revolution, 30 thousand modernist-nationalists and Marxists were murdered in 1988.

Slavoj Žižek (2011) states that the inevitable conclusion to be drawn is that the rise of radical Islamism was always the other side of the disappearance of the secular left in Muslim countries. When Afghanistan is portrayed as the utmost Islamic fundamentalist country, nobody still remembers that, 40 years ago, it was a country with a strong secular tradition including a powerful communist party that took power. Where did this secular tradition go?”

Social State in Turkey

Before the welfare state in Turkey was dissolved in 1980, the Gülen community had set up their own training homes and dormitories in 1970. After the military regime, number of houses and dormitories increased. Therefore, we need to understand the transformation of the welfare state. In this respect, the paradigm that offered grounds for the strategies of reducing poverty was initiated by the January 24, 1980 decisions. The process henceforth has evolved through the liberalization of domestic financial markets, the commodity market, the foreign trade system and the exchange rate system and through the policies directed toward the privatization and reduction of labor costs. In the meantime, public employment has been gradually eliminated through these policies, which were devised and implemented for Turkey's articulation into the capitalist world order as a depository of a cheap and harmonious labour force. Furthermore, the establishment of the The Social Assistance and Solidarity Fund (SYDTF) in 1986 and the Green Card² service in 1992 can be considered within this framework, and certainly as a product of the populist concerns for addressing liberal policies (Uzgel& Duru 2009).

In health, a conception focused on foreign-dependent medicine and technology consumption has developed instead of protective health service. While employee rights were ignored, the concept of a charitable state has become widespread instead of a social state, with policies to relieve victims of the market,

² The Green Card system was established in 1992 and is directly funded by the Government. Poor people earning less than a minimum level of income which is defined by the law, are provided a special card giving free access to outpatient and inpatient care at the state and some university hospitals, and covering their inpatient medical drug expenses but excluding the cost of outpatient drugs

the poor and the ones at the very bottom. While the entitlement for retirement has been getting more difficult, pensions have been reduced. While labor has been getting flexible, subcontracting has become widespread. The tax collected from wageworkers has been constantly increasing. The tax collected from the lower classes has come to be used least for the lower classes. Those who were members of the trade unions and used their right to strike have been made redundant. The Ministry of Health has become a controller rather than producing service. Private hospitals have become widespread. Health service for the ones with money have become the rule (Yıldırım, 2009).

Turkish society is faced with informal work, with the lack of social security and with deunionisation, which has resulted in endemic insecurity. Hence, the society as whole is rendered dependent upon social assistance (Coşar 2012). The focus here is on individual responsibility and it is stressed that there are no rights without duties. So, in neoliberal social policy, as MacGregor notes, “rather than risks being shared and collective responsibility accepted, the focus is on a balance of rights and obligations at the level of the individual” (MacGregor, 1999).

In other words, under the AKP’s rule, life itself, with its social, social academic and cultural dimensions, has become a marketplace. The social security reform, which was started before the AKP came to power but was finalized by the party, is a good example of the subjection of health and social security system to the disciplines of the market (Coşar, 2012).

The AKP’s neoliberal agenda is in line with the so-called “structural reforms”, which were introduced in conjunction with the IMF and the World Bank and have functioned as a surveillance mechanism over Turkey, just as they have in other countries where they provide funding. One of the main requirements and/or

reforms, which both the IMF and the World Bank have established as stipulations for providing funds, is the restructuring of the social policy in line with neoliberal ideas (Coşar, 2012).

Essential to all religions, charity is also a central organizing principle in Islam, which the AKP refers to rather often. The Islamic elements in the ideological orientation of the ruling party also appear to be very useful in motivating and mobilizing civil initiatives towards providing social assistance. An important example of the purpose of orienting Islamic elements is the rise of Islamic NGOs in the realm of social assistance. Of these, the Lighthouse Association (Deniz Feneri Derneği) is the most prominent. It provides food, health, services, shelter, guest houses, public kitchens, clothing education, occupational courses, and in-cash benefits to its beneficiaries. It is a strategy, which is used in the construction of the political and ideological bonds/links that keep the AKP in power (Coşar, 2012).

It can be argued that in Turkey, such policies center on family and religious organizations (Avcuoğlu, 2009, p. 35), which are stronger than public protection organizations and market institutions, and through these institutions “traditional religious community-based solidarity patterns” are reproduced, thus reinforcing a “communitarians-conservative” liberal welfare regime (Ender, 2004) in this welfare regime, policies are implemented not on the axis of social citizenship or universal principles, but in regard to charity.

Conversely, the majority earn their living under more precarious conditions. As a result of this increased deregulation and flexibility of work, the labor market has been transformed into a risk society, incalculable in terms of individual lives (Coşar, 2012).

Islamism developed in Turkey with 1980s free market. In the early 80s, the military government also promoted religion in the battle against communism. Turgut Özal, the prime minister and the president, who was also the first to apply neoliberal policies in Turkey, used to travel regularly to İzmir from Ankara to listen to Gülen. The neoliberal policies of Özal had an important role in the empowerment of industrialists and businessman close to Gülen (Turam, 2011)

Identity

The Gülen community wanted to construct a golden generation (new identities) movement through an education movement. For of this reason, we need to know what identity is. Identity enables us to acknowledge that our conduct is at once structured and open-ended. Identity references the tension between what has been and what we do, say and are in the here and now; between what has become automatic in our conducts and other aspects of behavior that afford learning, change, redefinition, restyling (Bourdieu, 1987).

Identities on all scales shape and are shaped by desires and fears rooted in human embodiedness and its subsistence needs, affordances for pleasure, and vulnerabilities to pain. The phenomenological experience of unique selfhood overflows social semiotic categories, both structural and agentive, as we create feeling as well as meaning for ourselves and others across the multiple timescales of our lives (Bourdieu, 1987).

As part of its inheritance from earlier notions such as personality, subject and soul, we tend initially to imagine an identity as unitary. What does it take for momentary actions to add up to a consistent longer-term identity? It takes both the

recurrence of the opportunities to enact these identity, for example, access to situations, material affordances/resources, presence of particular others or types of others, and so dances/resources, presence of particular others or types of others, and so on, and the will to enact that identity on each such occasion (Bourdieu, 1987).

Most of all he emphasizes the similarity and difference of dispositions, not according to individuality, but according to similarity and difference in the typical opportunities and demands of lives lived in different positrons in society (Bourdieu, 1987).

What links the long term to the short is precisely recurrence: of persons with whom we can continue to enact some relationship in which our role is significant to our identity; of objects, including diaries, favorite books and films, familiar furnishings and clothes, through which we can continue to express aspects of our identities; of situation types in which we can continue to express aspects of our identities; of situation types in which we can recognize familiar scenarios and roles we can perform (Caldas-Coulthard, 2008). Some aspects of our identities may persist for days or weeks, but not longer, as we travel, as we create intense but transient personal relationships, as we “try on” identities in play or game environments and communities in which we participate only on these timescales.

Our identities are build in response to these primordial desires and fears, as well as to those additional desires and fears which our cultural words elaborate on their foundation (Caldas-Couilthard, 2008). The identity structure is dynamic, not static. The identity process neither begins nor ends with adolescence. It begins with the self-object differentiation at infancy and reaches its final phase with the self-mankind integration at old age.

Rational authority is based on competence so it helps the development of personality, but irrational authority is based on power so the person obeying irrational authority can easily be exploited by others (Fromm, 1976). Persons who have authority without merit gain their status due to hierarchy and power. Somebody using power causes the loss of power on somebody else's part. The combinations of economical dependence, physical terrorization and psychological restrictions influence the perception of people about themselves (Ackelsberg, 1991).

Authoritarian social relationships have divided society as committers and persons taking order, which has caused the impoverishment of person's emotion and mind. This situation prevents people from becoming realistic and judgmental. As a result, these people believe that irrational authority is necessary. They cannot trust their own observation or justice (Fromm, 1976).

According to Wilhelm Reich (1970), who has analyzed how authoritarian civilization has been produced by using inventions of Freud in his analysis, when sexual ideas are suppressed, these ideas condense under subconscious which then causes antisocial relationships and pathological illnesses. Such persons are obedient and shy. According to Rianne Eisler, in addition to disconfirming sexuality, disconfirming pleasure has been causing these behaviors. According to psychologist Else Frenkel-Brunswick (1950), people who yielded their wills to authoritarian families during childhood, yield their wills to authoritarian leaders when they grow up.

If everybody was free and stand-alone, they could make their own choices based on mutual advantages. Self-activity can help the persons who obey authority to develop creativity, sociability, imagination and critical thinking ability (Malatesta, 1949). Equal persons can collaborate the democratic society. Society cannot think;

only individuals can think. According to Erich Fromm, individuals in person have to constitute morality as the part of society. Being relativist or absolute about moral ideas has caused the impoverishment of ego and individualism.

Subjectivity

We need to know how subjectivities of students are affected by these identities, while the Gülen community is constructing identities. Touraine (1995) thinks that modernity has two features. First one is rationalism and the later is subjectivity. Falling in love and our emotions have appeared in subjectivity. Only subjectivity can resist to the generalization and being single of social system. Moreover, according to Touraine, liberalism has created the individual and the individual has to be integrated to the market economy; but, the subject has been different from the individual. The subject who resisted all addiction, restraint, authority and submission confronted the market economy and the liberal system when they wanted to dominate the subject. As a result, the individual identifies with market economy but subjectivity is a new concept we have to develop instead of the individual, according to A. Touraine (1995). Subjectivity has been comprised of three sections that are freedom, resistance against traditional and authorial systems and how to create relationship with the other. The person can be the subject when she becomes critical to life and social roles because the subject has to be creative about her own life. We can think that the person can be the subject or not when she or he gets rid of their own religion and cultural inheritance. Taoure mentioned that sometimes the person uses their inheritance and religion in order to discard the hegemony of power; which means that if people want to become the subject, people

do not need to abandon their own religious and cultural inheritance. Furthermore, while being the subject, the person should not be in the jail of their background. In fact, we can be subjects by developing critical thinking on inheritance of the past and the tradition. Taoure, (1994) said that the person has to be at peace with the past and look at the past critically. The subject designates your past more. Buket Türkmen (2011) thinks that our religious, national and social belongings can be parts of our subjectivity but the person must read these parts once more. Unless being Kemalist or Islamic are not discussed, when we accept these identities, we can produce only mottos. These mottos produced against others are not enough to create free identity or subjectivity. Moreover, in many cases, these mottos produced against others have produced reactionary and puritanical identities that have been causing the violence.

Foucault (1991) insists repeatedly and clearly in *Discipline and Punish*, that power is exercised first and foremost on bodies, and that is precisely the source of its materiality. The body is the surface on which the game is played, on which power is produced and repressed. Power and culture, then, need to be seen, not as static entities with no connection to each other, but as attributes of existing economic relations in a society. They are dialectically interwoven so that economic power and control is interconnected with cultural power and control (Peters, Besley 2007). This very sense of the connectedness between knowledge or cultural control and economic power once again serves as the basis for our historical analysis here.

Two things have been central to this approach, so far. First, it sees schools as caught up in a nexus of other situations - political, economic, and cultural - that are basically unequal. That is, schools exist through their relations to other more powerful institutions, institutions that are combined in such a way as to generate structural inequalities of power and access to resources. Second, these inequalities

are reinforced and reproduced by schools (though not by them alone, of course).

Through their curricular, pedagogical, and evaluative activities in day-to-day life in classrooms, schools play a significant role in what (Besley, 2007)?

As with power, Foucault conceives of bodies, not as mere substances but as the effects of discourses of power that have their own history city. His many writings on the topic intend to open up sociological and historical perspectives on the body, yet this movement does not reduce the body to being the effect of transcendental and already determined context. For example, in *Discipline and Punish*, Foucault (1991) goes from the inside to the outside: from the discourses on disciplining bodies to the more general regularities for organizing space and time, individuals, or power grids. It is not because of a context that the body is produced in particular ways, but it is through understanding the minutiae of everyday monastic rules or apprenticeship regulations that one can learn something about a given epoch.

Following Foucault, Brazilian historian Denise Bernuzzi Sant'Anna wrote that the body is a polysemic text in which biology, psychological expressions, cultural anxieties and phantoms, and history get mingled. The body is a mutant memory of the laws and codes of each culture, a register for the solutions and for the technological and scientific constraints of each time. The body has not ceased to be fabricated throughout time (Peters & Besley 2007).

In the twentieth century, pedagogy and education were dominated by rational pedagogies, with echoes from Calvinist pedagogies even in Catholic countries such as France or Spain that conceived bodies as the site of sinful inclinations or, in the modern scientific version, pathologies and illnesses. Foucault's work has rendered visible the phenomenal concern about bodies in educational institutions. As British sociologist Philip Corrigan (1988) said, one usually forgets what schools made

"with, to, and for my body." Schools sought to produce a total transformation of students' bodily behavior, through rules and regulations that prescribed social performances, appearances, and moral scales and that established "normal" patterns as well as deviations. Notions of decency and decorum, cleanliness and filthiness were tied into political, economic, and moral categories, and constructed power relations that had pervasive effects (Vigarello, 1988). This construction persisted for many decades. In her reflections on bodies and schools, a contemporary Brazilian educator, Guacira Lopes Louro (1999), recalls the struggle with the educational authorities over the regulation of attire, particularly over the donning of uniforms, which apparently expropriated the students of their bodies and turned them into an indivisible part of the school community. These struggles condensed issues of authority and knowledge in schools that were far from marginal to their educational aims.

This construction persisted for many decades. In her reflections on bodies and schools, a contemporary Brazilian educator, Guacira Lopes Louro (1999), recalls the struggle with the educational authorities over the regulation of attire, particularly over the donning of uniforms, which apparently expropriated the students of their bodies and turned them into an indivisible part of the school community. These struggles condensed issues of authority and knowledge in schools that were far from marginal to their educational aims.

Curriculum

The Gülen community constructs the identities by curriculum. For this reason, we need to know what curriculum is. Curriculum is experiences proffered to

students at schools and is definition of what is to be learned. Curriculum confines its coverage to the prescribed content of learning during the years of compulsory education. But even during compulsory education, it is possible to refer to the hidden curriculum, which it is not overtly stated and which may be unintentionally passed on through the process of education.

When we think critically, we are required to orchestrate a vast variety of cognitive skills, grouped in families such as reasoning skills, concept-formation skills, inquiry skills, and translation skills. Without these skills, we would be unable to deduce meaning from a piece of written text or from conversation, nor could we impart meaning to a conversation or to what we write (Lipman, 2007)

The teacher is going to produce knowledge (i.e., reflect on her experience) as part of her attempt to develop a sixth-grade social studies curriculum, the knowledge she produces is likely to be influenced by a dominant discourse found in many, if not most, schools that education functions to sort students from best to worst. This assumption or common-sense position about sorting may also operate in (Gitlin and Ornstein, 2007). The normative nature of these discourses may give teachers and others the impression that they are being neutral as they sort students based on their understanding of the accomplishments of government. However, it is also possible that this impression of neutrality may hide the way in which sorting serves a legitimating function in supporting differential social and cultural group opportunities, while focusing on accomplishments may further political quiescence and the maintenance of existing distributions of power and rationality in society (Apple, 1983).

We should promote freedom by enlarging our horizons, increasing our autonomy, and making more complex our visions and our imagination (Gitlin,

Ornstein 2007). Vision and imagination are particularly critical for freedom, for they speak to what is unique about our humanness our ability to begin somewhat a new and to find something previously unseen (Arendt, 1968). To do so, knowledge/politics needs to address the specific relation between mind/body/soul (self) and the articulation of com- nonsensical texts.

One such space is what we call the borderland between differences. This is a space in the knowledge-production / a political process that is neither that of the text nor that of the teacher. Instead, it is a space that emerges out of the differences in perspectives between the text and the teacher. As such, borderland spaces, spaces of freedom in our view, are one terrain on which new possibilities can develop when the influences of common sense do not totally saturate teachers' perspectives. Relations of freedom, therefore, include not only knowledge/ political production of a certain type, but also the intimate connection between producing a certain type of knowledge/politics and expanding possibilities to act (Giroux, 1988).

Quite the contrary is true. Multicultural education is more than content; it includes policy, learning climate, instructional delivery, leadership, and evaluation (Bank, 1994). Making explicit connections between multicultural education and subject and skill-based curriculum and instruction is imperative. For instance, students should not simply memorize facts about major events involving ethnic groups, such as civil rights movements, social justice efforts and cultural accomplishments. Instead, educators should teach students how to think critically and analytically about these events, propose alternative solutions to social problems, and demonstrate understanding through such forms of communication (Gay, 2007).

Students may memorize key information about biology for the science test but never ponder I what that knowledge says about personal health (Bransford,

Franks, Vye, & Sherwood, 1989). Distinctly different child-rearing patterns are one mechanism through which social-class differences affect the academic performance of children. For example, parents of different social classes often have different ways of disciplining their children, different ways of communicating expectations, and even different ways of reading to their children. These differences do not express themselves consistently or apply to every family; rather, they influence the average tendencies of families from different social classes (Rothstein, 2004).

That there are personality and child-rearing differences, on average, between families in different social classes makes sense when you think about it. If upper-middle-class parents have jobs in which they are expected to collaborate with fellow employees, create new solutions to problems, or wonder how to improve their contributions, they are more likely to talk to their children in ways that differ from those of lower-class parents whose jobs simply require them to follow instructions without question (Rothstein 2004).

On average, lower-class children have poorer vision than middle-class children, partly because of prenatal conditions and partly because of how their eyes are trained as infants. They have poorer oral hygiene, more lead poisoning, more asthma, poorer nutrition, less adequate pediatric care, more exposure to smoke, and a host of other problems. Each of these well-documented social-class differences is likely to have a palpable effect on academic achievement, and the combined influence of all of these differences is probably huge (Rothstein, 2004).

The growing unaffordability of adequate housing for low-income families is another social-class characteristic that has a demonstrable effect on average achievement. Children whose families have difficulty finding stable housing are

more likely to be mobile, and student mobility is an important cause of low student achievement (Rothstein, 2004).

For example, black students may value education less than white students because a discriminatory labor market has not historically rewarded black workers for their education but values can persist independently and outlast the economic circumstances that gave rise to them (Rothstein, 2004).

Lower-class children cannot produce typical middle-class academic achievement unless they learn basic and more advanced skills simultaneously, with each reinforcing the other. This is, in fact, how middle-class children Who come to school ready to learn acquire both basic and advanced skills. We also don't know the extent of the social-class gaps in no cognitive skills such character traits as perseverance, self-confidence, self-discipline. These are important goals of public education. In some respects, they may be more important than academic outcome (Rothstein, 2004).

Employers, for example, consistently report that workers have more serious shortcomings in these no cognitive areas than in academic areas. Econometric studies show that no cognitive skills are a stronger predictor of future earnings than are standardized test scores. In public opinion surveys, Americans consistently say they want schools to produce good citizens and socially responsible adults first and people with high academic proficiency second (Rothstein, 2004). Children of lower social classes exhibit more antisocial behavior than children of higher social classes, both in early childhood and in adolescence. It would be reasonable to expect that the same social and economic inequalities that seem likely to produce gaps in academic test scores also produce differences in no cognitive traits (Rothstein, 2004). This is a peculiarly American belief – that schools can be virtually the only instrument of

social reform but it is not based on evidence concerning the relative effectiveness of economic, social, and educational improvement efforts.

For example, some educationists speak of the 'hidden curriculum', by which they mean those things which pupils learn at school because of the way in which the work of the school is planned and organized, and through the materials provided, but which are not in themselves overtly included in the planning or even in the consciousness of those responsible for the school arrangements. Social roles, for example, are learnt in this way, it is claimed, as are sex roles and attitudes to many other aspects of living. Implicit in any set of arrangements are the attitudes and values of those who create them, and these will be communicated to pupils in this accidental and perhaps even sinister way (Kelly, 2004).

Others, however, take a less definite and perhaps less cynical line on this but wish nevertheless to insist that teachers do have a responsibility here. They accept that some of the values and attitudes learnt via the hidden curriculum are not directly intended by teachers, but believe that, since these things are being learnt as a by product of what is planned and of the materials provided, teachers should be aware of and accept responsibility for what is going on, for what their pupils are learning in this unplanned way. It is this view which is at the heart of attempts to eliminate implicit racism and sexism from the experiences children receive at school (Elly, 2004).

The Curriculum Theory (The Social Reconstruction Ideology)

Social and economic conditions have an important effect on being able to enter these houses and dormitories. As a result, the social reconstruction theory

comes into prominence. Social Reconstructionists are conscious of the problems of our society and the injustices done to its members, such as those originating from racial, gender, social, and economic inequalities. They assume that the purpose of education is to facilitate the construction of a new and more just society that offers maximum satisfaction to all of its members. Social Reconstructionists assume that education is the social process through which society is reconstructed. They have faith in the ability of education, through the medium of curriculum, to teach people to understand their society in such a way that they can develop a vision of a better society and act to bring that vision into existence.

Social Reconstructionists begin with the assumption that the survival of our society is threatened by many problems. These problems include, among others, racism, war, sexism, poverty, pollution, exploitation of workers, global warming, crime, political corruption, population explosion, energy shortage, illiteracy, inadequate health care, and unemployment. Underlying many of these problems are deep social structures—many based in Eurocentric conceptions of knowledge, culture, and values—that through the school's hidden curriculum subtly shape student beliefs and behavior in such a way that they, as both students and future adults, will contribute to the perpetuation and aggravation of these problems. If these problems are not resolved, they will threaten the survival of our society.

Social Reconstructionists view their world from a social perspective. The nature of society, as it has been, as it is, and as it should be determines most of their concepts and assumptions. For example, human experience, education, truth, and knowledge are socially defined. Human experience is believed to be fundamentally shaped by cultural factors; meaning in people's lives is defined in terms of their relationship to society. Education is viewed as a function of the society that supports

it and is defined in the context of a particular culture. Truth and knowledge are defined by cultural assumptions; they are idiosyncratic to each society and testable according to criteria based in social consensus rather than empiricism or logic.

As a result, Social Reconstructionists believe that "there is no good individual apart from some conception of the nature of the good society. Man without human society and human culture is not man" (Schiro, 2008). They believe that "there is also no good education apart from some conception of the nature of the good society. "Education is not some pure and mystical essence that remains unchanged from everlasting to everlasting" (p. 258). They believe that there is no truth or knowledge apart from some conception of the nature of the good society; "and the good society is not something that is given by nature: it must be fashioned by the hand and brain of man" (Schiro, 2008).

It is important to note first of all that education is essentially a political activity, that the education system is the device by which an advanced society prepares its young for adult life in the society, a formalization of the role played in primitive societies by all or most of the adult population. The political context, then, is a major element in any scheme or system of education, and one without reference to which such a scheme or system cannot be properly understood.

Social Reconstructionists want to reconstruct society through social processes. Their first concern is the education of the group and the second one is the education of the individual. From this perspective, learning experiences are construed to be group experiences that take place through human interaction, and the focus is on the "group mind" rather than the "individual mind" As Freire writes, "in this theory of action one cannot speak of an actor, nor simply of actors, but rather of actors in intercommunication" (1970, p. 123). Individuals are critical to the ideology,

for it is through the reconstruction of individuals that one reconstructs society. However, education of individuals is viewed as achievable primarily through group-centered, social processes.

Underlying both the discussion and experience methods is a belief in the crucial role that language plays in education and social reconstruction. As McLaren and Giroux emphasize, "knowledge ... is a social construction" that takes place largely through language, "which means that the world we inhabit as individuals is constructed symbolically by the mind (and body) through social interaction" (1997, p. 27). Further, "the nature of the language we use determines how we make sense of our experiences and the type of social action we choose to engage in as a result of interpreting our experiences" (p. 21). In addition, "language ... is always situated within ideology and power/ knowledge relations," which means that "meanings of any event or experience are only available through the language selected by the particular interpretive community wishing to render such event intelligible" (p. 22). As a result, "the struggle over how to name and transform experience [through language] is one of the most critical issues in.

In other words, "are schools to uncritically serve and reproduce the existing society or challenge the social order to develop and advance its democratic imperatives?" (Giroux, 1992). Giroux's answer to this question is simple: "I opt for the latter.... I believe that schools should function to provide students with the knowledge, character, and moral vision that build civic courage" (p. 18) in a manner that leads to the reconstruction of society in accordance with "the principles and practices of human dignity, liberty, and social justice" (p.8).

From the Social Reconstructionist perspective, bias and partiality are inherent in the very nature of education. The questions teachers ask, the language teachers

use, the social interactions acceptable in school (such as respect for teachers), and the hidden curricula of schools (for example, expectations for work-related behaviour of children from different economic classes; (Anyon, 1980) all have social biases embedded in them. Questions of what to teach, what to expect of students, where to teach, and how to teach all involve value decisions that make impartiality impossible. Social Reconstructionists believe that educators who consider themselves impartial and neutral transmitters of instruction are ignorant of the nature of their endeavours.

What needs to be explicitly stated is that Social Reconstructionists do not want to simply program learners' minds or fill them with a specific collection of facts and concepts. Because such an approach would prepare learners to deal with only the crises of the past and not the crises of the future, it is inconsistent with the Social Reconstructionist belief in social relativity. It is the unknown crises of the future that children must be prepared to encounter, understand, and act to resolve. Social Reconstructionists want to have children construct a specific social orientation and social perspective along with a specific set of social values and problem solving skills that will allow them to confront, analyze, understand, react to, and rectify whatever social problems might arise in the future in a manner consistent with the social perspective and values of the educator. Providing learners with such a social perspective and set of social values which are by definition biased is what Social Reconstructionists call social acculturation (or imposition).

Knowledge does not come into existence by itself and passively reside in objective reality. It comes into existence when someone actively impresses meaning on sensory data, and it resides within the subjective consciousness of its possessor. Knowledge is not viewed as a purely intellectual quantity. Both people's "gut"

knowledge and their "intellectual" knowledge are important and interdependent. Both their "unrational" (subconscious) and their "rational" (conscious) knowledge are valued. Knowledge is both cognitive and experiential in nature. Knowledge is not just "information about" but also "experience with" a subject. Knowledge is based both in people's experiences and in their ability to understand those experiences.

Although knowledge is a personal attribute of the perceiver, Social Reconstructionists are concerned with the knowledge possessed by society. Educators wish to reconstruct the society by reconstructing the social consensus of the masses—the summative total of the knowledge held by the many individuals who make up society.

Social Reconstructionism views knowledge as "interdisciplinary in nature" and questions "the fundamental categories of all disciplines" (Giroux, 1992). It creates "new forms of knowledge through its emphasis on breaking down disciplinary boundaries and creating new spheres in which knowledge can be produced" (Giroux, 2005). As Giroux emphasizes, "the struggle over the production and creation of knowledge" is "an ... issue of power, ethics, and politics" (p. 69).

Social Reconstructionists highlight the ethical and political dimensions of knowledge and its use by emphasizing that schools "must be seen as places where culture, power, and knowledge come together to produce a vision of the future," a vision that determines what knowledge we consider to be true, ethical, emancipator, and worthwhile (Giroux, 2006).

Social Reconstructionists view learning as children's having inculcated into them a way of viewing events in their environment through an intelligence oriented around a vision of a future good society. This intelligence allows them to learn

things both in relation to what they already know and within the context in which they occur.

Learner-centered educators view the whole person as an integrated organism possessing natural goodness, as a self-propelled agent of his or her own growth, and as a self-activated maker of meaning. They focus on people rather than on the acts or attributes of people, and on the uniqueness of individuals as they are in the present rather than as they might be in the future. These educators are concerned about processes internal to people, such as mental health and self-esteem, and talk as though they can visualize the inner workings of people's minds during their intellectual, social, and emotional development. Social Reconstructionists view people as social beings whose nature is defined by the society in which they live.

The Hidden Curriculum

The hidden curriculum is an important factor in the daily life of students in the houses and dormitories. For this reason, we research the hidden curriculum. According to Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis (1976), through formal and hidden curricula schools reproduce the social relations necessary to maintain capitalism: competition and evaluation, hierarchical divisions of labor, bureaucratic authority, compliance, and the fragmented and alienated nature of work. They argue that the reproduction of these skills and attitudes through the educational system corresponds to and prepares students for future stratified work roles.

Students encounter norms, values, and beliefs through the rules and practices that form the daily routines and social relationships in the classroom and the

extended school. This hidden curriculum, grounded in industry's attempt to control labor and increase productivity, must also foster faith in the putative "neutrality" of schools and the supposed "natural" environment of education and tolerance (Apple 1982).

Hidden curricula occur at multiple places and times during schooling. As Apple noted, however, we should not conceive of the curriculum as a thing, such as a syllabus or course of study. Rather, we should conceptualize it as a symbolic, material, and human environment that is continually reconstructed (Apple 1993).

Elements of the hidden curriculum ultimately serve not only to the reproduction of both hierarchy and marginalization, but alienation as well (Bourdieu 1973, 1977; Passeron 1990). Speaking of their personal experiences or relying on their observations of various institutional practices, many academics described how hidden curricula in higher education assimilate individuals into the class structure, practices, and values of an established predominantly white, male-oriented, middle-class academic environment.

Apple's most recent work, *Teachers and Texts* (1986), examines the ways in which reproduction occurs through the control of teachers and textbooks in schools. The production and control of textbooks is also defined as a key issue in the reproduction of inequalities. This is especially noticeable in the realm of career guidance, where, as Willis (1977) observed, the socialization models offered by teachers to pupils are those which they deem congruent with their anticipated sex roles and class position.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

The research problems of this thesis required a qualitative research method like oral history interviewing. Qualitative method is also effective in identifying socialization of students, gender roles, the hidden curriculum, identity, subjectivity, and religion in this study. One advantage of qualitative methods in this research is that use of open-ended questions and probing gives participants the opportunity to respond in their own words, rather than forcing them to choose from fixed responses, as quantitative methods do. Oral history has been used to explore tensions between individual and collective forms of memory and how these can be represented through memorialisation. The life history method provides details on many social and power relationships that have shaped this person life over time. In the actual telling of life stories, people contextualise their lives and make links across different phases (Bozzoli, 1991).

Research Setting

Oral histories were done with ten persons who stayed in dormitories or houses of Gülen religious orders. These houses and dormitories are in Istanbul, Ankara, Afyon, Antalya, Hatay and Gaziantep. Students in this study lived in the houses or dormitories of the Gülen community between two to five years. The private schools of the Gülen community are not included in this study.

There are many studies in these areas. Several studies explain the existence or success of the Gülen congregation by conspiracy theories. These studies cited the economic and political support of United States. This is true even if claimed. They cannot explain all the facts about the Gülen congregation. The few researchers tried to analyze Gülen's words and books. This study gives information about illiterate persons whose written history is either missing or distorted. What is more, the daily life and material culture of these students are analyzed in this study.

Research Participants

Some of these persons who are my friends lived in religious houses with me. These students are both students dividing from the Gülen religious order and students relating to this religious order. These persons, who are 18 to 30 years old lived in the houses or dormitories of Gülen community between two to five years. Interviewees were not selected according to their ethnicity or culture. There are people from all regions of Turkey. The houses and dormitories in this study are in İstanbul, Ankara, Afyon, Antalya, Hatay and Gaziantep.

Table 1. Demographic Information of the Participant Students

Names	Place of Birth, Age	University Location	House or Dormitory
Serkan	Trabzon-22 years old	İstanbul	House
Selim	Ağrı-27 years old	Antalya	House
Mahmut	Yozgat-23 years old	Ankara	Dormitory
Izzet	Afyon-24 years old	Afyonkarahisar	Dormitory
Eren	Sivas-21 years old	Gaziantep	House
Meral	Hatay-22 years old	Hatay	House
Tarık	Siirt-23 years old	Ankara	House
Engin	Antalya-25 years old	İstanbul	House
Adil	Edirne-25 years old	İstanbul	House
Süleyman	Osmaniye-25 years old	Ankara	Dormitory

Data Collection

After telling purposes of this thesis, the approval of these people are taken. Oral histories were recorded in a coffee shop these persons chose. They did not want to sign any written document, for this reason the permission of persons were taken orally. The real names of them were not used in thesis. The interviews were transcribed on Word documents on the computer.

Data Analysis

Oral historical sources are narrative sources. Therefore the analysis of oral history materials must avail itself of some of the general categories developed by narrative theory in literature and folklore (Portelli, 1991). This enables us to rethink the politics of the Gülen through the concrete experiences and narratives of the invisible actors; whose presence is acknowledged, yet whose voices cannot circulate within public discourses. We know that written sources are not always automatically reliable (Portelli, 1991). As a result, there may not be accurate and precise information on the publications of the congregation about the Gülen congregation because facts can be manipulated in written media.

Oral history has been about the fact that there's more to history than presidents and generals, and there's more to culture than the literary canon. These persons' imaginative errors expressed the shared subjective dreams, desires, and myths of the narrators. The discrepancy between fact and memory ultimately enhances the value of the oral sources as historical documents. It is not caused by faulty recollections (some of the motifs and symbols I found in oral narratives were

already present in embryo in coeval I written sources), but actively and creatively generated by memory and imagination in an effort sense of crucial events and of history in general (Portelli, 1991).

Oral history changes the writing of history much as the modern novel transformed the writing of literary fiction; the most important change is that the narrator is now pulled into the narrative and becomes a part of the story. This is not just a grammatical shift from the third to the first person, but a whole new narrative attitude. The narrator is now one of the characters, and a telling of the story is part of story being told (Portelli, 1991). This oral history project will change a lot of things written about the Gülen community. Oral sources tell us not just what people did, "but what they wanted to do, what they believed they were doing and what they now think they did. These persons' memories are not a passive depository of facts but an active process of creation of meanings (Portelli, 1991).

After gathering dates, these questions were used in this study:

What was the expectations of these persons before entering in the congregation? What motivates these persons' expectations? What are their expectations after entering in the congregation? How had they entered the Gülen religious order? How is the curriculum being implemented at home and dormitories of this religious order? What are functions of "brothers" (imams with supervisory responsibilities) of houses and dormitories? Do they have control over the human body? How are the relations between the sexes described? That how identity is established was going to figure out. Thus, effort in this thesis is to make life histories and oral narratives fit into the pattern of historical discourse.

A Brief History of The Researcher

I was born in 1984 as the sixth child of a family with six siblings in Sultandağ county of Afyon, Karapınar town. I was the only student in the village to be admitted to Kütahya Simav boarding school. I started middle school on a free state boarding school in Simav county of Kütahya. Simav county, the place that I had come to, thinking it could be different, was a place where there were lots of community schools. Even though I was staying in the state dormitory, most of my friends from dormitory were going to Gülen community houses to study. Most of the teachers in the dormitory were also known for their affinity to the Gülen community. Twenty-year-old university students from the community were coming to the dormitory, buying us sweets and sitting with us as if we were big, grown men to have conversation with us and listen to our problems. I was brought up in a family of six siblings and they were giving the attention to us that we had never seen in the family, society or classroom. For the first time, I was feeling that we were paid attention to and considered important by such grown-up people. As most of my friends were coming from similar conditions, they were admiring that attention. Almost all of the boarding school was poor village children who did not receive a decent amount of money from their families. They were caring much about the very bright ones among us, helping with our studies and preparing us for the high school exams. Besides that, they were having us start performing prayers, and read Said Nursi's Epistles and explaining them to us. Those of us who were successful were referred to the private teaching institutions of the community. I left community houses and brothers a while later. After high school exams, I was admitted to Usak – Eşme Anatolian High School For Teachers (Eşme Anadolu Öğretmen Lisesi). The

school also had free boarding dormitory, but the head teacher told us that the school and the dormitory were new and therefore we would pay 150 TL. Even though I had the right to stay in free state dormitory, because they asked for money, first I enrolled in the school and then had to leave, as we could not pay that money. My father was a primary school graduate who had engaged in farming for years and lived in the village. As he could not seek our rights, he took me out of the school. I went back to Simav to the boarding high school again. As the English language education was very poor in this school, I graduated without learning much. When I started Boğaziçi University's Turkish Language and Literature department, I was very hopeful about the future; however, as I came with a very poor background, I started the prep year as a beginner. As I had come with a poor English language background, I repeated the prep year. I stayed at the school dormitory again when I was in my remedial year, but I could not pay the fee of any month. Moreover, my scholarships had been cancelled as I was required to repeat the prep year. I was the only student to go to university among the family with six siblings, but due to economical and psychological obstacles, it was difficult for me to continue with my education. As I have never had enough emotional support from my family, I had to take care of this problem on my own as well. On the other hand, Gülen community dormitories were the only option for me to stay, to pass the English proficiency exam at Boğaziçi. Including the Gülen community dormitory, I stayed at 3 different community houses and dormitories. Thanks to the lectures given at the dormitory of the Gülen community, I passed the prep year for English at Boğaziçi. I think always how the community achieves forming this political identity and subjectivity. It was always going to remain at the back of my mind.

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS

Serkan comes from a poor family in the Black Sea region. He made his own toys of wood when he was little because his family could not buy him toys. In the last year of primary school, he saw his classmates who had been doing worse than him at school previously outscoring him by going to private teaching institutions (these are institutions that students go to, in addition to the traditional school). As he could not go to a private teaching institution, he could only get accepted to an Imam-Hatip middle school. In Turkey, there have been many private teaching institutions owned by religious communities. In middle school, his family pushed to adjust their budget so he could go to a private teaching institution but because everyone was aware of the repressive power of the military on the government, he went to another private teaching institution rather than a religious one. Later, he got accepted to an Anatolian high school where successful students were picked and the language of the education was English. In high school he was a shy kid who wanted to be an engineer. He used to read books about masonry and the deep state in the last year of high school. During the first years, he stayed with a religious community other than Gülen. He focused on religious topics there and his education became of secondary importance.

I wanted to know the truth. When you are questioning things, you neglect your education. You no longer have expectations about your life. My course does not mean anything, anyway. But if someone asked me what I would study now, I would say history or theology.³

³ Gerçeği bilmek istiyordum. Bir takım şeyleri sorgularken dersleri salıyorsun. Hayattan beklentin kalmıyor. Zati okuduğum bölüm bir şey ifade etmiyor. Ama şu an ne okursun deseler tarih veya ilahiyat diyebiliriz.

I would like to say these as a person who stayed in various religious community dormitories: The biggest problem of a student who leaves her/his family to come to Istanbul is economical. S/he needs cheap accommodation. Religious community dormitories are the most convenient places in this sense. In state dormitories, floors are usually concrete and not carpeted or anything else. The rooms and toilets are not in a high state of cleanliness as the ones in the community dormitories. Sometimes, there are problems regarding security in the state dormitories. For this reason, they witness fights between leftist and rightist students. In community houses, daily time is organized according to the prayer times and the daily practices of the students are inspected by students called “brothers” and charged by the community. In community dormitories or houses, it is almost impossible to act in a way that disturbs your roommate's sleep or keeps them from studying. Some of the students in state dormitories chat in their room at night and use the internet, leaving the lights on. In crowded state dormitories, it is much more difficult to physically get motivated on studies and live in an organized way. While community dormitories are catered, students staying at state dormitories have to buy their own food outside.

Serkan, who knows all of these:

I stayed with my friends and it was not a place for study, so I left and moved to the community.⁴

The alcohol and smoking ban is strongly applied in the houses and dormitories. The ones who obey the rules can stay for cheaper, if their economic conditions are also bad. The relationships inside the community changes according

⁴ Kendi arkadaşlarımla kaldım ders çalışma yoktu o yüzden çıktım cemaate gittim.

to how useful you are to the community. The ones who find donations and donors to the community can rise to a better position.

They are not very strict but they want the rich to be from them. All the rich should be from them. Because I was smoking, I did not have any discount. They realized I was smoking in a few months, anyway. They were giving a dirty look at me, anyway. Usually they used to smoke at school, but this attitude was because I was smoking in the house, too. For instance, if you sign up 5 people for *Zaman* (newspaper), you are the best man. Or, if you have people to donate sacrificial animals, you are the best man. You know what, you can even be a regional leader. The ones who deserve to be a brother are few.⁵

Even though he studies physics, Serkan believes that studying theology is better now, so he expects religion to be applied more sincerely in society. Despite the physical and social conditions provided by the community to the students, he expects more sincere relationships instead of pragmatic profits.

Serkan: Freedom is important, sincerity is important.

Sabri: Fethullah Gülen is crying in his sermons and makes many people cry, too. Have you ever cried?

Serkan: I have never cried. None of the community leaders have affected me.

Serkan: Our prophet had the glances, glances that made you understand many things. Is there anyone having those glances anymore? I have said before, America killed lots of Muslims. It is a pain in the neck for the entire Middle East. I have said that Russia is better than America, but it is difficult to make them believe that Russia is better than America.⁶

Selim grew up in a poor family and they were 5 siblings. He went to boarding school in Ağrı for primary and middle school. He earned his pocket money selling

⁵ Çok katı değiller ama zenginler onlardan olsun. Tüm zenginler onlardan olsun. Sigara içtiğimden öyle indirim falan olmadı. Zaten sigara içtiğim bir iki ayda anlaşıldı. Zaten ondan sonra ters bi gözle bakıldı. Genelde onlar okulda içerdi ama ben evde de içtiğim için. Mesela 5 tane kişi Zaman üyesi yaparsan senden ala adam yok. Ya da kurban da 3 tane tosuncuk bağışlatırsan senden ala adam yok. Bölge liderleri var ya ona bile getirilirsin. Abiliği hakeden az.

⁶ Serkan: Serbestlik önemli, samimiyet önemli.

Sabri: Fethullah Gülen vaazlarında ağlıyor ve bir çoğunu da ağlatıyor sen ağladın mı hiç?

Serkan: Ben hiç ağlamadım. Beni etkileyen her hangi bir cemaat lideri olmadı.

Serkan: Peygamberimizin bakışları varmış bakışlarından çok şey anladım. Şimdi öyle bakışı olan var mı? Ben dedim Amerika o kadar Müslüman öldürdü. Ortadoğu'dan herkesin başına bela. Rusya daha iyidir Amerika'dan dedim ama Rusya'nın ABD 'den iyi olduğunu inandırmak zor.

bagels in summer. He earned the money for the private teaching institution working in summer. He finished high school in a school that did not promise any future and had a lot of violence. He was an innocuous person and for that reason, his teachers liked him. He was supposed to study fashion design at university. He tells how he joined the community:

It's an expensive course, you are supposed to buy a lot of paints and brushes and if the instructor doesn't like them, they go to the bin. I realized I was drinking a lot with friends. I should have stayed at Service (Hizmet), at least not to drink. There were useful things there, so people could improve themselves. But it depends on who you are with, too. Less money was supposed to be spent. I was going to study better. My family sent me to the west, I wasn't supposed to be a burden to them.⁷

The behaviours of the brothers in the community are important in that they reflect the perspective of the community on differences. Selim solves the problems stemming from a brother in the community by moving to another house with a different brother. The community is successful at teaching students some moral behaviours. Students realize some behavioural changes in themselves during their studies in community.

Selim: I read *Kirik Testi (Broken Pitcher)* and the books of Bediuzzaman. You read that book and it changes you. For instance, when I had seen something on the ground, I would have taken it. Let's say I saw a nice pencil, I would take it and put it in my pocket. After I saw Service (Hizmet), I wouldn't take that pencil and put it in my pocket, for example. Because I perform my five prayers, I cannot do that. The course is expensive and the pencils are not cheap ones. I cannot take a pencil that costs 70-80 Liras, because I perform prayers.⁸

⁷ Pahalı bölüm bir sürü boya alıyorsun fırça alıyorsun hoca beğenmezse çöpe atıyorsun. Arkadaşlarla baktım ki çok içiyorum böyle. Hizmette kalayım bari içmem. Faydalı şeyler vardı orda olan insan kendini geliştirebilir. Ama çevresindeki insanlara da bağlı. Az para gidecekti. Daha iyi ders çalışacaktım. Ailem batıya göndermiş aileme yük olmamam gerekiyor.

⁸ Selim: Kırık Testi'yi okudum Bediüzzaman hazretlerinin kitaplarını okudum. Sen okuyorsun o kitabı o kitap seni değiştiriyor. Mesela ben yerde bir şey görünce alırdım. Bir kalem gördüm güzel alırdım atardım cebime. Hizmeti gördükten sonra o kalemi alıp atmadım cebime mesela. Çünkü ben namaz kılıyorum yapamam öyle. Bölüm pahalı aldığımız kalemler ucuz kalemler değil böyle yani. 70-80 liralık kalem alamam çünkü namaz kılıyorum.

He is aware of the physical and motivating conditions provided by the community for poor students. It provides religious development for someone who did not research religious topics before.

Selim: I wake up for the morning payer and after that start studying. When I wasn't in Service (Hizmet), I used to sleep until noon. There is an order in Hizmet. If I had money, I would help people there, too. I learnt so much there to be honest, I learnt reading and thinking about religion there.⁹

Male-female relationships is an area in community where patriarchal relationships are reproduced. Women are only seen as sexual objects and an effort is made to prevent matters like love from being talked about. This effort causes confused and conflicting behaviours in students. The pressure on male clothing is really obvious.

Conversations about women did not take place. I didn't have a girlfriend when I was in Service (Hizmet). While I was in Service (Hizmet), I was thinking whether to have intercourse or not. I would, if I wasn't in Service (Hizmet), so I got out of it. I needed a girl. Praying and having intercourse at the same time would bother me. Why would I have intercourse if I was praying. I wanted to be comfortable when I was out. They say that your arms cannot be open like that and I say men go on pilgrimage like this, half-open. He wouldn't talk to the girl next to him. Intention is what matters. If you are looking with an evil eye, it wouldn't matter if you performed prayers or not.¹⁰

Poverty, unemployment and the bad conditions of workers made him lose his hopes about life, like many other graduates. As people who have religious faith, at least he wants to save himself the afterlife.

⁹ Selim: Sabah namazda kalkıyorum otur dersine çalış ben hizmette olmayınca öğlene kadar uyuyordum. Hizmetteyken bir düzen var. Param olsa ben de oradakilere yardım ederim. Ben orda çok şey de öğrendim Allah da var. Dini konuları okumayı ve düşünmeyi orda öğrendim.

¹⁰ Karı-kız muhabbeti olmazdı. Hizmetteyken sevgilim yoktu. Hizmetteyim ilişkiye gireyim mi girmeyeyim düşünüyorum böyle. Hizmette olmasaydım girerdim ama. Hizmetten çıktım. Kıza ihtiyacım vardı. Hem namaz kılacam hem de gidip ilişkiye girecem. Bu beni çok rahatsız etti. Ben namaz kılıyorsam niye ilişkiye giriyorum. Çıkınca rahat hareket edeyim. Diyor böyle kolun açık olamaz diyorum adam gidiyor ya hacca böyle yarı açık. Önündeki kızla konuşmuyordu. Önemli olan niyet. Kötü gözle baktıktan sonra istersen namaz kıl.

I am almost 27 and when I look back, I cannot see anything, everything is temporary. I don't want to risk afterlife for a few things.¹¹

Mahmut grew up in a middle class family. They were 3 siblings and the eldest one is an engineer now. Mahmut has always been successful at the schools he went to. He graduated from a good Anatolian high school. He describes his family as conservative and rightist. But he says that he, himself is not much interested in politics. His mother performs prayer 5 times a day. He joined the community via the private institution he went to in high school. He started reading the books that the community advised.

Books like *Kendini Arayan Adam (The Man Searching for Himself)*. If someone was reading, the others were reading, too. There was a reading culture. I had 8-9 books. I don't remember many books.¹²

They come across a teacher model who establishes a close relationship with them, does sports and has a good time with them, instead of the ones in the state schools who only give the lecture, do not establish a personal relationship and usually only care about their salary. These teachers work for a purpose and make sacrifices along with their salaries. This different teacher model is a teacher that the students have never met before. For this reason, students take them as a model.

I was learning more by taking someone as a model rather than reading. Modelling valuable people was one of my main principles. Their positive energy, motivation, positiveness, peppiness, how they approach you and how you spend time with them...¹³

Mahmut talking about one of his teachers in the community:

He was such an honest and generous teacher, he was spending an incredible amount of money. He was spending his budget and life for us. People made it

¹¹ Yaşım 27 merdiven dayamış arkama bakınca bir şey yok, her şey geçici. Ben birkaç şey yüzünden öbür hayatımı riske atmak istemiyorum.

¹² Kendini Arayan Adam o tarz kitaplar. Biri okuyorsa diğeri de okuyordu kitap okuma kültürü vardı. Benim 8-9 tane kitabım vardı. Çok kitap hatırlamıyorum

¹³ Daha çok okuyarak değil birilerini model olarak öğreniyordum. Kıymetli insanları modellemek temel ayaklarımdan biriydi. Pozitif enerjisi, motive edişi, pozitif oluşu, enerjik oluşu, hocanın nasıl karşıladığı, nasıl vakit geçirdiğin.

to Boğaziçi and Bilkent thanks to his efforts, not everyone can make it to those universities. He was moral and meticulous. You couldn't swear in his presence, you wouldn't. He had a sensitive approach to women. We would have football games with him. He was a man of grace and courtesy. We would have meal and parties, bringing food from home was a part of sharing-focused high morality. They were ideal, positive people.¹⁴

Male-female relationships would be maintained in the way the community required. Male students would be kept away from the world of females with sports, trips and religious talks. The students internalize this.

I didn't have relationships with girls, there were a lot of people around me. I was very active and men were enough for me, brother. I don't have a close female friend at university, they are all men. I haven't fallen in love with anybody.¹⁵

İzzet grew up in a family with 7 siblings. His family lives in the village and they are poor. They grew up with patched trousers and ripped shoes. Sometimes they used to wear the same trousers they bought for 1-2 years. He went to boarding vocational high school and he is a graduate of a 2-year higher education institution (he is a graduate of 2-year university-based programme). He stayed in the community dormitory and went to the community private teaching institution to pass Public Personnel Selection Exam (KPSS). He is attributing his bad conditions in general to his family being uneducated and poor.

It was to save the day and get by the short hairs of the state, but we couldn't find it either. I was actually hopeful in high school. Because we were in vocational high school, our score were halving in the university exam. Our family did not advise us. If I had gone to a regular high school, my life would

¹⁴ Çok dürüst çok cömert bir hocaydı inanılmaz derecede para harcıyordu. Bütçesini hayatını bize harcıyordu. Gerçekten onun vesilesi Boğaziçi'ni ve Bilkent'i kazandı, herkes kazanamaz. Ahlaklı, titizdi onun yanında küfür edemezdin, etmezdin. Bayanlara karşı hassas yaklaşımı, futbol maçları yapardık, zerafet ve nezaket insanıydı. Yemek partileri yapardık evde, paylaşımcı yüksek ahlakın parçalarıydı. İdeal insan pozitif insanlardı

¹⁵ Kızlarla ilişkim yok, çok fazla insan vardı çevremde çok aktiftim erkekler yetiyordu abi. Üniversitede yakın arkadaşım kız yok, hepsi erkek. Kimseye aşık olmadım.

have been different. My family had the fault. I am in this situation now, because there was nobody educated around me.¹⁶

He is talking about how he joined the community and the rules:

I went to a private teaching institution at the age of 25, to prepare for KPSS. Because there was no place to stay in Afyon, they said they would arrange it. I stayed in the dormitory owned by Fethullah Gülen. When you step into the dormitory, you take off your shoes first. They check your clothes, you are not allowed to wear jeans. You cannot smoke in the dormitory. Performing prayers five times is considered as doing sports. They told me I had to participate in these. They asked me how I got along with religion. They made me sign a contract stating that I would be kicked out of the dormitory if I didn't obey one of the rules. I made a contract stating that I would be kicked out of the dormitory if I smoked, did not pray five times a day and did not attend the activities. There wasn't much pressure in the first dormitory I stayed, but there was in the last one. You are not supposed to come inebrious, you are not supposed to smoke and you are not supposed to arrive after 11 pm. They used to wake us up at 5 am to attend sports sessions. If they were making you perform Tesbihat¹⁷, morning prayers would last 1.5 hours.¹⁸

It is impossible to stay in a community dormitory if you are not performing prayers. Even if you are not made to sign a contract as in this example, everyone knows the unwritten rules. Daily life practices are entirely and strictly controlled by the community. Gülen community is aware that if the entire daily life practices of a person are controlled, be it in the dorm or in houses, it is possible to reshape and

¹⁶ Günümüzü kurtarmak için kendimi devlete dayamak için onu da bulmuş değiliz . Aslında lisede umutluydu. Biz meslek liseli olduğumuz için üniversite sınavında yarı yarıya düşüyordu. Ailemiz yönlendirmedi. Düz liseye gitseydim hayatım çok farklı olacaktı. Ailemde hata vardır, çevremde okumuş insanların olmayışı, beni bu durumlara getirdi.

¹⁷ Tesbihat is the act of chanting for God after daily prayers.

¹⁸ KPSS hazırlanmak için 25 yaşında dershaneye gittim. Afyon'da kalacak yer olmadığı için onlarda ayarlarız dediler. Fethullah yurduna ait yurttan kaldım. Yurda girdiğinde önce ayakkabıyı çıkartıyorlar. Üst baş kontrolü yapıyorlar, kot pantolon giyemiyorsun. Yurttan sigara içemiyorsun. 5 vakit namaz spor olarak geçiyor. Bunlara katılmak zorundasın dediler. Dinle aran nasıl diye sordular. Herhangi bir kurala uymadığın taktirde yurttan atılacaksın diye bir sözleşme imzalattılar. Sigara içtiğim taktirde, namazları kılmadığım taktirde, etkinliklere katılmadığım taktirde yurttan atılacağımı söyleyen bir sözleşme yaptım. İlk kaldığım yurttan fazla baskı yoktu bu son kaldığımda vardı. Alkollü gelinmeyecek sigara içilmeyecek 11'den sonra gelinmeyecek. Sporlara katılacaksınız diye. Sabah 5'te kaldırırlardı. Tesbihatı kaldırırlarsa sabah namazı 1,5 saat sürüyordu.

recreate him/her as a new person. Eren's mother is a woman who prays five times a day. She sent all of her kids to Quran courses at young ages. They are not comfortable with the fact that religion is being interpreted by only Fethullah Gülen and Bediuzzaman. The control on how the students should use their bodies is striking. Eren explains:

So far as we know, in talks, the life of the prophet is supposed to be told. They constantly go on about Fethullah Hodja Efendi is this and that, they only tell stories about his life. There is tolerance in our religion, but there is no tolerance in this dormitory. For instance, Christians go to the church on Sunday, we need to respect, but they wouldn't. They would say "Look, here's the infidels". I had long hair, the guys were giving me weird looks. I grew goatee, they told me it didn't look nice on me. I used to wear sleeveless clothes and they would never approve of that. They were looking for an excuse to entirely externalize. Normally, they take people who are like themselves.¹⁹

Socialization areas are restricted to sports, especially football, religious talks and visits to other dormitories of the community in Ramadan. Male-female relationships are condemned.

They take snacks and coke, go to their rooms and have religious conversations to attract people. If you want to go to a cafe outside, they don't allow you. If you don't go to the mosque, they give you weird looks. You check on girls, the brother hears about it immediately. You don't have much of a social life. According to their views, you are going to keep away from girls, fast, perform your prayers and wear fabric trousers. In Ramadan, you get invitations and go to other dormitories to have fun. There were invitations from restaurants and we would go to those. Every week, at certain times, we had astro pitch football games with brothers. Those were the most frequent activities.²⁰

¹⁹ Bizim bildiğimiz sohbetlerde peygamberin hayatı anlatılır. Sürekli Fethullah hoca efendi söylemiş de sırf onun hayatından kesitler anlatılır. Dinimizde hoş görü vardır ama bu yurttan hiç hoş görü yoktur. Mesela Hıristiyanlar cumartesi kiliseye gidecek saygı duymak lazım değil ama onlar duymazdı. Vay elin gavuru böyle elin gavuru şöyle derlerdi. Mesela benim saçım uzundu. Adamlar bana tuhaf tuhaf bakıyorlardı. Top sakal bırakıyordum yakışmamış diyorlardı. Yani çok hoş bakmıyorlardı. Sıfır kol giyerdim hiç hoş bakmıyorlardı. Tam dışlamak için bahane arıyorlardı. Ha normalde bunlar kendilerine yakın kişileri alıyorlar

²⁰ Kolayı çerezi alıp odalara geçip kendilerine çekmek için dini içerikli sohbetler yapıyorlar. Dışarıya kahveneye gidersen kahveneye göndermezler. Camiye gitmezsin değişik bakarlar. Karı-kıza bakarsın hemen abinin kulağına gider fazla sosyal hayatın yok. Onlara göre karıya kıza bakmayacaksın orucunu tutacaksın. Namazını kılacaksın. Kumaş pantolon giyeceksin. Ramazanda eğlenceli oluyor başka yurtlara davet oluyor başka yurtlara gidiyorsun. Restoranlardan davet oluyordu davetlere gidiyorduk. Haftanın belli zamanlarında abilerle halı saha maçları oluyordu. En fazla yapılan aktiviteler bunlardı.

They feel a lot of pressure even on the music they listen to and their tastes.

We were going to the astro pitch and I was listening to Indian music when he asked me why I was listening to the music of infidels, for instance. The one who said that was supposed to be our teacher. I replied saying that our religion is the religion of tolerance and he shouldn't look at things like that. I reminded him that he is a hafiz and he is supposed to have tolerance for people.²¹

At the beginning, students are free to choose their roommates but the community places its own brother in every room. Brothers are the most important element of the control mechanism.

We selected rooms and we were staying with 4 people we agreed to. A week after that, they changed our rooms. They placed what I call agents. Before that, you could smoke secretly in your room, but now you had no chance to do it, as there were those men in your room.²²

Religious curriculum had an invisible discipline. He is talking about how the students participated in religious talks:

They place a chair in the middle. People are entirely focused with their arms crossed while he is talking. For instance, he is talking about a topic in Q&A mode, catechizing. Normally, they are the ones talking all the time. Nobody dares to talk because they are afraid of being told off, if they say something wrong. They don't get involved. You only get involved if they directly ask you about your personal opinion.²³

Meral grew up in a family where her mother and father had problems. Her parents were civil servants and they did not have big economical problems, but they were arguing every day. She was always upset by the fact that her father was

²¹ Halı sahaya gidiyorduk Hindistan müziği idi gavur müziğini niye dinliyorsun dedi mesela. Bunu söyleyen belletmen başımızda. Ben de dedim bizim dinimizi hoş görü dinidir böyle bakarsanız olmaz dedim. İnsanları hafız insansınız insanlara hoşgörü ile bakmanız lazım dedim.

²² Odalar seçtik anlaştığın dört kişi ile kalıyordun aradan bir hafta geçti bizim odaları değiştirdiler. Ben ajan diye tabir ediyim aralara yerleştirdiler. Arada gizli sigara içebiliyordun odanda adamalar olduğu için yapma şansın yoktu.

²³ Ortaya bir tane sandalye koyuyorlar. Herkes pür dikkat ellerini kollarını bağlamış o adam anlatıyor mesela soru cevap şeklinde mesela bir konu anlatıyor böyle yaparsanız böyle olur gibi. Normalde sürekli onlar anlatıyorlar. Bir şey deriz de bizi terslerler mi diye kimse bir şey konuşmuyor. Müdahil olmuyorlar. Sen ne düşünürsün derse ancak o şekilde müdahil oluyorsun.

oppressive and stingy. Because her grandparents brought her up until she was 6½, she thought they were her parents. She was unhappy to move into her parents' house in primary school. She compensated for the lack of love from her family with the love of God.

I don't have a real relationship with my mother and father. My mother used to follow me at school. My father was indifferent. He was very good outside, extrovert. But not to us, he used to beat my mother a lot and me, too. He would act as if he was a drunk man, couldn't have been worse if he was drunk. He is usually stingy, doesn't give money. He doesn't accept me, doesn't say he loves me. I only witnessed that a few times in my life.²⁴

I used to go to Quran courses in summer when I went to the village, just the things I heard from them. If it wasn't for them, I would be miserable. I couldn't have saved myself. Islam has a lot of benefits, there is no such thing as getting lost in Islam. The worst thing for a human is to just vanish, the fact that there is nothing after this world. I don't know, I mean the fact that I cannot come to this world again. There is no point of living. As the notion of afterlife forms, as I know that God loves me... I know my family doesn't love me but God loves me.²⁵

She came across the community in the talks she went to in high school and maintained her relationship in the private teaching institution. She stayed in their house for a short period. At university, she broke her connection with the community. She felt suffocated by the community controlling her entire life. She is describing the community sisters:

The ones that always have books of Said Nursi and Fethullah Gülen in their hands. Those who can stay when there is compulsory book reading. For instance, it bores me to stay in the same environment and have the same talks, because I have nothing to learn. Don't know, like those who can postpone their family affairs, or come early to serve them. She should come when she is told

²⁴ Annemle babamla ilişkim diye bir şey yok annem okulda arkamdan takip ederdi. Babam çok ilgisiz. Dışarıya açık çok iyi ama bize karşı öyle değil annemi çok döverdi beni döverdi. İçki içmiş adam gibi içse bu kadar olmaz. Genelde böyle pinti. Para vermez. Beni kabullenmez. Seni seviyorum demez hayatımda birkaç kere denk geldim.

²⁵ Yazın köye gittiğimde kuran kursuna gittikçe onlardan ne kadar duyduysam. Onlar olmasaydı o bataklığın içine sürüklenirdim. Kurtulamazdım yani. İslamiyet çok faydası var İslamiyet'te kaybolma diye bir şey yok. İnsan için en kötü şey yok olma bu dünyadan sonra olmaması. Ne bilim yani tekrar dünyaya gelmicek olmam. Yaşamamın hiçbir anlamı yok. Ahiret kavramı oluştuğu Allah'ın beni sevdiğini bildikçe ailem beni sevmiyor ama Allah beni seviyor biliyorum.

to, and go again when she is told to Those kinds of people. They cannot take me out whenever they want to.²⁶

As a woman who received oppression in her family, she made a lot of observations and has been in very different groups. According to what she said, her boyfriend in middle school was a rambler. This is how she describes male-female relationships and criticizes the community:

I don't think this is the right way. Everyone should make mistakes so they can find the right thing. Of course, this has to be controlled, it shouldn't be too intimate when you are talking to men or women. Nowadays, flirting means going out for two days and leaving on the third day. If you are flirting in the community, there are sisters or brothers around you. You cannot talk about love there, even internet is forbidden. And, you cannot have an ordinary talk on the phone, you have to explain to your sister who you are talking to.²⁷

Currently, Meral is an active woman in the Grey Wolves and she believes that being together with men provides women with self-esteem in social life.

And there is this thing, it is empowering to be among men. At least empowering for women. You become more down-to-earth, this doesn't affect one in a bad way. For this reason, the Grey Wolves made a good impact on me.²⁸

As someone who knows about Gülen community and various conservative rightist parties, she witnessed the biggest marginalization in Kemalist groups. They did not take her to their meeting because Meral was turbaned.

We don't think that the Atatürkist Ideology Association (Atatürkçü Düşünce Derneği) is a reliable group. For one thing, they are too bigoted. They are

²⁶ Sürekli elinde Said Nursi, Fethullah Gülen kitabı olan. Zorunlu kitap okuma olduğu zaman kalabilecek. Aynı ortamın içinde aynı muhabbetleri yapıyor olmak beni sıkıyor mesela. Çünkü öğrencim bir şey yok. Ne bileyim ailesini erteyebilecek. Veya erken gelip onlara hizmet edebilecek. Gel diyince gelecek git diyince gidecek. Öyle insanlar. Beni isteyen istediği yerde dışarı çıkartamaz.

²⁷ Bence öyle doğru değil herkes yanlış yapmalı ki doğruyu bulabilsin. Tabi bunu kontrol etmek lazım. Çok içli dışlı olmadığı sürece kadınlarla da konuşmazsın erkeklerle de. Günümüzün flörtü 2 gün gezip 3. gün bırakma. Cemaatte de flört ediyorsan abi ya da abladır. Orda aşkların konuşmazsın. Hatta internet bile yasak. Telefonla da alalede konuşamazlar. Konuşurken hesap verirler. Kimle konuştuklarını ablalarına.

²⁸ Biraz da şey erkeklerin içinde bulunmak kuvvet veriyor. Kadına kuvvet veriyor en azından. Daha ayakları yere basan, bu insanı kötü etkilemiyor. Ülkü ocakları bu nedenle bende iyi etki bıraktı.

much more fascist than those people who call us fascists. They are formalist and they don't take you in.²⁹

Tarik was born into a family of 8 siblings in Istanbul, without economical problems. His 5 sisters recited the Quran. He came across the Gülen community in the private teaching institution, while he was in high school. He was bad at school before, but he received a certificate of achievement, thanks to the private institution he went to. He stayed in the community houses at university. This is how he describes his high school period:

I was alone when I was a teenager. I always felt alone. From the age of 16 to the age of 19, I was alone in a crowd. I don't like talking about my private life, so I wanted to keep to myself. I became more shy in my 2nd year of high school. I was going to the private teaching institution in the last year. I received a certificate of achievement.³⁰

The people I interviewed generally go to shopping malls, bazaars and historical places. Building a career is very important for some of them.

There was a shopping mall, we used to have picnics and went to Nevşehir and so. We went to seminars. I participated in programs. I went to a computer course at the weekends. We were staying there as 5 friends, taking photos.³¹

Tarik stayed in the community house for 5 years. He describes having no male-female relationship as normal:

Tarik: My male-female relationships were normal. I did my best not to have a girlfriend. I chose not to fall in love with a girl. I think at the moment it is early. And if I fall in love after today, I would plan for marriage. I should finish university first.

Sabri: Why do you think so?

²⁹ Atatürkçü Düşünce Dernek'i bizce çok sağlam bir gurup değil. Bir kere çok bağınazlar. Bize faşist diyen insanlardan çok çok daha faşistler. Şekilciler, içlerine bile almıyorlar.

³⁰ Ergenken yalnızdım. Hep yalnız hissederdim. 16'dan 19 yaşına kadar kalabalıklar içinde yalnızdım. Özel hayatımı anlatmayı sevmiyorum. O yüzden sadece kendimde kalmasını istiyorum. Lise 2'de daha çok çekingen oldum. Son sınıfta dershaneye gidiyordum. Teşekkür aldım.

³¹ AVM vardı, piknik yapardık Nevşehir'e falan gittik. Semierlere gittik. Programlara katıldım. Hafta sonu bilgisayar kursuna gittim. 5 kişi kalıyorduk, fotoğraflar çekiyorduk.

Tarık: Because I aim to build a career. As I want to build a career, I have put love at the end of the list. It's going to happen after university, because you cannot run away from it always.³²

He thinks society should be controlling the male-female relationships and he considers those who do not live according to his beliefs abnormal.

How should I put it? I believe one shouldn't go beyond a line regarding traditions. There should be a level. I see wrong things happening in the parks, I don't want to see those. I think they should be respectful to people. Excuse me but they are participating in very wrong activities in the middle of the street. I definitely don't approve those. In parks, at the sea coasts... If you are going to do it, do it indoors.³³

Engin was born into a family where the father was a civil servant, in Antalya. His mother would pray five times a day and his father would go to the Friday prayers regularly. He witnessed how the people engaged in agricultural work changed as Antalya became a touristic city. He describes the class change:

We didn't even say we were hungry when we were. But the people around me, became very spoiled in a way that I don't know how to describe, when they got richer. Inadvertently, I became a part of it. I didn't use to spend a lot. I used to lend money but wouldn't pursue it back. When I asked for it, I would be the bad guy.³⁴

Engin went to a high school owned by the community and stayed in the dormitory for two years. At university, he maintained his relationship with it for a short period.

³² Tarık: Kadın erkek ilişkilerim normaldi. Sevgilim olmaması için elimden geleni yaptım. Bir kıza aşık olmamayı tercih ettim. Şu an erken olduğunu düşünüyorum. Eğer olursam da bugünden sonra evlilik diye düşünüyorum. Üniversiteyi bitiriyim ondan sonra. Sabri: Neden böyle düşünüyorsun.

Tarık: Çünkü ben kariyer yapma peşindeyim. Kariyer yapmak istediğim için aşk ilişkilerini sona bıraktım. Üniversite bittikten sonra gönül bu boş durmuyor bazen.

³³ Geleneğe göre nasıl diyim çok fazla abartıya kaçmamak gerektiğine. Seviyeli olmalı. Parklarda çok yanlış şeyler görüyorum görmek istemiyorum. İnsanlara saygılı olmaları gerektiğini düşünüyorum çok afedersin ama sokak ortasında çok yanlış hareketler yapıyorlar. Kesinlikle bunları tasvip etmiyorum. Parklarda deniz kenarında sahilde falan yapacaksa da kapalı ortamda yapsın.

³⁴ Biz karnımız açken, karnımız aç demezdik. Ama çevremdekiler bir anda maddi kaynakları fazlalaşınca. Adını koyamadığım bir şımarıklığın içine girdiler. İstemediğim halde bu durumun parçası oldum. Çok para harcamazdım. Borç verirdim ardına düşmezdim, isterdim isteyince kötü adam olurdu ama ben.

People in the community feel close to me. I didn't try to be close to them on purpose. I told their mistakes to them, face to face, for many times. For instance, their conservatism and approaches to people who are not religionist. I still say that, I haven't been among people who call themselves “-ist”. I didn't prefer that. I didn't divide people as rightist, leftist or communist. I was afraid of one thing when I was studying there, what if someday, someone reacts to me saying I am one of their people or vice versa? I never wanted anybody to own me.³⁵

He explains his reasons for leaving the community:

I had to break my ties with some of them. They showed me that they liked me on the condition that I would be in their group. I am not keeping in touch with them but I don't get cross with someone because they are some -ist or they do this and that. I repeat it, they have been in my help a lot and I have been in their help a lot, too. What can I say? There could have been an offer from another community and I could have gone there if it had made sense.³⁶

As a believer, Engin is in the pursuit of a sincere Islam. He desires for a more democratic, more tolerant Islam that stands besides the poor. He criticizes the community over these aspects.

At the points where I came to them with 100% objective data and told them it wasn't the way to go, they would act with herd psychology and tell me “no that is not right, this one is right”, for example. I support the ideal of being a helpful person in everything, unconditionally. They help people whom they feel closer to and I was very upset by that. When they admit someone to the dormitory or to the school... Some of the received income and donations are used so loutishly – well, I don't really think they are abusing but this is an abuse, too – they tend to spend it easily. That was sticking in my mind and bothering me. A considerable amount of food was being catered in some places, for the motivation meetings.

If you are that helpful, there are loads of hungry people in the world. Instead of spending the money here, you could help there. There is someone living around Taksim that I assume needs help. I saw a man living on the streets. I asked them to help him but they didn't. They didn't prioritize it, said this and

³⁵ Cemaatteki insanlar beni yakın olarak görürler. Ben ne özellikle onlara yakın olmaya çalıştım. Hatalarını yüzlerine açıkça çok vurdum. Mesela yani tutucu olmaları, dindar olmayan insanlara yaklaşımları. Ben hala söylüyorum sonunda şucu, bucu diye biten insanların içinde olmadım. Olmayı tercih etmedim. Kimseyi sağcı, solcu, komünist diye ayırmadım. Orda okurken de şundan korkuyordum ilerde birinin bana onun insanısın diyip tepki gösterir mi tam tersi yaşanır mı? Birilerinin beni sahiplenmesini asla istemedim

³⁶ Belli başlı olanlarla koparmak zorunda kaldım. Beni o grubun içinde olmam şartı ile sevdiklerini bana gösterdiler. Onlarla görüşmüyorum ama şu adam sucuymuş şu adam şunu yapıyormuş diye küsmem yani. Benim üzerimde hakları çoktur tekrar söylüyorum. Benim de onların üzerinde hakkım çoktur. Ne diyim atıyorum bilmem ne cemaatinde de teklif gelebilirdi. Mantıklı olması durumunda ben oraya da gidebilirdim.

that and just hampered it. I didn't believe the sincerity there. I just don't find them sincere anymore... If they heard me talking like that, they would say... shame on you. But they don't have the right to tell me that, because I was telling the same things when I was among them, too. I mean, there is no point of doing things just for the sake of doing them. There has to be sincerity in it. You don't worship for the sake of worshipping. You don't help for the sake of helping. You don't seem nice to be nice. Some things need to happen with sincerity.³⁷

He is aware of the fact that the community helps with the purpose of gaining power and rulership. He thinks it is not fair that the help is only being delivered to students. He deems that the solution to these problems is possible with the education of people one by one and an increase in the number of people who thinks like him.

These problems will not be solved unless there are millions who think like me. How they will not be solved lies in the nature of humans. It's in the nature of human to feed to the utmost. Again, feeding the closest ones to the utmost. Then, feeding those closest to them. After some point, just to feed for pleasure. Then, to feed out of love. I don't believe that it is possible to solve these, as long as people have the instinct to feed for this and that and as long as there is no effort to help at every moment, from people like me.³⁸

³⁷ Ben yüzde yüz objektif verilerle böyle yapılmaz dediğim noktalarda sürü psikolojisiydi hayır öyle değil böyle olucak derlerdi mesala. Ben koşulsuz şartsız her konuda yardım edecek bir insan olunması gerektiği taraftarıyım. Biraz daha kendilerine yakın insanlara yardımcı oluyorlar. Ve ben buna çok bozuluyordum. Yurda alırken okula alırken. Elde edilen bir takım gelirlerin, yardımların o kadar hoyratça aslında suistimal ettiklerini düşünmüyorum ama şu da bir su istimaldir. Biraz rahat harcayabiliyorlar. Ben ona çok takılıyordum. Motivasyon toplantıları için bir sürü yemek yeniyordu bir yerlerde.

Madem bu kadar yardım seversiniz. Dünyada bu kadar aç insan var. Oraya vereceğiniz parayla oraya yardım edin. Taksim tarafında yardıma muhtaç olduğumu düşündüğüm biri var. Sokakta yaşayan bir adam gördüm. Destek olmalarını istedim ama olmadılar. Öncelik göstermediler mesala bilmem ne bilmem ne yokuşa sürdüler. Ben ordaki samimiyete inanmadım. Artık samimi bulmuyorum yaa. Samimi bulmuyorum. Konuştuklarımı duysalar şey derler. Yazıklar olsun derler. Ama yazıklar olsun diyecek hakları yok bana. Çünkü ben onların içindeyken de söylüyordum. Yani bir şeyleri yapmış olmak için yapmanın anlamı yok. Samimiyet olmak zorunda. Ben samimi olduklarını düşünmüyorum. İbadet etmiş olmak için ibadet edilmez. Yardım etmiş olmak için yardım edilmez. Güzel olmak için güzel görünülmez. Bir şeylerin içtenlikle olması lazım.

³⁸ Bu sorunlar benim gibi düşünenlerden milyonlarca olmadığı sürece çözülmez nasıl çözülmez insanın doğasında. İnsanın doğasında alabildiğine doyurma. Yine yakınlarını alabildiğine doyurma Sonra onların çevresindekileri doyurma. Bir yerden sonra zevk için doyurma. Sonra aşk için doyurma. Bilmem ne için doyurma güdüsü olduğu sürece benim gibi insanların her an destek olma çabası olmadığı sürece. Bu işin çözülme şansı olduğuna inanmıyorum.

Adil grew up in a family where the father was a leftist and the mother's side valued religious principles. He lived inside of various different religious groups. He regularly reads the meaning of Quran. He spends his leisure time chatting with people from different countries on religion and politics on the internet. He is the only child of a family who lived in rented house for years, a working father and a housewife mother. He describes his family and himself:

My mother used to call me stupid when she saw me doing something stupid. Maybe it's the Turkish style of upbringing. I hear that in the West, they try to bring up their children as a free person and give them self-esteem. I read the meaning of Quran on my own, so I cannot get on the same page with others. People join communities and so on, I criticize the views of the community leader and so on... I cannot hold on to these.³⁹

He stayed in the community dormitory for 2 years when he was at university and this is how he explains the community house and the brother there:

He is strict, demanding for obedience to the rules of the house and wants you to sit and behave. You need to internalize the rules to the deepest, constantly talk about *Risale-i Nur* and Hodja Efendi. I wasn't giving a hoot. I mean, I considered neither of them to be a great thinker. Constantly Said Nursi... They used to take us to talks on Fridays and I didn't like it even a bit. Not the ones who gave the talks, but I regarded the speeches to be wish-wash. Don't ever leave us, if you do, you leave Islam and quit performing prayers. They should have told us not to quit performing prayers if we left them, but they kind of consider themselves owning Muslimism. They don't consider other Muslims to be worthwhile, you see.⁴⁰

Süleyman's family values religious principles. He grew up in a family whose budget is of moderate means. He came across the community during high school, in

³⁹ Annem salaktı bir davranışımı görse salak derdi. Belki Türk çocuk yetiştirme tarzıdır. Batıdan özgür yetiştirmeye çalışıyorlarmış özgüven aşlamaya çalışıyorlarmış. Ben kendi kendime Kur'an Meali okurum o yüzden de kimseyle de uyuşamam. İnsanlar cemaatlere falan girer ben cemaat liderinin görüşünü eleştiririm falan filan tutunamam.

⁴⁰ Katı falan böyle evdeki kurallara çok riayet edilmesini isteyen, edepli uslu oturulmasını isteyen biri. Kuralları çok benimsicen sürekli Risale-i Nur konuşucan. Hoca efendi konuşucan ben takmıyordum ya. İki de çok büyük alim görmüyordum yani. Sürekli Said Nursi, cumaları bizi sohbetlere götürüyorlar ben hiç hoşlanmazdım. Sohbetleri yapana değil de konuşmalara çok abuk sabuk görürdüm. Sakın bizi ter etmeyin terk ederseniz Müslümanlıktan da olursunuz efendim namazı falan bırakırsınız. Buradan ayrılırsan namazı bırakmayın falan der ama onlar biraz Müslümanlığı kendilerine ait görüyorlar. Diğer Müslümanları pek adamdan saymıyorlar ya.

the private teaching institution. There is no counter-ideas in the dormitory, or the student has to hide those. S/he is aware of the fact that s/he will be kicked out if s/he made them public. Regarding the brothers, İlker describes them as people who don't swear and guides the students in every aspect.

Sabri: Was there anyone in the dormitory holding counter-ideas?

Süleyman: Of course there was, but I didn't come across.

Sabri: How were the brothers like?

Süleyman: The bothers were respectful, only focused on your problems. I couldn't figure out why they were doing it, maybe they take money for it. Maybe for God, I couldn't figure it out, you see. But they help you. They are helpful in every aspect. They don't speak bad.⁴¹

Süleyman had a girlfriend before, but he could not share this with his friends in the dormitory.

My girlfriend was outside. We had started in high school. I used to talk to her on the phone or internet. But in the dormitory, we wouldn't talk about love affairs. They didn't consider it to be good deed or halal regarding religion. Of course we were talking about it among friends. We just didn't talk about it with brothers and they didn't ask, either.⁴²

Socializing venues of the community are in accordance with the consumer society and also protective of traditional values.

Shopping malls, Çanakkale, historical places, markets, bazaars... Such as mosques, courtyards, sea coast. During the first year, we travelled to Çanakkale and Antep. Antep Castle, mosques..⁴³

Şahin grew up in a family with 4 siblings. His mother was a housewife and he describes her as oppressive. She did not let him to the street until he started

⁴¹ Sabri: Yurtta aykırı fikre sahip var mıydı?

Süleyman: İllaki vardı ama ben rastlamadım.

Sabri: Abiler nasıldı?

Süleyman: Abiler saygılı, sadece senin sorunlarına odaklanmışlar neden yaptıklarını çözemedim belki bunun için para alıyorlar. Belki Allah için ya çözemedim ben. Ama yardımcı oluyorlar. Her konuda yardımcıları. Temiz ağızlılar kötü laf söylemezler

⁴² Kız arkadaşım dışardaydı. Liseden başlamıştık internetten, telefonla konuşurdum. Ama yurtta aşk konularında konuşmuyorduk dinen sevap ya da helal olarak düşünmüyorlardı.

Arkadaşlar arasında tabi konuşuyorduk. Abilerle yapmıyorduk onlar da sormuyorlardı.

⁴³ Alışveriş merkezleri, Çanakkale, tarihi yerleri, çarşılar, pazarlar. Cami gibi, avlu gibi, sahil deniz. Çanakkale ve Antep'i gezdik ilk yıl. Antep kalesi, Camiler.

secondary school. He went to an Imam Hatip school for secondary and high school. His parents wanted him to go to an Imam Hatip school. As he took Quran course before for 6 years, he was prepared. His parents pray five times a day. He meets the community when he is in high school, going to a private teaching institution. After high school he goes to the private teaching institution for 1 more year.

The community meets the students that they helped getting admitted to the university, in the cities they go to and place them in their dormitories or houses, and Şahin was supposed to be met too. However, something went wrong and there was nobody to meet him at the bus station, so he moved to a state dormitory. After that, when the community called him to their dormitory, he refused and this is the reason he gives:

I wanted to research and be open to any kind of ideas, with a free brain, not by having them telling me which community and which books to read and telling that person is right. Therefore, I was going to find my own way.⁴⁴

When he looks back on the community, here is how he interprets it:

It is not Islamic, regarding the religion. It has too much power, big media outlets, TV channels, newspapers, magazines etc. The way of the prophet is to invite to Allah. The life in this world is temporary. Yield to Allah, there is no other god than Allah. What are those doing? Look at the newspaper of the community – *Zaman* – you see political news from Turkey, from the world, sports, economy, this and that... Hey, what are you doing? Is your purpose to serve Islam? If it is to serve, then directly say ‘Ye, people! Yield to Allah. Do not forget people with news, sports, advertisements, trade’. Things like ‘we will be rich, powerful and serve Islam’... Which prophet served this way? They all came out and invited to Allah directly. Can you think of a prophet who deals with what happened here, what happened there and politics? He already has a policy, which is Islam. In this regard, I do not find it Islamic. It sure has benefits. Instead of starting drinking and gambling at university, at least they will become people with morality. People see it this way.⁴⁵

⁴⁴İslamiyet’i özgür bir beyinle, şu cemaati şu kitapları oku demesi ile değil. O kişinin dediği doğrudur demesi yerine. Ben her türlü fikre açık olayım, araştırayım. Böylece kendi yolumu kendim bulayım dedim.

⁴⁵ Dini açıdan İslami değil. Bu kadar söz sahibi. Büyük medya organları, televizyonları, gazeteleri, dergileri vesaire vesaire. Peygamberin yolu Allah’a davet etmektir. Bu dünya hayatı geçicidir. Allaha teslim olun Allah’tan başka ilah yoktur. Bunlar ney yapıyorlar cemaatin Zaman gazetesini aç dünyadan, Türkiye’den politik haberler, spor, ekonomi şu bu.

Identity in the Gülen Community

The identity that is constructed by Gülen community is as follows; to be regular on praying, non-user of cigarette and alcohol, conservative about man-woman relationships, short haired, non-goatee beared, user of corduroy, non-short sleeve t-shirt, participating regularly in trainings. What is more, the Gülen community wants to raise persons who read regularly books suggested by them, follow the rules without an objection in any way. It is likely to deduce this model from the narratives of the following student below:

Serkan: They realized I was smoking in a few months, anyway. They were giving a dirty look at me, anyway.

Selim: I realized I was drinking a lot with friends. I should have stayed at Service (Hizmet), at least not to drink.

Selim: After I saw Service (Hizmet), I wouldn't have taken that pencil and put it in my pocket, for example. Because pray five times a day, I cannot do that.

İzze: Praying five times a day is considered as doing sports. They told me I had to participate in these. They asked me how do I get along with religion. They made me sign a contract stating that I would be kicked out of the dormitory if I didn't obey one of the rules. I made a contract stating that I would be kicked out of the dormitory if I smoked, did not pray five times a day and did not attend the activities.

İzzet: I had long hair, the guys were giving me weird looks. I grew a goatee, they told me it didn't look nice on me. I used to wear sleeveless clothes and they would never approve of that. They were looking for an excuse to entirely externalize.

İzzet: According to their views, you are going to keep away from girls, fast, perform your prayers and wear fabric trousers.

Yav ne yapıyorsunuz sizin amacınız İslam'a hizmet etmek mi? Hizmet etmekse doğrudan deyin ki. Ey insanlar Allah'a teslim olun. İnsanları unutmayın haberlerle, sporla, reklamlarla, ticaretle. Yok zengin olacağız da, güçlü olacağız da İslam'a hizmet edeceğiz de. Hangi peygamber öyle hizmet etmiş. Hepsi de çıkmış doğrudan Allah'a çağırmış. Bir peygamber düşünebiliyor musun şurada ne olmuş, burada ne olmuş onula uğraş, politikayla uğraş. Zaten onun politikası İslam. O yönden İslami bulmuyorum. Yararları vardır. İnsanlar şöyle bakıyor. Üniversiteye gidince içkiye, kumara mı takılsın en azından ahlaklı olsunlar.

Meral: The ones that always have books of Said Nursi and Fethullah Gülen in their hands. She should come when she is told to, and go again when she is told to.

Tarık: I see wrong things happening in the parks, I don't want to see those. I think they should be respectful to people. Excuse me but they are participating in very wrong activities in the middle of the street. I definitely don't approve those. In parks, at the sea coasts... If you are going to do it, do it indoors.⁴⁶

Curriculum in the Gülen Community

The Gülen community uses two important means in constructing these identities, including the curriculum (books read in the dormitories and houses) and the hidden curriculum (the atmosphere, socialization, daily behaviours of teachers, brothers and sisters). The books of Said Nursi, Fethullah Gülen and Halit Ertuğrul (a writer of the Gülen community) are used in the curriculum, whereas they do not

⁴⁶ Serkan: Zaten sigara içtiğim bir iki ayda anlaşıldı. Zaten ondan sonra ters bi gözle bakıldı

Selim: Arkadaşlarla baktım ki çok içiyorum böyle. Hizmette kalayım bari içmem.
Selim: Hizmeti gördükten sonra o kalemi alıp atmadım cebime mesela. Çünkü ben namaz kılıyorum yapamam öyle. Hem namaz kılacam hem de gidip ilişkiye girecem. Bu beni çok rahatsız etti.

İzzet: 5 vakit namaz spor olarak geçiyor. Bunlara katılmak zorundasın dediler. Dinle aran nasıl diye sordular. Herhangi bir kurala uymadığın takdirde yurttan atılacaksın diye bir sözleşme imzalattılar. Sigara içtiğim takdirde, namazları kılmadığım takdirde, etkinliklere katılmadığı takdirde yurttan atılacağımı söyleyen bir sözleşme yaptım.

İzzet: Mesela benim saçım uzundu. Adamlar bana tuhaf tuhaf bakıyorlardı. Top sakal bırakıyordum yakışmamış diyorlardı. Yani çok hoş bakmıyorlardı. Sıfır kol giyerdim hiç hoş bakmıyorlardı.

İzzet: Onlara göre kariya kıza bakmayacaksın orucunu tutacaksın. Namazını kılacaksın. Kumaş pantolon giyeceksin. Namazını kılacaksın. Kumaş pantolon giyeceksin.

Meral: Sürekli elinde Said Nursi, Fethullah Gülen kitabı olan. Gel diyince gelecek git diyince gidecek.

Tarık: Parklarda çok yanlış şeyler görüyorum görmek istemiyorum. İnsanlara saygılı olmaları gerektiğini düşünüyorum çok afedersin ama sokak ortasında çok yanlış hareketler yapıyorlar. Kesinlikle bunları tasvip etmiyorum. Parklarda deniz kenarında sahilde falan yapacaksa da kapalı ortamda yapsın.

make use of different sources about religions such as the books of other religious groups. The following is expressed by the students, which implies this issue:

Selim: I read *Broken Pitcher (Kırık Testi)* (written by Fethullah Gülen) and the books of Bediuzzaman (Said Nursi).

Mahmut: Books like *The Man Searching for Himself (Kendini Arayan Adam)*.

İzzet: They constantly go on about Fethullah Hodja Efendi is this and that, they only tell stories about his life.

Meral: The ones that always have books of Said Nursi and Fethullah Gülen in their hands.⁴⁷

The Hidden Curriculum in the Gülen Community

The Gülen community produces governance on what kinds of clothes they wear, what they listen and in what shapes they use their own hair. While brothers and sisters teach students how they use their body and motive specific kinds of pleasures determined previously, the community establishes governance on bodies by the way in which these sorts of dictations are implemented (Foucault, 2006). The following is expressed by the students, which implies this issue:

İzzet: I had long hair, the guys were giving me weird looks. I grew goatee, they told me it didn't look nice on me. I used to wear sleeveless clothes and they would never approve of that.

İzzet: I was listening to Indian music when he asked me why I was listening to the music of infidels, for instance. The one who said that was supposed to be our teacher. I replied saying that our religion is the religion of tolerance and he shouldn't look at things like that.⁴⁸

⁴⁷ Selim: Kırık Testi'yi (yazarı Fethullah Gülen) okudum Bediüzzama (Said Nursi) hazretlerinin kitaplarını okudum.

Mahmut: Kendini Arayan Adam (Halit Ertuğrul) o tarz kitaplar.

İzzet: Sürekli Fethullah hoca efendi söylemiş de sırf onun hayatından kesitler anlatılır.

Meral: Sürekli elinde Said Nursi, Fethullah Gülen kitabı olan.

⁴⁸ İzzet: Mesela benim saçım uzundu. Adamlar bana tuhaf tuhaf bakıyorlardı. Top sakal bırakıyordum yakışmamış diyorlardı. Yani çok hoş bakmıyorlardı. Sıfır kol giyerdim hiç hoş bakmıyorlardı.

The hidden curriculum is applied in a class atmosphere according to behaviours of brothers and sisters and in the ways of teaching lessons implying students need to be reshaped into their new identities. Students, who are to be passive listeners, are expected to memorize short stories about books of Said Nursi and Fethullah Gülen given in the houses of the Gülen community as well as to give approval in response to them. It is almost impossible to object to or criticize in this stern atmosphere. The hidden curriculum generates a hierarchical and authoritarian structure in this way. It is likely to deduce this model from the narratives of the following student below:

İzzet: They place a chair in the middle. People are entirely focused with their arms crossed while he is talking. For instance, he is talking about a topic in Q&A mode, catechizing. Normally, they are the ones talking all the time. Nobody dares to talk because they are afraid of being told off, if they say something wrong. They don't get involved. You only get involved if they directly ask you about your personal opinion.⁴⁹

Patriarchy in the Gülen Community

Patriarchy is reproduced by the hidden curriculum in a way that spaces of women and men are separated, there are neither mixed-sex dormitories nor houses in the community. The Gülen community does not allow students to communicate with

İzzet: Halı sahaya gidiyorduk Hindistan müziğiymiş gavur müziğini niye dinliyorsun dedi mesela. Bunu söyleyen belletmen başımızda. Ben de dedim bizim dinimizi hoş görü dinidir böyle bakarsanız olmaz dedim.

⁴⁹ İzzet: Ortaya bir tane sandelye koyuyorlar. Herkes pür dikkat ellerini kollarını bağlamış o adam anlatıyor mesela soru cevap şeklinde mesela bir konu anlatıyor böyle yaparsanız böyle olur gibi. Normal de sürekli onlar anlatıyorlar. Bir şey deriz de bizi terslerler mi diye kimse bir şey konuşmuyor. Müdahil olmuyorlar. Sen ne düşünürsün derse ancak o şekilde müdahil oluyorsun.

different genders not just in dormitories given to them but also on the campuses of universities where students go together.

Meral: And, you cannot have an ordinary talk on the phone, you have to explain to your sister who you are talking to.

Süleyman: But in the dormitory, we wouldn't talk about love affairs. They didn't consider it to be good deed or *halal* regarding religion.⁵⁰

Gender discrimination can be realized in the hidden curriculum as one takes socialization of the students into the consideration. For instance, women and men do not share the same spaces; to give an example, they do not go on trips together. To point another issue, they make schedules such as strolling around religious places and historic places, aiming to produce a context for a hegemonic ideology in the students' ways of thinking. In addition to these, they go to the centers of consumption such as bazaars, markets and shopping centers. However, they do not go to cinemas theatres, concerts, or dances collectively, because these spaces are social domains for both genders. Moreover, these places do not produce conservative identities. Some students speak about this issue:

Tarık: There was a shopping mall, we used to have picnics and went to Nevşehir and so. We went to seminars. I participated in programs. I went to a computer course at the weekends. We were staying there as 5 friends, taking photos.

Süleyman: Shopping malls, Çanakkale, historical places, markets, bazaars... Such as mosques, courtyards, sea coast. During the first year, we travelled to Çanakkale and Antep. Antep Castle, mosques.⁵¹

⁵⁰ Meral: Telefonla da alalede konuşamazlar. Konuşurken hesap verirler. Kimle konuştuklarını ablalarına.

Süleyman: Ama yurttta aşk konularında konuşmuyorduk dinen sevap ya da helal olarak düşünmüyorlardı

⁵¹ Tarık: AVM vardı, piknik yapardık Nevşehir'e falan gittik. Seminerlere gittik.

Programlara katıldım. Hafta sonu bilgisayar kursuna gittim. 5 kişi kalıyorduk, fotoğraflar çekiyorduk.

Süleyman: Alışveriş merkezleri, Çanakkale, tarihi yerleri, çarşılar, pazarlar. Cami gibi, avlu gibi, sahil deniz. Çanakkale ve Antep'i gezdik ilk yıl. Antep kalesi, Camiler

Subjectivity in the Gülen Community

Becoming a subject is synonymous with becoming a person who can step out of the borders drawn by religion and experience love with little consideration for the traditional norms of the society and who does not suppress his/her sexuality. They cut loose from the Gülen community for various reasons, in particular, making love freely, dressing at will, reading religion from different sources, programming their daily life independently, to be independent from authority, not to be associated with any group. Persons who want to become subject withdraw from the Gülen community. It is obvious that becoming subject is possible out of the community even if they maintain some identities of community. Some students talk about this issue in the following way:

Selim: I didn't have a girlfriend when I was in Hizmet. While I was in Hizmet, I was thinking whether to have intercourse or not. I would, if I wasn't in Hizmet, so I got out of it. I needed a girl. Praying and having intercourse at the same time would bother me. Why would I have intercourse if I was praying. I wanted to be comfortable when I was out. They say that your arms cannot be open like that and I say men go on pilgrimage like this, half-open. He wouldn't talk to the girl next to him. Intention is what matters. If you are looking with an evil eye, it wouldn't matter if you performed prayers or not.

Meral: You cannot talk about love there, even internet is forbidden. And, you cannot have an ordinary talk on the phone, you have to explain to your sister who you are talking to.

Meral: For instance, it bores me to stay in the same environment and have the same conversations, because I have nothing to learn. Don't know, like those who can postpone their family affairs, or come early to serve them. She should come when she is told to, and go again when she is told to. Those kinds of people. They cannot take me out whenever they want to.

Engin: I still say that, I haven't been among people who call themselves “-ist”. I didn't prefer that. I didn't divide people as rightist, leftist or communist. I was afraid of one thing when I was studying there, what if someday, someone

reacts to me saying I am one of their people or vice versa? I never wanted somebody to own me.⁵²

To become a brother is possible by being active and successful at getting donations. It can be interpreted as encouraging entrepreneurship. While desires of humans are suppressed, career and working ethics are stimulated through the hidden curriculum. All of my interviewees repeatedly narrated such stories:

Serkan: For instance, if you sign up 5 people for *Zaman* (newspaper), you are the best man. Or, if you have people to donate sacrificial animals, you are the best man. You know what, you can even be a regional leader.

Tarık: Because I aim to build a career. As I want to build a career, I have put love at the end of the list. It's going to happen after university, because you cannot run away from it always.⁵³

⁵² Selim: Hizmetteyken sevgilim yoktu. Hizmetteyim ilişkiye gireyim mi girmeyeyim düşünüyorum böyle. Hizmette olmasaydım girerdim ama. Hizmetten çıktım. Kıza ihtiyacım vardı. Hem namaz kılacam hem de gidip ilişkiye girecem. Bu beni çok rahatsız etti. Ben namaz kılıyorsam niye ilişkiye giriyorum. Çıkınca rahat hareket edeyim. Diyor böyle kolun açık olamaz diyorum adam gidiyor ya hacca böyle yarı açık. Önündeki kızla konuşmuyordu. Önemli olan niyet. Kötü gözle baktıktan sonra istersen namaz kıl.

Meral: Orda aşklarını konuşmazsın. hatta internet bile yasak. Telefonla da alalede konuşamazlar. Konuşurken hesap verirler. Kimle konuştuklarını ablalarına.

Meral:Aynı ortamın içinde aynı muhabbetleri yapıyor olmak beni sıkıyor mesela. Çünkü öğrencim bir şey yok. Ne bileyim ailesini erteyebilecek. Veya erken gelip onlara hizmet edebilecek. Gel diyince gelecek git diyince gidecek. Öyle insanlar. Beni isteyen istediği yerde dışarı çıkartamaz.

Engin: Mesala yani tutucu olmaları, dindar olmayan insanlara yaklaşımları. Ben hala söylüyorum sonunda şucu, bucu diye biten insanların içinde olmadım. Olmayı tercih etmedim. Kimseyi sağcı, solcu, komünist diye ayırmadım. Orda okurken de şundan korkuyordum ilerde birinin bana onun insanıydın diyip tepki gösterir mi tam tersi yaşanır mı? Birilerinin beni sahiplenmesini asla istemedim.

⁵³ Serkan: Mesala 5 tane kişi Zaman üyesi yaparsan senden ala adam yok. Ya da kurban da 3 tane tosuncuk bağışlatırsan senden ala adam yok. Bölge liderleri var ya ona bile getirilirsin. Tarık: Çünkü ben kariyer yapma peşindeyim. Kariyer yapmak istediğim için aşk ilişkilerini sona bıraktım. Üniversite bittikten sonra gönül bu boş durmuyor bazen.

Capitalism in the Gülen Community

Instead of eliminating poverty directly, the Gülen community approaches it in an elitist manner and puts emphasis on the accumulation of capital. The Gülen community helps poor students, but they do not help persons who are poor but not students in which case they are not considered as able to be availed for Gülen community in the future. In this sense, a pragmatist culture is produced through the hidden curriculum. When encountering a needy or indigent person, despite of the request below of the one who is really a student from the community, they did not help to poor person mentioned by him. Engin and Serkan explain:

Engin: I support the ideal of being a helpful person in everything, unconditionally. They help people whom they feel closer to and I was very upset by that. There is someone living around Taksim that I assumed needed help. I saw a man living on the streets. I asked them to help him but they didn't. They didn't prioritize it, said this and that and just hampered it.
Serkan: They are not very strict but they want anyone and everyone who is rich to be part of their movement.⁵⁴

While the Gülen community, which is a family holding, is becoming rich and powerful by means of its own companies, newspapers, televisions and its educational institutions are creating a new generation who want to serve Islam in this way. However, this method does not produce a way to embrace humanity and even Muslims. While enrichment is praised through the hidden curriculum, anti-capitalist comments about how wealth is gained are avoided. Şahin says:

⁵⁴ Engin: Ben koşulsuz şartsız her konuda yardım edecek bir insan olunması gerektiği taraftarıyım. Biraz daha kendilerine yakın insanlara yardımcı oluyorlar. Taksim tarafında yardıma muhtaç olduğunu düşündüğüm biri var. Sokakta yaşayan bir adam gördüm. Destek olmalarını istedim ama olmadılar. Öncelik göstermediler mesala bilmem ne bilmem ne yokuşa sürdüler.

Serkan: Çok katı değiller ama zenginler onlardan olsun. Tüm zenginler onlardan olsun.

It has too much power, big media outlets, TV channels, newspapers, magazines etc. The way of the prophet is to invite to Allah. The life in this world is temporary. Yield to Allah, there is no other god than Allah. What are those doing? Look at the newspaper of the community – *Zaman* – you see political news from Turkey, from the world, sports, economy, this and that... Hey, what are you doing? Is your purpose to serve Islam? If it is to serve, then directly say ‘Ye, people! Yield to Allah. Do not forget people with news, sports, advertisements, trade’. Things like ‘we will be rich, powerful and serve Islam’... Which prophet served this way? They all came out and invited Allah directly. Can you think of a prophet who deals with what happened here, what happened there and politics? He already has a policy, which is Islam.⁵⁵

Teachers in the Gülen Community

One crucial reason for students to be involved in the Gülen community is the teacher factor. The way in which it is different from the ones in the state and other private schools is to be idealistic and as a result more altruistic as being a part of the struggle that aims to generate conservative identities. In contrast to teachers from the state and private schools, the Gülen community creates an idealistic and altruistic model for teachers. In Turkey, teachers generally attend a class but are neither sufficiently interested nor motivated in seeking solutions for any problem of students. In the Gülen community, teachers work in a sense of mission which is to create a new generation and which has an importance they are truly aware of. All teachers deal with the psychological, economic and social problems of students whereas in state schools and private schools, only guidance counselors deal with the

⁵⁵ Şahin: Bu kadar söz sahibi. Büyük medya organları, televizyonları, gazeteleri, dergileri vesaire vesaire. Peygamberin yolu Allah’a davet etmektir. Bu dünya hayatı geçicidir. Allaha teslim olun Allah’tan başka ilah yoktur. Bunlar ney yapıyorlar cemaatin Zaman gazetesini aç dünyadan, Türkiye’den politik haberler, spor, ekonomi şu bu. Yav ne yapıyorsunuz sizin amacınız İslam’a hizmet etmek mi? Hizmet etmekse doğrudan deyin ki. Ey insanlar Allah’a teslim olun. İnsanları unutmayın haberlerle, sporla, reklamlarla, ticaretle. Yok zengin olacağız da, güçlü olacağız da İslam’a hizmet edeceğiz de. Hangi peygamber öyle hizmet etmiş. Hepsi de çıkmış doğrudan Allah’a çağırılmış. Bir peygamber düşünebiliyor musun şurada ne olmuş, burada ne olmuş onula uğraş, politikayla uğraş. Zaten onun politikası İslam.

problems of students in limited conditions. In the Gülen community, the fact that every teacher works like a counsellor is, of course, discerned positively by students.

Another interviewees narrates:

Süleyman: The bothers were respectful, only focused on your problems. I couldn't figure out why they were doing it, maybe they take money for it. Maybe for God, I couldn't figure it out, you see. But they help you. They are helpful in every aspect. They don't speak bad.

Mahmut: He was such an honest and generous teacher, he was spending an incredible amount of money. He was spending his budget and life for us. People made it to Boğaziçi and Bilkent thanks to his efforts, not everyone can make it to those universities. He was moral and meticulous. You couldn't swear in his presence, you wouldn't. He had a sensitive approach to women. We would have football games with him. He was a man of grace and courtesy. We would have meal parties, bringing food from home was a part of sharing focused high morality. They were ideal, positive people.⁵⁶

Symbols in the Gülen Community

Most of the students mentioned in this study have serious economic problems in addition to ones related to their parents. The Gülen community seems to be an alternative family to them. There are some kinds of symbolizations which are created by people in the dormitories who are called brothers and are responsible for the houses and the dormitories. The community claims that brothers are real brothers of the students, what is more is that they are real family of the students. It is possible to say that Fethullah Gülen is a symbol of the father and Said Nursi is a symbol of the grand-daddy. Father and grand-daddy communicate with students at training

⁵⁶ Süleyman: Abiler saygılı, sadece senin sorunlarına odaklanmışlar neden yaptıklarını çözemedim belki bunun için para alıyorlar. Belki Allah için ya çözemedim ben. Ama yardımcı oluyorlar. her konuda yardımcılar. Temiz ağızlılar kötü laf söylemezler. Mahmut: Çok dürüst çok cömert bir hocaydı inanılmaz derecede para harcıyordu. Bütçesini hayatını bize harcıyordu. Gerçekten onun vesilesi Boğaziçini ve Bilkenti kazandı, herkes kazanamaz. Ahlaklı, titizdi onun yanında küfür edemezdin, etmezdin. Bayanlara karşı hassas yaklaşımı, futbol maçları yapardık zerafet ve nezaket insanıydı. Yemek partileri yapardık evden, paylaşımcı yüksek ahlakın parçalarıydı. İdeal insan pozitif insanlardı.

meetings through the books written by Fethullah Gülen and *Risaleler*, written by Said Nursi. While education is being privatized and converted into corporatization, this new family (the Gülen community) has presented cheap and hygienic dormitories and houses, cozy study opportunities as well as a social support by means of the brothers (responsible students and teachers) who are to deal with their all problems, hence, offered sheltered and a safe family environment. The father (Fethullah Gülen) and grandfather (Said Nursi) have been pointing out their way in words from *Risaleler* and the books of Fethullah Gülen. This situation reduces the fear and anxiety of students about the future.

This family (the Gülen community) with their newspapers, television channels, firms and educational networks can be analyzed as a family company. After graduating, students are more likely to find employment in the community. It is also possible for them to find a job in different institutions with cultural capital in the family (the Gülen community). Students can be successful through working systematically and motivation is provided by the Gülen community. Moreover, the Gülen community gives students an opportunity to marry someone from the Gülen religious group. As a result, the family has presented a promise of hope for suppressed desires and sexuality. Students to whom this family (the Gülen community) devotes close attention have families which are probably not solicitous about themselves. It is impossible to have these opportunities in their own family and in the dormitories of public schools and other private educational institutions. Therefore, the Gülen community, as the public space, is transformed into private space for students. The Gülen community as a public space gives them an autonomy that they cannot find in their own homes, where their behaviour is strictly controlled. Serkan lives in a context where he does not see any hope for the future. As he

himself expresses, he lives in a claustrophobic universe produced by extreme poverty. The Gülen community promises him a safe life.

CHAPTER 5

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this section, the findings of the data analysis are discussed. After the data analysis, 6 themes were found: the Success of the Gülen community, Subjectivity, Authoritarian Social Order, Patriarchal Sexual Identity, Curriculum and Hidden Curriculum, Capitalism.

The Success of the Gülen Community

As seen in the findings, the Gülen community contributes to constructing conservative, capitalist, patriarchal, and authoritarian identities in many areas of society. The success of the Gülen community mentioned in the literature, compared to other Islamic movements, is due to rejecting violence, synthesizing science and religion, and embracing democracy (Çalışlar, 2006), (Özdalga, 2006). However, I do not agree that these reasons will be enough to clarify this fact. Some academicians believe that neoliberal policies and the collapsing of the social state paved the way for the spreading of religious communities (Coşar, 2012). In my opinion, it is not real because the dormitories and houses of the Gülen communities were widespread in 1970s, before the collapsing of the social state in Turkey (Çalışlar, 1997). The conditions for the spreading of religious orders are suitable in neoliberal terms, but I think that left and secular academicians provide a similar descriptive analysis about this issue due to the fact that left and secular movements can not succeed in organizing people. Some writers in Turkey claim that the Gülen communities develop by the assistance of the USA (Çalışlar, 1997). In my opinion, this claim is

not enough to explain the real reasons of success of the Gülen community because in the beginning the community grew stronger by means of its own resources. In other words, the community became associated with the sovereign powers after it gained strength. This is why I believe that it is important to understand the social base of the Gülen community and how the Gülen community is organized.

Kemalism too was an authoritarian example of laicism, though not as much as Soviet communism. Kemalism only focused on the negative communitarian aspects of Islamist movements while failing to notice the pluralist dynamic aspects (Özdalga, 2006). Ahmet İnsel (1990) asserts that the highest motivation of Islamic movement is the suppression of the statist-Kemalist regime. Turkish secularism is based on the radical Jacobin laicism that aimed to transform society through the power of the state and eliminate religion from the public sphere (Berkes, 1998). I think that socialist and Kemalist movements produce other things in terms of the religious identities, so these situations cause religious people to become closer to the religious orders so that these movements could not organize masses. What is more, while socialists want to organize the working class, the best part of this class in Turkey are conservative and have Islamic identities. The Gülen movement wins the bourgeoisie and shopkeepers over to support houses and dormitories economically. Furthermore, workers, farmers and the poor send their children to these houses and dormitories. Teachers who are the part of working class are mobilized for the Gülen community. In addition to these, youth is the biggest part of the mobilization. The Gülen community has the ability to mobilize whole classes and masses. Left movements want to mobilize secular people and the working class but they are not successful.

According to Gülen, Islam is primarily related to personality and identity. The teachers of the movement believe that the way to becoming conscious includes not only religious rituals but also pedagogical activities (Yavuz, 2005). Many students are aware of the physical and motivating conditions provided by the Gülen community for poor students. The success of the Gülen community results from the fact that it makes use of pedagogy smoothly as well as successful teachers who are more qualified than those in state and private schools. In fact, teachers shape mothers, fathers and society in many areas. Teachers have been considered philosophers, dervishes and zahids. Teachers leave their marks on their times (Ergene, 2007). Students come across a teacher model who establishes intimacy, do sports and have good times with them, instead of the ones in the state schools who only give the lecture, do not establish intimacy and usually only care about their salary. The teacher model, which was drawn in the process of establishing the Turkish Republic which had a mission to create a nation working altruistically as well as being idealistic, has disappeared in state and private schools in the present day. The Gülen community creates and motivates this idealistic teacher in order to construct Islamic and conservative identities.

Ahmet Insel (1990) states that the success of these schools does not result from the education of poor students; rather, only clever and capable students are preferred in these schools. The schools of the Gülen community are elitist, as Ahmet Insel said, but the same case holds for all private schools. Yet students in the houses and dormitories are mostly indigent. Most of the students mentioned in this study are impoverished. In this sense, the Gülen community assesses needy families. The symbolic atmosphere of the family that is created by the Gülen community is of interest to students who are needy and have troubles with their families.

In short, lighthouses (houses and dormitories) are centers for personality and identity formation (Çobanoğlu, 2012). The alcohol and smoking ban is strongly applied in the houses and dormitories. Through moral education and discipline, the aim is to protect them from degeneration, immorality and downfall (Turam, 2011). The community is successful at teaching students some moral behaviours. Students realize some behavioural changes in themselves during their studies in the community.

While teachers of state and private schools prepare students for exams by teaching mathematics, language, chemistry, physics and so on, the real aims of education which are learning morality, social behaviour, critical thinking and discovering one's talents, are disregarded by them. In this sense, teachers of the Gülen community engender behaviour models via brothers and sisters in houses and dormitories, and teach ethical education or meaning of life by Islam. The identity that is constructed by Gülen community is as follows: to be regular in praying, be a non-user of cigarette and alcohol, be conservative about man-woman relationships, be short haired and non-goatee bearded, be a user of corduroy, be a non-short sleeve t-shirt wearer, and participate regularly in trainings. One of the identities is keeping away from physical violence because we do not find any physical violence in findings. This situation is important for Islam and society. Furthermore, these teachers are successful at teaching science and technology. Families and students prefer these model students and teachers to teachers and students of state and private schools.

Subjectivity

Subjectivity is comprised of three sections: freedom, resistance against traditional and authorial systems and how to create relationship with the other (Taoure, 1994). The Gülen community does not encourage free will and individualism (Çobanoğlu, 2012). In the community, it is not possible to be a subject who opposes to the authority and limitations. It is not possible to do your own cultural, feminist and religious readings. Those who joined because they are poor are economically oppressed. If they become critical, they will have to leave the community. Outside the community, there is a worse life by economical means.

We understand that person leave from the houses and dormitories of the Gülen community because of the fact that they want to behave subjectively. In my opinion, even if these students leave the Gülen community, they resume the identities of the Gülen community on their own. There are not anti-authoritarian, anti-capitalist religious and cultural constitutions helping these students. For these reasons, these students join the capitalist and authoritarian system easily.

Authoritarian Social Order

As a natural outcome, the conservative behavior which is brought into being by the Gülen community leads to the suppression of love and sexuality of students living in these dormitories and houses. I think that those young people in the community behave like children whenever they come to an sexual issue, which accordingly paves the way for ethics and religion. I believe that all of these create a general weakening of intellectual and emotional functioning. The mass psychology

of the authoritarian social order is created in this way (Brown, 1986). According to Eric Fromm (1976), while pleasures and desires are suppressed, the belief that a career is the most important thing in life is produced as well as the belief that duty is more important than happiness. While having a career is glorified, the pleasures of youth should be postponed. Father-centered anti-sex morality is produced (Brown, 1991). Pressure and intimidation arising from socio-economic relations spread in daily life and naturally in their sexual and emotional experiences. We need to know the political significance of sexual repression. We are internalizing social dominance through sexual repression in our personality (Brown, 1986). Paternal authority is thereby produced (Reiche, 1970). These people are alienated from their bodies, desires and experiences. Foucault (1991) insists repeatedly and clearly in *Discipline and Punish*, that power is exercised first and foremost on bodies, and that is precisely the source of its materiality. The body is the surface on which the game is played, on which power is produced and repressed. The elements of the hidden curriculum ultimately serve not only in the reproduction of both hierarchy and marginalization, but alienation as well Bourdieu (1973, 1977), and Passeron (1990).

Patriarchal Sexual Identity

Patriarchal sexual identity is reproduced in daily life of these houses and dormitories under the supervision of the religious order. If students postpone sexuality and love for their careers, they will access them when they marry. A 25-year-old male student says, “I didn't have relationships with girls, there were a lot of people around me. I was very active and men were enough for me, brother”, it shows us how sexuality is suppressed. According to Wilhelm Reich (1970), who has

analyzed how authoritarian civilization is produced by using inventions of Freud in his analysis, when sexual ideas are suppressed, these ideas condense in the subconscious, which then causes antisocial relationships and pathological illnesses. In the sequel, such persons are open to be obedient and shy.

Further, "the nature of the language we use determines how we make sense of our experiences and the type of social action we choose to engage in as a result of interpreting our experiences", according to McLaren and Giroux. When talking about women, men use a sexist language, such as non-virgin and virgin girls (karı-kız). According to men, women could not exist without their sexuality, but women may enter into the lives of men through marriage.

Men-women relationships are built according to the sexist understanding and sites of women and men are separated. A serious hegemony is being built in sexuality and gender. The view of love and gender can be defined in terms of psychological oppression. Therefore, persons cannot be realists. They must obey the irrational authority. This situation leads to psychological deprivation and they cannot have a healthy communication with the opposite sex outside. Anti-social, shy and obedient people are raised by suppressing their sexual ideas. Individuality is weakened and this explains the power over the body that Foucault refers to.

Curriculum and the Hidden Curriculum

Apple's most recent work, *Teachers and Texts* (1986), examines the ways in which reproduction occurs through the control of teachers and textbooks in schools. Those textbooks of Said Nursi and Fethullah Gülen have been taught only in training sessions and the curriculum has been shaped in this way. In the curriculum, there is

no book analyzing Islam from the point of view of the poor. In addition to this, Islamic Sufism (Melamilik and Kalenderîlik) does not assign value to property and reputation (Laçiner, 2004). Islamic Sufism emphasizes that human beings are part of God and demand the rejection of all hierarchical order in society. There is no evidence of these in the curriculum of Gülen community. Students' worlds of dreams and their political views are controlled by having them read only the main community authors. People who embrace capitalism are being raised through the books taught in the community, which I analyze in my dissertation. I believe that the world is read only within the capitalist system. The only way that the poor are able to stand on their feet is with the hand of the rich, their zakat and charities. While conservative and capitalist lifestyles such as building a career, going around in the shops and visiting the places where the symbols of heroism coalesce with conservatism is made prevalent, questioning the system and anti-capitalist criticisms are avoided. In other words, it is not possible to read the world differently in the community. The governance of the students is ensured by teaching main authors of the community like Said Nursi, Fethullah Gülen and other similar authors. Only the capitalist interpretation of Islam is made dominant. Education is shaped through the needs of the community and the authors whose accuracy they are sure of, instead of being student-centered. The real Islam is re-shaped according to the view of the community.

The elements of the hidden curriculum ultimately serve not only in the reproduction of both hierarchy and marginalization, but alienation as well Bourdieu (1973, 1977), and Passeron (1990). While the brothers (teachers or responsible student about problems of other students) in Gülen community are expert talkers, students are expert listeners. The discipline approach in the houses and dormitories

serves to the target of raising productive, obedient workers and civil servants for the future. A constant work ethic and postponing oneself sexually and individually, only produces the hegemony for capitalists which provides them with a great capital accumulation. There is a high level of obedience to the brothers. They are, in a way, organized as house imams because they are the representatives of religion. It is not possible to criticize them. People's clothing, tastes and how they use their bodies are being standardized. This situation provides the control over the body that Michel Foucault refers to. The brothers, in fact, symbolize the first boss in the capitalist system. What the brothers say must be done and must not be questioned. The state of being a good citizen is defined by the rules like not drinking, not having alcohol, not taking anyone's belongings without permission, performing prayers, standardizing your appearance and being a member of a religious community. Other than these, it is not possible to be a good citizen. This way, other citizenship interpretations are ignored.

Capitalism

Fettulah Gülen was an imam in Erzurum and made anti-communist propaganda in the mosque (Çalışlar, 2006). Fethullah Gülen said "I am not interested in politics and I think of only God" in an interview conducted in 1994. Even if Fethullah Gülen and Said Nursi develop discourses on avoiding politics and not being political, this is itself related to politics and used as a tool to establish political capitalism. What is meant by not being political is to ensure the capitalist system maintains by not talking about politics. As the community focuses on raising Islamic-capitalist modern leaders in the capitalist system, it does not look for answers to the situations like social injustice. Issues like thinner-addict gamins,

homeless people and the unemployment created by capitalism are ignored and liberal hegemony is developed with the view that anyone who works can have a job. Those who stay in the community think that they can only obtain their rights when they come to better places and positions. According to them, this can only happen through education. This opinion is a rather liberal one. The state is applying neoliberal policies in education and health and the taxes collected from everyone are not sufficiently used in health and education. The donations that the community collects from the rich and tradesmen are being spent on the houses and dormitories of the community. In these circumstances, we are expected to plead to the rich. Yet, the rich provide a small part of what they exploit from us, the labourers, to the community and we are expected to be grateful because a very small part of what was exploited from us is returned through the community. This is another aspect of alienation.

Ernst Bloch (2011), who was a religious and socialist thinker, asserted that religion had a revolutionist side to it but the ruling classes were abusing religion as a drug for their own interests. In South America, Christian socialist ideas have been prevailing as liberation theology. Islam emerged against inequality and injustice in Mecca. Basic functions of Islam were charity and protection of the poor'. Muslims prostrating to purge themselves of arrogance and conceit spread in Mecca (Tekin, 2010). The unique religious book of Islam is the Kur'an, which contains sentences of God. The Kur'an has many references to social justice, ill-gotten gain, doing someone a kindness for God's sake (unrequited), and rightful due. These sentences (Ayet) of the Kur'an have revolutionary effects on society. In my opinion, the Gülen community circumscribe Islam with some codes of ethics such as alcohol prohibition, larceny, peacemaker and some religious rituals such as salat, sawm, haj.

If we understand Islam as only rituals, conservatism, patriarchy, Islam is prone to be a part of dominant ideology. This situation prevents interpretation of Islam from being understood in an anti-capitalist point of view.

Two concluding reflections can be made based on the study: One is that Islam has a significant role in shaping identities in this geography. It is the Muslims who probably suffer the most from capitalism, patriarchy, and authoritarianism. For this reason, what is needed is a more pluralist religious education and one that is not decoupled from social issues, sides with the oppressed and has a transformative quality in all spheres of life. This can be rendered possible only through achieving an improvement in the quality of religious instruction. Another is that in addition to the formal education, the identities are also shaped by means of non-formal education. One example is identity construction of the youth via the adult education in religious houses and dormitories as explored in this study. Based on this study, the suggestion is that adult education should take into consideration the social challenges of the youth, especially for the ones with low socio-economic status, and should not restrict their subjectivity and individualism and dormitories and houses in general should be places that create nourishing study environments and identity development opportunities for the youth to reach their full potential.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ackelsberg, M. (1982). *Free women of Spain: Anarchism and the struggle for the emancipation of women*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Anyon, J. (1980). From social class and the hidden curriculum of work. *Journal of Education, Vol. 162, no. 1*.
- Apple, M.W. (1982). *Education and power*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Apple, M.W. (1986). *Teachers and texts: A Political economy of class and gender relations in education*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Arendt, H. (1968). *Between past and future: Eight exercises in political thought*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Agai, B. (2003). *Fethullah Gülen hareketinin eğitime İslami etik kazandırma projesi*. Retrieved from <http://tr.fgulen.com/content/view/3749/135/>
- Bozzoli, B. ,Nkotsoe, M. (1991). *Women of Phokeng: Consciousness, lifestrategy and migrancy in South Africa, 1900 – 1983*. Portsmouth, NH : Heinemann
- Balcı, B. (2005). *Orta Asya'da İslam misyonerleri: Fethullah Gülen okulları*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Badıllı, A. (1990). *Bediüzzaman Said Nursi: Mufassal tarihçe-i hayatı*. Retrieved from <http://www.nurunbekcisi.com/kitab-indir/mufassal-tarihce-i-hayat/>
- Bank, J. A. (1994). *Multiethnic education: Theory and practice (3rd ed.)*. Boston: Ally and Bacon.
- Bernstein, B. (1997). *Class, codes and control volume 3: Towards a theory of educational transmissions*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Bloch, E. (2011). *Umut ükesi*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınlan.
- Boratav, K. (2005). *Türkiye iktisat tarihi*. Ankara: İmge Kitabevi.
- Bowles, S. And Gintis, H. (1976). *Schooling in capitalist America: Educational reform and the contradictions of economic life*. New York: Basic Books.
- Bourdieu, P. (1973). *Cultural reproduction and social reproduction*. London: Tavistock.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. London: Sage Publications.
- Bowles S. and Gintis, H. (1976). *Schooling in capitalist America*. New York: Basic Books.

- Brown, B. (1986). *Marx, Freud ve günlük hayatın eleştirisi: Sürekli kültür devrimine doğru*. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.
- Caldas-Coulthard, C. R. (2008). *Identity trouble: Critical discourse and contested identities*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Çalışlar, O. (1997). *Fethullah Gülen'den Cemalettin Kaplan'a: İslamiyet üzerine söyleşiler*. İstanbul: Pencere Yayınları.
- Çalışlar, O. (2006). *İslamcılığın üç kolu*. İstanbul: Güncel Yayıncılık.
- Çobanoğlu, Y. (2012). *Altın nesil'in peşinde: Fethullah Gülen'de toplum, devlet, ahlak, otorite*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Dam, N. V. (2000). *Suriye'de iktidar mücadelesi: Esad ve Baas partisi yönetiminde siyaset ve toplum*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Demirağ, D. (2010). Sol ilahiyat tartışmalarına “sapkın” bir bakış. *Birikim Dergisi*, 253, 62-69.
- Doğan, L. (2006). *Küçük dünyam Fethullah Gülen*. İstanbul:Ufuk Kitapları.
- Eagleton, T. (2010). *Estetiğin ideolojisi: Terry Eagleton*. İstanbul: Doruk Yayınları.
- Eagleton, T. (2003). *After theory: Terry Eagleton*. New York: Allen Lane.
- Else Frenkel-Brunswick. (1950). *The Authoritarian Personality. American Jewish Committee. Social studies series, publication no. 3*. New York: Harper
- Erkin, A. (2005). *Fethullah Hoca'nın şifreleri: başmuavini Nurettin Veren anlatıyor*. İstanbul: Kaynak Yayınları.
- Ergene, E. (2005). *Geleneğin modern çağa tanıklığı*. İstanbul: Yeni Akademi Yayınları.
- Fisk, R. (2011). *Büyük medeniyet savaşı Ortadoğu'nun fethi*. İstanbul: İthaki Yayınları.
- Fludernik, M. (1993). *The fictions of language and language of fiction: The linguistic representation of speech and consciousness*. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, M. (1991). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. London: Penguin Books.
- Freire, P. (2006). *Ezilenlerin pedagojisi*. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.
- Freire, P. (1987). *A pedagogy for liberation: Dialogues on transforming education*. London: Bergin & Garvey.

- Gay, G. (2007). The importance of multicultural education. *Contemporary issues in curriculum* (pp. 273-278). Boston: Pearson/AandB.
- Genette, G. (1973). *Narrative discourse*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Giroux, H. A. (1992). *Border crossings: Cultural workers and the politics of education*. London: Routledge.
- Giroux, H. A. (1988). *Teachers as intellectuals: Toward a critical pedagogy of learning*. Granby, Mass. : Bergin & Garvey
- Gramsci, A., Longo, L., Togliatti, P. (1984). *Din -üretim biçimleri üstüne - tarihsel uzlaşma*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınevi.
- Gülen, F. (1998). *Prizma*. İstanbul: Nil Yayınları.
- Hirsch, E.D. (1987). *Cultural literacy*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- İnsel, A. (1990). Kemalist laiklik mi çoğul toplum laikliği mi? *Birikim Dergisi*, 20, 18-25.
- İnsel, A. (1997). *Altın nesil, yeni muhafakârlık ve Fethullah Gülen*. *Birikim Dergisi*, 99, 67-76.
- Karaosmanoğlu, Y. K. (2003). *Yaban*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Kelly, A.V. (2004). *The curriculum: Theory and practice*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Kepel, G. (2002). *Bir şark savaşı güncesi*. İstanbul: Doğan Kitapçılık.
- Kepel, G. (2006). *Fitne: İslam'ın merkezinde savaş*. İstanbul: Doğan Kitapçılık.
- Keyder, Ç.. (2005). *Türkiye'de devlet ve sınıflar*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayıncılık.
- Kliebard, H. (2004). *The Struggle for the American curriculum: 1893-1958*. New York: Taylor Francis.
- Laçiner, Ö. (2004). *İslamcılık, sosyalizm ve sol: Modern Türkiye'de siyasi düşünce* cilt 6. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Löwy, M. (1996). *Marksizm ve din: Kurtuluş teolojisi meydan okuyor*. İstanbul: Belge Yayınları.
- Lynch, K. (1989). *The hidden curriculum: Reproduction in education, a reappraisal*. New York: Falmer Press.
- Malatesta, E. (1949). *Anarchy :by E. Malatesta ; with a biographical note and portrait*. London: Freedom Press.

- Marcus, A. (2009). *Kan ve inanç: PKK ve Kürt hareketi*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Mardin. Ş. (2008). *Bediüzzaman Said Nursi olayı: Modern Türkiye’de din ve toplumsal değişim*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Mardin, Ş. (1990). *Türkiye’de toplum ve siyaset*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- McLaren, P. (1997). *Revolutionary multiculturalism: Pedagogies of dissent for the new millennium*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Margolis, E. (2001). *The hidden curriculum in higher education*. New York: Routledge.
- Nursi, S. (2009). *İçimai dersler (makeleler)*. İstanbul: Zehra Yayıncılık.
- Nash, C. (1994). *Narrative in culture*. London: Routledge.
- Okçabol, R. (2005). *Türkiye eğitim sistemi*. Ankara: Ütopya Yayınevi.
- Ornstein, S. C., Behar-Horenstein, L. S, Pajak, E. F.. (2007). *Contemporary issues in curriculum*. Boston: Pearson/AandB.
- Özdek, Y. (2011). *Şirket egemenliği çağı: Sosyal devletten ceza devletine*. Ankara: Notabene Yayınları.
- Özdoğan, K. (2010). Bir özgürlük teolojisinin imkanları üzerine. *İstanbul: Birikim Dergisi*. 250,26-36.
- Özdalga, E. (2013). *İslamcılığın Türkiye seyri*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Peters, M. A., Besley, T. (2007). *Why Foucault?: New directions in educational research*. New York : Peter Lang.
- Portelli, A. (1991). *The death of Luigi Trastulli and other stories: Form and meaning in oral history*. Albany, N.Y. : State University of New York Press.
- Prince, G. (1987). *Dictionary of narratology*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Ravitch, D. (2000). *Left back: A century of battles over school reform*. New York: Simon Schuster.
- Reich, W. (1970). *The mass psychology of fascism*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Rothstein, R. (2004). A wider Lens on the Black-White Achievement Gap. *Phi Delta Kappan; Oct2004, Vol. 86 Issue 2, p104*. Retrieved from <http://connection.ebscohost.com/c/articles/14719631/wider-lens-black-white-achievement-gap>
- Reiche, R. (1970). *Sexuality and class struggle*. London: NLB.

- Savran, S. (2010). *Türkiye'de sınıf mücadeleleri*. İstanbul: Yordam Kitap.
- Schiro, M. (2008). *Curriculum theory: Conflicting visions and enduring concerns*. Los Angeles, Calif: Sage Publications.
- Şapolyo, E. B. R.. (1964). *Mezhepler ve tarikatlar*. İstanbul: Türkiye Yayınevi.
- Touraine, A. (1995). *Critique of modernity*. Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Turam, B. (2011). *Türkiye'de İslam ve devlet: Demokrasi, etkileşim, dönüşüm*. İstanbul: Bilgi Yayınevi.
- Tuğal, C. (2009). *Passive revolution: Absorbing the Islamic challenge to capitalism*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Uzgel, İ., Duru, B. (2009). *AKP kitabı: Bir dönüşümün bilançosu: AKP ve neoliberal popülizm*. Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi.
- Willis, P. E. (1977). *Learning to labour: How working class kids get working class jobs*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Wright, R. B. (2001). *The last great revolution*. New York: Random House.
- Yavuz, H. (2005). *Modernleşen Müslümanlar (Nurcular, Nakşiler, Milli Görüş ve Ak Parti)*. İstanbul: Kitap Yayınevi.
- Yavuz, M. H., Esposito, J. L. (2003). *Turkish Islam and secular state: The Gülen movement*. New York: Syracuse University Press.
- Zürcher, E. J. (2004). *Turkey: A modern history*. London: New York: I.B. Tauris.