

MULTICULTURALISM IN ADULT EDUCATION:  
THE PERCEPTIONS AND PRACTICES OF ADULT EDUCATORS

İSMAİL ELÇİÇEK

BOĞAZİÇİ UNIVERSITY

2022

MULTICULTURALISM IN ADULT EDUCATION:  
THE PERCEPTIONS AND PRACTICES OF ADULT EDUCATORS

Thesis submitted to the  
Institute for Graduate Studies in Social Sciences  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts  
in  
Educational Sciences

by  
İsmail Elçiçek

Boğaziçi University

2022

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I, İsmail Elçiçek, certify that

- I am the sole author of this thesis and that I have fully acknowledged and documented in my thesis all sources of ideas and words, including digital resources, which have been produced or published by another person or institution;
- this thesis contains no material that has been submitted or accepted for a degree or diploma in any other educational institution;
- this is a true copy of the thesis approved by my advisor and thesis committee at Boğaziçi University, including final revisions required by them.

Signature.....

Date .....

## ABSTRACT

### Multiculturalism in Adult Education: The Perception and Practices of Adult Educators

This study aims to investigate how adult educators perceive and practice multicultural education. A phenomenological research design as a qualitative research method was employed in this study. Ten adult educators from three types of non-formal education institutions were interviewed. The data were analyzed by using content analysis. The findings indicated that the adult educators found multicultural education important and mostly advantageous. The educators associated multicultural education with the coexistence of culturally diverse people in a learning environment and educational materials that consider diversity. Even though the educators touched upon several aspects of multicultural education, most did not define multicultural education comprehensively and extensively. Their practices related to multicultural education were limited to content integration and equity pedagogy. The incorporation of multicultural content by the educators was at the levels of contribution and additive. Transformative and social reconstructionist aspects of multicultural education were lacking in the educators' definition and practices of multicultural education. This study may contribute to adult educators' understanding, helping them to comprehend multicultural education from transformative and social action approaches. Further, since multicultural education within the adult education context was not paid attention to enough, this study is expected to contribute to national and international literature.

## ÖZET

Yetişkin Eğitiminde Çokkültürlülük:

Yetişkin Eğitimcilerin Algı ve Pratikleri

Bu çalışma, yetişkin eğitimcilerin çokkültürlü eğitimi nasıl algıladıklarını ve uyguladıklarını araştırmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu çalışmada nitel araştırma yöntemi olarak olgubilim araştırma deseni kullanılmıştır. Üç farklı yaygın eğitim kurumundan 10 yetişkin eğitimci ile görüşülmüştür. Veriler içerik analizi kullanılarak analiz edilmiştir. Bulgular, yetişkin eğitimcilerin çok kültürlü eğitimi önemli ve avantajlı bulduklarını göstermiştir. Eğitimciler, çok kültürlü eğitimi, bir öğrenme ortamında kültürel olarak farklı insanların bir arada bulunması ve çeşitliliği dikkate alan eğitim materyalleriyle ilişkilendirmişlerdir. Eğitimciler çokkültürlü eğitimin çeşitli bileşenlerine değinmiş olsalar da çoğu çokkültürlü eğitimi kapsamlı bir şekilde tanımlamamışlardır. Eğitimcilerin çokkültürlü eğitimle ilgili uygulamaları içerik entegrasyonu ve eşitlikçi pedagoji ile sınırlı kalmıştır. Eğitimciler tarafından çokkültürlü içeriğin entegrasyonu ise iliştiirme ve ekleme düzeyinde olmuştur. Eğitimcilerin tanım ve uygulamaları değerlendirildiğinde çokkültürlü eğitimin dönüştürücü ve sosyal yeniden yapılandırıcı yönleri eksiktir. Bu çalışma yetişkin eğitimcilerin çokkültürlü eğitimi dönüştürücü ve sosyal eylem yaklaşımları açısından anlamalarına yardımcı olabilir. Ayrıca yetişkin eğitimi kapsamında çokkültürlü eğitime yeterince önem verilmediği için bu çalışmanın ulusal ve uluslararası literatüre katkı sağlaması beklenmektedir.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my special thanks and genuine gratitude to Assoc. Prof. Havva Ayşe Caner, my thesis advisor, for the endless amount of her support, effort, guidance, and wise advice throughout my thesis period. She always encouraged, motivated, and strengthened me whenever I tended to lose my motivation, hope, and interest in this challenging journey. Without her continuous support, valuable feedback, and inclusive attitude, I would not complete this work. I am also grateful to Assist. Prof. Raşan Nazlı Somel and Prof. Havva Eylem Kaya, my committee members, for their contribution with their valuable guidance and constructive feedback during the whole process. I also would like to thank Prof. Fatma Gök and Assoc. Prof. Zeynep Hande Sart for their inclusiveness and solidarity and for helping me to have a critical eye and social justice perspective toward educational issues. I also would like to express my appreciation and gratefulness toward my friends, Selin Azizoglu, Kübra Demirörs, Elif Kaya, Dinemis Kip, Sıdıka Gürsoy, İrem Ege Tuğcu, Mohammad Muhaidat, Züleyha Taştan, Sezgin Mengi, Aycan Adıgüzel and Çağdaş Salih Öztaş. They were always with me physically and heartfully whenever I needed their help, and I always felt their social support. I also would like to thank Merve Şen and Ayşenur Vatansever, my friends from the master's cohort, for their all contributions. Lastly, I am also grateful to my family for their support, and I appreciate the endless love and support of my sister Kübra Elçiçek. I would not accomplish this thesis without her psychological support and valuable advice.

*To those who are doomed to failure in education...*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .....	1
1.1 Significance of the study .....	3
1.2 Research questions .....	4
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE .....	6
2.1 Definitions of multiculturalism and multicultural education .....	6
2.2 History of multicultural education .....	20
2.3 Importance of multicultural education .....	22
2.4 Challenges to multicultural education.....	26
2.5 The role of educators on multicultural education.....	28
2.6 Multicultural education approaches .....	30
2.7 Multiculturalism and multicultural education in Turkey .....	37
2.8 Empirical research on multicultural education.....	47
2.9 Adult education from multicultural education perspectives .....	64
2.10 Multicultural adult education and related studies .....	71
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY .....	79
3.1 Research design.....	79
3.2 Participant selection .....	80
3.3 Data collection.....	83
3.4 Data analysis .....	85
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS.....	86
4.1. Definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education.....	87
4.2 Advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education .....	100
4.3 The impact of culture on learning and teaching .....	106

4.4 The role of educator .....	117
4.5 Multicultural education practices .....	120
4.6 Findings according to Banks' model of multicultural education .....	125
4.7 The difficulties that adult educators encounter .....	137
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION .....	140
5.1 Summary .....	140
5.2 Discussion .....	142
5.3 Conclusion.....	173
5.4 Limitations of the study.....	174
5.5 Suggestions for future studies .....	174
APPENDIX A: THE ETHICS COMMITTEE FOR MASTER'S AND PHD THESES IN SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES APPROVAL.....	176
APPENDIX B: PARTICIPANT INFORMED CONSENT.....	177
APPENDIX C: PARTICIPANT INFORMED CONSENT (TURKISH).....	180
APPENDIX D: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS .....	183
APPENDIX E: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS (TURKISH).....	185
APPENDIX F: INTERVIEW NARRATIONS IN TURKISH.....	187
REFERENCES.....	211

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Participants Profiles.....	82
Table 2. The Categories and Themes.....	86
Table 3. Definitions of Multiculturalism and Multicultural Education.....	88
Table 4. Advantages and Disadvantages of Multicultural Education.....	100
Table 5. The Role of Adult Educators on Implementing Multicultural Education.....	117
Table 6. Multicultural Education Practices.....	120
Table 7. Multicultural Education Practices by Banks' Dimensions.....	125

## CHAPTER 1

### INTRODUCTION

Multicultural education takes into account all learners' cultures and aims to transform the learning environment to provide equal educational opportunities to all students from diverse backgrounds to increase their academic achievement (Banks & Banks, 2019). Besides academic achievement, multicultural education has an approach that aims at social, intellectual, and personal development (Bennet, 1999, as cited in Aydın, 2012). Grant and Sleeter (2010) assert that multicultural education is not reduced to a single type of determined educational practice; rather it encompasses various educational practices about equity, including minorities, racially, ethnically, religiously, linguistically, and socio-economically diverse groups, women, and individuals with disability. Further, process of teaching and learning are strongly influenced by power relationships based on race, gender, class, and sexual orientation (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 1998; Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 2000). Thus, multicultural education can be seen more comprehensively as an attempt for educational reform not only reforming the curriculum but also reforming school as a whole (Nieto & Bode, 2008; Sleeter & Grant, 2007, as cited in Banks & Banks, 2010).

Multicultural education studies have been mostly carried out in K-12 and higher education settings, but multicultural education issues have started to get attention in the field of adult education as well. As cited in Johnson-Bailey (2001), Freire's works related to oppression and empowerment of oppressed adult groups (Freire 1970, 1973) provided an important contribution in discussion of multicultural issues in adult education. Diverse ethnic groups' struggles for equality and human

rights and their educational demands during the rise of Civil Rights Movements in the 1970s also urged to consider diversity issues in the field (Banks, 2009; Johnson-Bailey, 2001).

According to Knowles' theory of andragogy, one of the basic principles of adult learning is regarding learners' experiences as a rich source for learning (Knowles, 1980) which are shaped by their cultures (Guy, 1999). Although adults learn for similar purposes, it does not mean that all the adults experience the learning in a single dimension (Naisbitt & Aburdene, 1990). Diverse cultural backgrounds of learners have an impact on their learning process (Gay, 2010). Consequently, taking learners' diverse culture into consideration in creating a learning environment becomes evident as one of the fundamental principles of adult learning.

Increase in the number of the adult learners from diverse races, ethnicities and languages and other forms of diversity necessitate learning approaches that are relevant and responsive to sociocultural aspects of diverse groups (Guy, 1999), which is vital for supporting all adult learners to empower them to hold the control of their own lives (Hollins et al., 1994, as cited in Guy, 1999). However, adult educators encounter difficulties to create a comprehensive learning environment for diverse adult learners (H.E. Kaya, 2014; Tisdell, 1995). There is an emphasis on the role of educators in creating an inclusive and culturally relevant learning environment in the literature since besides learners' cultural diversity, educators' cultural backgrounds also shape the ways they teach (Brown et al., 2000). Adult educators need to get to know about learners' cultural identities and they should go through a process for examining their cultural identities, their beliefs, attitudes, and behaviors related to culture (Guy, 1999). Also, adult educators should create curriculum and use materials that are responsive to learners' cultures. They should

pay attention whether the curriculum and their instructions discriminate and stereotype learners or not (Guy, 1999). Adult educators need to be more knowledgeable about practicing multicultural education in adult education settings to meet the educational needs of diverse learners (Kumi-Yeboah & James, 2011). Adult educators should be cognizant of the way knowledge is produced, who produces the knowledge and the impact of power relations and social structures on formation of curriculum and instruction related to race, ethnicity, gender, and class (Cunningham, 1988, as cited in Tisdell, 1995). Tisdell (1995) suggests that multicultural education approaches can present a framework to adult educators and help them create an inclusive adult learning environment.

Since the way how multicultural education is perceived by educators shape the educators' practices (Aydın & Tonbuloglu, 2014), it is important to determine how adult educators conceptualize multicultural education and what their multicultural education practices are. Thus, the aim of this study is to determine adult educators' perceptions of multicultural education and their practices of multicultural education. Also, this study aims to examine the challenges that adult educators encounter in dealing with diverse learners and practicing multicultural education.

### 1.1 Significance of the study

It is hoped that this study would be significant with its expected contribution to national and international related literature. Multicultural education research is mostly conducted in K-12 and higher education settings. This study aims to contribute to the field of adult education within a multicultural education context.

Although there is a growing international literature in the field of multicultural adult education, most of the studies focused on the sociocultural impact on adult learning.

Even though there is a strong emphasis on the role of adult educators in using multicultural practices, the adult educators' multicultural practices and their perceptions about multicultural education, which is very important in their practices, have often been neglected. Furthermore, this study might be considered as a pioneering work in national adult education literature since despite the diversity of Turkey, no empirical studies related to multiculturalism in adult education conducted in Turkey could be found.

It is also hoped that this study would contribute to the design and implementation of more effective multicultural educational programs and practices in adult education since there are many culturally diverse groups in Turkey. Therefore, this study is deemed important in designing and implementing more effective multicultural adult education programs and practices as well as improving adult educators' knowledge and skills in designing and creating inclusive learning environments for their diverse adult learners.

## 1.2 Research questions

- i. What meaning do adult educators attach to (are the perceptions of adult educators toward) multiculturalism and multicultural education? How do adult educators conceptualize multicultural education?
- ii. What are the perceptions of adult educators about the advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education?
- iii. What are their perceptions of adult educators' roles in incorporating multicultural education in their training?

- iv. According to adult educators' perspective, do learners' and educators' culture have an impact on the teaching and learning process? If they do, in which way?
- v. What are the practices of adult educators in incorporating multicultural approaches in their training / In what ways do they integrate multicultural approaches, if they practice?
- vi. What challenges do adult educators encounter in integrating/ incorporating multicultural education in their trainings, courses, if they have any?

## CHAPTER 2

### REVIEW OF LITERATURE

#### 2.1 Definitions of multiculturalism and multicultural education

In this section, how multiculturalism and multicultural education are defined in the literature will be presented. In the first part of this section, definitions of multiculturalism and in the second part, definitions of multicultural education will be provided.

##### 2.1.1 Multiculturalism

Multiculturalism is a broad term and shows fluidity in its definition. For instance, while multiculturalism is defined very broadly by APA (2002) as the acknowledgment of all dimensions of diversities including all races, languages, religions, ethnicities, genders, sexual orientations, ages, and disabilities, multiculturalism is beyond the acknowledgment of diverse groups; multiculturalism is an attempt to analyze, understand and transform structural inequalities, discrimination, and power relations (Aronowitz & Giroux, 1993). Further, APA Dictionary of Psychology defines multiculturalism as a societal position in which equal status and accessing to power is owned by all ethnic and cultural groups by sustaining their own identities and cultural features.

Reitz (2009) states that multiculturalism is a philosophy and policy, aiming cohesiveness, of culturally diverse groups and recognition of this diversity, it addresses the issues of discrimination and inequality. Reitz (2009) maintains that even though there are diverse approaches in the explanation of multiculturalism, it is commonly used as a philosophy against assimilation ideology. While Parekh (2002)

defines multiculturalism as the coexistence of different cultures as cited in Alanay and Aydın (2016), according to Reitz (2009) multiculturalism does not only mean the physical existence of diverse cultures in a society, but it also recognizes the social and political existence of them by not putting and melting cultural groups and identities into a single cultural pot (Reitz, 2009). Reitz (2009) maintains that multiculturalism is a movement and philosophy that aims to form a society in which cohesiveness of groups who belong to diverse ethnicities and cultural identities are ensured. Recognition and valuing of diversity is one of the essential aspects of multiculturalism. “Not seek to downplay diversity, or to cast all groups within one single cultural mould.” (Reitz, 2009, p1)

Multiculturalism, then, implies a public sphere in which all people from different cultures can freely create their own spaces in the society to enrich their own cultures and empower the interaction among all cultural diversities (Aronowitz & Giroux, 1993). Multiculturalism also acknowledges a social diversity which is formed with the coming together and interaction of all diversities and cultural groups, and their participation in a political and economic life (Banks, 2009; Varma-Joshi, 2004). According to Sleeter & Grant (1987), taking inequity issues into consideration is the main goal of multiculturalism; if it does not deem inequity, multiculturalism loses its function to eliminate inequalities in societies.

There are also three theoretical frameworks conceptualizing multiculturalism classified by McLaren (as cited in Castagno, 2009), which are conservative multiculturalism, liberal multiculturalism, and critical multiculturalism. Conservative framework aims to assimilate culturally different groups into mainstream culture. Liberal multiculturalism is characterized by acceptance, recognition, valuing and appreciation of cultural diversity. Lastly, critical multiculturalism as opposed to the

first two frameworks, discuss diversity in regard to inequalities, power relations and social justice (Alismail, 2016; Castagno, 2009).

Some scholars also underline the importance of education in multiculturalism by relating the definition of the concept with education.

For instance, Banks and Banks (2010) defines multiculturalism within the context of education by remarking as:

A philosophical position and movement that assumes that the gender, ethnic, racial, and cultural diversity of a pluralistic society should be reflected in all of the institutionalized structures of educational institutions, including the staff, the norms and values, the curriculum, and the student body (p.447).

In addition to the definition of Banks and Banks (2010), conceptualization of multicultural education will be discussed in detail in the following part.

### 2.1.2 Multicultural education

As mentioned before, one of the primary aims of this study is to examine how adult educators perceive the concept of multiculturalism and multicultural education.

When considering the aim of this study, literature related to the conceptualization of multicultural education was reviewed. Since multicultural education is mostly studied in K-12 and higher education levels, the review findings related to the definitions of multicultural education will mostly be presented from the K-12 and higher education literature. Literature related to multicultural education shows that the definition of multicultural education varies among scholars (Aydın,2013; Banks & Banks, 2010; Gay, 1994; Gorski, 2010; Sleeter and Grant, 1987; Tisdell, 1995). Varieties in the definitions of multicultural education can be seen as creating a confusion and vagueness in understanding and proper implementation of multicultural education (Banks, 1993b; Castagno,2009).

Multicultural education is considered by some educators as a celebration of ethnic holidays and integration of people of colors' experiences, or it is seen as including not just color but also gender (Banks & Banks, 2010). It is also noted by Kumi-Yeboah and B. James (2011) multicultural education is to learn and to teach cultural and historical backgrounds of all students no matter what the education system is.

Beyond incorporation of people experiences into curriculum, multicultural education is attached a meaning as an attempt to restructure school as a whole in order to foster equity in education for all culturally different groups (Banks, 2009; Gorski, 2010; Nieto and Bode, 2008; Sleeter & Grant, 2007). For example, Banks (2001) defines multicultural education as an educational reform action which aims to make transformative changes in the education system and promote individuals' critical thinking. However, it is not just an action for curriculum changes, rather it is a movement for a social transformation (Banks & Banks, 1997; 2001). According to Banks (2009), multicultural education refers to an idea, a process, and an educational reform act. The idea behind multicultural education implies that every single student should have an equal chance for learning and should benefit from educational opportunities equally without regarding their race, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, social class, and any kind of identities. Also, multicultural education draws attention to the point that a group of students who have certain identities are privileged to access high quality of education whereas other groups of students do not have it due to their diverse identities and cultures (Banks, 2009). Furthermore, Grant and Ladson-Billings (1997) address that multicultural education is based on the principles of freedom, justice, human rights, human dignity, equality, and equity.

Some other scholars also conceptualize multicultural education by emphasizing its transformative goal and standing against social injustices and inequalities. For example, According to Bennet (2001), there are four important essential principles of multicultural education that also constitute the foundations of multicultural education.

Cultural pluralism is one of the essential principles of multicultural education. Cultural pluralism addresses the values including equity, social justice, dignity, and human rights and affirms the rights and freedom of all groups from different ethnicities to sustain their own cultural identities (Bennet, 2001). Even cultural pluralism accepts and appreciates diversity, cultural pluralism conditions the minority groups to harmonize with the dominant mainstream culture and comply with the national identity to be able to maintain their own cultures. It lacks political, educational, and economic justice (Bennet, 2001). Hence, another fundamental principle of multicultural education as a complementary to the principle of cultural pluralism to annihilate structural inequities based on diversities and including not only diversities in race and ethnicity but also diversities related to gender, social class, disability, and sexual orientation. This principle, beyond prevention of prejudices and discrimination at an individual level, focuses on the issues of systematic and structural oppressions and political inequities at a societal level (Bennet, 2001) The third essential principle pays attention to culture and its significance in education. Bennet (2001) defines culture as “Culture refers to a society’s shared beliefs, social values, world views, and preferred standards of behaving.” (p.173). Gay (2000) points out that culture should not be ignored, and it matters in every part of education including assessment, instruction, curriculum, and administration (as cited in Bennet, 2001). As a last principle of multicultural

education, it is founded on the basis of educational equity and academic success.

Bennet (2001) discusses that educational equity should not be understood as equal exam scores and indicates that the potential of the students can differ, which necessitates changes in instruction according to the needs of the students.

Furthermore, Gorski (2010) defines multicultural education as a transformative educational approach that critically and responsively deal with the educational policies and implementations which are discriminatory. According to Gorski (2010), multicultural education is based on the principles of social justice, equity, and critical pedagogy and characterized with the idea that it attempts to enable experiences in education through which every single student 'potentials are fully accomplished as active learners whose social awareness are high. Thus, Gorski (2010)'s definition of multicultural education underlines transformative change as its goal so Gorski divided the transformation into three dimensions, which are transformation of the self, school, and society. For the self-transformation, an educator should go over critically and continuously how their prejudices influence the way they teach and their students (Gorski, 2010). As for the transformation of school, it emphasizes a pedagogy that is student centered, inclusive curriculum, educational tools and materials, school climate and assessment (Gorski, 2010). All students' voices and experiences should be paid attention to, and they should be encouraged to think critically toward all the teaching and learning process, measurement and evaluation of the students should be reviewed and be developed according to students' learning needs and help them to accomplish their own potential. Lastly, with the transformation of schools, the aim of multicultural education is also seen as to transform society and ensure equity and social justice (Gorski, 2010).

Consequently, multicultural education has a transformative goal which aims to reform the education system in terms of equality and social justice to create an equal educational environment for all students regardless of what their diversity is (Banks, 2009)

To sum up, after a general review of the literature, it can be said that there are multiple definitions of multicultural education. multicultural education is perceived as adding ethnic dances, festivals, food as the richness of diversity to the curriculum within mainstream perspective, whereas some others perceive it as the education for social justice and inequality from political, transformative, or reconstructionist perspective (Banks, 1993b; Banks, 2009; Sleeter and Grant, 1987). There are also distinctions in defining which form of diversities or cultural groups as the target group of multicultural education. Some scholars 'approaches emphasize only racial and ethnic diversity some others comprehend all form of diversity regarding race, ethnicity, religion, gender, sexual orientation, disability etc. (Sleeter & Grant, 1987). However, despite the variations of the definitions, there are some common points agreed on the definitions and goals of multicultural education; it means having knowledge about cultural diversity and appreciating it; it is about changing the curriculum, teaching material, instruction, or institutions to include cultural diversities (Banks, 1993b; Gay, 1994; Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

Some scholars had an attempt to clarify and reduce the confusion about what multicultural education means by developing some typologies that identify conceptualizations and the approaches followed by scholars and educators practicing multicultural education. For example, Sleeter and Grant (1987) did a meta-analysis: they conducted and analyzed a literature review to elucidate the meaning of multicultural education. They reviewed 89 articles and 39 books. It was found that

the meaning of multicultural education differs from person to person. However, there is a general agreement on the meaning of multicultural education, which is the educational changes that aim to help people of color. It was also revealed from the findings of the review, the studies in the field in general emphasizes race and ethnicity as a dimension of diversity while some of them also mention gender and language. Social class and disability were included in a few of the studies (Sleeter & Grant, 1987). Banks (1993b) also developed a dimensional model so that multicultural education can be easily conceptualized and practiced by educators. Hence, Sleeter and Grant (1987) and Banks (1993b) summarize the approaches in multicultural education literature and develop multicultural education models. In the multicultural education approaches section, these both models will be presented successively.

### 2.1.3 Meaning of culture

Even though perception of the concept of culture is not aimed to investigate, since one of the aims of this study is to examine what adult educators think about how adult learners' cultures influence their learning process, culture is an important concept that should be elaborated within the context of education. Therefore, in this section, definitions of culture and approaches toward it reviewed in the literature will be provided.

Culture is a complex concept that not everyone can explain clearly even though it is frequently used in daily life. It is associated within different contexts (Convertino et al., 2013). For example, it can refer to something that is related to a cultural knowledge, a music taste, art, or a habit. Within the educational context, it can be associated with otherness or "tourist approach". Also, culture is a concept

that is gotten to know by educators via the field of multicultural education, of which main focus is to integrate ethnic differences into curriculum (Convertino et al., 2013). However, educators should have a deeper understanding of culture beyond viewing culture from a *tourist-based approach* including holidays, foods etc. and should grapple with its connection with education (Convertino et al., 2013).

As discussed by Convertino et al. (2013), when looking at education system in Western nations, schools are mostly expected to exhibit a culture owned by dominant culture having a higher cultural capital, which is white and middle class (Convertino et al., 2013). Due to the fact that schools are the cultural capital of a dominant group, students from this group maintain more learning opportunities, more academic success, and more economic opportunities after they graduate than the students who have different cultural capital from the dominant groups, meaning mismatching with school culture (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977, as cited in Convertino et al., 2013). According to Levinson, Foley and Holland (1996), because, the schools only exemplify the dominant group's cultural characteristics, other groups whose culture are not represented do not benefit from opportunities, so schools are more likely to reproduce inequalities among classes (as cited in Convertino et al., 2013).

Convertino, Levinson and González (2019) discuss that culture is very commonly perceived as certain and separate characteristics including holidays, foods, customs, language etc. that are possessed by different groups of people, which perception is also known as *tourist-based approach*. However, they contend that this way of seeing culture does not provide exact and sufficient understanding of culture, especially for educators. In order to have a holistic understanding of what multicultural education means, it is also crucial to grasp the meaning of the concept of culture.

Convertino et al. (2013) elaborate the connection between culture and education through two important cultural models practiced from the years of 1950 to now describing how educational achievement is connected to culture, which are called *cultural deficit* and *cultural difference* models. In the late 1950s, according to cultural deficit models, students from minority groups were seen as people deficit and below a satisfactory standard in terms of language, social life, and family (Convertino et al., 2013). This cultural deficit model has adverse influences on teaching and learning processes especially regarding students who are poor and from minority groups. This model gives rise to misunderstanding and the usage of the concept of culture in an unsuitable way within the context of education. Culture is viewed in this model as certain and unchanging characteristics and values that are assumed that all people in the group have the same. As an example, referring to this misunderstanding, students coming from a culture are stereotyped as poor, are not expected to learn reading, are unwilling to work and whose parents are indifferent toward education. This understanding also leads to these students' failure in education (Convertino et al., 2013).

After several decades, in the 1970s and 1980s, cultural differences model started to be paid attention, according to which, these students' failure in education resulted from the fact that culture in school and at home do not match with each other (Heath, 1983; Levinson et al., 1996). Heath's (1983) conducted a study examining "home literacy practices" of communities from three different communities, African American community from working class, 2 white communities; one of them is from working class and the other is from middle class. The study revealed that white-middle class community's literacy practices were aligned with school practices. Practices of the people different from that class did not

match with the school practices (as cited in Convertino et al., 2013). Considering this study in terms of cultural difference model, cultural difference model suggests that educators should get to know and celebrate students' cultures and be involved with their communities' language practices so that they design their courses accordingly. However, this model was criticized for just paying attention to changing the methods educators use but ignores issues related to political, economic, and power relationships between dominant groups and subordinated-minority groups (Convertino et al., 2013).

Convertino et al. (2013) assert that educators should approach culture and its connection with education from multiple dimensions not depending on a single dimension. They should embark on a cultural approach that goes beyond holiday, foods, language, and tourism: they should have a cultural approach that focuses on culture from a holistic perspectives consisting of power issues and political and economic inequalities between people from underrepresented groups and people from dominant group (Convertino et al., 2013).

Culture is also defined by Bullivant (1993) a program that a group has in order to survive and adapt in an environment (as cited in Banks, 2010). Shared knowledge, concepts, and values by a group of people are the elements of this program (Banks, 2010). Banks (2010) notes that "The essence of a culture is not its artifacts, tools, or other tangible cultural elements but how the members of the group interpret, use, and perceive them. It is the values, symbols, interpretations, and perspectives that distinguish one person from another in modernized societies."(p.8).

Also, as it was cited in Guy (1999), Culture is "personal, communal, familial, institutional, societal, and global" (Banks & Banks, 1989, p. 35). At this point it is also important to define the meaning of a group. Banks (2019) defines the group as

“The group is the social system that carries a culture.”(p.10). It is also defined as unity or a shared identity that people have in a collective way (Banks, 2019). Ethnicity, religion, exceptionality, social class, gender, nationality etc. can be counted as groups that people belong to. A person can be a member of an ethnic group but also a member of a religious social class or gender group. Belonging to different groups is also associated with how much people identify themselves with these groups (Banks, 2019). A person might identify themselves strongly with a certain ethnic group whereas not with other groups. For example, an individual might strongly identify oneself as Christian but at the same time black and women. This level of identification might change; the individual might have a stronger religious identity than being a woman or a black. Therefore, it is important for educators and education institutions to familiarize themselves with the students’ identifications and how much they identify themselves and socialize with a group or more than a group in order to have a better understanding of students’ behavior including learning styles, self-esteem, individualistic or collaborative etc. in a learning environment (Banks, 2019).

Multicultural education is characterized by an idea that better learning opportunities are more possessed by a certain group of students than students from different groups. Equal learning opportunities in education are refuted systematically by schools (Banks, 2014). For example, educational opportunities that students living with disabilities experience are not equal with other students in school. Also, gender of students is another factor influencing learning (Banks, 2019).

A study conducted by Boaler and Sengupta-Irving (2012) results that boys and girls show similar success on math and science in the early years of education but in the following grades, there is an achievement difference on math scores; boys

get higher score than girls (as cited in Banks, 2019). Similarly, regarding students' race, compared to white students, the color of students fall behind in terms of academic achievement as their grade level increases (Banks, 2019). Also, males from people of color particularly males who are African Americans encounter an excessive rate of disciplinary actions and suspensions at school (Sadker & Zittleman, 2007).

Hence, multicultural education also aims to reform all educational institutions in which equal learning opportunities are experienced by all students belonging to all cultural groups (Banks, 2014). Further, Banks (2019) notes that educators not just get to know students' groups that the students identify themselves with but also should grapple the intersection of ethnicity, gender, social class, exceptionality, LGBTIQ and other cultural dimensions that affect students' learning since these dimensions are not singly influence students' behavior but also, they influence them in an interactive way. Banks (2019) provides an example of this interaction from Perney's (1976) study findings as follows:

Middle-class and highly assimilated Mexican American students tend to be more field independent than lower-class and less-assimilated Mexican American students. African American students tend to be more field dependent (group oriented) than White students; females tend to be more field dependent than male students. Therefore, it can be hypothesized that African American females would be the most field dependent when compared to African American and White males and White females (p.12).

Thus, multicultural education pays attention to and examines the impact of such variables and intersection of these variables consisting of race, gender, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, sexual identity and other variables on learning process of students and their learning behavior (Banks, 2014). Multicultural education suggests that educators cannot have a holistic understanding of their students' learning needs and behavior just through learning students' ethnicity or race

(Banks, 2019). In order to have a comprehensive understanding, the educators should also have knowledge about their students' social class, native language, or other variables that the students identify themselves with and should also pay attention to how much the students identify themselves with these variables (Banks, 2019).

Although these literature findings are provided within the context of K-12 education, there is also a strong emphasis on the impact of adult learners' cultures on their learning put forth by some scholars (Banks, 2014; Guy, 1999; Merriam et al., 2006; Sheared, 1994; Yelich-Biniecki & Kang, 2014). For example, adult education programs are criticized because the programs are designed according to the experiences of the white and middle-class group and the profile that the programs are usually provided to the adult learners from that group (Flannery, 1994; Merriam & Brockett, 1997; Ross-Gordon, 1990). Further, it is noted by Ross-Gordon (1990) that participation rates of the ethnic and racial minorities are lower in adult education. It was also stated that learners coming from disadvantaged groups are more likely to be excluded by a system of an education that is dominated by mainstream culture (Guy, 1999). Guy (1999) also claims that culture is a factor that shapes all adults' lives and adult learners learn within the context of culture and society that they belong to. It is also maintained by Guy (1999) "the nature of the fit between learners' cultural backgrounds and their educational experiences is of central concern" (p.13). As it was discussed in the section of adult educators' roles on applying multicultural education and multicultural education practices, there was an important emphasis on getting to know learners' cultures and considering them while designing a training. In relation to this, Sheared (1994) states that learning materials that do not appeal to the lives of learners, they will be irrelevant for the learners and learning will be ineffective and difficult. It was also noted that adult learners know and learn in a

cultural way, so it is crucial to familiarize educators themselves with the learners' cultural backgrounds (Goldberger, et al., 1995; Yelich-Biniecki & Kang, 2014).

## 2.2 History of multicultural education

With the rise of civil right movements, some educational movements emerged in the late 1960s and the beginnings of 1970s such as special needs education, bilingual education, desegregation, and mainstream education. The common goal of all these movements was to provide equal and accessible education to diverse groups. One of the educational reform movements also emerged in this time was multicultural education (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

Multicultural education emerged first in the US as a natural outcome of the civil right movements in 1960s and 1970s (Grant & Ladson-Billings, 1997) After the US, multicultural education started to arise in other countries like the United Kingdom, Canada, Australia. Multicultural education did not appear suddenly, and schools did not start to practice it immediately. It has developed stage by stage in the light of the protests, demands and needs of diversities in countries over time. The focuses, definitions and goals of multicultural education has been evolved and shaped in the direction of human right movements and protests such as feminist movements, gay right movements etc. (Banks, 2009; Mayo, 2010). In the beginnings, the focus of multicultural education was the racially, ethnically, and linguistically diverse people but over time it also began to bring other diverse groups such as individual with disabilities, LGBTIQ people and women into the focus (Banks, 2009; Grant & Ladson-Billings, 1997; Ramsey et al., 2003).

Education systems in almost all countries have been following the mainstream culture glorified by their own nations, which reproduce injustice,

inequality and discrimination experienced by minority and diverse groups (Gillborn, 2008). This situation was much worse in the past. There were big achievement differences between minority groups and racially, ethnically, and linguistically dominant groups living in various countries (Banks, 2009). These minority groups were having academic and language difficulties at schools. With the impact of civil right movements, the minority groups were protesting these inequalities and huge academic differences and were demanding that all educational institutions should include their cultures (Gorski, 1999; Banks, 2009) School responded to these demands just for the purposes of silencing the protests (Banks, 2009) For example, they started to practice a limited multicultural education; they made some changes in the curriculum; ethnic holidays, dances and festivals were integrated to the courses (Boyer, 1985; Cole, 1986; Ramsey et al., 2003). Language programs were found to eliminate language problems of minority groups . For immigrant students, teacher recruitment were sometimes being made by considering the immigrant students 'hometown (Banks, 2009; Ramsey et al., 2003).

However, it was noticed that these changes were not enough to reduce the achievement differences between minority groups and the mainstream, which showed that there was a need for further multicultural education practices; need for change in structure and restructure of the school system for the aim of increasing the academic achievement of the students coming from diverse cultures (Aydın, 2013; Banks, 2009; Gorski, 1999). The need for new multicultural implementations was emphasizing the attitude, belief and value development of teachers and students (Banks, 2009). At this point, multicultural education started to take a more comprehensive position as an educational reform act on school system like school culture, student testing and assessment, expectations, and attitudes of teachers

(Banks, 2009; Gorski, 1999; Nieto, 1996) In time, the critiques and debates in definition, scope and practices of multicultural education led to the rise of the need to refer this educational movement in different versions such as intercultural education, antiracist education (Banks, 2009).

### 2.3 Importance of multicultural education

When considering the conceptualizations of multicultural education, it can be said that there are many anticipated consequences of multicultural education regarding fundamental components of multicultural education including appreciating diversity, learning cultural differences, equal opportunities in education and social transformation (Ameny-Dixon, 2004; Gay, 1994; Nieto & Bode, 2008; Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

In the literature, it was found that some scholars synthesized the expected results of multicultural education. For example, Casto (2020) synthesized the basic principles of multicultural education, which remarks the importance of multicultural education. Casto's (2020) synthesis illustrates that the goals that multicultural education advocates are prone to be divided into three categories: "educational equity, cultural tolerance, and social transformation"(p.22). In the first category, educational equity. According to Gorski (2011), multicultural education not only fosters equity in education but also ensures social justice. Teaching multiple perspectives will necessitate teachers to grasp globally how schooling is affected socio-politically (as cited in Casto, 2020). There is an important common point that the scholars in the field of multicultural education shared that learning opportunities should be possessed by every single student equally. For example, including diverse cultural groups into mainstream curriculum should be practiced by teachers to make

all students benefit from (Banks, 1999). Secondly, multicultural education aims to construct a society that is democratic and tolerant, which also consists of reconstruction of educational environment in which the attitudes of showing respectfulness and inclusiveness toward cultural diversity are promoted (Banks, 1987; Manning & Baruth, 2004). Lastly, as similar to Gay (1994)'s categorization of goals and contributions of multicultural education, Casto's (2020) synthesis shows that another essential goal of multicultural education is to transform society as a whole. This encourages students and teachers to have a critical consciousness and understanding of power relations and impact of culture on learning process, and to have an active role to diminish the harm caused by discrimination toward culturally or ethnically minority groups. It is asserted that multicultural education challenges a culture dominated by the mainstream ideology through critical examinations of power relations (Casto, 2020)

Besides the Casto's (2020) categorization, Gay (1994) similarly but more broadly divided the goals that are anticipated to reach into 6 categories and elaborated them under these categories. The categories are "ethnic and cultural literacy, personal development, attitude and values clarification, multicultural social competence, basic skills proficiency, educational equity and excellence, and empowerment for societal reform" (p.15).

The first aim and the contribution of multicultural education is to develop "ethnic and cultural literacy", which helps people to get to know and have knowledge about ethnically diverse groups in terms of their historical background, social, political, and economic situation, cultural features, important names, and events. It is also emphasized that provided knowledge needs to be inclusive, including both cultural similarities and differences and this knowledge should have

analytical and comparative characteristics. It is also stated that learning about different groups' cultural characteristics constitutes the basis of respect and appreciation toward diversity (Gay, 1994).

Another valuable contribution of multicultural education is that it fosters people's personal development, exploration and understanding of the self, positive perception toward the self and appreciating one's own cultural identity through which also enhances achievement of a person academically, socially, and intellectually. This personal development can also help a person to develop interaction with other people and increase respect toward these people's cultures (Gay, 1994).

Consequently, multicultural education also creates a space in which people from culturally different groups can interact with each other, learn from each other and their negative attitudes and stereotypes toward each other can turn to positives. It helps people to examine critically their attitudes and behaviors toward others (Gay, 1994). As it was mentioned before, the principles and values of freedom, justice, human rights, human dignity, equality, and democracy are the foundational elements of philosophy of multicultural education (Grant & Ladson-Billings, 1997). Hence, multicultural education also strengthens these principles. Further, the interaction and communication among culturally diverse people also help to resolve conflicts, understand each other's perspectives, frame of references, thoughts and beliefs and empower people's multicultural social competence (Gay, 1994). Another contribution of multicultural education is facilitating the teaching and learning process. Different people have different learning needs and multicultural education advocates that there is a relationship between success of the students and the teaching methods used and it suggests that teaching materials and methods should be designed

in accordance with learners' cultures and their learning needs (Gay, 1994). Thus, through multicultural education there will be increase in some basic skills related to provided content area as well as problem solving, critical thinking and conflict resolution skills and academic achievement of learners from different cultural groups having different learning needs (Gay, 1994). Banks (2010) emphasizes that

Another important idea in multicultural education is that some students, because of these characteristics, have a better chance to learn in schools as they are currently structured than do students who belong to other groups or who have different cultural characteristics (p.3).

Within the emphasize put by Banks (2010) on the learning opportunity differences based on cultural characteristics, multicultural education helps providing equity in education (Gay, 1994). It is characterized by the idea that equal learning opportunities should be provided to all students no matter what their cultural identity is (Banks, 2010). Therefore, educators should create diverse educational tools and methods and should offer various options that fitting to diverse learners' cultural characteristics (Gay, 1994).

Lastly, as explained in Sleeter and Grants' (1987) multicultural education for social reconstruction category and Banks (1993a)'social action approach, another contribution and aim of multicultural education emphasizing transformation in society, multicultural education empowers students to develop some values like equality and dignity, decision making and leadership skills and democratic attitudes that enables them to be active citizens in decision making process socially and politically for societal changes in order to eliminate inequalities in society between different cultural groups (Banks, 1991; NCSS, 1992, as cited in Gay, 1994; Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

As distinct from the synthesis made by Casto (2020) and Gay (1994) that underlining the importance and strength of multicultural education, Ameny-Dixon

(2004) also specified several important benefits of multicultural education within global and higher education context. One of the contributions of multicultural education put a remark on enlarging productivity. Thanks to the availability of multiple diverse mental resources, productiveness will increase. It also strengthens people' cognitive and moral development. It is assumed that multicultural education enables culturally diverse people to interact with each other. In relation to that, with the help of diverse points of view toward an issue, multicultural education improves creativity and problem-solving skills. Also, biases and stereotypes diminish by means of the interactions of people from diverse cultural identities. Additionally, contribution to a society's vitalization owing to cultural richness and expanding the way of perceiving the world are the other benefits of multicultural education (Ameny-Dixon, 2004).

#### 2.4 Challenges to multicultural education

Multicultural education is criticized by its adversaries as aggravating division among different groups, consequently hindering a unity in a society, rather than facilitating it (Egne, 2015). Egne (2015) states that the most controversy related to multicultural education occurs among the scholars who are radicals and the conservatives. Nieto (2009) claims that they both blame each other for being conservative and radical; the radicals evaluate multicultural education as conservative while the conservatives judge it as radical (as cited in Egne, 2015). Banks (2006, p.184) maintained that conservatives content that schools have basic goals like teaching science, language, knowledge, some skills, and attitudes that support students to able to function and join the society, however, overemphasize on multicultural education deviates from these basic goals of schools (as cited in Egne, 2015). When it comes to the radical

critiques, they assert that multicultural education is inadequate for reaching the transformative goal of multicultural education; because it only pays attention to cultural diversities and interaction among diversities, it neglects the issues of power relations and oppressions embedded on the institutionalized structures that underrepresent and suppress people from minority groups (Banks, 2006, as cited in Egne, 2015).

There is another argument among scholars embarking on assimilation theory and scholars of multicultural education. It is argued by assimilation theory that a group different from the dominant group in a society is supposed to follow dominant group's path and to abandon their own cultural identities (Zhou, 2002, as cited in Egne, 2015) Within the context of learning, the goal of it is to make the different groups to have dominant group identity and learning process are all designed according to this goal. However, instead of designing teaching and learning processes dominated by a mainstream ideology, multicultural education scholars emphasize the importance of an education approach in which learning occurs in congruence with all learners' cultural characteristics (Banks et al., 2001 as cited in Egne, 2015).

Furthermore, Banks (2014) argued that multicultural education was critiqued and seen "as a movement against Western civilization, as anti-White, and by implication, anti-American (Chavez, 2010 )" (p.51). It was also perceived as a movement that emphasizes incorporation of African point of view to the curriculum, which makes it "Afrocentric" implying that it leaves out whites (Banks, 2014).

Lastly, multicultural education is also criticized for its unclear conceptualization and scope in terms of who is included in it (Nieto, 2009). It has been paid attention by many scholars to include gender, disability, social class, and

other differences in addition to racial and ethnic differences. However, some other scholars assume that focusing on including all dimensions of differences give rise to diminishing the primary aim of multicultural education, which is providing equal educational opportunities for people of color who are marginalized (Gay 2003, as cited in Nieto, 2009).

## 2.5 The role of educators on multicultural education

So far, literature review of how multicultural education is defined by scholars and its importance and challenges were presented. They show that all the definitions made by scholars and the importance of multicultural education put a quite important reference to the required roles of educators on understanding, practicing, and ensuring multicultural education. It was noted by multicultural education scholars that educators assume a significant role on implementation of multicultural education (Aydın, 2013; Banks, 1999; Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009; Gorski, 2010; Guy, 1999; Ladson-Billing, 1992; Marchesani & Adams, 1992; Rhodes, 2018). For example, in Banks' dimensional model of multicultural education, Banks (1999) assists educators to have a better understanding of multicultural education and guides them to be able to practice multicultural education. However, to be able to implement these dimensions mentioned before, all parts of educational institutions including teachers, administrators, curriculum etc. should be restructured so that equal learning opportunities are provided to students belonging to all cultural groups (Banks, 1999).

To ensure this, Banks (2014) identifies several roles of teachers emphasizing culturally sensitive attitudes, teaching materials, and methods. Firstly, teachers' expectations toward all students should be high and they should be positively responsive, care and have positive attitudes toward all students. Secondly, teachers

should use teaching methods complying with students' learning and cultural features. They should also design and use teaching materials comprehending multiple and diverse points of view of diverse cultural groups. Further, students' mother tongue and dialects that they use should be respected by teachers.

Additionally, measurement and evaluation methods used by teachers should be responsive to student cultures (Banks, 2014).

In addition to Banks (2014) identification of requirements that teachers should meet, Marchesani and Adams (1992) provides a model, which will be discussed in the multicultural adult education section in detailed way, emphasizing educators' roles extensively on implementing multicultural education (as cited in Guy, 1999). Their model underlines educators' own culture, learners' culture, curriculum and teaching methods and materials. Firstly, in order to create a culturally sensitive learning environment, educators should critically examine their own cultures, attitudes, beliefs, and thoughts. Also, it is maintained that teachers should get to know learners' cultures and should understand the meanings attached by learners in terms of their cultural identity. It was also noted by Kumi-Yeboah and James (2011) that adult educators need to be well knowledgeable about practicing multicultural education for adult learners so that they fulfill the culturally diverse adult learners' needs. However, it is not enough to learn learner's' culture but they need to use the cultural knowledge in their instructions. Teachers should use educational materials that learners culturally relate themselves with. Lastly, educators should share the power and responsibility with learners, and they should pay attention to active participation of all learners. It was also discussed by Rhodes (2018) that educators should also provide learners an opportunity to take decisions on determining educational goals and activities,

Gorski (2010) also indicated that educators should be well-prepared for the facilitation of all students' learning process. They should actively have a role in the examination of all elements in education including teaching methods and materials, institutions, and assessment. Moreover, as described by Kumi Yeboah and James (2011), changes in the curriculum should not be restricted in the level of integration of ethnically, racially, linguistically, or other culturally different groups into the content. Multicultural education also deals with power relations and social inequity issues based on race, social class, ethnicity and gender and the intersection among them (Banks, 1993c; Grant & Sleeter, 1986, as cited in Kumi-Yeboah & James, 2011). Also, multicultural education is achieved when every component of the schools including educational policies, teaching styles, attitudes of teachers, and assessment is transformed (Banks 2002; Banks, 2006, as cited in Kumi-Yeboah & James, 2011). Therefore, the educators should also be critically aware and cognizant of how and by whom knowledge is produced and they should also be able to examine the structural power, oppressions, and inequalities (Cunningham, 1988, as cited in Tisdell, 1995). Additionally, educators should support learners to grasp how issues nationally, regionally, culturally socially, economically, politically, and globally are related to each other (Banks, 2004).

## 2.6 Multicultural education approaches

In this section, multicultural education models developed by Sleeter and Grant (1987) and Banks (1993b) will be provided.

### 2.6.1 Sleeter and Grant's model

With the civil right movements and multicultural education movements, studies conducted in the US related to multicultural education literature started to arise in the 1970s. Until the late 1980s there were not any studies that reviewed the literature on multicultural education and analyzed and synthesized the views, discussions, theories, and practices in the field of multicultural education. The first pioneering review was done by Sleeter and Grant (1987) who reviewed more than 100 studies including books and articles to clarify the meaning of multicultural education by examining explanations made by authors about the term. After their examination of the literature, they classified the different perspectives and discussions revealed from multicultural education literature into 5 approaches and evaluate the literature within the frame of these approaches. These approaches are (1) teaching the culturally different, (2) human relations, (3) single studies, (4) multicultural education, (5) education that is multicultural and social reconstructionist.

- i. Teaching the culturally different approach: This approach underlines the cultural differences or diversity as richness and a bridge for the promotion of social mobility. The aim of this approach is to help culturally different students to increase their academic achievement, to make them adapt to the mainstream norms and culture in the US and to make them competent in necessary functional skills and knowledge that enable them to find a job and actively participate in the mainstream dominant culture of the US. The literacy courses or language education can be shown as one of examples of multicultural practices to increase culturally different people's achievement and welfare. This approach does not aim to emphasize power relations and eliminating educational inequalities between marginalized groups and dominant culture. The multicultural education framed by this approach is only

culturally different from mainstream culture in the US, whiteness. Also, even though this approach is about teaching culturally different things, there are differences in description of different cultures. Scholars mostly included only racially or ethnically different groups whereas a few others take other forms of diversities such as gender, social class into consideration in their description of culturally different (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

ii. Human relations approach: Intercultural communication is emphasized in this approach. It aims to help students to develop positive communication skills and relationships between diverse cultures within the existing structured system. The issues related to the system like power relations, social structures, oppression, poverty are not included and argued by this approach. It is reduced to an individual oriented approach. This approach recommends some practices to the practitioner like doing activities that promote cultural communication and interaction and removing cultural stereotypes from course materials (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

iii. Single studies approach: Unlike other approaches, the focus of this approach stresses a particular culturally different group referring to multicultural education instead of focusing on the culturally different groups in general. These studies deeply look over the specific groups' experiences regarding education. For example, in higher education, there are some courses that can be displayed as the single studies approach such as women studies, African American studies. This approach aims to increase knowledge about specific identities. However, Sleeter and Grant (1987) evaluated that this approach does not pursue a goal for "social action" and does not consider "social stratification". Also, it is criticized that mostly these groups consist of racial and ethnic groups, and it can have tendency to ignore other diversity issues.

For example, even an ethnic group study focuses on race or racism issues, the study or a material can still be sexist or homophobic (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

iv. Multicultural education approach: Even though the approaches explained above are the approaches that are used under the topic of multicultural education, this approach is directly called as the multicultural education approach. There are 5 important common goals followed by this approach, which are to encourage 1) cultural diversity, 2) other life forms, 3) human rights, 4) social justice and 5) equity. As distinct from previous approaches, the terms social justice, human rights and equity are addressed by this approach. This approach aims to eliminate discrimination and prejudice toward the all the students coming from diverse cultures. It also aims to provide equal educational opportunities for all. Changes in curriculum and school systems are desired by this approach to create an inclusive and empowering learning environment (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

v. Multicultural and social reconstructionist education approach: This approach is an expanded version of the multicultural education approach as it aims to help students to promote critical thinking about their own experiences, how their diversity affects their lives in society and reflect them critically. This approach has also a goal to make students question power relations and the oppression by dominant culture in a society. The questioning of who is the privileged and who is the oppressed and marginalized and what makes this distinction are among the critical purposes of this approach. Through the critical thinking practices, it is aimed to encourage students to have an active role in social change by struggling with structural inequalities and in reconstructing the education system. Diversity is not just seen as part or characteristics of a society; it is also considered from the perspective of power relations and oppression. It has more political understanding of the education system

and educational experiences of oppressed groups culturally different groups and marginalized groups. Compared to previous approaches, not just race and ethnicity but gender and social class issues are also taken into consideration more by this approach (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

#### 2.6.2 Banks' model of multicultural education

Banks (2001) states that even though there are so many diverse groups in US society, the content of curriculum, educational materials, schoolbooks are surrounded and represented by one dominant group ideology which is the White supremacy (Tisdell, 1995). Banks (2001) defines multicultural education as educational reform action which aims to make transformative changes in the education system and promote individuals' critical thinking. Banks (2001) However, it is not just an action for curriculum changes, rather it is a movement for a social transformation (cited in Banks & Banks, 1997; 2001). He also maintains that there are multiple explanations from different perspectives, which shapes the way multicultural education is implemented at schools. Banks (2009) summarizes diverse perspectives in the practices of multicultural education under four approaches. These are 1) contributions approach, 2) additive approach, 3) transformation approach, 4) social action approach.

- i. Contributions approach: The focus of this approach is to add contents related to cultural items into the curriculum. Multicultural content is reduced to celebrations, cultural holidays, characters, heroes, and dances of racial or ethnic groups. This approach is mostly applied in K-12 education. However, these cultural characteristics are integrated into the curriculum that is dominated by mainstream culture (Banks, 1993a).

ii. Additive approach: Additive approach is similar to contributions approach in terms of following a mainstream centric curriculum. It integrates diverse cultures into existing curriculum as an addition of materials, unit, book, course etc. without reforming the curriculum. Like, contributions approach, even the additive approach integrates diverse groups from different cultural backgrounds as a separate unit or a course, they are still presented from the perspective of the dominant culture not from the perspectives of cultural groups themselves (Banks, 1993a).

iii. Transformative approach: In contrast to the previous approaches, this approach aims to support students to think critically about the way how and by whom knowledge is produced and take an active role in the knowledge construction process. Students are encouraged to interpret and analyze the content from diverse cultures' perspectives, not just mainstream culture. It challenges the mainstream centric curriculum (Banks, 1993a).

iv. Social action approach: The scope of social action approach is the broader version of the transformative approach. As it is understood by the name of the approach, the main goal of this approach is to empower students to have an active role in social action. It promotes students to discuss and analyze the social issues and making decisions in these issues and take part in the solution of the issues. For example, in the community service class, students develop a project for increasing awareness about immigrants. Also, students can change the reading list and add diverse materials written by authors from diverse cultures in the syllabus of a course if they notice that the majority of the books or articles are written by white authors (Banks, 1993a).

Both Sleeter and Grant (1987) and Banks' (1993b) analysis of multicultural education perspectives shows that regardless of which approach is followed as a way

of multicultural education, they all have deficiencies when it comes to the implementation stage of multicultural education.

Thus, Banks (1993b) developed five dimensions that can enable educators to implement multicultural education more effectively.

i. Content integration: The dimension of content integration is about the infusion of diverse cultures into the subject and classroom materials. This dimension leads to the discussion of which classes are appropriate for the integration of diversity to the content. Some courses like math, science are non-applicable courses for the infusion whereas social sciences or language courses can be viewed as more doable for it (Banks, 1993b).

ii. Knowledge construction: This dimension concerns the process of how knowledge is constructed and how students perceive this process and the knowledge constructed. This dimension helps students and teachers to question and notice how cultural backgrounds of the knowledge producers have an impact on the knowledge production. It also supports students to be a part of the knowledge production process (Banks, 1993b).

iii. Equity pedagogy: It emphasizes the modification of the teaching styles by considering the learning needs of diverse students to increase the academic achievement of the students. It is against the idea of adaptation of the students to the school so the behavioral change expectation from students. Instead, it defends the idea of modification of the schools in accordance with the students 'needs (Banks, 1993b).

iv. Prejudice reduction: While An equity pedagogy rejects the behavioral change, this dimension expects to observe a change. However, this approach aims to

empower students to improve democratic attitudes toward diverse students (Banks, 1993b)

v. Empowering school culture: It underlines all the school components such as administrators, parents, teachers, staff, and their responsibilities to create an environment in which all the cultures are accepted so that students can feel equal, secure, and belonged (Banks, 1993b).

According to Banks' dimensions of multicultural education, multicultural education is not just to integrate diverse races, ethnicities, languages etc. to the content. It also entails to reconstruct the content considering the needs of students and their diversity, which should develop culturally responsive behaviors on teachers and students with the collaboration of all the responsible components of school including teachers, parents, administrators, staff (Banks, 2004).

## 2.7 Multiculturalism and multicultural education in Turkey

According to KONDA's report (2011), there are diverse languages such as Turkish, Kurdish, Zazaki, Armenian, Arabic, Caucasian, Greek, and Circassia spoken by diverse people with 36 ethnicities (as cited in Aydın & Damgacı, 2014). This diversity has further been increased with the rapid increase of refugees in Turkey. As reported in ERG report (2017), there are 2. 871. 112 Syrian refugees living in Turkey. The refugee population in Turkey does not only consist of people coming from Syria but also includes refugees from other countries such as Somalia, Iraq, and Iran. In addition to ethnic, racial, and language diversity, Turkey is a country that is also religiously diverse including religious groups such as Muslims, Sunnis, Alevis, Christians and other non-Muslims (Koltuk & Kocakaya, 2018). In addition to diversity related to race, religion, ethnicity and language, there are other diverse

groups existing in Turkey including individuals with disabilities, different sexual orientations, and eating preferences such as vegetarian, vegan, celiac etc.

The legislation and committed international conventions acknowledge the right to education as one of the fundamental human rights in Turkey. In the Constitution of the Republic of Turkey, Article 42 emphasizes that nobody can be deprived of education rights. Also, Article 10 underlines that everybody is equal before the law regardless of language, race, sex, color, political opinion, religion, philosophical belief, sect, and so on (Constitution of the Republic of Turkey, 1982). When considering Articles 42 and 10, it can also be said that the Constitution protects all people's right to receive an education without discriminating against anyone due to their language, race, sex, color, political opinions, religion, beliefs, etc. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) also underlines that regardless of race, sex, ethnicity, social class, color, language, or religion, every single individual has all the rights in Article 2, and education is a right for everyone, and education should increase tolerance, respect, and peace among all nations, races, and religions in Article 26 (UN, 1948). Based on these articles, it is clear that education is not only a right that provides equal access to education but is also responsible to eliminate discriminative implications in the education system.

According to the report published by ERG (2018), even though Turkey's national and international laws ensure all people's right to access education regardless of their cultural diversity, there are many groups of people that encounter difficulties in the process in Turkey. These people are girls, poor children, children whose families are seasonal agricultural workers, Syrian children under temporary protection, people coming from other countries such as Iraq, Afghanistan, and Somali with forced migration, people whose mother tongue is not Turkish, people

living in rural areas, people with special needs, people with learning difficulties,, LGBTI+ and Roman people. In addition to these groups, the report also underlines the people who are in multiple disadvantageous positions such as a child who is a girl, living in poverty in a rural area and living with disability (ERG, 2018).

Moreover, the study conducted by Semerci, et al. (2017) reported that othering and keeping a social distance are high among the young people who are between the ages of 18-29 toward the people who do not have a similar sexual, religious, ethnic, or national identity, and schools and families play a major role in development of these attitudes (as cited in ERG, 2018). A cultural mismatch between home and school experienced by students leads them to be subjected to discriminatory practices, thus, they are expected to leave their cultural characteristics and adapt to the mainstream culture taught at schools (Acar-Çiftçi & Gürol, 2015) or fail, and drop out of school (Acar-Çiftçi & Gürol, 2015; Acar-Çiftçi, 2019; Aydın, 2013). For example, Kurdish students are likely to perceive their mother tongue as an obstacle and problem, when they are exposed to the constant warnings given by their teachers about not using Kurdish as their mother tongue at schools (Uçarlar & Derince, 2012). This discriminatory practice based on the students' ethnicity and language forces students to give up their language as an important part of their lives and identities, which also result in being deprived of their education right (Özgen & Köşker, 2019).

Having a more comprehensive understanding of the problems with accessing the right to education and othering of different cultural groups in education necessitates examining the education system in Turkey within the context of multiculturalism in more depth which will be done in the following section.

The education system in Turkey within the context of multicultural education: Throughout history, there has always been a multicultural societal structure in Turkey where many culturally diverse groups have always existed (Çelik et al., 2017; Günay & Aydın, 2015; Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). The historical root of this multicultural structure in Turkey is based on the Ottoman Empire which had a multicultural and multilingual structure that was a shelter for a wide variety of ethnically and religiously diverse identities (Çelik, et al., 2017; Y. Kaya, 2015). In Ottoman Empire, it was possible to receive education in one's mother tongue, and people who were not Muslim were allowed to open their own schools in addition to the madrasah that was providing education to only Muslims (Kaya & Aydın, 2013). After the Ottoman Empire's transition to the Republic of Turkey with the buildings of the nation-state, the education system in Turkey has turned to be based on a national identity that is monocultural (Alanay & Aydın, 2016; Celik, et al., 2017).

The Republic of Turkey is founded on the philosophy of the establishment of a society that has a homogenous structure in which cultural differences are defined through a single identity compatible with the nation-state concept (Arslan, 2016; A. Kaya, 2005; Kaya & Aydın, 2014, as cited in Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). This philosophy has also shaped the foundations of educational policies in Turkey, which is based on "Turkishness." (Çapar, 2004; Öztan, 2011; Üstel, 2014, as cited in Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). The purpose of the national ideology was to create a national culture that is shaped by a single language, single religion, and a single ethnicity (Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). In order to achieve this goal, education has been seen as the crucial tool for the development of national unity, which has served as a means of assimilating other diverse cultures existing in Turkey, to create the

Turkish nation, and the curricula are designed in accordance with this goal (Çayır, 2003; Kaplan, 2008; Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020).

A centralized structure and single culture have dominated the education system in Turkey since the foundation of the Republic of Turkey. The process of restructuring the education system started with the law on the unification of education passed in 1924, and with this law unifying education was aimed, the curriculum was centralized, and Turkish was accepted as the language of schooling (Acar-Çiftçi & Gürol, 2015).

Considering the basis of the national education system in Turkey, some policies have given rise to discriminatory practices in education against certain groups of students and violated their rights to access education. For example, the Kurdish language was banned in public spheres including educational environments between the years of 1983 and 1991 even though Kurds constitute the country's biggest ethnic minority population (Aydın, 2012; Somersan, 2012). Thus, Kurdish students were prohibited to receive education in their mother tongue (Aydın, 2012).

Çelik et al. (2017) assert that the extremely centralized system in education constrains the perception and implementation of multicultural education practices (Çelik et al., 2017).

Çelik et al. (2017) also evaluated the education system in Turkey as monocultural. Nieto (1994) defines monocultural education as educational policies represented by a dominant culture (as cited in Çelik et al., 2017). They claim that Turkey's education system is monocultural, which predominantly disregards the differences in religion, ethnicity, language, and other cultures. They explain the monocultural structure of Turkey's education system in three domains which are "ethnolinguistic domain, religious domain, and cultural domain" (p. 104).

In the following section, the education system within the context of multicultural education in Turkey will be discussed in ethnolinguistic, religious, and other domains including disability, gender, sexual orientation, and sexual identity.

Ethnolinguistic domain: Despite the fact that there are many people from other ethnicities living in Turkey such as Kurds, Arabs, Circassians, and Lazs, except for the minorities determined by the Lausanne Treaty, the Constitution in Turkey (Article 42) indicates that languages other than Turkish as mother tongues are not allowed to be taught at schools (Akınlar & Doğan, 2017; Çelik et al., 2017; A. Kaya, 2013).

In the reform process that started with Turkey being accepted as a candidate country to the European Union in 1999, a number of changes have been made in the Constitution. Education is also one of the fields that has been reformed. Steps have been taken to assure cultural rights (N. Kaya, 2012). For example, opening private Kurdish language courses, and opening departments at universities such as Kurdish Language and Literature, and Armenian Language and Literature were among these steps (Akınlar & Doğan, 2017; Alanay & Aydın, 2016; N. Kaya, 2012). In 2003, learning and teaching in different languages and dialects were allowed but only in private language courses (Çelik et al., 2017). After 2012, in order somewhat to respond to the demands for teaching and learning other languages other than Turkish in schools, languages such as Kurdish, Abkhasian, Georgian, and Laz have started to be taught in the middle schools as elective courses under the title of Living Languages and Dialects (Çelik et al., 2017; Günay & Aydın, 2015). With the Democratization Package in 2013, private schools were allowed to provide education in different languages and dialects, yet, although guaranteed legally, it has not been

implemented sufficiently. Also, the opportunity for the education in mother tongue is just provided to the people who can afford to go to private school even though there is a considerable demand for the education in mother tongue in public schools (Akınlar & Doğan, 2017; Çelik et al., 2017).

Further, as it was mentioned before, education system in Turkey is founded on the principles of Turkishness, which is often emphasized in a very nationalistic and militaristic way (Çelik et al., 2017). These emphases are reflected in schools and textbooks. Studies examined the textbooks in terms of discourses indicated that textbooks include excessive nationalist and militarist items, contents glorifying the violence and war (Altınay 2009; Bora 2009, as cited in Çelik et al., 2017). Some important steps have been taken to reduce the exclusive, nationalist and militarist content in education. For example, in 2012, “National Security” course, which was mandatory in high school for all students and the course was provided by military officers, was removed from the curriculum. Additionally, a Turkish oath-taking ceremony called “*Our Oath (Andımız)*” at primary schools that emphasized the Turkish nation and included some lines as “*I am Turkish*”, “*May my existence be a gift to the Turkish existence.*” “*How happy is the one who says I am a Turk!*” was abolished in 2013 with the Democratization Package (Çelik et al., 2017).

Despite the considerable advancements in multicultural education, single culture still dominates the curriculum and textbooks (Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). Right to education in the mother tongue has not been recognized yet and education in the mother tongue is still an important controversial issue in Turkey (Alanay & Aydın, 2016). This situation leads students whose mother tongue is different from Turkish to be in a disadvantageous position when they start to receive education in Turkish compared to their peers whose mother tongue is Turkish (N. Kaya, 2012).

Therefore, these students do not have equal educational opportunity and do not benefit from the right to education equally (N. Kaya, 2012).

Religious domain: In addition to ethnicity and language, religion is also an important facet of multiculturalism (Özgen & Köşker, 2019). With the Dress Code Regulation in 1981, wearing a headscarf was banned in all educational institutions in Turkey (Çelik et al., 2017). This situation discriminated against the women based on their religion and clothing styles, violated their rights to have an education, and was against the principles of multicultural education that advocate all students should have equal opportunity to get an education regardless of the student's cultural characteristics (Aydın, 2010; Aydın, 2012; Banks, 2013). Since this regulation gave rise to the restriction of women wearing headscarves from accessing education, many people protested this regulation and demanded for the removal of this ban. Later on, some amendments in the regulation were made and in 2014 according to the new regulation, headscarves were allowed to wear in middle and high schools. However, having tattoos, piercing, beards, and coloring hair are not allowed according to the regulation (Çelik et al., 2017).

Moreover, in education system in Turkey, a religion course called 'Religion Culture and Moral Knowledge' is a compulsory course in primary and secondary schools which is dominated by the Sunni-Islam religion (Çelik et al., 2017; Özgen & Köşker, 2019). Since 1990, while non- Muslim students have been excused, Atheist students have been required to receive this course (Çelik et al., 2017). Further, there are many Alevi people living in Turkey (Karşlı, 2012; Özgen & Köşker, 2019) and they call for the exclusion of the obligation of receiving the course (Çelik et al., 2017). Even though it was ruled in 2007 and 2014 by The European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) that compulsory religion courses should be stopped at schools in

Turkey because they exclude other religious differences, this regulation violates the right to education in the European Human Rights Convention (Şirin et al., 2016, as cited in Özgen & Köşker, 2019).

Other domains: According to Özgen and Köşker (2019) issues related to multiculturalism in Turkey is not just restricted to discriminating and otherizing people based on ethnicity, language, and religion, but also on their gender, disabilities, sexual orientations, sexual identities, and ages.

For example, students with disabilities are being subjected to discrimination, and exclusion and they might be exposed to physical abuse (Meral, 2015; Akbulut et al., 2015). Some studies conducted in Turkey reported that students with disabilities are excluded by administrators, teachers, and parents; they do not accept students in their schools and classrooms (Akbulut et al., 2014; Akbulut et al., 2015).

Not just students with disabilities experience differential treatments and exclusion, also LGBTQ students are exposed to such treatments. Findings of the studies conducted with LGBTQ individuals who are high school, undergraduate, and graduate students revealed that LGBTIQ students are being bullied, abused, and discriminated in their school environments (Ummak et al., 2014; Çavdar & Çok, 2016). According to SECBİR 's research (2016), teachers don't perceive themselves as sufficient enough working with LGBTQ students and they feel incompetent in the field of such issues (SEÇBİR & SPoD, 2016).

Thereby, it can be said that the discriminative treatments toward students who are from diverse groups mentioned above are the violations of human rights of these groups according to the UDHR articles and the Constitution in Turkey. According to Aydın (2012), these cases demonstrate how the political and education system in Turkey has failed to put initiatives relating to diversity into place and institutionalize

them. The ideology of education, being monocultural, marginalizing or excluding minority groups in the curriculum and textbooks, and not taking adequate measures to combat discrimination still remains an unresolved issue (Çelik et al., 2017; N. Kaya, 2012).

In 2005-2006 in Turkey, with the transition to the constructivist approach to education, an indirect emphasis on multiculturalism integrated into the curriculum as the importance of cultural differences, respect to differences, and equal treatment (Demircioğlu & Özdemir, 2014). As mentioned in Şahin-Bektaş's study (2022), even though multicultural education is not directly reflected in educational programs in Turkey, the objectives of some courses determined by MoNE in 2018 include some issues related to multicultural education including noticing the importance of human rights, getting awareness of societal values, increasing the awareness of democracy, being sensitive to the environment, knowing the responsibility toward the country and society they live in, developing cultural awareness, and respecting cultural differences (Akhan & Yalçın, 2016; Demircioğlu & Özdemir, 2014). However, it can be said that these objectives are restricted only to underlining cultural differences and respecting these differences by sustaining the norms of the existing curriculum of national education.

Although important steps have been taken related to multicultural education, problems in practice still exist (Çelik et al., 2017). Arguments on multicultural education in Turkey mostly focus on education in the mother tongue, and multicultural education in general is perceived as diversity only in ethnicity or race (Karatas & Oral, 2015; Y. Kaya, 2015). Tonbuloğlu and Aydın (2014) pointed out that multiculturalism and multicultural education were not extensively comprehended and did not take place in teacher training programs in Turkey.

Textbooks still include discriminative discourses, nationalist and militaristic contents, and their content are male dominant (Aratemur-Çimen & Bayhan, 2018 & Çelik et al., 2017). Studies conducted in Turkey in the field of multicultural education indicate that the teacher education programs are not sufficient enough to meet culturally diverse learners' needs and suggest that teachers need to be trained in sensitivity to cultural diversity (Aydın, 2013; Coban, Karaman, & Dogan, 2010; Yavuz & Anil, 2010; Unlu & Orten, 2013; Tortop, 2014, as cited in Erbas, 2019). Therefore, pre-service, and in-service teachers consider themselves incompetent and unprepared for multicultural education In Turkey (Aydın, 2013). Universities are dubious about how to properly incorporate multicultural education into the teacher education programs (Demircioglu & Ozdemir, 2014; Tortop, 2014; Unlu & Orten, 2013, as cited in Erbas, 2019) and only few teacher training programs offer elective courses related to multicultural education.

In sum, there is still much to be done to have a multicultural education system in Turkey. More steps are needed to be taken to be in line with the national and international human right law standards determined by international conventions in order to meet the educational needs of culturally diverse learners in Turkey (Çelik et al., 2017; N. Kaya, 2012).

## 2.8 Empirical research on multicultural education

In this section, national and international empirical studies conducted on how the concepts of multiculturalism and multicultural education are perceived will be presented. The sample of the current study is adult educators working in non-formal education environments, but when the national and international literature were reviewed , no empirical studies examining adult educators' perceptions and practices

of multiculturalism and multicultural education have been found. When looking at the empirical studies in the literature, the participants in empirical studies in the field of multicultural education are mostly K-12 teachers, pre-service teachers, and academics in higher education, who constitute educators and adults. For this reason, the empirical studies discussed in this study were conducted in the fields of K-12 and higher education research.

### 2.8.1 Empirical research on conceptualizations of multicultural education

In this section, empirical studies conducted in Turkey and outside of Turkey investigating how the concept of multicultural education is perceived will be presented.

#### 2.8.1.1 National research

The research examining teachers, pre-service teachers and academic perceptions of multiculturalism and multicultural education and how they practice these concepts has been paid attention in the last decade in Turkey. For example, Erbas (2019) conducted a qualitative study to investigate how multiculturalism and multicultural education is perceived by 10 teachers and teacher candidates in Turkey. The research participants were offered a course related to multicultural education. Their perceptions of multiculturalism and multicultural education were examined before the course and after the course. Before the course, it was found that participants' definitions of multiculturalism were divided into three themes which are coexistence of cultures, acceptance, and respect. Half of the participants associated multiculturalism with coexistence of cultures. For the participants' definitions of multicultural education, 2 primary themes emerged, that are "integration of

differences” and “equality of opportunity”. Most of the participants elaborated multicultural education within the theme of integration of differences and they perceived multicultural education as integrating different students’ backgrounds into education. After the multicultural education course, it was observed that although the participants’ responses mostly showed similarity with their previous definitions, the participants enhanced their understanding of multicultural education. Some of the findings indicated that that multicultural education was seen by some participants as beyond linguistic and ethnic differences, it was also associated with age, gender, and sexual orientations. Additionally, multicultural education was related to equal access to education.

Furthermore, Başarır et al. (2014) also examined the multicultural education perceptions of 12 teachers who work in secondary and high school, the researchers examined how the teachers define multicultural education, which multicultural education practices they do, what difficulties they encounter with practicing multicultural education what the advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education are. According to the findings of this study, the teachers defined multicultural education mostly as an education in which individuals having different cultural values coexist. The study concluded that the teachers' definitions of multicultural education included some dimensions of culture, which were race, ethnicity, social class, religion, and language. However, the others were not considered by them such as gender, age, sexual orientation, or disability. Moreover, the findings of this study revealed that the teachers described multicultural education practices as creating a classroom environment that is sensitive to cultures including enabling feelings of equality and justice, comprehending different various points of

views, creating a democratic atmosphere, informing students about cultures, teaching sensitive different ages and regions.

Another study investigating perceptions of graduate students, who were also teachers, toward multicultural education conducted by Aydın and Tonbuloglu (2014) revealed that the concepts of equality, justice and democracy are the concepts that were mostly pointed out by the graduate students and stated that multicultural education encourages them. The findings also indicate that all students agreed that considering cultural differences are the requirement of multicultural education and cultural differences were seen as richness.

Similarly, Akınlar and Dogan (2017) also conducted a qualitative study examining the high school teachers, school principals and vice-principals and students' perceptions and practices of multicultural education in Istanbul. The findings of this study illustrates that the participants described multicultural education by using some metaphors including, "rainbow, mosaic, to get wet under the same cloud and richness" (p.12). The findings also revealed that the participants emphasized educational equality and education for all and elaborated multicultural education within them of "Equal Opportunity in Education and Education for All " (p.9). Another research carried out by Eskici and Cayak (2018) concluded that the teachers used some metaphors reflecting coexistence of different cultures such as rainbow, ashore and mosaic while describing multiculturalism.

There are also studies in the literature emphasizing teachers' perceptions and practices of multicultural education. For example, according to Aslan (2019)' study conducted with 15 classroom teachers from Elazığ, the teacher perceived multicultural education as an education that is provided to the students who come from different ethnic, linguistic and religious backgrounds, and gender. In this study,

it was noted that, age, sexual orientation, social class, and disability were not pointed out or not mentioned explicitly by the teachers. The findings of this study also shows that the activities the teachers mostly practice are student-centered; using drama, playing games, films, and case studies, holding discussions, brainstorming, doing research are the activities the teachers practice.

Further, Yilmaz (2016) examined how teacher candidates perceive multiculturalism and multicultural education. He conducted a qualitative study with 12 teacher candidates to investigate their perceptions. The research findings revealed that the teacher candidates described multiculturalism as “cultural difference, ethnicity, diversity of language and way of life, coexistence without marginalizing others, knowing each other, and establishing empathy as the richness of the social structure.” (p.10). Different lifestyles were addressed by the teacher candidates while talking about multiculturalism. They indicated hesitations while they underline the sexual orientation and social gender differences. The study claimed that there is an hesitation toward talking about sexual orientation differences in Turkey. As for the concept of multicultural education, the pre-service teachers associated multicultural education with cultural diversity, differences and tolerance, a training for familiarizing with different cultures underlined the coexistence of differences and “social structure” does not have a homogenous structure. Also, the meanings they attached to multicultural education were “education in mother tongue and reconstructing the educational system according to the cultural structure” (p.7). Moreover, the findings showed that the teacher candidates thought that multicultural education can ensure the academic success of the students, it also contributes to raising students having higher awareness, respect, and empathy toward differences, and to prevent conflicts and biases.

Olur and Oguz examined (2019) 160 teacher candidates' perceptions toward multicultural education in Afyon. According to the findings of this study, most of the teacher candidates attached a meaning toward multiculturalism as coexistence of nationally, racially, originally, and linguistically diverse people. Some prospective teachers also explained multiculturalism as "having knowledge about different cultures" (p.174). As for the concept of multicultural education, the teacher candidates defined multicultural education mostly as education of culturally different people. Further, it was also explained by some participants as comprehending all cultures to education, education presented to people from different cultures, being knowledgeable about all cultures and equal education. The findings of this study also revealed that the teacher candidates mostly used some practices to support multicultural education including usage of diverse materials and methods, "teaching different cultures." Similarly, a study conducted by Akcaoglu and Arsal (2017) examining prospective teachers' views toward multicultural education concluded that the teacher candidates associated multicultural education with cultural difference, race, language, religion, and acceptance of others. They did not explain it as a "reform movement" as Banks (2009) did and not related with disability and gender.

#### 2.8.1.2 International research

When examining international literature, it can be said that there are a number of studies investigating educators' perceptions and practices of multicultural education.

For example, a study conducted by Neuharth-Pritchett et al. (2001) in the US examining the pre-service early childhood education teachers' perceptions of multicultural education and their ideally perceived multicultural education practices. The study findings revealed that the pre-service teachers perceived multicultural

education as adding diversity on the curriculum “not an educational approach that integrates diversity into all elements of the curriculum” (p.263). The study also concluded that some pre-service teachers stated that being exposed to cultures or having knowledge of the cultures are the required ways for multicultural education. Further, half of the participants considered integration of multicultural content to the instruction as an ideal way of multicultural education implementation. Some other participants emphasized a behavioral change of students and stated that attitudes like respect, tolerance, awareness, appreciation, acceptance, acknowledgment of differences and similarities should be taught as an implementation of multicultural education. It was noted by some participants that negation of stereotypes in instruction or adding separate units like holidays can be another way of practicing multicultural education. The study concluded in general that the pre-service teachers ‘understanding of multicultural education remained minimal and restricted to race and ethnicity.

Another study conducted in the US, Bigatti et al. (2012) investigated the faculties’ perceptions toward multicultural teaching, and it was concluded that most of the participants described multicultural teaching as using materials and pedagogies that are diversified. It was also considered by some others as creating strategies to appreciate all students’ voices and teaching about multiple cultures. Integration of multicultural content was the mostly used multicultural practice by the faculties. Heightening learning experiences of the students and making them exposed to cultures was also among the teachers’ implementations. Utilizing different pedagogies and enhancing themselves in terms of multicultural teaching were the expressed multicultural teaching practices used by the faculties.

Within the Jordan context, the perceptions of middle and high school teachers who are in social studies branch toward multicultural education was also examined by Alazzi (2016). The study concluded that the teachers did not have a clear definition of what multicultural education is. One of the teachers associated multicultural education with the issues of refugees, immigrants, and economy. The other one also linked it with immigration and thought that multicultural education is about teaching different cultures and religions. The study claimed that the teachers did not use any strategy in terms of their instruction in accordance with multicultural education. This study also discussed that the meaning attached to multicultural education is only linked with different nationalities and it is used within the context of politics not in education. The study also argued that because schools in Jordan are highly focused on national exam scores, multicultural education is not a part of curriculum. The findings of this study also showed that most of the teachers have a willingness for teaching multicultural education and they need to be well knowledgeable about multicultural education and multicultural teaching strategies.

Within the Iraq context, the study conducted by Celik (2020) concluded that multiculturalism was mostly linked by English teacher candidates with culturally different people living together in the same region. The teacher candidates' attitudes toward multiculturalism were mostly positive and they believed that multiculturalism led to tolerance, peace, freedom, and diversity. Also, some preservice teachers' attitudes toward multiculturalism were negative and they thought that multiculturalism can also lead to conflicts and assimilation. As for the concept of multicultural education, it was considered as "respect for cultural differences and tolerance training" by most of the teacher candidates. Some others also explained

multicultural education as introduction of cultural diversity to the curriculum, universal education, providing equal educational opportunity.

Moreover, Logvinova and Ivanova (2016) investigated a study analyzing documents and educational materials regarding multicultural education in pedagogical science in Russia and preservice teachers' competencies on multicultural education. According to the findings of this study, multicultural education was explained within the context of diversity in ethnicity, language and religion but not issues of sexual orientation, gender, and special needs and it was mostly practiced in the additive level that is featured by the practice of adding a subject or a unit on the educational program. It does not implement restructuring the educational content and the curriculum holistically.

Another study carried out in Malaysia by Phoon et al. (2012) also addresses the perceptions and attitudes of preschool teachers toward multiculturalism. The study also concluded that even though the teachers attached an importance to multicultural education in preschool years, the preschool teachers' understanding of multicultural education in Malaysia was quite limited. They associated multiculturalism only with race and ethnicities. The teachers did not point out the issues related to disability, social class and gender while talking about multicultural education. A great majority of the teachers described multicultural education as learning culturally diverse ethnic groups from the aspect of their cultural habits, festivals, traditions, celebrations etc.

Further, according to the study conducted by Kuppens et al. (2020) examining the perceptions of secondary school teachers in Kenya on multicultural education. The study concluded that the teachers saw multicultural education valuable, their general opinions toward multicultural education were positive. Incorporating the

content to the curriculum that is multicultural was supported by the teachers and they attempted to exemplify groups from diverse ethnicities, which are in line with dimension 1: content integration. The teachers also claimed that stereotypes can be broken through multicultural education. Some teachers also indicated that they consider students' ethnicity for their academic achievement (Equity pedagogy). Most of the teachers showed their eagerness for the activities that foster diversity including festivals (Empowering school culture). However, practicing multicultural education remained to a limited extent. The teachers also mentioned their worries about integrating some ethnic identities in Kenya to the curriculum and they expressed their hesitation to point out in the class like female circumcision. They preferred to narrow the topics related to cultural diversity into foods, clothes, and habits. It was found that national unity is more likely to be emphasized than the appreciating and acknowledging diversity by the teachers.

Lastly, when looking at the study of Egne (2016) evaluating the perceptions and practices of Ethiopian secondary teacher education program officials, teacher educators and teacher candidates on multicultural education, it was concluded that even though the awareness of multicultural education among teacher educators and program officials are increasing, the teacher candidates' awareness were low. Also, it was found that the implementations of multicultural education in terms of multicultural education dimensions developed by Banks were inadequate. The study argues that the reason that their multicultural education practices are inadequate is having not enough competency on multicultural education

## 2.8.2 Empirical studies related to advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education

There are also a number of empirical studies investigating how importance and advantages of multicultural education is perceived by educators (teachers, pre-service teachers). For example, a study emphasizing the importance of multicultural education in higher education conducted in Turkey, by Damgacı and Aydın (2014), which explored the 357 academics' perceptions toward multicultural education. Their study findings revealed that a great majority of the academics perceived multicultural education as advantageous for all students. Some of the academics asserted that since people cannot choose their own culture, all people should possess rights equally. Also, the academics pointed out that learning more about diverse cultures supports people to be responsive to others. However, they indicated that because multicultural education is not grasped and practiced successfully by educators, it might take a disadvantageous form of education.

Ozen (2015) also evaluated teacher candidates' attitudes toward democracy and multicultural education. Study findings reveal that the teacher candidates explain multiculturalism. For the purposes of multicultural education, the study results showed that the teacher candidates explained that multicultural education enables cultural diversity, freedom of speech, equal educational opportunities; it eradicates racism and assimilation, protects the rights of people, showing respect to differences. The teacher candidates described multicultural education in relation to its variables as differences related to culture, race, social class, religion, language, ethnicity, socio-economic level, disability, and gender. According to the participants' responses it was found that multicultural education improves empathy, tolerance, acceptance, and respect toward differences. Also, the teacher elaborated the meaning of

multicultural education within the 6 different themes as the contents of multicultural education, which are diversity, pluralism, universal values, democracy, human rights, and equality. The results also show for the necessities of multicultural education that the changes in curriculum, multicultural competence and teaching toward social justice were considered as the requirements of multicultural education. Lastly, multicultural education was also criticized as it will give rise to polarization, separation and it is about minorities.

In another study conducted by Başarır et al. (2014), the teachers considered the advantages of multicultural education as that it enables to get to know different cultures; it increases motivation and achievement; improves students' points of view, empathy skills, feeling of tolerance, positive social relationships, reflective thinking, and global thinking skills. Most of the teachers found it advantageous and a few teachers thought that multicultural education gives rise to some disadvantages "such as disintegration and perturbation in the classroom"(p.96).

According to the study conducted by Erbas (2018), it was revealed that teachers and teacher candidates considered multicultural education as helpful for teacher education programs. They indicated that in teacher education, multicultural education contributes to the development of respect toward diversity and high-quality teaching, meaning culturally sensitive and respectful teaching. Also, some participants claimed that multicultural education develops democratic perspectives and helps prospective teachers to develop empathy skills. Multicultural education was also evaluated as disadvantageous in some ways. The participants indicated that multicultural education could give rise to polarization in the society. Exaggeration and overly addressing diversity can lead to polarization and damage to the coexistence of different cultures.

Further, another study administered by Bigatti et al. (2012) within the context of higher education in the study revealed that most of the faculties thought that multicultural teaching improves students' cultural sensitivities. Appreciation, respect, valuing and acknowledgment of other cultures are the attitudes that students get. It was also indicated that multicultural teaching creates an environment that is inclusive and has a safe classroom climate, which contributes to the learning of the students. Further, it was mentioned that multicultural teaching enables us to talk about prejudices and contributes to the perspective enhancement of the students.

Moreover, Phoon et al. (2012)' study conducted within early childhood education in Malaysia, almost all of the teachers agreed that multicultural education in early childhood education has beneficial sides consisting of acquiring knowledge about different cultures, personal development, contribution to uniting the nation, annihilating prejudice, increase in an interaction and respect. A small number of the teachers indicated that they disagreed on that. They thought that it would create some conflicts and should be applied in some certain schools that are multiethnic.

### 2.8.3 Empirical studies related to the role of educators on multicultural education

There are also studies investigating how teachers see the role of educators on implementing multicultural education. For example, according to the findings of Günay and Aslan (2016)' study investigating how teachers describe a multicultural educator, it was revealed that a multicultural teacher is a teacher who is able to manage diversity meaning that the teacher needs to inhibit a chaos and create a learning space in which diverse individuals are able to have a voice and these individuals get to know each supports each other, respect and accept each other, which leads to annihilation of prejudices. Furthermore, the teacher should arrange the

teaching and learning process in compliance with different cultures, the teacher should be well knowledgeable about all cultures and know the different cultures enables enrichment. The faculties also emphasized that a multicultural teacher should be competent and well knowledgeable and be familiar with diverse cultures and improve themselves constantly and be open to new things. Additionally, the teacher should treat everyone equally, impartially, and just. They should consider the rights of every individual and be responsive to the issues of societal inequality.

There are also studies revealing that educators are not competent enough to practice multicultural education and experience difficulties to form an inclusive learning environment (H.E. Kaya, 2014; Tisdell, 1995).

For example, when looking at the study of Egne (2016) evaluating the perceptions and practices of secondary teacher education program officials, teacher educators and teacher candidates on multicultural education, it was concluded that even though the awareness of multicultural education among teacher educators and program officials are increasing, the teacher candidates' awareness were low. Also, it was found that the implementations of multicultural education in terms of multicultural education dimensions developed by Banks were inadequate. The study argued that the reason that their multicultural education practices are inadequate is having not enough competency on multicultural education. Another study administered by Olur and Oguz (2019) concluded that a great majority of the teacher candidates did not see themselves as knowledgeable and it was concluded that they need education related to multicultural education.

Further, Damgacı and Aydın (2014) conducted a study examining academics' perception of multicultural education and one of the findings pointing out the importance of educators' competency on multicultural education revealed that the

academics pointed out that learning more about diverse cultures support people to be responsive to others. However, they indicated that because multicultural education is not grasped and practiced successfully by educators, it might take a disadvantageous form of education. This study also showed that teachers should be trained in multicultural education for the effective implementation of multicultural education.

Another study conducted by Sharma (2005) also emphasized the necessity of training about multicultural education for teachers.

#### 2.8.4 Empirical studies related to difficulties educators encounter

In Başarır et al. (2014) study, teachers explained the difficulties while they practice multicultural education, and it was found that the teachers had difficulties related to students, families, and teachers. Families: prejudiced families, students: exclusion, humiliating, not accepting each other, for teachers: the need for time and effort, incompetency about multicultural education and communication difficulties were the difficulties that the teacher encountered

It was also found in Aslan's (2019) study that the difficulties are mostly related to the students; students' biases and prejudices in the classes, their negative attitudes, disrespectfulness, and intolerance toward culturally different people, excluding and mocking these people are the student related problems. When it comes to the difficulties related to the teaching program, the program and the book contents are not designed in compliance with multicultural education. It was also found that family and school administration biases and having lack of knowledge and material are the other problems the teachers encounter (Aslan, 2019).

Similarly, In Bigatti et al. (2012) study, the faculties also elaborated the obstacles for multicultural teaching: the most mentioned barrier was resistance

shown by students. Also “lack of preparation in using multicultural teaching strategies” and inadequate support or guidance from institutions were other mentioned barriers.

Additionally, Trower (2020) examined how adult educators perceive themselves in practicing multicultural education. The study showed that the adult educators emphasized that lack of resource funding affects their self-efficacy in meeting their diverse adult learners’ needs. They asserted that they need more professional development to reach their diverse students.

#### 2.8.5 Empirical studies within adult education context

Another study done by Tisdell et al. (2013) focuses on incorporating diverse learners’ experiences in preparing adult education training programs. They carried out a study examining how educators who teach financial literacy to adults who are from “underserved population groups” (p .339) use culturally responsive teaching in their training. The educators emphasized that it is important to be aware of the meaning of money that the learner attaches to and how the learners’ attitude toward finance is shaped by their cultural backgrounds. The educators indicated that they help learners to question and be aware of how their historical and cultural backgrounds influence their attitude and belief toward money. Further, the findings revealed that the educators use some strategies to encourage learners to share their experiences, asking questions and to have an active role in the learning process such as storytelling, small group discussions, and hands-on activities that are relevant to learners’ identities. Yet, cultural issues were not discussed by complete awareness of race and ethnicity, instead, they were based on specific groups and subcultures such as culture of military or homeless women. The educators’ main focus was on a

certain group of people's money related issues, not on a culture of a specific race or ethnicity. Additionally, some of the educators stated that as a culturally responsive teaching, they adapt or develop curriculum that reflects learners' experiences, race, class and income level and gender. Lastly, the findings also suggest that educational materials in various languages should be developed for the immigrant learners and the learners speaking other languages.

In addition to integrating culturally diverse groups' experiences into training programs as a multicultural teaching practice, ensuring equality and democracy are addressed in Zammit's (2021) study. Zammit (2021) conducted a qualitative study with 17 Maltese language educators who teach Maltese to adults coming from different cultures. The study aimed to examine the educators' perceptions and attitudes toward multicultural teaching. Findings of this study revealed that multi-ethnic education is critical for ensuring equality. The educators used the terms equality, justice and democracy when explaining multicultural practices. . Most of the educators stated that guaranteeing these terms for learners no matter what their gender, race, ethnicity, and religion is the important practices for multicultural education, inclusion, and students achievement. This study suggested that educators should be trained about multi-ethnic teaching for ensuring democracy and equality in a society.

Besides learners' cultural experiences, funding and adult educators' experiences related to their own culture have an impact on practicing multicultural education. Trowers (2020) investigated how educators perceive themselves in practicing multicultural teaching. The educators, who were all Caucasian, teach literacy and English language to learners coming from diverse cultural backgrounds in an adult learning center in New York. This study concluded that the educators'

own cultural experiences shaped their cultural responsiveness to the learners from diverse cultures and have a belief that they would be more effective if they did not have some challenges such as insufficient funding and lack of attendance of the learners due to their poor socioeconomic status.

## 2.9 Adult education from multicultural education perspectives

Although studies in the field of multicultural education are conducted within the context of K-12 and higher education, multicultural education approaches can pave the way for the formation, implementation, and evaluation of inclusive adult education programs (Tisdell, 1995). Transformative and social action approaches dealt by James Banks (1993a) and the approach of multicultural and reconstructionist education discussed by Sleeter and Grant (1987) can be crucial to be adhered by adult educators to be able to create an inclusive and transformative adult education environment (Tisdell, 1995) by integrating these approaches to adult education theories such as Andragogy, Transformative Learning Theory, Critical Pedagogy. Therefore, the next sections will firstly present some adult education theories from the perspective of multicultural education and multicultural education approaches to adult education.

Alfred (2003) stated that even though adult education emphasizes individual development and change, it ignores the sociocultural side of the individuals' learning. Adult education is also criticized as generalizing the way how adults learn based on white and middle-class ideology by decontextualizing the learners' historical and cultural background and experience (Flannery, 1994, as cited in Guy, 1999; Merriam & Brockett, 2011; Ross-Gordon, 1990; Sheared & Sissel, 2001).

As Knowles (1980) stated that andragogy is different from pedagogy and the most important difference between adult education and K-12 education is that adults' source of knowledge is their own experiences which is shaped by culture in which adults grew up (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 1998; Guy, 1999). Thus, considering the cultural context of adult learning should be one of the basic principles of adult education for designing inclusive adult learning programs (Guy, 1999). However, some fundamental adult education theories such as Knowles' andragogy and Mezirow's transformative learning theory have been criticized that adult education assumes that all adult learners have a single learner profile and learn the same way (Sheared & Sissel, 2001). Also, these adult education theories are criticized that adult education is framed by white and middle- class mainstream perspective and ignore sociocultural and sociohistorical context of adults (Grace, 1996; Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 1998, Pratt, 1993).

In the following sections, these adult education theories, and critiques within the context of multicultural education will be discussed separately.

### 2.9.1 Andragogy

The fundamental principles of adult learning set by Knowles show that the basic values underlying some principles comply with the goals of multicultural education. For example, Knowles (1980) suggests that learning environments for adults should be arranged in a way that adults should experience feelings of acceptance, support, and respect (as cited in Merriam et al., 2006). Also, it should provide an environment in which adults are able to have a role in determining their learning needs and in the process of developing and implementing a learning program. Knowles' theory of andragogy emphasizes individual development and considers an individual as

independent, self-directed, and growth. However, Knowles' theory has been criticized by some scholars for various reasons such as ignoring the socially constructed learning and learners, not considering individual development as being affected and shaped by sociocultural and historical factors (Merriam et al., 2006), and regarding the aim of learning is to make individuals adapt to the changes in the world (Grace, 1996). For example, adults needed to obtain skills related to agricultural production in colonial times in America. Also, during the time in which religion was the ruling mechanism in Europe, adults had to learn how to read the Bible. After passing to a democratic system, adults needed to learn how to be a citizen in a democratic society. With the emergence of the industrial revolution, adults had to gain skills related to industrial production. Moreover, after the industry revolution, the massive immigration led immigrants to be exposed to learning citizenship skills that "enabled" them to adapt the culture of the hosting society (Merriam et al., 2006).

Compared to other aforementioned critiques, Sandlin (2005) criticized andragogy more comprehensively by basing this criticism on critical, feminist and Africentric approaches. Sandlin's (2005) first critique is that andragogy remains impartial and apolitical in terms of value neutrality. Another critique is that andragogy sees adult learners and the way they learn as the same; the profile of the adult learners for andragogy is middle class and white. Correspondingly, it does not regard the different learning types and mutes diverse voices. As a fourth critique, andragogy overlooks the relationship between society and individuals. It does not consider the significant factors that affect learning such as race, ethnicity, gender etc.; it ignores the issues of structural inequalities, power relations and oppression. Thus, as a result of the fourth critique, in contrast to reducing the structural

inequalities and discrimination experienced by oppressed groups, andragogy serves the reproduction of the structural inequalities (Sandlin, 2005).

Alfred (2000) discussed andragogy from Africentric feminist perspective. Alfred (2000) conducted a study to examine the applicability of andragogy to the adult learners who are African American. Andragogy gives importance to learner's experiences, but the experiences based on learners' race, class, gender, oppression etc. and adult educators' experiences are not taken into consideration (Alfred, 2000). Also, although andragogy points out to a learning climate in which trust and care is underlined, it does not concern learning from political context. Additionally, Afrocentric perspective, andragogy ignores the learners' knowledge production and their credibility (Alfred, 2000). Alfred (2000) stated that although andragogy overemphasizes individual learning, according to an Afrocentric perspective "for knowledge to be validated, it must be made public, and that is done in relationships with individuals or within a community" (p. 21). According to Alfred (2002), adult educators should consider the learner as a whole, sociocultural context of learning, and the relationship between the learner and society.

All in all, based on all these criticisms it can be said that there is a lack of attention to the sociocultural, historical, and political context of learners and learning in Knowles' andragogy model.

### 2.9.2 Transformative learning theory

Mezirow's transformative learning theory has also been criticized by some scholars as not considering the context in which adult learners experience (Clark & Wilson, 1991, as cited in Merriam et al., 2006), and learn and emphasizing an individual transformation rather than a social action as well as reducing the process of meaning

making to rationality (Merriam et al., 2006). Mezirow's transformative learning theory has also been criticized as being white and middle class centric (Merriam et al., 2006). and lacking a historical and sociocultural context approach (Clark & Wilson, 1991). Having examined empirical studies related to Mezirow's theory, Taylor (2000) concluded that the sociocultural and historical background of learners had an important role in their transformative learning process.

According to Tisdell (2003), the transformative learning process of a learner is affected by the learner's culture. Tisdell (2003) discusses the role of culture on learner's knowledge construction as well as considers the learning as a "whole-person learning" such as personal learning, social learning, historical learning, political learning etc. Accordingly, educators' role, then, becomes vital for transformative learning as being a facilitator and authentic rather than an authority who presents a predetermined knowledge.

The theory has also been criticized for neglecting the power issues in society. The dominant ideology in the society has the power to oppress the minorities so minorities' transformation process and their praxis can be negatively affected by the mainstream ideology (Merriam et al., 2006). For example, a study conducted with vegans and related to their transformative process in being vegan showed that even though the way they behave complying with being vegan, the dominant ideology in the society had power against veganism and exercise its ideology on the vegans by exhausting and silencing them (McDonald, Cervero, and Courtenay, 1999; Kiely, 2003)

### 2.9.3 Freire's critical pedagogy

One of the origins of critical pedagogy comes from Paulo Freire's works. Freire's philosophy is one of the well-known sociocultural approaches to transformative learning. Unlike Mezirow, Freire's transformative learning approach called emancipatory approach is based on the issues of poverty, oppression, illiteracy, which aims for social transformation. Freire asserts that since individual and social transformation are not mutually exclusive, the individual transformation is not independent from social transformation (Merriam et al., 2006). Conscientization and empowerment are foundational terms of his theory. It aims to support learners to notice the oppression occurring in their lives and empower them to take an action in the process of social change, which can be called liberation. There are 3 stages for conscientization. In the first stage, the learners may not be aware of and refuse their potential to have a role in social change. After this stage, the learner starts to question things and feel that they are actually able to have control in their own lives independent from external control. Finally, the last stage occurs as the ultimate goal of conscientization called critical consciousness. They begin to have enough awareness of noticing the oppressive factors in their lives, to reconstruct their knowledge and to join actively in social transformation (Freire, 2000).

Freire (1970, 1973, 1976) asserted that individuals who are oppressed by the power of dominant ideology in society should improve critical consciousness so that they are able to be liberated and be part of social transformation (as cited in Sleeter & Bernal, 2004). Freire used the term cultural circles instead of using the classroom which tends to ignore learners as being active participants (Akkari & Mesquida, 2008). Cultural circles are the places for adults in which they were learning literacy and while learning literacy in these circles, they were critically thinking and

discussing their issues to improve critical consciousness, to have a voice in the solution of these issues and have a role in changing the system (Sleeter & Bernal, 2004).

According to Gay (1995), critical pedagogy and multicultural education show similarities in their concepts and goals and thus they should align with each other. The practices and the concepts in critical pedagogy are related to multicultural education, among which power, social transformation, voice, oppression, culture can be counted as the examples of related concepts used in both multicultural education and critical pedagogy. Critical pedagogy empowers silenced groups who were oppressed and marginalized by the dominant ideology to have a voice and engage in a dialogue with others. The learners' voice and the dialog comprehend the experiences shaped by their culture and history (Freire, 1998).

Therefore, culture is one of the main focuses of critical pedagogy. Like culture and voice, the issue of power relations is also at the center of critical pedagogy. It questions and discusses the power within the frame of culture (Freire, 1970). Even though critical pedagogy is mostly based on class and power issues, the way how it approaches and discusses class issues are very essential in creating an inclusive learning environment for the other diverse learners (Sleeter & Bernal, 2004).

Furthermore, critical pedagogy considers the learners as the constructor of the knowledge (Sleeter & Bernal, 2004). The learners are not the obedient passive knowledge receivers. Instead, the power in the classroom should be shared between the learners and educators and the educators should be in the role of a facilitator who supports the learners to develop a critical eye toward the world for their liberation called problem posing education (Freire, 1970). Freire, in his literacy teaching,

categorized literacy as technical literacy and critical literacy. The former is about the technical rules of a language as a subject-matter culturally decontextualized whereas the latter emphasizes how learners attach a meaning toward the words in the language by relating the words with their culture and experience. Therefore, culture plays a fundamental role in adult learning (Guy,1999).

According to Cunningham (1988), to build a learning setting in which the learners' consciousness toward how life is socially constructed, and power relations and inequalities related to race, class and gender is developed is one of the roles of adult educators. However, although critical pedagogy presents a critical theoretical framework to educators about the class, power, and oppression issues, it does not focus on race, ethnicity, gender, disabilities, and other forms of diversity (Sleeter & Bernal, 2004). Also, the practical side of critical pedagogy is limited and needs to be developed. Multicultural education approaches can complement these drawbacks of critical pedagogy (Sleeter & Bernal, 2004).

## 2.10 Multicultural adult education and related studies

As mentioned earlier, since the majority of the studies and discussions of multicultural education are related to K-12 and higher education, there is a limited number of multicultural adult education studies (Guo, 2018; Ribeiro, 2005; Ross-Gordon, 1991; Tisdell, 1995). Yet, there is a developing literature emphasizing a need for multicultural approaches in adult education (Alfred, 2002; Guy, 1999; Kumi-Yeboah & James, 2011; Rhodes, 2018; Ross-Gordon, 1991; Tisdell, 1995). Furthermore, the number of empirical studies on implementation of multicultural practices in adult education is on the rise (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 1998; Sealey-Ruiz, 2007; Tisdell et al., 2013).

Guy (1999) states that the goal of culturally relevant adult education is the transformation of learning models, programs, and environment in which learning takes place by emphasizing social injustice and inequities, questioning, reconstructing the power relations and development of the learners' critical consciousness (as cited in French, 2019). Moreover, it also regards the sociocultural diversities of learners and engages, recognizes, and accepts diverse learner groups who are oppressed (French, 2019).

A literature review related to culturally responsive teaching in adult education conducted by Rhodes (2018) presented that within the frame of sociocultural approach, learners' culture, educators' cultural self-examination and the curriculum arrangement are most of the topics covered in literature in the field of adult education. Sociocultural approach addresses creating an inclusive education by remarking that educators should be more aware of their own cultures and learners' cultures and should create a learning environment by integrating learners' cultures (Alfred, 2009, as cited in Rhodes, 2018).

Similarly, as described by Guy (1999) and H.E. Kaya (2014), a model of multicultural teaching that provides a practical guideline for educators to create a culturally responsive learning environment is presented by Marchesani and Adams (1992). The model underlines four important components. The first one is the awareness of educators' own cultural identity. Adult educators should critically examine their own cultural identity and values, their beliefs, thoughts, and attitudes toward other cultures. Educators can bring their own cultures into the learning environment and the way how the educator instructs and acts in the classroom can be affected by his/her culture. According to Adams (1992), educators who adopt a single culture perspective can have difficulties understanding the learning needs of

students. Brown, Cervero and Johnson-Bailey (2000) conducted a study to examine the experiences of African American women educators teaching math to adults. The study found that the positionality of the educators in terms of their race and gender had an impact on their classroom experiences and practices. When they were learners, they were marginalized according to their gender and race. These adult educators shaped their teaching philosophy and learning environment as opposed to the mainstream centric according to their past learning experiences, which are “(a) producing a teaching philosophy based on a history of marginalization, (b) raising issues of credibility with students because of the teachers’ race and gender, and (c) directly affecting their classroom interactions and teaching strategies.”(p.277) They used the strategies to eliminate discrimination and inequality in the learning environment based on their prior experiences that confirm the significance of culturally self-examination of an adult educator for understanding their students’ learning needs and designing a multicultural adult education program (as cited in Guy, 1999).

According to the second component in the model for creating a culturally responsive learning environment developed by Marchesani and Adams (1992), educators should also be aware of and get to know their students ‘cultures as well as being aware of their own cultural identities. It is important to be able to understand the meanings attached to learning by considering the cultural context of the adult learners.

The third component in the model is a culturally sensitive curriculum. The content of the materials used in the education programs should be responsive to the learners’ cultures. The learners should relate themselves to the provided content (Sheared, 1994) and the content should be eliminated from stereotypes and

prejudices toward culturally diverse learners. The last element of the model is about the way the educators instruct and which method they choose. According to Marchesani and Adams (1992), there should not be a hierarchy between educator and learner in terms of power and responsibility; adult educators should facilitate sharing the power among all the learners and promote inclusive participation of all the learners in a learning setting. Yelich-Biniecki and Kang (2014) reviewed the literature related to adult learning in the US within the frame of culture by examining the practices that adult educators use to promote learning. Four themes emerged from the review of literature , which are “critically examining one’s own and others’ cultural stories; utilizing sociocultural approaches to facilitate or guide adult learning; developing and maintaining dialog; and incorporating strategies to improve people’s cultural awareness and competency.” (p.134.)

French (2019) posed a question that how practices which are culturally relevant can be integrated into adult education and conducted a study examining three culturally relevant models and their applicability to adult education especially based on the principles of andragogy developed by Knowles (1984). These models are culturally responsive teaching (Gay, 2018), motivational framework for culturally responsive teaching, (Wlodkowski & Ginsberg, 2009) and culturally relevant pedagogy (Ladson-Billings, 1995). The study revealed that culturally relevant pedagogy together with motivational framework for culturally responsive teaching are more applicable to andragogy in terms of learning climate, assessment, learning readiness and program planning and development (French, 2019).

Ladson-Billings (1992) developed a model for culturally relevant teaching inspired by teaching of Freire’s critical pedagogy. This teaching model is created in the light of Ladson-Billings's 3-year study conducted to find out the classroom

experiences of teachers working with African American students. This model is based on three components. The first one is that academic success should be experienced by students and all students regardless of their race, ethnicity and religion should be an active participant of a democratic society but to be able to do this, they should develop certain skills such as literacy and technological skills etc. Therefore, it also emphasizes the role of educators on academic success and motivating learners to succeed by paying attention to and understanding the learning needs of the learners (Ladson-Billings, 1995).

In addition to academic success, the second component of Ladson-Billings' (1992) model is improving and sustaining cultural competency of learners. Thus, educators should shape the learning material benefiting from the learners' culture for making learning easier and culture can be a tool that functions as a bridge for learning. For example, in Ladson-Billings's 3-year study, one of the teachers used rap songs that are famous in African American culture as a learning material. Students are asked to bring rap music lyrics to the classroom and sing them. After that, the literal and figurative meanings and poetry side of the lyrics were discussed and analyzed in the class. This learning activity helped students to feel academically and culturally successful (as cited in Ladson-Billings, 1995).

The last component in Ladson-Billings' model (1995) critical consciousness is an important skill that learners should acquire, which helps them to question the structural system and social order. The first two components of the model have an orientation to individual achievement whereas the last one underlies the social change by indicating that students should critically think and question the structures that create and reproduce social inequalities. Having this critical examination skill is seen as an important element of active citizenship.

Motivational framework for culturally responsive teaching: As described by Rhodes (2018), this framework of culturally responsive teaching is developed for adult learning settings specifically for higher education. It aims to appeal to faculties and teaching centers. It presents a model for creating an inclusive learning environment, which encompasses some norms including respect toward diversity, encouraging diverse learners to engage in and inquiry. In this model, there are four components through which enhancing the minority learners' motivation is aimed. These components are establishing inclusion, developing attitude, enhancing meaning and engendering competence (Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009; Wlodkowski, 2004, as cited in Rhodes, 2018).

i. Establishing inclusion: Establishment of an inclusive learning environment can be created by establishing the norms and practices to build a respectful learning setting in which connection between learner and educator is emphasized. The co-construction of knowledge is among one of these norms related to the reflection of learners' experiences. Educators establishes positive interdependence among the learners benefiting from the activities which necessitates collaborative works such as jigsaw activities and peer teaching strategy as well as listening to all learners' voices and encourage them to have a voice their thoughts and feelings toward the learning environment, rules, and procedures (Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009).

ii. Developing attitude: Developing attitude necessitates that the learning should be relevant to learners' interests, background, and experiences as well as that the learners should have power on determining and deciding learning curriculum and activities in order to have a positive learning experience (Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009).

iii. Enhancing meaning: This component of culturally responsive teaching is about providing the learners with deep and meaningful learning experiences rather than perceiving the learning as reaching certain academic achievements. These meaningful learning experiences can be attained through inclusive and challenging learning activities including role-play activities, problem-posing activities, and simulations by considering the learners' views and values (Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009).

iv. Engendering Competence: The last component of the culturally responsive pedagogy is related to student assessment. It suggests assessing the students without decontextualizing them from their culture, experiences, and background. Educators should create an opportunity for the learners to exhibit competence in diverse ways. Assessments based on performance or portfolio can be useful for the effectiveness and authenticity of the assessment. Also, self-assessment has a critical role on students to engender competence (Ginsberg & Wlodkowski, 2009).

Rhodes (2015) conducted a survey study with 34 questions developed by utilizing the Motivational Framework for Culturally Responsive Teaching of Ginsberg and Wlodkowski (2009). The survey questionnaire was administered to 143 adult educators working with the linguistically and ethnically diverse learners in Florida to investigate the frequency of the educators' usage of culturally responsive teaching practices in their teaching and to examine their beliefs toward the importance of benefitting from these practices. The study revealed that the culturally responsive teaching practices that are mostly used and given importance by the educators who use rubrics and reports that explain how much the learners progressed and getting students' experiences in classroom activities. It was also found that practices emphasizing learners' independence, and their contribution to planning the

learning process were ranked as the least utilized practices. Further, integrating lessons related to discrimination and prejudice toward immigrants was rated as the least used and the least important practice.

## CHAPTER 3

### METHODOLOGY

#### 3.1 Research design

Qualitative research design was employed in this study. Qualitative research method provides a deep and holistic examination of an issue focused on in a study (Creswell & Creswell, 2017). Since this study aims to examine adult educators' perceptions of multicultural education, their perceived practices of multicultural approaches in their training, and encountered difficulties related to multicultural education, qualitative research design is more suitable for this study. Within this qualitative design, a phenomenological research method was utilized in this study. "Phenomenology is a study of people's conscious experience of their life-world" (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015, p.26). Human experiences about a phenomenon are an important component of phenomenological research (Creswell & Poth, 2016; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Since multiculturalism in adult education is the phenomenon in this study which aims to explore the phenomenon by focusing on adult educators' perceptions and practices, phenomenological research method is considered to be appropriate for the aim of this study. The research questions to be addressed within the aim of the study are as follows:

- i. What meaning do adult educators attach to multiculturalism and multicultural education? How do adult educators conceptualize multicultural education?
- ii. What are their perceptions of adult educators' roles in incorporating multicultural education in their training?
- iii. What are the perceptions of adult educators about the advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education?

- iv. According to adult educators' perspective, do learners' and educators' culture have an impact on teaching and learning process? If they do, in which way?
- v. What are the perceived practices of adult educators in incorporating multicultural approaches in their training. In what ways do they integrate multicultural approaches if they practice?
- vi. What challenges do adult educators encounter in incorporating multicultural education in their trainings, courses, if they have any?

### 3.2 Participant selection

In this section, how the participants were selected, and their profiles will be provided. Firstly, the researcher and thesis advisor listed and determined several possible non-formal education institutions. Maximum variation sampling method was used to reach diverse participants from a population to access a wide variety of samples, which can make data rich and strong in terms of data interpretation (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2007). It was decided to select three types of educational institutions, which are Public Education Centers, Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Art and Vocational Training Courses (İSMEK) and non-governmental organizations.

After obtaining permission from the Ethics Committee for Master and PhD Theses in Social Sciences and Humanities at Boğaziçi University, which can be found in APPENDIX A, participants working at these three types of institutions were contacted via email and phone call with the referral of their thesis advisor.

Purposeful and snowball sampling methods were used in the selection of the participants. Also, some educators were contacted via e-mail with the referral of thesis advisor. The content of the study was told to the participants by the researcher and an informed consent form was sent via email. Informed consent form can be

found in APPENDIX B and C as the Turkish version. After receiving their consents, the researcher and the participants determined an interview time in accordance with the participants' availability. The interviews were held through Zoom due to the Covid-19 pandemic. This qualitative study does not aim to apply a generalization of the results obtained from the study sample to a population. Instead, it aims to explore a phenomenon in great detail. In this study, participants were selected purposefully according to the criteria that was pre-selected. Therefore, purposeful sampling methods were employed in this study. Considering the aim of the study, that is to examine the perception of adult educators working in non-formal educational institutions toward multicultural education, a purposeful sampling method enabled the researcher to choose the participants matching best with the research context.

In selection of the non-formal education institution and participants two criteria were employed:

- i. The institution should have training for adults coming from heterogeneous backgrounds which necessitates a multicultural educational context as much as possible.
- ii. Adult educators should have provided at least two adult education training to those heterogeneous groups of adult learners. The reason for the second criterion is to ensure that the participants have experience working with adult learners.

Profiles of the participants of this study are 10 adult educators working at various (governmental and non-governmental) non formal education settings. Also, demographic information of the participants was illustrated in Table 1.

Table 1. Participants Profiles

Pseudonyms	Institution	Educational Background	Working field	Year	AE	ME
Selma	Public Education Center	Bachelor's degree in primary education	Turkish language teacher	6	Yes	Yes
Ali	Public Education Center	Bachelor's Degree in English teaching	English teacher	8	Yes	Yes
Hacer	Public Education Center	Bachelor's degree in Spanish Language and Literature	Spanish teacher	3	Yes	No
Ash	ISMEK	Bachelor's degree in clothing Teaching Master's degree in fashion design and educational administration	Clothing teacher	17	Yes	Yes
Gönül	ISMEK	Bachelor's degree in clothing Teaching Master's degree in textile and fashion design	Clothing teacher	6	Yes	No
Poyraz	ISMEK	Bachelor's degree in theater Bachelor's degree in singing Master's degree in theater	Drama-theater teacher	6	Yes	No
Yüksel	NGO	Bachelor's degree in law	Lawyer	7	No	Not directly related
Deniz	NGO	Bachelor's degree in physical education teaching Master's degrees in human rights law and sociology (unfinished)	NGO specialist	13	No	Not directly related
Gökçe	NGO	Bachelor's degree in Psychology Master's degree in clinical psychology	Psychologist	5	No	Not directly related
Melis	NGO	Bachelor's degree in foreign language education MA students in adult education	Lazuri Teacher	6	Yes	Not directly related

In addition to the demographic information provided in Table 1, participants were also asked to describe their learners' profiles and whether they received any training related to adult education, which can be found under the title of AE and multiculturalism under the title of ME in the table. In general, it was found that the

adult educators provide training to the learners from culturally diverse groups. The educators also indicated that they got some training about adult education, presented under the title of AE. The educators who work in Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Art and Vocational Training Courses, İSMEK, and public education centers, PEC, took these training as in-service training and the training their institutions provided. However, the educators who work at NGOs did not receive training directly related to adult education. One of them received several training sessions about learning and training the trainee. One of them is already a student in an adult education program. They did not receive any specific training about multiculturalism but some of the educators indicated that they joined some training in which multiculturalism, which is provided under the title of ME, was not directly talked about, but some related contents were provided such as human rights, inclusiveness, intersectionality, how to work with foreigners etc.

### 3.3 Data collection

Interview method was utilized for the study since it is considered as more appropriate for in-depth detailed understanding of a complex issue and people's experiences (Palmer & Bolderston, 2006; Gravetter & Forzano, 2018). "Interviews are also useful in situations in which you are willing to accept the limitations of a small group of participants in exchange for the in-depth information that can come from a detailed interview." (Gravetter & Forzano, 2018, p.332). However, even though interview questions are pre-determined, they are not strictly developed. It includes open-ended questions to have a better and deeper understanding of the participants' experiences (Berg, 2001). Therefore, semi-structured interview is more appropriate to use for this qualitative phenomenological study that examines adult educators' perceptions

toward multicultural education and their practices and challenges in integrating multicultural approaches in their training.

Semi-structured interview form which was developed by the researcher with the help and supervision of the thesis advisor and the committee was used in the study. After determining the interview questions, a pilot study was administered with 2 participants in order to evaluate whether the interview questions are suitable for the research context and clear enough for the participants or not. After holding these two pilot interviews, the required duration of interviews, the order and wording of the questions were edited and finalized according to the researcher's observation during the interviews and to the participants' feedbacks at the end of the interviews. After generating the final version of the interview questions, the actual interviews were held with 10 participants. The interviews were administered during the months of October and November in 2021 and January in 2022.

Due to Covid-19 pandemic, the interviews were held via video or phone call. Before starting the interview, participants' permissions were obtained through the informed consent form. The informed consent forms were sent to the participants through email, and they were asked to read the form and if they approved to participate in the study voluntarily, they were also asked to sign the form and to send the signed version of the form. They were also asked if they did not have an opportunity to sign the form in a digital platform, they were requested to send an email indicating that they read the form and approved to participate in the study.

Based on participants' permission, interviews were recorded. The interviews took approximately 40-75 minutes. The questions asked in the interviews were provided in APPENDIX D in the English version and APPENDIX E as a Turkish version.

### 3.4 Data analysis

After collecting data, responses of the participants were transcribed, and analyzed by using a content analysis method. Summarization, categorization, and coding of qualitative data are the ways that content analysis method provides (Mayring, 2000). In this study, participants' responses were coded and categorized in accordance with the research questions and under each category, themes were determined according to the finding patterns and frequencies obtained by the responses.

## CHAPTER 4

### FINDINGS

In this chapter, themes emerged from the responses of the participants will be provided under 6 categories according to the interview questions, as shown in Table 2, which are (1) definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education (2) advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education (3) the role of the educators with the (4) impact of culture on learning and teaching (5) multicultural education practices (6) difficulties with the implementation of multicultural education.

Table 2. The Categories and Themes

Categories	Themes
<b>Definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education</b>	
Multiculturalism	Coexistence of different cultures Intersectionality
Multicultural education	Educational material considering different cultures Coexistence of culturally diverse learners Inclusiveness Equal treatment
<b>Advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education</b>	
Advantages	Get to know different cultures Enrichment Empathy Easier learning
Disadvantages	Learners' reactions Conflicts Resistance Pricy
The role of adult educators	Constant learner Equal facilitator and guide
Impact of culture on learning and teaching	Previous learning experiences Being culturally relatable Other: Family, gender identity, ethnicity, disability, age
Multicultural education practices	Adapting educational material Learning learners' cultures Using an inclusive language
Difficulties with the implementation of multicultural education	Learner-related difficulties Educator-related difficulties Educational resource

#### 4.1 Definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education

Participants' conceptualizations of multiculturalism and multicultural education will be provided under this category.

Multiculturalism was explained by the participants within two themes, which are (1) coexistence of different cultures and (2) intersectionality. As for the conceptualization of multicultural education, it was described within four themes, which are (1) educational material considering different cultures, (2) coexistence of culturally diverse learners, (3) inclusiveness and (4) equal treatment.

Since most of the participants explained multiculturalism and multicultural education by associating it to the culturally different people coexisting in a place.

Also, participants mentioned differences in ethnicity, language, family, region, religion/belief, tradition, education level, sexual identity, refugee, clothing, gender, race, age, habit, sexual orientation, socioeconomic status, Lifestyle, Food, profession, learning style, perception level, hometown, point of view, view, experiences, and disability.

Frequencies of the cultural differences that the participants mentioned and the themes under the definitions of multiculturalism and multicultural education category can be found Table 3.

Table 3. Definitions of Multiculturalism and Multicultural Education

	Themes	f
Multiculturalism	Coexistence of different cultures	7
	Intersectionality	2
Multicultural education	Educational material considering different cultures	6
	Coexistence of learners from different cultures	7
	Inclusiveness	3
	Learning different cultures	4
Different cultures	Equal treatments	2
	Ethnicity	10
	Language	8
	Family	8
	Region	8
	Religion/Belief	7
	Tradition	6
	Education Level	6
	Sexual Identity	4
	Refugee	4
	Clothing	4
	Gender	4
	Race	3
	Age	5
	Habit	3
	Sexual Orientation	3
	SES	3
	Lifestyle	3
	Food	3
	Profession	3
	Learning Style	3
	Perception Level/Style	3
	Hometown	3
	Point of view	4
	View	2
	Experiences	3
	Disability	3

#### 4.1.1 Multiculturalism

When participants were asked to define multiculturalism, they had difficulty making a definition. However, when they were asked what came to their minds, they were able to respond to that question. They were elaborated within the themes of coexistence of different cultures and intersectionality.

Theme 1: Coexistence of different cultures: When it was asked what comes to their mind when saying multiculturalism and how they define multiculturalism, seven out of 10 participants defined multiculturalism as people from diverse cultures and their coexistence. For instance, Hacer associated multiculturalism as people from different cultures and diversity:

When saying multiculturalism, I think people from different cultures come first. Different cultures can often be associated with religion. It could be Islam, Christianity, or Judaism. But in a fundamental sense, it can be said that language, religion, race, and gender diversity of people gave us the meaning of multiculturalism. Diversity itself is multiculturalism. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 1)

Similarly, Deniz defined multiculturalism as a place in which people from different cultures live together by relating it to accessibility of human rights:

I define multiculturalism as a place where people who share a space and have different cultural values and codes can live together without oppressing each other, and where the access of any person's rights is not restricted due to any cultural code, feature, or identity. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 2)

Deniz also asserted that multiculturalism is more than togetherness of different cultures and emphasized human rights:

Multiculturalism is beyond just the coexistence of different cultures. In other words, is there an equal, fair, and honorable life for those cultures? Since I work in the field of Human Rights, but if I hadn't worked in this field, I would just define multiculturalism as different cultures living together, but something is added here, living but is living the same thing for all of us? A place where someone's right to life is not violated, where someone lives but has no rights, or where someone lives perfectly, is not multicultural in my opinion, which is a place where one culture represses the other, where it tries to oppress or assimilate. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 3)

Some of the participants described togetherness in different contexts. For example, some of the participants talked about togetherness in a place like a classroom, whereas some of them gave examples of togetherness in a city like Istanbul or Mardin. For example, Melis defined multiculturalism as coexistence of different cultures in a society by likening it to a puzzle:

When we think of a society, I think of the fact that different cultures have lived here by harmonizing together. In fact, all of them have found a place for themselves in society, and the system progresses in that way, they can live that way together, this is multiculturalism for me. All together, they are part of a society, like pieces of a puzzle. The coexistence of different cultures. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 4)

Selma defined multiculturalism as cultural diversity and she exemplified it from Istanbul and Şişli region in Istanbul, which is the region that she works in as a rich place in terms of cultural diversity. She also talked about her class people from diverse nationalities come to:

Cultural diversity comes to my mind, for example, Istanbul is a multicultural and culturally diverse city. Especially since there has been a great increase in immigration in recent years, I think that it has increased in terms of multiculturalism. To put it simply, the teachers who come to my class are surprised and they say that how there are people from such diverse nationalities, is it such a mixed class? Istanbul is a rich city in terms of multiculturalism. We can see people from many races, especially in our region, there are a lot of foreign nations in Şişli. I think that a large number of foreign nations means that there is a lot of culture. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 5)

Similarly, Aslı (she is a clothing teacher and working in the Sultanbeyli region) perceived multiculturalism as the coexistence of different cultures and she gave examples of Istanbul and the Sultanbeyli region in Istanbul. She also talked about how different student profiles in adult education are specifically in her class in terms of age, different cultures and cities:

The coexistence of different cultures is actually multiculturalism. I am giving an example in adult education. You live in Istanbul, not in Urfa. If you had asked this question in Urfa, I would have told you that people from the same culture are more concentrated. 80 percent of the students who come from Van or Tokat Reşadiye are from the same or similar cultures. But when it comes to Istanbul, we are talking about a class with different cultures and different mosaics. That's why adult education is very different. If we say for Sultanbeyli, where completely different cultures come together, 20 students are in the 20 different ages and there are only 3-4 students in the same age. 18-60 age group. All of them are from different cities and different cultures. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 6).

Gönül also defined multiculturalism referring to her class and Mardin, which is a province in Turkey:

Cultural differences living within certain boundaries. The coexistence of many customs and traditions such as race, gender, religion and language are multiculturalism. When we look at our own society, we are really a multicultural society. Last year, I traveled to Mardin. You can see multiculturalism together, or it is the situation where groups from different countries, different religions, different beliefs, and different families come together within certain boundaries, or in your classrooms. For example, I can have students from different races in my class or students with different religions, views and beliefs. gender, I think this is one of the cultural differences. Because I think that there is a difference between the girls and boys in terms of support in education. The traditions, the customs, the food they make, the clothes they wear, the colors they prefer, the way they sit, the way they talk, their morals, these are all things that come from a certain ethnic origin, and all of these are actually one of the cultural differences (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 7)

Yüksel also described what comes first to her mind when saying multiculturalism by pointing out possible negative outcomes of the togetherness of different cultures.

When it comes to multiculturalism, what the word echoes first in the person is such a lot of good things because the culture is well, multi is well, they are combined but it doesn't always resonate like that for example if I have hesitation toward the coexistence of those identities, there can be a conflict, we can be challenged. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 8)

Theme 2: Intersectionality: When asked what comes to their minds when saying multiculturalism, Yüksel and Gökçe responded it as intersectionality. They explained intersectionality to make a definition of multiculturalism:

Something intersectional comes to my mind. It is like a person is sometimes the direct subject, sometimes the carrier, sometimes the witness of more than one culture and identity and shapes their stance in life and their political stance accordingly. Intersectionality comes to mind when I say multiculturalism. Intersectionality is when a person's baggage is mixed with more than one culture or identity. This may not always mean that the person is the subject of more than one identity. Sometimes the person may have witnessed those identities very closely. Sometimes the person doesn't even need to be witnessed, the person may have possessed it, or may have possessed it on an ideological background. It may even seem to us that they sometimes contradict each other. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 9)

I have never defined this concept, but when I first think of it, ethnicity comes to mind first, and then intersectionality comes to mind, it changes according to our understanding of culture, multiculturalism, therefore culture can be related to everything, in my opinion. In other words, a society may have a general culture, or it may be a culture within a family, it may be some habits and traditions. Something very broad comes to mind when I think of culture. Intersectionality, ethnicity orientation, identity is a place where all these intersect. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 10)

Overall, cultural diversity, coexistence of diverse cultures at a place and intersectionality came out to be the meanings attached by the adult educators toward multiculturalism.

#### 4.1.2 Multicultural education

The participants were asked to define multiculturalism in an educational context and to explain what comes to their mind when they hear multicultural education. Five themes emerged under multicultural education, which are (1) educational material considering different cultures, (2) coexistence of learners from different cultures (3) inclusiveness (4) learning different cultures (5) equal treatment

Theme 1: Educational material considering different cultures: Six out of the 10 participants talked about materials used in training in terms of considering cultural differences while they were describing the meaning of multicultural education. Ali explained multicultural education in terms of how it should be by underlining educational materials:

When it is said multicultural education, education materials and education programs should be prepared in accordance with the appropriate curriculum according to multiculturalism. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 11)

For example, Selma defined multiculturalism as multidimensional education and education that appeals to everyone's culture in terms of educational activities by giving examples as follow:

For example, not only Turkish culture, for example, we can dedicate a lesson to Russian culture. I think we can explain this to other students, whether it's Russian dishes, folk dances or traditions, I think this would be a multicultural education. It wouldn't be one-sided. Multicultural education means the education given to the students from all nationalities by making them actively participate and talk in the lesson. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 12)

Hacer described multicultural education as integrating students' cultures into the class, and giving examples related to these cultures during the class:

There is a Jew, there is a Christian, there is a Muslim, what makes it multicultural, in fact, giving examples from each of them, their own traditions, their own beliefs, and actually lecturing by integrating them into the class. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 13)

Similarly, Yüksel associated multicultural education with inclusive education and embedding the cultural codes of people in training by giving inclusive and diverse examples.

When I think of multicultural education, inclusive education comes to mind, I think of imagining that the audience can be from any place, any identity, every socio-cultural level, and to make everything more inclusive, from the language to what you are talking about and the examples you give during the training. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 14)

Gökçe also related multicultural education to inclusiveness and indicated that Gökçe understands multicultural education as creating an educational plan counting and considering different cultures.

Multicultural education reminded me of inclusiveness because we call it multiculturalism. It is being able to comprehend different cultures and create an education plan that actually takes them into account. In other words, when I say multiculturalism, I understand it as addressing (appealing to) differences. You can provide training just by appealing to a single type of profile, you can talk about it by assuming that the person in front of you is a single type. For example, if I am talking about sexual orientation and gender identity in the training, I talk about that as everyone there may or may not be LGBT, not as we are a group and we are talking about that group out there, but I am talking about that group as a group including that group. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 15)

Gönül defined multicultural education indirectly. She addressed the perception level differences between learners and explained multicultural education by providing examples from her class experiences.

In fact, the language of education is common and what you want to learn is the same. you teach something and you expect the other to receive it. ...What they want to learn with their friends next to each other are the same, but their perceptions are very different. For example, I will teach basic skirts, or I will teach skirts, I will teach you to use machines, yes, this is something that does not change, but I think it differs from person to person from culture to culture. Yes, what you teach is only one thing, but learning styles are very different...For example, you want to teach a student something, let's say what you want to teach is sewing zippers. but you give feedback according to the student's capacity, you can sometimes teach the same thing many times, depending on the student's learning level, it may be 10 times, but we will try together, according to their levels, according to their educational capacities, you are trying to teach it to them. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 16).

Theme 2: Coexistence of learners from different cultures: When participants were asked what comes to their mind when saying multicultural education similar to the way they defined multiculturalism, seven out of 10 associated multicultural education with the togetherness of learners from different cultures in a learning environment. For example, Selma described multicultural education by giving examples from their own class in terms of diverse foreign nationalities.

What I understand from multicultural education is the diversity of races. For example, not only being Syrian, Korean, but also Russian, Afghan, Jordanian being together all of them, which makes it a very colorful class. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 17)

Hacer also made a similar association but based on religious differences.

There is a Jew, there is a Christian, there is a Muslim etc. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 18)

Similarly, Aslı defined multicultural education as the coming together of different cultures by giving an example of a classroom as a version of America:

Multicultural education is the coming together of different cultures. I will give an example of many cultures together, in America. America is a country where people from many different countries gather together, the most obvious example is America, its classroom version of multiculturalism. That version in the educational institution is an example of multiculturalism. Our classrooms are similar to America. What we mean by American is their origins there, they may be British, they may be Turkish, they may be African something like this. Different cultures, different lifestyles. Single and married. The culture of married students and single students are different. In married people, because of their spouses, their spouses' hometowns also become a part of their cultures. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 19)

Gönül and Yüksel also described a multicultural education environment in which there are participants from diverse cultures and underlined student profiles:

I think what makes a classroom multicultural is related to the diversity of the participants. In other words, it is very important what your student profile is. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 20)

I think of imagining that the audience can be from any place, any identity, every socio-cultural level. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 21)

In addition to the learners' cultural differences, Ali underlined the educators who are from different cultures while describing multicultural education:

When it comes to multicultural education, think of a school, think of an educational environment, where there are educators from different cultures, naturally, in a place where there is a multicultural educator profile, you have to prepare your curriculum, your curriculum and your materials accordingly. The material is not enough, whether you prepare it multiculturally or not, the practitioner must also be multicultural so that a multicultural living space can be created. When we say multicultural education, for example, we can see the number of Iraqi, Libyan and Syrian students in our schools, even if it is small. For multicultural education, it is necessary to have different cultures, both on the practitioner side and the trainee side. What makes the educational environment multicultural is the fact that the learners come from different cultures, and if you offer educators, teachers, trainers from different cultures to a learner group from the same culture, this is a multicultural education environment. Likewise, teachers from the same cultures, but if the learners are from different cultures, this is a multicultural environment. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 22)

Additionally, Melis explained multicultural education by addressing a place in which people coming from different cultural backgrounds are harmonized:

It is actually to ensure that people from different views, from different cultural backgrounds, can harmonize with each other in the educational environment, and that they can coexist in the same environment in every way. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 23)

Theme 3: Inclusiveness: Three out of 10 participants interpreted multicultural education as an education that includes everyone. For example, the first responses of Yüksel and Gökçe to the question of what comes to their mind when saying multicultural education was inclusive education:

When I think of multicultural education, inclusive education comes to my mind, I think of imagining that the audience can be from any place, any identity, every socio-cultural level, and making everything inclusive, from the language you used and the examples you gave. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 24)

Multicultural education reminded me of inclusiveness because we call it multiculturalism. Being able to comprehend different cultures. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 25)

Further, even though Hacer did not use the word inclusion, the way she described multicultural education was referring to inclusiveness. She explained it as an education that does not exclude the other:

Multicultural education is an education in which everyone is equal and does not feel different or marginalized from others. When everyone feels that they exist there, that they are not ignored, that they create an identity there, then we can talk about multicultural education (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 26)

Similarly, Deniz considered multicultural education as an approach that does not threaten people's cultures. He also emphasized the difficulties of practicing this approach in Turkey:

Multicultural education is an approach that focuses on eliminating the risks that threaten people's own culture when they come to the education environment, and also it includes the new cultural codes, but we are talking about something so difficult, especially in the conjuncture of Turkey. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 27)

Theme 4: Learning different cultures: Four out of 10 respondents perceived multicultural education through that people learn about different cultures. For example, Ali (English teacher working at HEM) described multicultural education in regard to learning a language as learning a new culture:

When we say multicultural education, if you study in the culture that you belong to, multicultural education can be like this: you learn a new language, when you learn a new language, you are learning a new culture. Every language is a culture. If you are learning English, you are learning English culture. You learn a new culture that is inappropriate for us but not in their cultures, or which is appropriate for us not for theirs. (Ali, HEM, Appendix F, 28)

Selma (Turkish teacher working at HEM) also understands multicultural education is to inform students in her class about the different foreign nations that other students come from:

I think my understanding of multicultural education is to give information about the students' nation states to the classmates of the students in my class. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 29)

Gönül talked about life-long learning and explained multicultural education as learning from different ethnicities by expanding it to out of class:

In fact, we are together with people from different cultures. In fact, learning is a life-long learning thing that continues, not just in the classroom, you continue to learn from every aspect of life. You learn from a Russian, maybe from a British, from Italian, but learning continues throughout life. We should not restrict it to a single class. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 30)

Poyraz (theater teacher working at ISMEK) defined multicultural education as getting to know different cultures within the context of theater training. He also described how he practices multicultural education in terms of learning about different cultures.

Multicultural education is getting to know and observe different cultures by students. If they are performing Lorca play, what are the relations between the Spanish Civil War and the effects he created and the rhythm of speech? What was the economic and political situation of that country at the time the play was written? Or what message is the author trying to convey? While talking about the history of theater, we try to explain multiculturalism on the basis of education. The student gains knowledge on these and conducts research. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 31)

Theme 5: Equal treatments: Multicultural education was also defined by 2 participants emphasizing equal treatment. For example, Hacer explained multicultural education as:

I think that approaching every group equally regardless of religion, language, age, social class, ethnicity can be multicultural education. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 32)

Moreover, Deniz approached multicultural education on the basis of the national education system and questioned which position national education portrays other ethnicities in terms of equality:

For example, it seems futile to talk about multiculturalism in the education system affiliated with MoNE. There is something strange from the beginning, we are talking about national education, we have already defined something that is national, and we can only define multiculturalism as follows. In the past, there were Armenians, they were very good people, or the Armenians are a very loyal society, the most rebellious in the Ottoman Empire. When you look, does the name of that cultural code group appear, but in what way and in what position? Is it an equal thing to have Kurds as brothers, why do we become big brothers. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 33)

In general, similar to the perception of multiculturalism, multicultural education was also associated with coexistence of culturally diverse learners. Also, according to the educators' perception of multicultural education, designing educational material and content in accordance with learners' cultures and inclusive and equal treatment were found to be the components of multicultural education.

#### 4.1.3 Different cultures

As it is mentioned in the category of perceived definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education, most of the participants associated multiculturalism and multicultural education with coexistence of different cultures while they were describing what comes to their mind when saying multiculturalism and multicultural education. Participants were also asked to explain what these cultures are and who they are. In the beginning of the interview for the questions of what comes to their mind when saying multiculturalism and multicultural education, more than half of the participants (n=6) talked about ethnic differences, half of the participants mentioned language differences and religious differences. Some participants related different cultures with family (n=3), traditions (n=3) and habits (n=3). A few participants also mentioned gender(n=2) sexual identity and sexual orientation (n=2) and political view (n=2). Only one participant talked about age differences.

However, when looking at the all the responses toward all questions during the interviews, it is found that the number of cultural differences participants mentioned increased. For example, the frequency of mentioning ethnicity by the participants increased. All of the participants mentioned ethnicity as a cultural difference. Similarly, as another cultural difference, language is mentioned by 3 more participants (n=8). Also, five more participants talked about family as a cultural difference (n=8). Furthermore, while in the beginning only one participant mentioned age differences as a cultural difference, during the interview, 4 more participants talked about age differences. It was also found that new cultural differences emerged during the interviews, which are regional differences (n=8) educational level (n=6) clothing style (n=4) socioeconomic status (n=3), professions (n=3), lifestyles (n=3), perception/comprehension levels (n=3), foods (n=3),

disability(n=3), learning styles (n=3), point of views (4), experiences (n=3) and hometowns (n=3).

To summarize, ethnicity, language, religion was mostly mentioned by the educators in the description of cultural differences while talking about multiculturalism and multicultural education. Differences in gender, age, sexual orientation, and sexual identity were mentioned least. Nevertheless, considering all the interview questions, other cultural differences such as differences in family, region, educational level, socioeconomic status, profession, disability etc. were also pointed out by the educators.

#### 4.2 Advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education

Participants are asked whether they find multicultural education important or not, all of the participants indicated that they find it is very important. Right after this question, they were also asked to describe the advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education. As shown in Table 4, this category was divided into two sub-categories, which are advantages of multicultural education and disadvantages of multicultural education.

Table 4. Advantages and Disadvantages of Multicultural Education

	Themes	f
Advantages	Getting to know different cultures	8
	Richness	3
	Easier Learning	2
	Empathy	2
Disadvantages	Learner's reactions	4
	Conflicts	3
	Resistance	2
	Pricy	2

#### 4.2.1 Advantages of multicultural education

They elaborated the advantages within 4 themes (from the most frequent to least one:

(1) Getting to know different cultures (n=8), (2) Enrichment (n=3), (3) Empathy (n=2) and (4) Learning (n=2).

Theme 1: Getting to know different cultures: Most of the participants (n=8) mention that multicultural education is very advantageous because it gives an opportunity to getting to know about different cultures, which contributes to the personal development of people, breaking taboos, and prejudices. For example, Selma considered multicultural education as beneficial through which people can get knowledge about the cultures of different countries:

I think it would be beneficial to learn about the culture of many countries. It can contribute to personal development. Think about it, if you think that I have knowledge about the culture of all countries, I think it would make a great contribution to the personal development of people. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 34)

Similarly, Ali and Poyraz indicated:

Learning from different cultures always has a positive effect. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 35)

Recognition of different cultures gives us a rich perspective in almost every field, I find it advantageous. I believe it provides richness (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 36)

Hacer pointed out that an educational environment provides an opportunity to encounter different cultures whereas it is not easy to experience that outside of the educational environment. She also underlined that this encounter can help annihilate prejudices:

You may not be able to encounter people who are different from you, have different beliefs, come from a different social background, and have different ethnic structures in your social environment but you can see this in an educational environment, so I think it provides an opportunity to get to know different cultures. Recognizing other cultures can eliminate being misinformed about those cultures. and I think it can eliminate prejudices. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 37)

Similarly, Asli emphasized adult education which includes so many students from different cultures by remarking on the interaction among students, which can contribute to students learning about different cultures from each other:

If I say for adult education, first, everyone in the class learns from each other, and I learn from them, this gives you an experience in every sense. No matter what program you give, the reason why I gave you an example of a mosaic because it is like a mosaic, because the stones of different colors are together, which turns some knowledge to you. We interact with each and every individual while interacting, the student tells you that this is how we are, and we are like this. Everyone has their own place, they talk about their traditions, sometimes they talk about different family structures. I had a student who did a PhD and we learned strange things from the student. For example, a student of mine works in a workplace. There are students who have worked in textile before, the student says, "We do it like this in textile," and I see and hear it for the first time. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 38)

When I see other cultures, this is enriching because we meet very different people and cultures in daily life, this is something that will be directly reflected in the educational environment. What I learned there can be useful for me in other places. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 39)

Furthermore, Gönül considered multicultural education as advantageous, which can make different students get to know each other and accept each other:

For example, there is a different point of view towards the Syrians, just like the perspectives of the Germans on the Turks who immigrated from here, there may be differences in their points of view. They may not want to accept it, but they start to get to know it, so they start to discover beyond just the seen, this is a disadvantage in a sense, but it can turn into an advantage. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 40)

Similarly, Deniz found multicultural education as very important and pointed out the importance of encountering different cultures and how this can work:

If I meet an LGBTI family member in primary school, for example, if I hear that Ayşe has two fathers, when I go to university, I will not be surprised that there are homosexuals. And I say to those who have problems with LGBT, I can ask why are you making a problem? For example, almost none of my friends who are from the big island in Istanbul do not discriminate based on ethnicity or language because they lived together with Armenians and Greeks for years. I mean, they have ideas about living with different cultures, and I think it is the same for the school environment. When a student sees a student use the henna as a cultural code, the student does not run away. They go into the dialogue and process of recognition and agreement. So of course, multicultural education is important. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 41)

Theme 2: Enrichment: Three out of 10 participants appreciated multicultural education through which people are enriched by being able to learn about each other's cultures. For example, Selma, Aslı, and Poyraz associated learning about all cultures with personal richness while talking about the advantages of multicultural education:

It can be personal richness. Think about it, if you think that I have knowledge about the culture of all countries, I think it would make a great contribution to the personal development of people. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 42)

You are making a serious fortune, multiculturalism helps you to have that knowledge wealth, and this is a serious treasure for us, especially in adult education, and I am growing my treasure over the years. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 43)

Recognition of different cultures gives us a rich perspective in almost every field . I find it advantageous. I believe it provides a richness. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 44)

Theme 3: Easier learning: Two out of 10 participants mention that thanks to multicultural education, learning becomes easier as follows:

You see that learning is much faster and more active in multicultural classrooms. As I said, you can see that learning is much faster and more active in such mixed heterogeneous groups rather than in a class in which there are students with only one type of family, one belief or one nation. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 45)

I said multicultural education and the multicultural education environment is always positive. Curiosity brings desire, desire brings learning. We can see that multiculturalism makes our work easier. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 46)

Theme 4: Empathy: Two out of 10 participants also deemed multicultural education as advantageous because it helps interacting with and learning about different cultures, which improves empathy:

Yes, sometimes it can create negativity, and sometimes it can create mutual disagreements, but the student can learn agreements as well. A student asks another student why you sew this way, the other one says I love sewing it this way, this is my lifestyle, then they will develop a sense of empathy. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 47)

I definitely find it important because, by exemplifying from my own life, being in such a different environment among my students when I am in such an environment full of differences, it increases the power of empathy in people. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 48)

Overall, multicultural education was found to be very important by the educators. It was appreciated by the educators that multicultural education enables learners and educators to get to know different cultures through which it enriches perspectives of people; it makes learning easier and faster; it improves empathy.

#### 4.2.2 Disadvantages of multicultural education

Even though seven out of 10 participants thought that multicultural education does not have disadvantages, six of them mentioned a few possible disadvantages. Other three participants directly talked about some disadvantages of multiculturalism. Four themes emerged under the category of cons of multicultural education: (1) learners' reactions (n=4), (2) conflicts(n=3), (3) resistance (n=2) and (4) pricy (n=2).

Theme 1: Learners' reactions: Four out of 10 participants thought that one of the disadvantages of multicultural education might be learners' reactions. For example, Selma talked about not wanting to receive education together:

If a person has not closed herself too much to the world, there is no disadvantage. If the person is biased, it can be a problem. They may not want to study together in the same class. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 49)

Other reactions that may come from students were indicated as follows:

It may be with the objections of the student, students may say "it is a shame in my culture", "it is a sin in my culture", or "I do not do it", "I do not say it", "we do not do it like that" (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 50)

Sometimes strange reactions can come. For example, reactions like "I don't think so", "I think there is no such thing." (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 51)

An NGO representative said that one of the participants was transgender and said, "This is against my religious values, I can't stay in this environment." and left. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 52)

Theme 2: Conflicts: Three participants talked about some conflicts arising during the training as a disadvantage of multicultural education. For example, Ali mentioned the disadvantage of bringing conflicting groups in terms of ethnicity together in a learning environment:

When you bring different cultures together, which have historical problems as a society, into a multicultural education environment, you will have trouble managing it. Disadvantage arises when you include groups that conflict with each other in the same educational environment. For example, there was nothing wrong with Syrians and Turkish people, that is, with Syrians in the past but if they have been in Turkey as a refugee for 7-8 years, social negativity has occurred. Also, for example, we have had constant problems with Greece historically. A Greek and a Turkish person cannot get along on the street if there are such political issues. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 53)

Aslı also indicated that conflicts related to religion can arise and gave an example from her class:

Some conflicts are arising, I will give an example. One of my students said “my teacher, I am very sorry for you because you are going to hell. I love you very much, I pray for you, may God guide you, I wish you were veiled”. Since they were not in the same sect (religious group), I encountered a few religious-based conflicts there, but very little. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 54)

Deniz expressed that multicultural education can lead to conflicts by underlining different groups’ readiness for coming together:

Of course, multicultural education is important but when being ready for togetherness. However, if they are not ready, if you get them together, fights may arise, whoever survives. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 55)

Theme 3: Resistance: One of the other cons of multicultural education that two participants touched upon was resistance:

There can be very strong resistance in some groups. For example, a parent may say “there is a Syrian student in my child's class, I will disenroll my child from the class. This is something related to adults other than children. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 56)

Of course, there are disadvantages. Sometimes there are people who are very close to learning, or they may not be able to learn even though they try to be together with different people but as I said, it happens a few times. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 57)

Theme 4: Pricy: Two participants addressed how costly multicultural education can be. Ali had described multicultural education environment in which there are trainers from different cultures, and he indicated that:

It may be a little expensive to find multicultural trainers. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 58)

Similarly, Deniz addressed the time and financial restrictions of multicultural education and found it as costly:

It is not result oriented, it is not result oriented, but our system is very success oriented, there is a problem here. Another thing in my opinion, it is a more costly thing in the first place, it cannot be paid in a place where multicultural education has already disappeared, but for example, bringing an Arabic translator even for training is a very expensive thing to support multiculturalism, even an Arabic translator wants to double the money. that is, even when they are producing educational material that always has limitations. Since you will respond to more than one need, the learning area must be qualified, which is a cost and time. These are the disadvantages that come to my mind first. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 59)

In sum, even though multicultural education was found to be very advantageous by the educators, a few possible disadvantages were mentioned. Students and family-related reactions such as unwillingness to be in the same classroom with different cultures, showing resistance to diversity and conflicts among different groups were considered to be a drawback of multicultural education. Also, multicultural education was also evaluated as expensive in terms of time and money.

#### 4.3 The impact of culture on learning and teaching

In this category, the educators initially were asked to describe whether culture has an impact on learners' learning process or not. Then, they were also asked to explain if their own cultures influence their teaching or not. Therefore, the category of the impact of culture on learning and teaching was provided under two topics: (1) The

impact of learners' cultures on learning and (2) The impact of educators' cultures on teaching.

#### 4.3.1 The impact of learners' cultures on learning

Participants are asked whether or not learners' cultures have an impact on their learning processes. If their response is yes, the participants are asked to describe how it affects their learning processes. All of the participants indicated that the cultures that they come from influences the learning process. According to participants' responses, three themes emerged, which are (1) previous learning experiences (2) being culturally relatable and (3) other. The last theme is elaborated under 6 sub-themes, which are generated from the examples that the participants gave related to learners' cultural differences: a) family related factors, b) gender-sexual identity, c) ethnicity d) disability and e) age

Theme1: Previous learning experiences: When asked to explain how learners' cultures affect the learning process, six out of 10 participants discussed that learners' previous learning experiences, their education levels can influence the way they learn, and their point of views related to the subject. For example, Ali described how coming from an environment that is closed or open to learning something new affects learning as follows:

Previous learning experiences reveal how open and closed they are to new information. If they are open to learning, you can provide them more information, you can teach them how to learn, but if it is an educational environment that is closed to learning, it is more difficult to open them up and encourage them to learn and use it. Especially religiously, for example, in Turkey, there is the teaching of the Qur'an. Qur'an teaching is a completely rote learning. If you read a verse and pronounce it, you can memorize and say it, but you do not know what it means. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 60)

Similarly, Melis talked about the previous learning experiences and gave an example of how learners' learning English experiences in the past influences the current learning process. Melis also mentioned as Ali effect of coming from a culture that is open or close to new things:

For example, they have learned English in a difficult way, and there was not anyone who knows English, where they grew up so they come very convinced that learning English is a difficult thing. Also, when they do not see anything culturally different around them where they were born and grew up, they come to learn something new, but they have difficulty learning it. If they grew up in an open culture, a culture that is open to outsiders, I see them more accepting and say let me try this, don't be afraid of trying and expressing themselves, some of them express themselves very well. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 61)

Hacer talked about the educational background of learners and how it affects learners' points of views:

I think culture has an impact on learning. Even the education you have can differentiate your feedback and comments on cases... The traditional background we have also affects our thoughts. Sometimes you may wonder how this person was able to make this interpretation and how the person could reach this conclusion from here, and that is due to the background. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 62)

Similarly, Gönül described how educational level of adult learners affect their learning by comparing two regions in Istanbul that she worked earlier:

The learning level of a primary school graduate and a high school graduate is very different. I also worked in the Mecidiyeköy region before. I had classes that I could understand quickly, but when I compare them with the Beylikdüzü region, when they think about their family and so on, sometimes I have to say something many times over and over. I noticed that they ask for permission more, they might say "they don't have time" but the absenteeism rates in the Mecidiyeköy region are much lower. Because most of them are well educated people who have accomplished certain things in life. I'm trying to say that there is a big difference between the experiences of a person who has a bachelor's degree and a person who has experienced many things. This person can graduate from primary school but improve herself/himself a lot and experience a lot of things. She/he starts to think in a way that a bachelor's graduate cannot think because his/her experience is too much, that's why I think it is very affecting. (Gönül, Appendix F, 63)

Deniz addressed how the previous discrimination experiences related to learners' cultures affect their learning process:

It is affecting, of course, if they come from a culture that is subjected to discrimination in any way, they have their own agenda in order to not to expose themselves to any other discrimination. Focusing on that subject brings that experience to the fore when they find a safe space in which they get an agenda about expressing themselves and struggling to keep their cultural values alive and living together with other people. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 64)

Gökçe also mentioned the learners' knowledge level and experiences while talking about the effect of learners' cultures on their learning process:

Since it is something that can change according to how much knowledge and experience, what kind of question you ask in a listening style in a training, what you pay attention to, it is related to the things you have brought up to that day, so I think it is affecting. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 65)

Theme 2: Being culturally relatable: Four out of 10 participants underlined that it is important to appeal to learners' cultures in their training. They discussed if their training is not culturally relatable for the learners, how the learners are affected by this. For example, Aslı who is a clothing teacher talked about how the learners' religious beliefs can have an impact on her classes and described what she does to appeal to their beliefs:

For example, we have a model called sewing trousers. In the program, the student says that I cannot wear pants, my teacher will not make them wear them, is it okay if I do not learn it? But you have to teach, that's where the thing comes in. They say that women don't wear trousers here. This is the most obvious example. They say, "my teacher, it is forbidden in the sect". I wanted them to sew the pants for their husbands. Their beliefs, the province they came from, their beliefs, their sects have impacts... Then, I say, let's do this, we have to learn this subject, let's change it according to you . If you force your students, you will lose all of those students. You have to respect the student; you have to respect their beliefs. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 66)

Similarly, Yüksel who is a lawyer and described what may happen if learners cannot connect themselves with the content of the training and shared an experience related to that:

For example, a topic that is mentioned can make that person pay more attention according to their baggage, or it can trigger them. I notice this, for example, something came out of my mouth and then they disconnected or started to think of something else. I gave training related to LGBTI+ at the Diyarbakır Bar Association. I went from Istanbul and the other trainer was from a western city. That day was the death anniversary of Tahir Elçi [who is a Kurdish lawyer and activist was killed in 2015. He was the president of Diyarbakır Bar Association] the other trainer was not lawyer, may not remember him, but there was Tahir Elçi pictures all over the bar room, and the trainer never mentioned him, the training was over, the subject told had nothing to do with Tahir Elçi. The training finished, I was there, I was preparing for my own training. I heard that the intern lawyers were talking among themselves, it was a training toward inter lawyers, nobody was talking about the training, everyone was just talking about how the trainer didn't mention Tahir Elçi how, his photos stand in front of the trainer. They said they are like this, they come from the west they only teach us something. It is needed not to miss some of the sensitivities of the participants, to hear, to see, I hear you, I am here, I am aware, I think it is very noticeable to say that I am aware of what is going on here. As I said, sometimes if they cannot connect his own story with the subject, what I am telling may mean nothing to them if there is no picture of their lives anywhere. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 67)

Also, Gökçe, who is a psychologist, explained the importance of appealing to learners' cultures in a training by giving examples of the romantic orientation differences:

For example, we are talking about love relationships, let's say we are talking about something romantic, but we do not talk about the a-romantic one, and if there is someone who is a-romantic, we did not include this person. While we are describing the love relationship, we are telling a single type of thing, we are describing the norm. In the learning process of the a-romantic person this person can think "they don't count my love relationship as a love relationship, what information can they give me then." We are not appealing to it in any way. With this, this person may become demotivated, feel excluded or can get angry. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 68)

Gökçe pointed out that when a learners' identity is not included in the training, learners' motivation to learn is negatively affected. Gökçe also responded to that question as a learner and talked about a learning experience Gökçe had in a training program:

Now, I will say this from the position of a student, not an educator. I had received education about sexuality somewhere, sexual dysfunctions and so on. Only sexuality between women was being told, it bothered me very much because I was very disturbed. It means that sexuality is viewed as something between men and women and what can be taught to me. My motivation to continue training decreased. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 69)

Deniz gave an example of a training program that he was witnessed with and criticized that it was not culturally relatable for the learners in terms of learners' language and pointed out power relations:

For example, if you make the program bilingual and then have the videos you watch in Turkish...I mean then allocate 5 minutes to its subtitles. For example, in one training, they watched a video shot in Syria, but the video was in Turkish, you can think that if it was filmed in Syria, it has both Arabic and Kurdish subtitles, and there was. The same video had sound options, for example, they did not do this. They made a group that doesn't speak Turkish watch a Turkish video and say, "You may not have understood, let's summarize." This situation will make people feel that it is okay if they do not understand the video. Let's give it to people as much as you want, let's not include it as much as we want, again it's a very power-oriented thing, something that the one who has power decides. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 70)

Theme 3: Other: The theme other was elaborated within 6 sub-themes, which are a) family related factors, b) gender-sexual identity, c) ethnicity d) disability and e) age. These sub-themes are considered by the participants as an example of different cultures that affect learners' learning processes.

Family related factors: Three out of 10 participants indicated that learners' family structures, their marital status or whether they have a child or not are the factors that affect their learning process. For example, Aslı described how some of her students' learning and understanding of the subject being told are affected by their family environment and the financial situation. She also mentioned this issue by relating it to the differences between adults and children:

There are so many factors that affects the students about being able to pay attention to the subject. For example, the student' child was sick in the evening, his mind is there not in the class, but she cannot comprehend anything. Family environment, the environment they grew up in, the place where they came from, economic difficulties, difficulties, all of these are reflected. If they don't have any financial worries, it is easier to pay attention to the class. Since you come across a student who comes and listens to the lecture with the worry of what she will cook at home, it has been a long time since my husband received a salary, the perception of all of them are therefore different. In other words, that student's mind is somewhere else, she does not hear you. She said, I'm sorry, my teacher. I don't understand anything today, I can't give my attention to you, , I have serious problems. She is in serious trouble, the family environment, the economic situation at work, whether they are married or single, whether they have a child or not. You do not encounter these in formal education at state school, the child does not think about the economy, the child is single, the only problem is themselves not others at that time, they have no problems other than learning that lesson. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 71)

Similarly, Gönül explained how the course of a day of the learners are affected during the training by their family issues and gave an example of her students:

Let me tell you this, the student has to take her children to the school in the morning. When she comes to the class, she gets fussy. Or when there is a problem at home in the evening, there is a problem with her husband, her daughter is sick, which makes her anxious, this is reflected in the work she does during the day, that is, their cultures affect their learning incredibly. It is really very important what the student experienced that day, how they feel, what they think. A student who is very energetic and happy one day can become very unhappy the next day and this is reflected in the work. For example, one of my students' husbands brings and takes her to the class. When I asked her why, she told me "My teacher, he doesn't trust me very much because he is a man." Her husband was from Elazığ, she says he doesn't trust outside too much, he is afraid that something will happen to me, so she accompanies me. When you look at someone else, they can come with their own cars by themselves. Some students only want to come for 1 day, they say, I have only one day, my husband allows just for 1 day to come here. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 72)

Poyraz also emphasized family factor affecting students' level of progressing in learning:

Of course, it is very different, their perceptions, concentration, interests, everything is different. The level of progress can also differ. We aim for the same point, but one student reaches that point in 6 months, but the other student can only reach it in the second year. I think the first is family, the second is the environment, daily habits, the music they listen to, the kinds of movies they like. All these factors, such as reading habits and participation in social activities, are factors, but they are purely sociological factors that originate first from family, environment and then from education. (Poyraz, PEC, Appendix F, 73)

Gender Identity: Three out of 10 participants deemed gender and gender identity of learners as the factors that affects their learning process. For example, Gönül described how learners' gender have an impact on their learning process and she indicated that a woman's efforts is more different than man to be able to get something:

If you are a woman, you have to work a little harder for something a little bit more, while a man can get a promotion immediately, you need to show yourself a lot more. In this sense, I think it is of course very important. I can say that, for example, we have such regions where I have a teacher working in the region of Esenyurt, for example, male students wanted to enroll, most of the women dropped out of that course, for example, this is a very important detail. Because they don't want to be in the same class with a man, they may rehearse (rehearse of what they sew) sometimes so they may not want to be in the same environment, I think it's important. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 74)

Aslı talked about transgender people, and she described how they can be included in trainings by emphasizing the role of adult educators:

Why can't transgender people get a comfortable education, why can't they enter our classrooms? It is also a serious problem for us educators. We can provide this, there are too many duties that fall on us. Maybe if you told me 10 years ago, I would have said for transgender individuals, so they should come and take lessons, but I think we should reach them, now I think that we should definitely include them in all kinds of education. I think that the point of view needs to be changed, it is a very important task for adult educators. Children may not perceive this in state schools, but since there are a lot of women in adult education, if we change the perspective of women, we will change the perspective of the society. Teachers' role is very important here, then multiculturalism will be real. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 75)

Disability: One of the participants, Aslı, talked about disability and complained about not being able to create a training program including learners with disabilities. She also described how she included one of her students living with disability:

Why can't we make a program for the disabled? This is a really serious situation... Years ago, I had a student who was born with a physical disability using a wheelchair. Years ago, she said to me, "can I learn something", I said "Yes", and she asked "How? I said "I will find a way". "I said, how can I find a method", but you have to create your class according to this situation. All the people around him have friends and associations, being disabled is not their choice. They were born with disabilities or have had it later, they are trying to survive, they want to learn something in a way, they want to do something. I did research about how they can use their elbow part while using a sewing machine. Unfortunately, there was no one I could get support from. I searched and caught a few examples, I found that there are sewing machines, you press the button, they sew on their own, I found a solution myself, the normal machine has a pedal, that foot needs to press, I adapted this machine to the way that the student can use her elbow instead of her foot. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F,76)

Ethnicity: One of the participants talked about the influence of a country, province, and ethnicity on learning. For example, Hacer addressed how the different countries and ethnicities learners comes from have an impact on their learning:

In other words, when you compare two 50-year-old women, let's say they are both university graduates, one from Ankara, the other from Istanbul, or one from Spain and one from America, of course, their perspectives the subjects and their interpretations probably will be different because they will have a trace of their own culture. I'm going to point out that the way a Turk looks at a subject, the way an Armenian, for example the Russians, A Russian's view of the subject is not the same with a Turk's way of handling the subject. You can see it very clearly. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 77)

Language: Selma gave an example from her class and described how learners' language affected the learner in her class:

In my class, there are students from the middle east countries. Suddenly a Nigerian student came, she had a hard time because everyone was speaking Arabic, she felt very lonely among herself. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 78)

Age: One of the participants, Aslı, considered learners' age as a factor for learning and indicated as follow:

Different age groups, I can teach a 50-year-old in a second but cannot sometimes teach a 20-year-old. I teach older people easier than younger ones. Sometimes, perception/comprehension is very important. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 79)

To sum up, learners' cultures were found to be a factor that influenced the learning process of learners. Past learning experiences, educational level, gender identity, family related differences, gender identity, ethnicity, disability, and age were considered as the influences on learners' learning process. Whether educational material is relevant to learners' cultures or not was also found to be the important factor for learners' motivation and success in learning.

#### 4.3.2 The impact of educators' cultures on learning

When participants were asked whether their own cultural backgrounds or identities have an impact on their training. Nine out of 10 participants indicated that their cultural backgrounds influence the way they teach and prepare training contents. For example, Selma (Turkish language teacher) mentioned that the region that she comes from, and her ethnic origin have an impact on the communication among her trainees. She mentioned before that most of her trainees come from the Middle East:

Since I'm from south-east origin, I can easily understand what they mean, if there is any discomfort, and I can easily understand their body language. I think that I am close to the Middle East culture, I am an Iranian immigrant myself, I am not a stranger to their culture. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 80).

Similarly, Deniz also mentioned the impact of the environment that he grew up in and gave the example of holding discussions about accessibility regarding this impact:

I am from Adıyaman, I grew up in Kahta as a place that did not have a theater and a cinema, only occurring once a year. You already feel that I'm in an undeveloped city, I'm in a place where the government of this country politically does not invest in. Secondly, there are things that I wanted to experience as a child or a teenager, but I could not reach them. Then you are discussing something about accessibility in your training which is something culturally and you are trying to increase accessibility for other groups. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 81)

Gönül (clothing teacher) emphasized that her past learning experiences influence her teaching elaborated it how it affects as follow:

I try to explain it with the smallest details while teaching. I teach with a model and show that we did this 2 cm from here. I say, "Why we did this because there is a waist gap here."...I discovered different dynamics of teaching it to a person, or I try to sew a zipper many times at home before the class and question how I can teach this to the student in the simplest way. I was not taught this by my teachers in the past, I always tried things by myself." (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 82)

Poyraz (theatre teacher) underlined the impact of family and environment that he was raised in on the content of his training, materials and the relationship between him and his students:

Well, I come from a family whose members were artists. When I was in primary school, I used to do my homework backstage, my mother would carry me with her, I would be with my father on tour, and of course I was impressed because they were retired artists from state theaters. When I entered the conservatory and won, I had already finished reading the books that my classmates had read in the first grade. When I was in high school, I read all the Shakespeare plays. I had already watched the opera maybe 20-30 times, and the ballet 5-10 times. I had already been to the Presidential symphony orchestra many times. Of course, the environment I came from affected me a lot. Cultural environment, background, and after that, of course, experiences are very important. I mean, I have many friends who graduated from fine arts or conservatory theater and started teaching without ever stepping on the stage without professional acting. I have 16-17 years of stage experience, a lot of tours abroad in Turkey, foreign local writers I have played with, can I tell classics, moderns, comedies, and musicals. Of course, the cultural environment and subsequent experience are very important. This affects the training I provide. If my student believes in me, if they love me...that's why they believe in me. These are all reflected in my classes, these are reflected in the materials I choose and the examples I give in the class. Of course, cultural identity and subsequent experiences change the educational materials I use a lot. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 83)

Yüksel (lawyer) talked about the effects of ethnicity, LGBTIQ+ identities and past experiences on the trainings as follow:

For example, if I am going to provide training about meetings and demonstrations, whether this is a mixed group or lawyers in the bar association, there is no possibility that I will not put the bans in the Kurdish provinces, for example. But I also put the Hrant commemorations. If this is at the end of the slide, I look at the time, I put it more forward and talk about it first. Because for me, it's probably something that touched me more and hurts my heart more, and I want everyone to remember to hear more. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 84)

Only one participant, Hacer, disagreed that her cultural background does not influence her teaching and indicated that educators' cultures should not influence their training.

No, it doesn't have an influence. it should not affect it anyway. Your cultural background should actually be put aside in the class, you should consider yourself away from them, if you are under that influence, I think you will not be open enough to other cultures. You should be equally distant. It does not require that I come from central Anatolia and approach the issues with a Central Anatolian mentality. I should also be open to completely different views. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 85)

Overall, educational content and materials used by the adult educators came out to be influenced by the educators' own cultural backgrounds such as previous learning experiences, language, ethnicity, geographical region, and environment etc.

#### 4.4 The role of educator

When it is asked to participants what adult educators roles should be in a multicultural education environment, as illustrated in Table 5, two prominent themes emerged, which are (1) learning (n=5) and (2) equal treatment (n=5).

Table 5. The Role of Adult Educators on Implementing Multicultural Education

	Themes	f
The role of the educators	Constant learner	5
	Equal facilitator and guide	5

Theme 1: Constant learner: Half of the participants mentioned that adult educators should be willing and open to learn about cultures. For example, Selma addressed the openness of adult educators to get to know different cultures:

First of all, they should be open to getting to know all cultures in an objective way, and then they should be willing to explain those cultures in their class. If necessary, we can bring that culture to daily life and keep it alive, for example, we can keep the Nigerian culture alive one day. Folk songs, folk dances, dances, etc. can be performed as activities. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 86)

Gönül also indicated that adult educators should renew themselves constantly in terms of teaching methods she used and in relation to that she emphasized that adult educators should know their students very well:

You need to know your students very well; you need to have an analytical talent. Constantly renewing yourself when I go home in the evening, what I did in my class today, how can I teach tomorrow, how can I explain it better, sometimes there may be a method that you constantly use, but sometimes a student has trouble getting it with this method, how can I explain this better. When you talk about adult education and multiculturalism, people's lives are so different that we don't know what they went through at home. They may have harshness, prejudices, and sense is really very important for the adult educator to play such a role here, at least. I can say that for myself. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 87)

Similarly, Deniz underlined the importance of knowing learning needs of people as a role of an adult educator:

I provide training about human rights, I will teach advocacy, I will study it very well, but at the same time, it is important to think about the needs of people who come to talk about this advocacy. Why do Roman people learn about advocacy, if you don't know this, there is nothing you're talking about. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 88)

Gökçe and Melis considered educators as a learner, and they indicated as follow:

If we say that everyone is different, I am there as a person who is going to learn in an interactive way or with the questions. Maybe I don't know what people know, I see it as an information exchange as an educator. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 89)

Showing that you are learning together, not acting to be an authority on them, not just showing that I know everything, and you will learn from me. We are on the way together and sharing because they all come from different backgrounds. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 90)

Theme 2: Equal facilitator: Equality was another theme that emerged when participants talked about the role of adult educators. Five out of 10 participants indicated that adult educators should treat learners equally. For example, Gönül indicated as follow:

Treating equally. Students should feel that they are equal with their friends, no matter what view, race, gender, belief the students have, they should feel that they receive the same service in the learning environment in the classroom. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 91)

Hacer addressed providing equal opportunity for everyone as a role of adult educators and elaborated other roles under this role:

I think educators' role should be to provide equal opportunity for everyone, not to discriminate, to be tolerant, to be accepting and tolerant. You should approach tolerance in an equal way so that you can be a role model for your students with your behaviors. You should also avoid potential conflicts. In other words, you can't do it by giving more attention to one group and giving less importance to the other group, and whatever your view is, you shouldn't try to impose your view, you should actually stay neutral. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 92)

Poyraz also defined adult educators' role as approaching the students equally by pointing out the measurement and evaluation process:

I think it is to give education to everyone in the same way, based on the same measurement and evaluation methods, without marginalizing. Approach the students in a way based on the evaluation criteria, with the same perspective, with the same distance to everyone, without seeing different, without othering, not approaching as you are different, you are superior, you are inferior, without making them feel the difference, without stating the difference. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 93)

Deniz remarked ensuring equality as a role of the adult educators:

To emphasize to participants that this is a place where people from different identities and experiences are all equal. We have to put this thing in the first place anyway, we are all equal, do we agree with that, let's hear this, at least this is an important step. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 94)

Additionally, Melis described the role of adult educators as follow:

The role of the educator is to make the environment suitable for everyone, making the learning environment accessible to everyone. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 95)

Overall, it was found that the educators discussed that an adult educator should have some knowledge about learners' cultures and willingness and open to the new; adult educators should treat all learners equally without discriminating any culture.

#### 4.5 Multicultural education practices

When they were asked whether they consider their learners' cultures and integrate them while preparing their educational materials and activities, all of the participants responded that they consider and integrate the learners' cultures in their training.

When asked to describe their practices related to considering and integrating learners' cultures, as shown in Table 6, the most frequent response obtained from the participants was (1) adapting the material and content according to the learners' cultures. Other frequent themes emerged among participants were (2) doing research and learning about learners' cultures, and (3) using an inclusive language.

Table 6. Multicultural Education Practices

	Themes	f
Multicultural Practices	Adapting the material and content according to the learners' cultures	7
	Doing research and learning about learners' culture	3
	Using an inclusive language	2

Theme 1: Adapting the material and content: For example, Ali, (English teacher) and mostly uses additional material. He works at a public education center indicated that they have to consider learners' cultures, beliefs, ethnic identities and all and he gave an example:

You cannot put a nude painting as a visual material in the content of the training. You need to consider learners' cultures. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 96)

Also, Hacer, a Spanish teacher working at HEM, explained what kind of arrangements she does while preparing the content and material:

In fact, while creating the materials, I avoid targeting a single culture as much as possible. If I am going to make sentences about cultures, if I include the mosque in one sentence, I include the church in the other sentence, I do not want to give the opinion that the teacher is close to, only one view. We can talk about the life of a very poor person in one reading text, and someone with a slightly higher income level in another reading text or we can talk about the sentences in which they interact with each other. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 97)

For example, Aslı who is a clothing teacher working at ISMEK emphasized flexibility in the training modules and materials. She indicated that you have to give room for flexibility in your training module. She described when and how she modified/adjusted the given training module by deeming the learners' beliefs, traditions, professions, and all etc.:

I will give an example related to learners' beliefs. You are making a skirt, your model is obvious, but the learner says that she can't wear this skirt model, she does not wear skirts, she says she only wears dresses but you have to teach how to sew a skirt so you can't say anything, you can't force it. How can we do it by flexing it, so I did this to one of my students, so this is a very specific example, but let's do this skirt, then when we go to the making a blouse unit, I know that she will not wear the blouse with a skirt, I said let's combine the blouse with the skirt and make a dress. She really likes this solution. You have to find a solution. If I did not find this solution and was not flexible, she would quit the class and the field. She works in this field now but if I did something wrong, I would lose her. For example, we have a model called sewing trousers. In the program, one student said that I cannot wear pants, it is forbidden in our sect, is it okay if I do not learn it? The student said that women don't wear trousers in our sect. But you have to

teach. I made them sew pants for their husbands. This is the most obvious example. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 98)

Similarly, Gönül who is also a clothing teacher working in ISMEK addressed the flexibility in learning material and underlined the importance of what learners want and their happiness:

Preparing educational material, many materials are common, board, machine, but when you go into details, it is very important. For example, if you sew a daily hanger blouse for a more conservative student or and if you sew an abaya for a student who thinks the opposite, this makes the student unhappy. What everyone wants is also important. For example, if the student wants to sew a larger cloth, you can't make it tight. or vice versa. more abundantly, then they are not happy. It is very important what the student wants, for example, a student gets a fabric and says, "I will make a skirt with this fabric", it can't be anything more ridiculous than asking the student will wear long clothes to make a mini skirt. I think what students want is related to their ethnic origins. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 99)

Deniz, who works in the fields of human rights at an NGO, also talked about what he does for the learners' sensitivities, expectations, and cultural codes in the training:

After you get information about the participant, you need to include his sensitivities, expectations and cultural elements, if you want the training to be really meaningful Sometimes you can include it very dominantly, for example, when you are with Kurdish participants, you address the issue of discrimination in education in mother tongue, because there is more life experience there, if there is a group that they should not be in close contact with each other, you act accordingly during the training. If there are participants speaking different languages, you act accordingly, you make the education bilingual or design according to a visually impaired person or a person who has a reading difficulty or giving examples from the places people come from while giving examples during the training. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 100)

Poyraz is a theater/drama teacher working at ISMEK. Even though he explained that students he works with are not so much culturally different from each other, he mentions that training content is the same, but he does some arrangements while choosing a work of art in theater according to the students' ages, point of views, physical characteristics, and their dialects:

For example, I have a student who was born in Istanbul, but he still has the Black Sea dialect in his language because he has just gotten used to it at home or the eastern dialect. If I have many such students, it is not possible to play Shakespeare. Putting the work of a Turkish writer brings them together in something real. I can put a Turkish writer, I can put a play by a foreign writer, comedy or drama according to the student profile, but the education does not change. The student's age, point of view, height and weight, of course, I cannot make everyone perform Hamlet or Juliet or I can't make everyone perform the slum character. The physical profile of the student is also very effective on this. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 101)

Melis (a Lazuri teacher working at an NGO) explained the practices she follows for the students from different languages.

This year, for example, I have two students from Germany, one is a university student and the other one is working. They speak English, they speak German, they learn Laz, but they are not Laz. The one from Central Anatolia and the other one from Trabzon, and I think they have Laz friends. For example, my group this year is very small and while I think about these two students, when I am going to do a lesson, I immediately think about them, and let's say I will give a grammatical structure. I combine the grammar they learned with the grammar in English with the grammar in German. They do not have a good command of Turkish grammar. So, I'm starting from English grammar to common. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 102)

Theme 2: Doing research and learning about cultures: Yüksel (lawyer) and Gökçe (psychologist) and Melis (Lazuri teacher) working at NGOs addressed the importance of doing research and learning and reading about the participants' cultures before the training:

For example, I did research before I met with Alevi women to talk about the Istanbul Convention. I looked up, In the last 5 years, what have Alevi women produced, women in Alevi culture, so what is their agenda. For example, very strangely, the end of that education was connected to something like that of Alevi women, which I read in this part. For example, the Pir Sultan Abdal association had sixty-four branches, only four of these 64 branches were chaired by women. We know that in the Alevi culture, Alevi women are strong, more resistant. I read those articles and so on, but they criticized themselves very much on this issue. For example, we only know a grandfather in Alevi culture. We know that in the movies and also in the stories of the Alevis around us but there was a grandmother who was the same as grandfather, but there was no grandmother for a very long time because even the oldest women did not want to be grandmothers, I can't do it, as if your grandfather would not be there, We left the Istanbul convention and talk about women empower each other, so I became a bit of a listener there, and participants talked to each other. If I did not do any research and did not

know them, it would be like this: I would probably just take the issue to where I knew (just Istanbul Convention) but I read about before the meeting (training). (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 103)

Theme 3: Using an inclusive language: Ali indicated that learners' cultures have to be considered while talking about something during the training. He elaborated as follow:

If you say something, yes it can be true for you but for the learners, in their language or culture, it may be an insult or it may be hurtful discourse so you have to take them into account. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 104)

Gökçe underlined the trainers' language in a daily life and using non-discriminatory language:

I might use a language that might be discriminatory, but I question my language I used. Trainers' daily language and how and what the trainer tells are very important. For example, you receive a class at a university, but the trainer just mentions Turks not Kurds. Now, I will say this from the position of a student, not an educator. I had received education about sexuality somewhere, sexual dysfunctions and so on are being told, only sexuality between men and women are constantly being told, it bothered me very much. I started to question how appropriate it would be to get something from that education while listening to someone from this point of view. My motivation to continue my education there decreased, it means that sexuality is viewed as something between men and women and what can be taught to me in a more personal way. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 105)

In summary, making changes in content, materials and activities used in the training was most used multicultural education practice by the educators. Further, attempting to do research and to get to know learners' cultures and using a language that does not exclude any culture were other practices the educators use.

In addition to the themes emerging under the category multicultural education practices that the educators use, in the following section, this category will also be elaborated within a model of multicultural education developed by James Banks.

#### 4.6 Findings according to Banks' model of multicultural education

Participants were asked to describe whether they consider learners' cultures while preparing their training or not, and if they consider what practices they do. Most of the participants implement the two dimensions formed by Banks, which are content integration (n=9) and equity pedagogy (n=10). When asked to explain whether they integrate their learners' cultures into the learning material activities or not and if they integrate how they do it, all of them responded that they integrate learners' cultures into their trainings. The ways the participants practice content integration were analyzed according to the four multicultural education approaches identified by Banks, which are (1) contribution approach, (2) additive approach, (3) transformation approach and (4) social action approach. The findings demonstrated that most of the participants follow additive approach (n=8), and half of the participants implement contribution approach (n=5) Also, two out of 10 participants use transformation approach and only one of them implements content integration in the level of social action approach.

These findings are illustrated in Table 7 and will be presented separately under each dimension by giving examples from participants' responses and they

Table 7. Multicultural Education Practices by Banks' Dimensions

Banks' Dimensions of Multicultural Education	f
Content Integration	9
Contribution Approach	5
Additive Approach	8
Transformation Approach	2
Social Action Approach	1
Knowledge Construction	4
Equity Pedagogy	10
Prejudice Reduction	1
Empowering School Culture	1

Dimension 1: Content integration: In this dimension, cultural content is inserted into a subject area by teachers. The teachers give various examples from different cultures and use contents related to culture (Banks, 2009). This cultural content integration can be implemented in four levels, which are (1) contribution approach, (2) additive approach, (3) transformation approach and (4) social action approach. In the contribution level, integration consists of just adding cultural elements like ethnic heroes, ethnic holidays, dances, foods, and music into the mainstream curriculum. Another level, additive approach is featured by infusing the cultural content to the curriculum but not changing its main structure. Third level of the content integration is the transformation approach, which is quite different from the contribution and additive approach since the integration does not occur in the mainstream curriculum, the structure of the curriculum is changed, and the content is integrated from more than one cultural perspective. Lastly, the social action approach is characterized by all the components of the transformation approach, but it also provides students an opportunity to take an active role, make decisions, and be critical and reflective about the cultural contents from several points of view (Banks, 2009). Within this framework, participants are asked to describe how they practice multicultural education in their training. It is found that nine out of 10 participants implement content integration dimension while practicing multicultural education. It is also found that 8 of them use an additive approach while integrating the learners' cultures into the content of their training and half of the participants also use a contribution approach.

Additive approach: For example, Selma, she is a Turkish language teacher, emphasized the goal of teaching Turkish culture but she added how she integrates trainees' cultures into her class within the mainstream curriculum:

In other words, our aim is to introduce them to Turkish culture, to teach them the Turkish language, their aim to learn Turkish language and Turkish culture and then we also talk about their cultures if there is enough time, we wonder and have conversation like “how this is in your country, sometimes they shows their hometown on the map, some people say that they have never heard of the village where they were born, they ask each other where you were born, sometimes the conversation can be extended, even the class continues. Now, our priority is the grammar needed to be taught in the modules, and after we give them, we have a conversation with each other in the remaining time, I think this contributes to the trainees in all classes. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 106)

Ali, (English Teacher) mentioned giving different examples of dialects used in different regions in Turkey as an integration of cultural content in his classes:

Since we teach language, when we give examples from Turkey, for example, we exemplify different pronunciations in Turkey. They pronounce this in this region while some others pronounce it differently in the other region. Or, culturally, in different regions, for example, different names can be given to objects, or there are different dishes, for example, in wedding associations, for example, we talk about these differences. We can give examples from different regions and make comparisons. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 107)

Hacer , a Spanish Teacher, described how she inserts her students' cultures while preparing the content of the training according to the SES or religion and indicated that she avoids talking about only one culture and she uses examples from people from more than one religion and socio-economic status:

In fact, while creating the materials, I avoid targeting a single culture as much as possible. If I am going to make sentences about cultures, if I include the mosque in one sentence, I include the church in the other sentence, I do not want to give the opinion that the teacher is close to, only one view. We can talk about the life of a very poor person in one reading text, and someone with a slightly higher income level in another reading text or we can talk about the sentences in which they interact with each other. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 108)

Gönül also talked about how she integrates her students’ ethnic backgrounds in her trainings, and she underlined the interaction among these students:

There are Albanian students, they are sewing Albanian shalwar. The students bring those materials, they take a lot of fabrics for it, and you see, there are many people who want to take its pattern and adapt it to their own work. An ethnic food, a cloth, or a product can have an incredible interaction within a class. Let me tell you that in many subjects, the area of the field can change, for example, this can be much more in embroidery, because it can be Antep, Maraş or British models, it can be integrated much more, but when you look at the clothes, there are more Abaya models, more draping models, shorter or longer models we can integrate these things too but this interaction can be much more in some areas that are very important here in the field, but it may be much more limited in some areas, but I try to use the ethnic origins of the students by blending them in the classroom environment as much as possible. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 109)

Poyraz, he is a theater teacher, he also elaborated how he adds cultural content into his training but different from other participants, he did not talk about inserting his students to the training. Instead, he indicated that he adds cultural aspect of a theater work into his trainings as a multicultural practices as follow:

I can say this for my own field. If they will play a game of Lorca, what are the relations between the Spanish Civil War and the effects he created and the rhythm of speech? What was the economic and political situation of that country at the time the play was written? Or what message is the author trying to convey? While talking about the history of theater, we try to explain multiculturalism on the basis of education. The student gains knowledge and conducts research about these things. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 110)

Gökçe underlined the using a term that is sensitive to the audience identities and indicated that she considers and add into the trainings what the audience (learners) says:

Years ago, for example, we used to use A trans from woman to man, things have changed a lot over time, trans identities etc. umbrella terms, not from woman to man, but actually he was always a man. As I learn from them, I edit my training. People can say something additional, or they know another side of the term I explained there, and they bring it there, for example, I can add it. I definitely add them. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 111)

Melis also explained the process of preparing the training that is flexible, diversified according to the students' profiles and referring to students' cultures. She also underlined the importance of moving from the point of what they already know:

For example, I have a student who speaks in another dialect, the student hears another dialect and warns me all the time. The student told me “I never heard this dialect, my grandmother was not speaking like that”. I say, “You may be saying this or that in your dialect or this statement might be said like this in your dialect. After that I’m telling for example, if things happen like this in Turkey, this event usually happens like that among the Laz, and that’s why we conveyed it that way. While preparing the lesson plan, I don’t do it at first like this: let me do this and that according to that. I change the plan immediately in the flow, because I do not prepare the plan in a very detailed auto-automatic way because it can change at any moment, the number of people changes the participant’s profile, while young people were always participating that day, one day over 50 years old participated, I should include them as well, I make a draft and plan because I will diversify it accordingly, we will do this and that, how we will do this, I refer to their culture right there, it is very important for me to go from a point they know, it is very easy for them to understand that way. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 112)

Contribution approach: As it was mentioned before, the contribution approach is dealing with adding ethnic dances, heroes, foods, clothes etc. to the curriculum. For example, Selma and Gönül talked about the activities they do in their trainings related to ethnic foods:

For example, we held a dinner event last year, and we cooked together with trainees and foreign trainees. Syrian culture has a famous salad called Tabbule. For example, my students made them, the others made pita bread, we served it to the whole school, and we made a nice event. Or we can do reading poetry activities, we can make the trainees read poetry on November 10 (death anniversary of founder of Turkish Republic, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk), we are trying to teach Turkish culture completely. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 113)

For example, they cook during lunch breaks, everyone brings something from their own region, they say “dried dolma is very nice, which region it is from”, “where can I order it from”. or the student from Uzbekistan brings the Uzbek rice from there, they get the recipe from each other. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 114)

Deniz gave an example of an activity including the music related to learners’ cultures:

For example, to organize a night of entertainment where their own cultures will be promoted, to create music lists, to make friends with the feeling that they can give gifts to each other, for example, they say why are you doing this, as a response: if you want to include more cultural elements, I think you should include something from your own cultures in the surprises you will prepare, I say. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 115)

Transformation approach: Adding various cultural elements from several cultural perspectives, point of views, frame of references into a subject area, concept, or a theory. For example, Yüksel indicated that she exemplifies from various areas while talking about something in the training and she gave the example of describing the concept of the state as follows:

I make a lot of examples; I give a lot of examples when I'm telling something, and I tell a lot of stories. For example, if we are talking about what a state is, for example, we are talking about a law or a constitution in general. The state is the judge who says to you in the courtroom, why are you dressing like that? I don't know, I'm actually trying to give examples like the examples I just mentioned, the state is the police that stops you for the general information gathering system (GBT) and surrounds the side of the pavement and puts the stones there at Commemorations of Hrant Dink. It's the doctor who says you're living with HIV, I won't treat you. by saying something from such a wide variety of areas. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 116)

If you want it to be really meaningful after you get information about the participant, you need to include his sensitivities, expectations, and cultural elements. Sometimes you can include it very dominantly, for example, when you are with Kurdish participants, you may address the issue of discrimination in education through the mother tongue, because there is more experience and experience there. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 117)

Social action approach: One of the participant, Deniz, underlined the participation of learners to the training content planning:

Giving examples from the places people come from while giving examples. As an example, while sharing the projects, there is a report of discrimination against Roman people while we are promoting well-written reports in a session of a training Roman participants surprised that there is a report about us, we know that we have contributed to this. It is what we call participatory method, you open such a space. Or you build that educational material together with people so that they already add something about their culture. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 118)

Dimension 2: Knowledge production: Knowledge production dimension deals with how and by whom knowledge is produced by examining the impact of ethnicity, race, gender, social class on the knowledge production process. Mainstream content and cultural assumptions are being challenged and questioned by

the students, which enables students to be a knowledge producer. For example, Yüksel emphasized the empowerment of Alevi women by making them actively question the assumptions and frame of reference about being an Alevi woman:

For example, I did research before I met with Alevi women to talk about the Istanbul Convention. I looked up, In the last 5 years, what have Alevi women produced, women in Alevi culture, so what's their agenda. For example, very strangely, the end of that education was connected to something like that of Alevi women, which I read in this part. For example, the Pir Sultan Abdal association had 64 branches, only four of these 64 branches were chaired by women. We know that in the Alevi culture, Alevi women are strong, more resistant. I read those articles and so on, but they criticized themselves very much on this issue. For example, we only know a grandfather in Alevi culture. We know that in the movies and also in the stories of the Alevi people around us but there was a grandmother who was the same as grandfather, but there was no grandmother for a very long time because even the oldest women did not want to be grandmothers, I can't do it, as if your grandfather would not be there, We left the Istanbul convention and talk about women empower each other, so I became a bit of a listener there, and participants talked to each other. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 119)

Similarly, Deniz mentioned a participatory approach he used in his training and gave example of Roman people as the training participants and preparing the educational material with them:

As an example, while sharing the projects, there is a report of discrimination against Roman people while we are promoting well-written reports in a session of a training Roman participants surprised that there is a report about us, we know that we have contributed to this. It is what we call participatory method, you open such a space. Or you build that educational material together with people so that they already add something about their culture. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 120)

Gökçe pointed out the role of the trainer as a learner and the role of the learners as a knowledge provider and enabling learners to discuss, question, criticize:

I think that we can never go on a journey by fully knowing what we are teaching while training, but sharing what you have learned, by learning from them, by transferring, it is such a way of learning. For example, it may be important to ask questions there, so it can be effective to get feedback on whether there is anything we left out, if there is anything you want to add or if you have criticisms, because everyone listening is a subject and we cannot provide everything. maybe we may not be able to offer a perfect training, but when we open a space for the conversation there, when we open the discussion, something more can happen, again, it may be a training where

there is exchange so I think we may not need to provide everything before.  
(Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 121)

Melis is also considered herself as a learner from the students and allow students to provide knowledge:

In order to learn about something, I need to know the reason for it. I have to question. I need to explain the reason behind it, how can I explain it to people, how it is like in the environment where the students live. If it is something that I don't know I tell it but If it's something I don't know, I ask them and learn from them. They tell it. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 122)

Dimension 3: Equity pedagogy: Equity pedagogy consists of practices like modifying teaching methods, learning material and activities according to the learning needs and features of students coming from different cultural backgrounds. Participants are asked to describe whether they rearrange their training after they get to know their learners more and if they do, how they revise their training and what they do. It is found that 9 out of ten participants implement the dimension of Equity Pedagogy.

For example, Aslı gave the example of disability and described how she adapts her training to her student with physical disability. She also described how a training program can arise from the learning needs of the students by exemplifying from one of her students:

Years ago, I had a student who was born with a physical disability using a wheelchair. Years ago, she said to me, “can I learn something”, I said “Yes”, and she asked “How? I said “I will find a way”. “I said, how can I find a method”, but you have to create your class according to this situation. All the people around him have friends and associations, being disabled is not their choice. They were born with disabilities or have had it later, they are trying to survive, they want to learn something in a way, they want to do something. I did research about how they can use their elbow part while using a sewing machine. Unfortunately, there was no one I could get support from. I searched and caught a few examples, I found that there are sewing machines, you press the button, they sew on their own, I found a solution myself, the normal machine has a pedal, that foot needs to press, I adapted this machine to the way that the student can use her elbow instead of her foot...For example, it happened last week, I wanted to tell you about this subject, because I realized that they need it. In fact, for example, I don't usually give homework, but I

asked if everyone had a sewing machine in the class, everyone said yes, I mean, I asked did anyone in the class have a sewing machine? If everyone did not have a sewing machine, a few students in the class said I did not have it, I would have given up on this activity. Financial situation of the students is also a factor. The number of students who can buy material is also very important. I consider it, I want to do something extra, but if the financial situation of a student in the class is bad, I do it accordingly... For example, when I worked in Mecidiyeköy, we had a Zenne, drag queen, student. This man earns money with this profession. He said "I want to sew my own clothes". He invited us to their shows. This is multiculturalism, his main reason for coming was to sew his own costumes. I went to the mask carnival in Venice, I researched the costumes, I opened a program called Costume Sewing to see what we can do. But why would you open a costume sewing program? Because of the coming of a few of your students, I researched them abroad, I looked at their examples abroad, this is even more important abroad, it is just being done in Turkey. I started making friends with the costume designers. When we talk about multiculturalism, it also determines the needs, and as you identify those needs, you open a program accordingly. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 123)

Further, Yüksel elaborated how she arranges the learning material by giving example of an experience she had in one of her trainings toward medical doctors, she considered professional identity as a cultural code:

I went to a university, these were medical school students, it was a department of psychiatry, most of them were mental health doctors. I went there to explain the gender adjustment process, when I was talking about a prisoner LGBTI+'s difficulties in the adjustment process, I talked about how difficult the doctor's reports made our job, and I "backbite" about the doctors, and it created a tension there, I understood directly from their faces. Then I realized that that was a period when violence toward medical doctors was very intense: I said, they do so much work, they see so many people, they disconnect from that person, and they can do something very flattering and pass. It's over there. I passed the question-and-answer session and realized that it was very sad, all the questions were about this. There were one or two questions about the essence of the subject I told, if there were 10 questions in total, they were all related to this, obviously I made a mistake there. They were asking "Do you think that doctors are such people?". And that's probably what they will remember from the training that everyone focused on. After that, I changed a lot of things, went back, and scanned some of the publications, scanned my articles and slides. I reviewed them all. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 124)

Hacer described what changes she makes in the educational material according to her students' age range and learning pace:

There can be changes in the sentences, there can be changes in the listening passages in the reading passages, considering the age range of the student group or the ethnic structure they come from, of course, their learning speed are not the same, that is, considering the audience in front of you, we try to organize the listening passages or dialogues in this way. I am revising. For example, I was working in a high school, and the student body in front of me was almost from a similar background, so I didn't need to revise much, but here, people from different age groups and different social structures were coming in every course every semester, so you have to adapt your exercises accordingly. (Hacer, PEC, Appendix F, 125)

Selma mentioned arranging an organization and event according to the students' cultures and gave an example from her Syrian students:

For example, sometimes we organize events, some trainees want to take photos, some trainees hesitate, especially Syrian women, because they come from a closed culture. For example, sometimes we do events, or I say that this event will be published on the website, they say please delete our photos. So I say we don't do those activities if necessary, I skip it if necessary. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 126)

Gönül emphasized the importance of flexibility by considering the comfort and needs of students:

It is very important to listen to what the student wants, analyze accordingly and present the right options to the student...For example, if a student is going to take his daughter to school in the morning, you should be able to give that student a 30-minute option, or if the student has a dental appointment in the afternoon, you should be able to provide an option accordingly. It is very important to be able to take initiative as a teacher, that is, not only within certain limits given by the institution, but also in the classroom in a way that the student can feel comfortable without approaching the boundaries too much, it is very important to be able to provide that equality of opportunity. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 127)

Deniz also talked about meeting the learning needs of learners and creating an inclusive environment:

In order to make the environment inclusive, the participants' needs must be met. To organize an organization according to those needs...If there are participants speaking different languages, you act accordingly, you make the education bilingual or design according to a visually impaired person or a person who has a reading difficulty. (Deniz, NGO, Appendix F, 128)

Gökçe underlined getting to know people in the training and described what she does to get to know their backgrounds and points of view:

Asking a question, posing a question. For example, doing interactive things is the best way to get some information about everyone and learn where they are, what their backgrounds are and what their thoughts are while coming here. I use certain games to get to know people. For example, everyone writes something on the paper, you collect it, you can learn from them. Maybe what is to be told and to do something that is not fully structured and, but that can change during the training. (Gökçe, NGO, Appendix F, 129)

Melis also described how she modifies learning activities by considering the profile of her students and learning environment dynamics:

If there is an environment where there are very passive people, I go more monotone, I go more grammar based. If there is a group that focuses on culture very much, I immediately give an assignment for the next week. I also do research about it, if it is something I can learn at that moment, I make something by including almost everyone so that I can design the materials accordingly. This year, there were a lot of students who turned their cameras off and didn't want to turn it on. I know that an adult has this right, I don't want to force them, but when I thought about what I could do to include them, I realized that they don't like to participate in the class actively, they like to be more listeners and they don't feel comfortable expressing themselves. When I notice in places like this, I develop material where everyone can feel good. For example, last year we always played games together, we were all playing together because they were all actively participating but now, I share the games on whatsapp so that they can play individually. Because they are not active in group work. They shouldn't feel outside, they need to feel that they've learned, they are more individualistic people. In speaking activities, for example I talked to them one by one. They feel more comfortable when they talk to me. They have prejudices when they talk to each other... In general, my technique is to observe all of them, observe all the dynamics and move towards their wishes... We have been going online for two years, I know that it will take a long time to get used to the zoom, for example, a lot of people who do not know the zoom, especially the older age group, the older age group really have a hard time controlling it. After talking about all this course plan and so on in the lesson, I am giving information on how to use the zoom, I am just telling you the things we will use, for now I say it is enough for you to know them. (Melis, NGO, Appendix F, 130)

Poyraz stated that he sometimes changes the type of theater work he chose according to the student's dialect, age, point of view, height, and weight:

For example, I have a student who was born in Istanbul, but he still has the Black Sea dialect in his language because he has just gotten used to it at home or the eastern dialect. If I have many such students, it is not possible to play

Shakespeare. Putting the work of a Turkish writer brings them together in something real. I can put a Turkish writer, I can put a play by a foreign writer, comedy, or drama according to the student profile, but the education does not change. The student's age, point of view, height, and weight, of course, I cannot make everyone perform Hamlet or Juliet or I can't make everyone perform the slum character. The physical profile of the student is also very effective on this. (Poyraz, ISMEK, Appendix F, 131)

Dimension 4: Prejudice Reduction: Even though some participants talk about prejudice reduction as an advantage of multicultural education, only one participant, Ali, mentioned implementing the prejudice reduction dimension:

After getting to know the group well, it will not be a problem. For some social mistakes, our duty is not just to teach a language, let's pass it on. We are together with adults, to make them see the truth if there are social mistakes, to make them see the truth, no matter how old they are, to integrate into the society. To show that things can be different from society to society that it can be different, and they can change. by giving examples from the past taboos, this taboo may have taken this, you may also have taboos. then, , we can give examples of objectionable topics, so we can make it in small conversations in lesson breaks. We can give examples from different regions and make comparisons. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 132)

Dimension 5: Empowering School Culture: While talking about the practices only one participant, Aslı, pointed out collaborative works in institution to empower their trainings as follows:

We hold group meetings beforehand, this is not just a decision I take alone, because if you are 100 teachers together, the meeting is held and decisions are made by all the group. Everyone gives different examples of that multiculturalism, some of them say we give this module like this, we act like that, let's be flexible. You are trying to discuss how much we can do. Then you have data about it, and according to it, you are moving within that framework, this is not actually an individual work. It's a collective effort. (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 133)

In sum, it was found that multicultural education was mostly implemented in the dimensions of content integration and equity pedagogy. It was also found that multicultural content was incorporated in contribution and additive level.

#### 4.7 The difficulties that adult educators encounter

Participants were asked whether they encounter any difficulties while employing multicultural education. Eight of 10 participants responded that they have some difficulties. These difficulties were described under the themes of (1) learner related difficulties, (2) educator related difficulties (3) educational resource related difficulties.

Theme 1: Learner related difficulties: Three out of 10 educators talked about learner related difficulties. For example, Aslı talked about how difficult it is to teach a subject that students do not want to learn:

The biggest difficulty is getting the student to accept. If the student doesn't accept it, then you can't force the adult to accept. They can say that "I will not do this", "I will not learn it", like the example of a trousers-skirt blouse, they can say "I will only wear a dress", "I do not want to do these two modules." (Aslı, ISMEK, Appendix F, 134)

Similarly, Deniz indicated that he sometimes encounters learners' resistance.

Gönül indicated that she has difficulties with being able to access her students when students do not want to be open about themselves:

Sometimes I have difficulties. Sometimes some students can be very closed boxes, not allowed to approach their boundaries. Sometimes, you also have to stay away, sometimes you need to be able to make the right move in the right place, there are some difficult points. Likewise, in one or two classes, there may be people who don't drop the class but are more passive. I mean there can be students that you can't reach. Not everyone can give that opportunity. Some students need to give the opportunity to you. Since no matter how much you do your best, you cannot convey this to them if they do not want to listen. The difficulties are more about whether students are open or not. (Gönül, ISMEK, Appendix F, 135)

Theme 2: Educator related difficulties: Four out of 10 participants talked about the difficulties related to themselves. For example, Selma pointed out the difficulty with not knowing the language that learners speak:

I have difficulties with language at first, think about it, they just arrived in A1 level Turkish language class, and sometimes it happens that they just entered

Turkey, they do not know a single word in Turkish, I do not know a single word of Arabic. (Selma, PEC, Appendix F, 136)

Yüksel talked about the difficulty with protecting the boundaries with learners and indicated as follow:

Sometimes I can feel that my limits have been exceeded a bit. I can have such difficulty. Someone may want to come and tell me a story after the training is over. This doesn't always bother me, but sometimes it does. For example, I'm tired, I have another agenda in my head, so I can't cut it when I can cut there, it's something about me. I have a hard time keeping my boundaries. On the one hand, while trying to talk about the law as something from life, you tell people something about your life story and their life story because that's how real ties and contact are established. I don't think you can teach a lot to someone you don't have a real connection with, nor do I think you can get anything. But while maintaining the continuity of that bond, I sometimes have difficulties keeping my boundaries. (Yüksel, NGO, Appendix F, 137)

Melis revealed her biases toward a certain group of students who do not show active participation during the class as a difficulty she has:

Sometimes yes I have difficulties. Because I am a very talkative and an extroverted person. I also keep quiet when I first enter, but then I like to be active when I get used to an environment. But when I talk a lot, the others in the class are silent, I say there is a problem, or if I think that I am not suitable for the class, then I feel very uncomfortable. Sometimes I don't want to go to class, I don't want to open the class...Seeing that they are not active seeing that they are not learning...There are times when I also have prejudices and the prejudices challenge me. I am on a certain student's wavelength, and I love to progress on that, but because it doesn't work with some of them, I can't talk to them from the same place. (Melis, NGO Appendix F, 138)

Theme 3: Educational resource related difficulties: Only one participant, Ali, mentioned that he has difficulty finding appropriate materials for learners:

You may not be able to find the visual material you want while searching for it or you may not be able to find the video you want, because I usually use images and videos more than text. I'm having trouble finding material. Sometimes the materials you find may not be suitable for the atmosphere of the group, for example, it may appear as a problem because for you, it can be a very interesting material, but the content of the material may not be such a familiar or interesting for them. (Ali, PEC, Appendix F, 139)

In sum, the difficulties were divided into three, which are learner related difficulties, educator related difficulties and resources related difficulties. For learner-related difficulties, it was found that learners' resistance to not learning were mostly encountered by the educators. As for educator related difficulties, not knowing learners' language by educators, educators' biases, difficulties with protecting boundaries with learners were found to be the difficulties had by the educators. Lastly, insufficient teaching material was another difficulty talked about by only one educator.

## CHAPTER 5

### DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In this chapter, summary of the study, discussion of findings, conclusion, limitations of the study, and suggestions for future studies will be presented.

#### 5.1 Summary

In this study 10 adult educators working in non-formal education settings were interviewed by utilizing semi-structured interviews. Having analyzed the data ,six categories generated in line with the research questions of this study, which are (1) definitions of multiculturalism and multicultural education, (2) advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education, (3) the role of adult educators, (4) impact of culture on learning and teaching, (5) multicultural education practices and (6) difficulties with the implementation of multicultural education.

In this study, multiculturalism and multicultural education are associated by the educators with the coexistence of people from different cultures at a place. In addition to the coexistence of different cultures, multicultural education is mostly perceived as educational content and materials that comprise diverse cultures. Inclusiveness and equal treatment are also mentioned by the participants while describing multicultural education. The participants find multicultural education as very important by identifying several advantages of multicultural education. The educators indicated that multicultural education enables one to get to know diverse cultures, through which learners' personal development and their points of view are enriched. It is also noted by few educators that multicultural education facilitates learning. Even though all of the educators consider multicultural education mostly

advantageous, they also mention some possible disadvantages of multicultural education. They conceive that learners may show some negative reactions and resistance toward the educational content and being with culturally different people in a learning environment. It is also indicated by the educators that conflicts may arise among different cultural groups. Further, multicultural education is deemed by them as expensive and difficult to afford creating a multicultural learning environment. Although they all find multicultural education as important and are able to describe what comes to their mind when they think of the concept of multicultural education, most of the educators do not have an adequate understanding of multicultural education. Their perceptions in general are limited to cultural diversity, coexistence of cultural diversity and educational content and material considering cultural diversity. The educators have a consensus on the matter that learners' cultures influence their learning processes. They consider previous educational experiences, educational level, family related issues, gender identity, ethnicity, disability, and age are the factors that affect learning. They underline the importance of using materials that learners can culturally relate themselves with. The educators also agree that their own cultures have an impact on their training. The educators believe that their past learning experiences, the environment they were raised in, their languages and ethnicities may influence their teaching. As for their perceived multicultural education practices, the majority of the educators adapt educational content, materials, and activities in accordance with their learners' cultures. The educators mostly practice multicultural education in the content integration and equity pedagogy dimensions. Most of them employ additive and contribution approaches while practicing multicultural education. Similar to their perception of multicultural education, most of the educators' perceived practices are

not at the transformation and social action level. The educators also encounter some difficulties related to themselves, their learners, and the educational resources. Resistance shown by learners to learn something new, being unfamiliar with learners' mother tongues and having biases by educators, and inadequate educational material are the challenges they experience.

## 5.2 Discussion

In this section, initially general findings of the study will be discussed. Then, categories and themes, derived from the findings will be discussed in line with the research questions separately in relation to the relevant literature.

### 5.2.1 Overall discussion of the findings

The interviews with the adult educators indicate that even though they were able to conceptualize multicultural education to some extent, most of them did not have an extensive and comprehensive understanding of multicultural education that this study implies. They all referred to some elements and dimensions of multicultural education, and mostly associated the concept of multicultural education with cultural diversity and coexistence of diverse cultures in a learning environment. Most of the educators also perceived multicultural education as learning about different cultures and designing or adapting educational material and activities in accordance with learners' cultures, and some of them even perceived it as treating all learners equally and some describe it as inclusive education. The way they conceptualize multicultural education mostly were not supportive of the social reconstructionist approach. Except for one educator working at an NGO in the fields of human rights, none of the educators provided a critical perspective to the issue. They mostly

restricted their definitions of multicultural education to the approach of “teaching the exceptional and culturally different”, which focuses on cultural differences and aims to support these differences to function in mainstream culture.

Since the educators associated multicultural education with cultural differences, it is important to examine what these differences are. The findings of the study revealed that all educators mentioned ethnic diversity. Further, most of the educators talked about differences in religion, language differences related to region and family and educational level. A few educators mentioned gender, LGBTIQ, disability and age.

The adult educators find multicultural education as very important by underlining the importance of encountering culturally diverse individuals. They identified several contributions of multicultural education regarding its importance. They mentioned that multicultural education enables one to get to know and learn different cultures which leads to personal development and enrichment. They also indicated that multicultural education improves sense of empathy and tolerance, reduces prejudices and stereotypes. Further, they thought multicultural education makes learning easier and faster. However, the educators did not point out the expected transformative outcomes of multicultural education regarding social action approach to multicultural education.

As for the educators’ practices in this study, the findings revealed that the educators modify their educational materials to match with learners’ needs and cultures. A few educators mentioned that they do some research to learn about the learners’ culture while designing the content of their training. Additionally, using an inclusive language is another practice implemented by a few other educators. The findings of this study revealed that educators’ practices were mostly reduced to

content integration and equity pedagogy dimensions. Since most of them elaborated their practices within the context of content integration dimension, the findings related to multicultural education were discussed based on the levels of content integration. It was found they mostly use content integration in additive and contribution level. It was also found that some educators implement multicultural education to some extent in knowledge production level. They mentioned that they see the learners as knowledge providers, and they design some content together. They do some activities including holding discussions and questioning. Except for two educators, the way they practiced multicultural education was not supportive of the social action level of content integration. The educators using social action approach underlined the importance of active participation of learners in the formation of training.

Consequently, when evaluating the educators' perceptions and practices of multicultural education by associating with the conceptualization of multicultural education in the literature, they all find multicultural education as important, and they are able to define and implement multicultural education to a limited extent. However, regarding social action and reconstructionist approach, their understanding of multicultural education is quite limited. These results indicate that the way multicultural education is perceived and practiced by educators is also closely related to the sociocultural and political structure and concurrent education system of Turkey. Turkey's education system has a centralized and monocultural structure, arguments and studies mostly deal with multiculturalism in terms of diversity in ethnicity, religion, and language (Celik, et al., 2017; Köşker & Erdoğan, 2020). Further, the steps have been taken in Turkey within the context of multicultural education such as opening private language courses, opening departments at

universities and teaching elective language courses at schools under the title of Living Languages and Dialects (Celik, et al., 2017; Günay & Aydın, 2015) are restricted to teaching the culturally different and single studies approach (Sleeter & Grant, 1987). Moreover, the multicultural content has been incorporated at additive and contribution level, not transformation and contribution level (Banks, 1993a; Banks, 1993b; Banks, 1993). This situation indicates that Turkey's education system has created educational policies in regard to multiculturalism by sustaining its mainstream structure dominated by single culture, not by transforming and restructuring the regulations and policies considering human rights and multicultural structure of the country.

#### 5.2.2 Discussion of the findings based on categories and themes

In this section the findings of this study will be discussed in relation to the relevant literature. Findings will be discussed according to the categories and themes derived from the data analysis under the research questions of the study.

##### 5.2.2.1 Multiculturalism

When considering the definitions of multiculturalism in the relevant literature, it can be said that there are several essential components of multiculturalism, which are cultural diversities, their coexistence in a society, interaction and recognition of cultural diversities, equality, and participation to political, educational, and economic life. (APA, 2002; Aronowitz & Giroux, 1993; Banks, 2009; Parekh, 2002; Reitz 2009; Sleeter & Grant, 1987; Varma-Joshi, 2004)

According to the findings of this study, most of the participants defined multiculturalism in a similar but limited way. Most of the participants only

mentioned the components of cultural diversity and coexistence of different cultures in a society or a place while defining multiculturalism. Some participants used several words related to cultural diversity and coexistence of different cultures to describe multiculturalism such as mosaic, Istanbul, and puzzle. Only one participant (Deniz) mentioned that multiculturalism is more than the togetherness of different cultures and associated multiculturalism with the concepts of equality, assimilation, oppression, and accessibility of human rights. He also indicated that if he was not working in the field of human rights, he would define it only as coexistence of different cultures. These findings show similarities with the findings of the studies conducted by Celik (2020), Erbas (2019), Olur and Oğuz (2019), Yılmaz(2016) studies in which the participants also defined multiculturalism as coexistence of different cultures. Similarly, the findings of Eskici and Cayak's (2018) study are in line with these findings in the sense that teachers use some metaphors that can have meaning of coexistence of different cultures, which are mosaic and rainbow.

Further, the concept of multiculturalism reminded two participants of intersectionality. One of them explained intersectionality as a person belonging to more than one culture or identity, being witnessed with different cultures or identities or neither having nor being witnessed, just internalized them ideologically. The other one described it as a place in which orientations, identities and ethnicities intersect with each other. Considering definition of multiculturalism by APA (2002), the adult educators mostly mentioned ethnic, language and religious diversities as a cultural dimension whereas a few educators talked about gender, sexual orientation and age while explaining different cultures. None of them mentioned disability, education, and social class but some other educators talked about family structures, ideological perspectives, traditions, habits, and experiences.

#### 5.2.2.2 Multicultural education

In general, multicultural education is seen as a teaching and learning approach that is inclusive and values diversity but not just the cultural diversity of students, but it also appreciates the diversity of educators, educational contents, and methods (Gay, 2004; Tiedt & Tiedt, 1999; Aydın, 2013). Multicultural education is characterized by the idea that students no matter what their race, gender, social class, ethnicity, and cultural difference are, have equal learning and educational opportunities. It is also defined as a movement that has an attempt to reform all educational institutions to ensure equal opportunity for all students coming from diverse cultures, social classes, gender, races, languages (Banks, 2009) These changes are not just limited to the changes in curriculum but reforming educational environment as a whole (Banks, 2009; Banks & Banks, 2010).

In this study, adult educators indicated four themes while describing multicultural education and it is found that these themes are in line with some of the components of multicultural education discussed in the literature, which are cultural pluralism, cultural diversity, changes in instruction and content, equality, inclusiveness and increase in knowledge about multiple cultural perspectives (Banks 2004, 2009, 2014; Gay, 2000, 2018; Gorski, 2011; Grant & Sleeter, 2010; Nieto & Bode, 2008; Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

Most of the adult educators associated multicultural education with cultural diversity and the coexistence of culturally diverse learners. They described a multicultural education environment as an environment in which learners from different cultures exist and they talked about cultural differences among learners in their classes/educational environment. When comparing these findings emphasizing coexistence cultural differences with the findings of the empirical studies in the

literature, these findings align with them. For example, in the study of Aydın and Tonbuloglu (2014) and Yılmaz (2016) emphasized cultural diversity deemed as a necessity of multicultural education. Further, in Başarır et al. (2014) study, teachers described multicultural education as an educational environment in which culturally diverse people coexist. Akınlar and Dogan (2017) associated multicultural education with coexistence of different cultures by using the metaphors of rainbow and mosaic. Similarly, Aslan's (2019) and Akcaoglu and Arsal (2017), Olur and Oğuz's (2019) study revealed that teachers and teacher candidates described multicultural education as an education that is presented to students from culturally different groups.

Considering definition of multiculturalism by APA (2002) and definition of multicultural education by Banks (2009), the adult educators mostly mentioned ethnic, language and religious diversities as a cultural dimension whereas a few educators talked about gender, sexual orientation and age while explaining different cultures. None of them mentioned disability, education level and social class but some other educators talked about family structures, ideological perspectives, traditions, habits, and experiences.

However, when looking at the other findings of this study related to the categories of multicultural education practices and the impact of culture on learning, it was revealed that other cultural dimensions such as disability, educational level, socioeconomic status, family related etc. were mentioned by the adult educators. Also, there was an increase in the number of adult educators who mentioned cultural differences in ethnicity, age, language, and family.

These findings show some similarities with the findings obtained from other related empirical studies. For example, findings of the studies administered by Neuharth-Pritchett et al. (2001) in the US, and Phoon et al. (2012) in Malaysia

revealed that multiculturalism and multicultural education was only associated with diversity in race and ethnicity by pre-school teachers and pre-service early childhood education teachers. Similarly, Logvinove and Ivanova's (2016) study conducted in Russia also showed that multicultural education was discussed within the context of diversity in ethnicity, religion, and language. Additionally, it was revealed in Alazzi's (2016) study in Jordan that multicultural education was only related to different nationalities.

For example, it can be said that findings of this study related to the different cultures in the explanation of multiculturalism and multicultural education are parallel with the findings of the relevant studies conducted in Turkey. The studies conducted by Aslan (2019), Akcaoglu and Arsal (2017), Başarır et al. (2014) and Olur & Oguz (2019) resulted that the participants mentioned diversity in race, ethnicity, religion, and language while talking about multicultural education.

Also, in the studies conducted by Başarır et al. (2014), Logvinove and Ivanova (2016) and Aslan (2018) were noted that disability, age, and sexual orientation were not pointed out while defining multicultural education. Similarly, Yilmaz's (2016) study findings revealed that the teacher candidates were hesitant to talk about differences in sexual orientation and gender.

The educators also emphasized educational materials considering learners' cultural differences as a requirement of multicultural education. In Erbaş's (2019) study conducted in Turkey they also considered multicultural education as an incorporation of cultural backgrounds of students' to education. Similarly, finding of the studies conducted by and Bigatti et al. (2012), Neuharth-Pritchett et al. (2001) in the US and conducted by Çelik (2020) in Iraq also found to be aligning with these

findings in the sense that participants explained multicultural education as adding diverse cultures into curriculum and material.

Multicultural education was also seen as inclusive education and as an education approach that all learners, coming from culturally diverse groups, feel equal and included rather than marginalized, ignored, discriminated against, and threatened. It is discussed that multicultural education occurs if all learners regardless of religion, language, age, social class, and ethnicity should be treated equally by the adult educators while explaining multicultural education. In Aydın and Tonbuloglu (2014), Erbaş (2019) and Akınlar and Dogan's (2017) study, study participants also emphasized equality in education while describing multicultural education. Similarly, the findings of the studies conducted by Başarır et al. (2014) and Olur and Oguz's (2019) are in line with these findings in the sense that they pointed out inclusiveness of different cultures and perspectives. Additionally, findings of the study conducted by Celik (2020) in Iraq, the teacher candidates described multicultural education as universal education and "providing equal educational opportunity".

Further, multicultural education was perceived as an education through which educators and learners learn about different cultural groups. It is discussed that this cultural learning can occur through the interaction among learners, learning language or a unit-subject that focuses on a particular cultural group. In Başarır et al. (2014), Olur and Oguz's (2019) and Yılmaz's (2016) studies conducted in Turkey and studies conducted by Phoon et al. (2012) in Malaysia and by Neuharth-Pritchett et al. (2001) in the US teacher candidates associated multicultural education with having knowledge and learning about different cultures.

However, the concepts of human rights, justice and democracy that are crucial elements of multicultural education (Grant & Ladson-Billings, 1997) were not mentioned by educators while conceptualizing multicultural education. In contrast to the findings of this study, these concepts were stated by teachers in the studies conducted by Başarır et al. (2014) and Aydın and Tonbuloglu (2014). In contrast to these findings, Yılmaz's (2016) study revealed that teacher candidates attached a meaning toward multicultural education as a reconstruction of the education system. Also, as it was revealed in Olur and Oguz's (2019) study, the educators in this study did not explain multicultural education from a transformative and reformist approach.

In the literature, it is found that there are various perceptions, explanations, and scope of multicultural education. Sleeter and Grant (1987) created a typology comprehending all these approaches to the explanations of multicultural education, which was mentioned before in a detailed way in the literature review section. Findings obtained from the adult educators in this study will also be discussed within this typology. The first approach in this typology, "teaching the exceptional and culturally different," which sees cultural differences as the richness of a society and aims to help culturally different people to adapt to the mainstream culture in the society. The second is the "human relations approach" which emphasizes intercultural communication among students and characterized by modifying educational content and teaching methods so that all students are able to achieve. The third one, "single group studies" deeply focuses on particular cultural groups such as African American studies, disability studies and women studies aiming to increase students' knowledge about history of a particular group and gaining awareness and respect toward the group. The other approach, "multicultural education" underlines

the social justice and equal educational opportunities, and it aims to eliminate discrimination and prejudices toward cultural groups that are oppressed. It also aims for changes in curriculum but also in the educational environment. The fifth and last approach “multicultural social justice education underlines structural inequalities and power relations based on race, class, gender and disability and reconstruction of the society for the equity (Sleeter & Grant, 1987).

The ways most of the adult educators’ approached toward multicultural education shows basic similarities with some features of the three approaches, which are teaching the culturally different, human relations and multicultural education in terms of valuing diversity and diversity in content used, learners and educators. According to the findings of this study, multicultural education was deemed as coexistence of learners from different cultures. The educators further discussed that multicultural education helps educators and learners to get to know and increase awareness of different cultural groups. They also emphasized changes in the educational contents, materials and activities used in training while describing multicultural education. It was found that the educators discussed these changes not as the structural changes but simply the changes made based on adding and integrating learners’ cultures into their trainings within the existing structure of their trainings. Adult educators associated multicultural education with the training content considering learners’ cultural differences. They emphasized that educational materials and activities should be formed in accordance with the learners’ cultural differences and their cultures should be integrated into the educational materials, content, and activities. The educators also mentioned the importance of providing diverse examples including different cultures instead of talking only about one culture. Only one educators’ approach toward multicultural education was similar to

the single group studies approach. The educator mentioned that he adds a unit related to some cultural and historical characteristics of a country as into the training

Only one adult educator approached multicultural education from the perspective of multicultural social justice education. The educator mentioned the necessity of structural changes in the education system that does not see one culture superior to another and pays attention to power relations while describing multicultural education.

Mostly, the educators associated multicultural education with culturally different learners, equal treatments, inclusive education, learning about different cultures and integration of different cultures into training. However, the transformation of the education system and society as a critical goal of multicultural education and the issues of inequity and power relations were not elaborated by the adult educators (except one educator) in general.

#### 5.2.2.3 Advantages and disadvantages of multicultural education

Ameny-Dixon (2004) listed some advantages of multicultural education identified by some multicultural educators . One of the benefits that multicultural education provides is that it enables students to have interactions among diverse cultures through which learning and getting to know diverse cultures occur (Parrish & Linder-VonBrschot, 2010, as cited in Erbaş, 2018) and which also reduces prejudices and stereotypes toward diverse cultural groups. It can create an opportunity that enables different cultures living together harmoniously, which can also increase tolerance among diverse groups (Peters-Davis & Shultz 2006; Sleeter 2002; Gorski 2004; Lee, et al. 2002, as cited in Aydın, 2013). Further, multicultural education also provides enrichment and peace in a society thanks to the coexistence of culturally

different people (Aydın & Tonbuloğlu, 2014). Similarly, the National Association of Multicultural Education (NAME) identifies some advantages of multicultural education. According to NAME, multicultural education improves by looking at it from various perspectives and point of views. It helps learners to think critically about the issues of social justice. It also challenges prejudices and stereotypes (Aydın, 2013).

When considering the importance of multicultural education identified in the literature, it can be said that the findings of this study related to the advantages of multicultural education are in line with the literature to some extent. Adult educators mentioned getting to know different cultures, enrichment, improving empathy and tolerance, easier learning as the advantages of multicultural education. All of the educators found adult educators as very important, and all the educators emphasized the importance of encountering diverse cultures. They claimed that multicultural education enables learners and educators to get to know each other's cultural differences and to interact with each other through which personal development, development of point of views and acceptance toward cultural differences can increase and prejudices and taboos toward these differences can be annihilated.

These findings are in line with the findings of the studies conducted by Phoon et al. (2012) in Malaysia, by Alazzi (2016) in Jordan and by Başarır et al. (2014) and Damgacı and Aydın (2014) in Turkey in the sense that learning about different cultures were considered as a beneficial side of multicultural education. Also, with regard to prejudice reduction, the study conducted by Bigatti et al. (2012) showed that multicultural education provides an opportunity to talk about prejudices.

A few of the adult educators indicated that the interaction among diverse cultures improves empathy, tolerance among people and peace in society. These

findings align with the findings of the studies administered by Başarır et al. (2014), Celik (2020), Erbas (2018), Neuharth-Pritchett et al. (2001), Ozen (2015) and Yilmaz (2016) regarding that multicultural education contributes to the development of empathy and tolerance.

Moreover, some adult educators also mentioned how multicultural education contributes to the enrichment of people and their perspectives. These findings are parallel with the findings reported in the studies conducted by Bigatti et al. (2012), Phoon et al. (2012) and Başarır et al. (2014).

Furthermore, a few other adult educators pointed out that multicultural education makes learning easier and faster which is in line with the studies conducted by Başarır et al. (2014) in Turkey and Bigatti et al. (2012) in the US, that revealed that multicultural education contributes to learning and increases motivation and success.

#### 5.2.2.4 Educators' roles

When considering the approaches toward multicultural education, it is seen that educators have an important role in creating a multicultural learning environment. In the literature, there is a strong emphasis on what educators' roles should be to ensure multicultural education (Brown et al., 2000; Ladson-Billing, 1995; Marchesani & Adams, 1992). Adult educators should be familiar with the multicultural education practices so that they are able to fulfill the needs that culturally diverse adult learners have (Kumi-Yeboah & James, 2011). Guy (1991) states that adult educators should be aware of their own cultural identity and be well informed about their learners' cultures. It is also maintained that the educators need to design a curriculum and use educational materials which are sensitive and relevant to learners' cultures (Alfred,

2009, as cited in Rhodes, 2018). Beside getting to know learners belonging to different cultural groups and designing multicultural curriculum and material, adult educators should also be aware of the issues of knowledge production, power relations and inequities based on race, social class, gender, ethnicity (Cunningham, 1988, as cited in Tisdell, 1995).

Marchesani and Adams (1992) developed a model consisting of 4 elements that can guide educators to create a learning environment from a multicultural perspective. The elements are (1) the instructor's cultural identity, (2) the learners' cultural identity, (3) the curriculum, and (4) instructional methods and processes. These elements put an emphasis on adult educators' roles in creating a culturally relevant learning environment. It can be said that this multicultural teaching model can provide a general frame that distinguishes adult educators' role in implementing multicultural education practices. Therefore, the findings within the category of educators' roles will be discussed based on this model. The first element underlines the cultural identity of educators, which suggests that adult educators should be aware of their own cultures and should critically look into how their cultures, values, beliefs, thoughts, and attitudes approach other cultures. The second one is identified by the importance of learners' cultures, and it points out that adult educators should be knowledgeable of their learners' cultures, and they should know what meanings learners attach to learning in regard to their cultures in order to respond to the learners' needs. The third one is about creating an inclusive curriculum. It advises adult educators to pay attention if their curriculum and educational materials discriminate, include prejudices and stereotypes, and comprehend learners' experiences or not. Adult educators should use culturally responsive content and materials that adult learners can relate themselves with (Sheared, 1994). The last

element is referring to adult educators' method and instruction styles. It addresses that adult educators should be cognizant of power sharing in the learning environment between learners and educators. The educators should include all learners and create a space in which everyone is encouraged to participate in the learning environment.

As for findings of the study, the element of getting to know learners' cultures was seen as an important role of an adult educator by most of the adult educators. The educators emphasized that they need to be open and willing to learn and know their learners' cultures very well. Some educators believe that with the learning of their learners' cultures, they are able to learn the learners' needs, which can assist them to design their training in accordance with the relevance of the learners' cultures and their needs. For the inclusive curriculum element, even though they did not mention creating an inclusive curriculum in detailed way while describing the role of adult educators, they elaborated and put a remark more on designing and adapting the curriculum, training content and material considering learners' cultures within the category of multicultural education and multicultural education practices. Another role of adult educators that the educators addressed was equal treatment and not discriminating. The educators stated that adult educators should create a learning environment in which all learners regardless of their cultural identities feel equal, included, and not marginalized. Some educators thought that educators should stay neutral toward all cultures and treat them equally. Some adult educators also described adult educators' role as non-hierarchic. They indicated that adult educators should be in an equal position with the learners, and they described an educator as not just teaching but also learning from the learners. However, it was found that the educators did not point out being aware of their own cultural identities in this part but

when they were asked to explain how their own cultures affect their trainings, they talked about their own cultures and elucidated the impact of their cultural backgrounds on their trainings, which will be discussed under the category impact of culture on learning. These findings show some similarities with the findings in the study conducted by Günay and Aslan (2016) in which it was reported by education faculty members that educators should get to know learners' cultures very well and have willingness to improve themselves and learn new things. They should design the education process in accordance with cultural diversity. They also asserted that educators should remain impartial and treat everybody equally. However, in contrast to the findings of the current study, it was revealed in Günay and Aslan's (2016) study that educators should regard human rights and issues related to social inequalities.

To sum up, it can be said that necessity of learning learners' cultures, designing an inclusive training content, promoting equality in a learning environment and nonhierarchical power sharing between learner and educator as the elements of multicultural teaching model developed by Marchesani and Adams (1992) were the shared views of the adult educators for the description of the roles of adult educators

#### 5.2.2.5 Impact of culture on the learning and teaching process

This section is divided into two part. In the first part, the findings related to the impact of learners' culture on learning process will be discussed. In the second part, discussion of the impact of educators' own culture on teaching process will be provided.

#### 5.2.2.5.1 The impact of learners' culture

Multicultural education signifies the impact of race, ethnicity, religion, language, gender, sexual orientation, sexual identity and class on students' learning (Banks, 2014). Multicultural education also deals with the idea that certain groups of students due to their cultural characteristics have more opportunities than other groups of students. For instance, in terms of gender, in the early years of education, girls' and boys' achievement in math and science are equal, later the achievement gap between girls and boys increases and female students lags behind male students (Clewell, 2002; Francis, 2000, as cited in Banks, 2010). Similarly, it was found that girls have more tendency to be silent and show less participation in the discussion held in the classroom than boys. Further, when it comes to the color of students, it was also revealed that the achievement level of the African American or Latin students are similar to the white students' levels in the early education years, however, the color of the students remains behind the white students in the later grades (Steele, 2003, as cited in Banks, 2010). Additionally, social class is another factor that affects learning, which can provide people in middle- and upper-class better learning opportunities whereas not to the people in the low class (Knapp & Woolverton, 2004; Oakes et al., 2004, as cited in Banks, 2010).

When looking at the findings of this study, it was found that the adult educators' responses are in line with the literature regarding the impact of adult learners' cultures on the learning process. The adult educators described the importance of designing a training that is needed to be culturally relatable to the learners' cultures. Further, most of the educators mentioned that learners' previous learning experiences and their educational backgrounds shape the way they approach their current learning. Additionally, some other educators talked about several

cultural factors that play a role in the learners' learning processes, which are ethnicity, gender identity, disability, factors related to family, having a child or not, and marital status. Thus, these findings that are parallel with the literature will be elaborated in the following section.

Educational level: More than half of the adult educators in this study indicated that previous learning experiences and their educational backgrounds influence the way the learners learn. For example, one of the educators gave an example related to learning the English language. She discussed that if the learners had difficulties with learning English in the past, the learners conceive learning language as a difficult thing, which affects their current language learning process. Some other educators pointed out that if learners come from a culture that is closed to learning something new, this affects learners' receiving a new knowledge. Some other educators discussed that educational levels of the adult learners have an impact on their learning. One of the educators exemplified that the absenteeism rates are lower in some regions in which educational levels of the people are higher than other regions.

Being culturally relatable: It was also found that four adult educators in this study reported that it is important to design their training as culturally relatable for their learners. They discussed that if their training is not appealing to the learners' cultures, the learning process of the learners are adversely affected. For example, one of the adult educators who is a clothing teacher talked about the impact of learners' religions in her training. She gave the example of a training module that the learners need to learn how to sew pants. The learners were women and did not want to sew pants because they said that wearing pants for a woman is not permitted by their religious belief. The learners sew the cloth for themselves to wear. Therefore, the

educator asked the learners to sew the pants for their husbands instead of sewing it for themselves and this solution made the learners happy. The educator mentioned that if she forced the learners, the learners would be unhappy and drop out of the training. Another educator shared her experience as a learner and talked about how a training that was not relatable for her decreased her motivation to continue the training. Two other educators elaborated how learners' cultures influence learners in a training by exemplifying a training that they were witnessed with. One of the examples was a training about LGBTI+ toward intern lawyers in the Diyarbakir Bar Association on the day of the death anniversary of Tahir Elçi. Since one of the trainers did not mention Tahir Elçi during the training. The learners criticized the trainer during the break and revealed their expectations about covering this incident rather than the routine content for the training. The adult educator emphasized the importance of considering learners' cultural sensitivities in a training with this example

Lastly, it was also revealed that there are some other factors that influence learning process of the learners. One of the important factors 3 educators mentioned was the family related factors like family structures, financial issues, marital status, having a child or not etc. For example, one adult educator emphasized whether having a child or not is important and gave an example of one of her students. One of her students have to take kids to the school and rush to come to the class, which makes the student fussy to learn something. Also, for example, if the learners' kids were sick at night before the class, the learners' cannot easily pay attention to the class because they worry about their kids. Another factor that three of the adult educators emphasized was gender identity. One of the educators pointed out that a woman needs to put more effort than a man for achievement. Another educator

talked about transgender people and discussed why they cannot comfortably receive education and put an emphasize on the role of adult educator to reduce the biases of people toward transgender people. She continued that the majority of the learner is women and if changing women's points of views means transforming the society's point of view. Furthermore, disability was also seen as a factor for learning by one educator. The educator complained about not being able to design trainings for people living with disability. She shared an experience with one of her student living with physical disability using wheelchair. She talked about how she rearranged the tools used in the trainings for the student with disability. In addition to disability, age, ethnicity, and language were considered as among other factors influencing learners' learning process by some adult educators. For example, one of the educators gave an example from her classes and continued that one of the trainees in her class came from Nigeria and most of the other learners were speaking Arabic and this Nigerian learner felt alone because of the language barrier. As for the factor of age, another educator indicated that people from different age ranges show differences in the comprehension level or learning speed. She maintained that she teaches older people than the younger. When it comes to ethnicity, the other educator mentioned that comments, perspectives, and the way of tackling the issues varies and differentiate from one ethnicity to another, and she gave an example that a Russian, Armenian, and Turk learner' views toward an issue are not the same and they are different from each other.

#### 5.2.2.5.2 The educators' cultures on teaching

Beside the impact of learners' culture, the literature also indicates the importance of considering adult educators' own culture on the adult learning process (Rhodes 2018; H.E. Kaya 2014; Guy 1999). The culturally responsive education model provided by Marchesani and Adams (1992) underlines that the educators should be aware of their own cultures and should go through a critical examination of their own cultures to be able to have a better understanding of their learners' needs and to practice multicultural education effectively (Guy, 1999). It was also maintained that the educators come to the learning environment with their cultures, which influences their instruction and practices. Further, it was noted by Adams (1992), educators following only one cultural perspective can encounter problems with the understanding of students' learning needs.

The findings of this study came out to be aligned with the points covered in the literature. The educators asserted that their cultures affect their teaching processes. They indicated that their previous learning experiences, their families, and environment that they were raised in, ethnicity, geographical regions, language shapes the content and materials used in their training. These findings also show similarities with Brown et al.'s (2000) study which concluded that the African American women adult educators' previous experiences related to race and gender had an influence on their teaching practices. It was found that they adopted a teaching strategies aiming to prevent racial and gender inequalities and discrimination and designed a learning environment that stands against to the system in which they were marginalized at the past.

#### 5.2.2.6 Multicultural education practices

Banks (2009) states that multicultural education is perceived only or in the first place as the content regarding races, ethnicities, or other cultural differences. Banks (2004) offered a model including 5 dimensions for the implementation of multicultural education that describes in which levels and which ways educators perceive and practice multicultural education. This model also provides a guide supporting educators to be able to conceptualize and practice multicultural education. The dimensions are 1) content integration 2) knowledge production 3) equity pedagogy 4) prejudice reduction and 5) empowering school culture. In the dimension of content integration, cultural content is inserted into a subject area by educators. The teachers give various examples from different cultures and use contents related to culture (Banks, 2009). Banks (2004) also developed four level approaches that educators use while integrating multicultural content. This cultural content integration can be implemented in four levels, which are (1) contribution approach, (2) additive approach, (3) transformation approach and (4) social action approach.

The findings of this study shows that the adult educators use some dimensions of Banks' multicultural education model. Therefore, because the findings are aligned with this model, the findings related to adult educators' practices will be discussed according to the dimensions and levels of multicultural education developed by Banks (2004).

Content integration dimension: As it was discussed in the educators' perception of multicultural education, most of the adult educators associated multicultural education with the educational content, material and activities considering and including learners' cultures. As parallel to their perception of multicultural education and the way they define multicultural education shows

similarity with the way they practice multicultural education. According to the findings related to adult educators' multicultural education practices, it was found that all of the adult educators regard learners' cultures and they integrate learners' cultures into their training. Hence, it can be said that the educators utilize the dimension of content integration. As Banks (2004) states, using examples and content consisting of different cultures while talking about a subject area or a topic is the main characteristic of the content integration dimension. Content integration is implemented in four levels: (1) contribution approach, (2) additive approach, (3) transformation approach and (4) social action approach. When they were asked to describe how they integrate learners' cultures into their training, it was found that content integration was mostly implemented in additive and contribution levels by the adult educators (Banks, 2004).

**Additive approach:** It was revealed that eight adult educators use additive approach while infusing learners' cultures into the contents within the existing training structure. Some educators diversify examples comprehending different cultures while talking about a subject and avoid restricting the content related examples into only one single culture. One adult educator adds learners' cultures as having conversations with learners about their cultures at a remaining time after completing the content. Additionally, another adult educator adds a unit in which they discuss the historical background of a theater work in terms of cultural aspect.

**Contribution approach:** The findings also revealed that three adult educators use a contribution approach for the integration of cultural content. As it was mentioned before, the contribution approach is related to adding ethnic dances, heroes, foods, clothes etc. to the curriculum (Banks, 2004). For example, two adult educators add some activities related to ethnic foods like organizing a dinner event or

utilizing lunch breaks in which learners bring foods from their own cultures introducing them to each other. The other adult educator talked about organizing an activity and introducing music from their own cultures there.

Transformation approach: As different from the first two approaches, “It changes the canon, paradigms, and basic assumptions of the curriculum and enables students to view concepts, issues, themes, and problems from different perspectives and points of view.” (Banks, 2014, p.55). It was also found that only 2 adult educators use a transformation approach. One adult educator mentioned that if talking about a concept or a subject, they are discussed critically from multiple perspectives. For example, the educator discusses the concept of a state or law with different cases such as:

The state is the doctor who says you're living with HIV, I won't treat you or the state is the police that stops you for a general information gathering system. (NGO, Yüksel)

The other educator restructures his training in accordance with the profile of the learners. For example, if the learners' ethnic origins are Kurds, if the subject of the training discrimination, the educator chooses to talk about the subject associating it with learners' experiences related to discrimination in education in mother tongue.

Social action approach: This dimension includes all the features of the transformation approach but additionally, it encourages learners to participate actively in the decision-making processes and doing activities and projects related to the subject area that provides them an opportunity “to take personal, social and civic actions” (Banks, 2014, p55). The findings revealed that the same two educators also use a social action approach. they create a space for learners to take an active role and empower their learners. For example, one adult educator talked about using a participatory method to design a training with Roman people. The other educator

gave the example of a training about the Istanbul Convention toward Alevi women. The educator reformed the structure of the content of the training, instead of just talking about what is Istanbul Convention as a subject, the educator talked about the content based on the current issues of Alevi women and encouraged them to hold a discussion about the issues among themselves, which aims to empower the Alevi women.

Knowledge construction dimension: In this dimension, it is aimed to help learners to question how knowledge is produced within the aspect of ethnicity, race, gender, social class issues. This dimension also aims to empower learners to have a role in the knowledge production process. It can also be said that the social action approach in the content integration dimension shows some similarities in terms of the feature of helping learners to take an active role in the process of knowledge production. It was found that all of the adult educators (n=4) work at an NGO practice multicultural education aligning with the knowledge construction dimension. Considering learners as knowledge providers, holding discussions and critical questioning were the examples of practices that the educators exemplified. For example, two adult educators emphasize the role of the learners as knowledge providers and their own roles as a learner. Similarly, another adult educator gave the example of designing a training with Roman people together. Further two adult educators addressed holding a discussion so that the learners and educators interactively learn from each other.

Equity pedagogy dimension: Equity pedagogy is characterized by modifying or adapting the learning materials, activities, and teaching methods in accordance with the cultural features of learners and their learning needs (Banks, 2004). It was found that nine adult educators' practices were in line with equity pedagogy

dimension. The adult educators gave different examples related to modifying their training according to the learners' cultures and their learning needs. For example, one educator who is a clothing trainer working at ISMEK, gave the example of one of her students living with physical disability and talked about how she modified the sewing machine so that the student can also join the class and learn how to sew. Another adult educator who is lawyer and provides training related to LGBTI+ issues considered a profession as a cultural code of a person and talked about the importance of considering learners' profiles while preparing a training in order to achieve the learning goals of the training. Some other educators mentioned that they adapt and revise the learning exercises according to the learners' age range and learning style, whether they like active participation or not, and their learning speed. Another educator shared an experience with a Syrian trainee; while doing photo taking activity, the trainees did not want their photos taken, so the educator canceled this activity. Furthermore, the practices such as doing training bilingual or arranging the training according to the needs of a learner with visual disability were mentioned by one of the educators.

Prejudices reduction dimension: In this dimension behavioral change of learners are intended. It seeks to reduce and eliminate biases and increase democratic attitudes toward diverse cultural groups (Banks, 2004). Even though some adult educators emphasized prejudice reduction as the strength of multicultural education, only one educator pointed out this dimension while describing multicultural education practices. The educator mentioned that after getting to know the learners well, he aims to talk about some taboos and misinformation in their society and making comparisons and giving examples from other societies and holding conversations so that learners' biases can transform.

Empowering school culture dimension: This dimension deals with the relationship among the different bodies of a school like administration, teacher, student, and parents. It emphasizes a collective learning environment in terms of planning and instruction (Banks, 2004). Because this dimension includes the word school which is referring to K-12 education, it may be difficult to align this dimension with findings of this study. However, as it was mentioned in the knowledge construction dimension, there was an emphasis on the learner as an important body of a learning environment. The educators addressed the role of the learners as a knowledge provider and designed their training and activities together with the learners. Additionally, one educator underlined a collective effort while planning and designing training. She talked about organizing meetings with other trainers and holding discussions about the training experiences with the learners coming from diverse cultures and taking decisions for arrangements of training modules and activities.

Beside similarities and differences between the findings of this study and the dimensional model of Banks (2004), these findings align with the findings of relevant empirical studies. For example, findings of the study conducted in Russia by Logvinova and Ivanova (2016) revealed that multicultural education was mostly implemented on an additive level by inserting a topic or a unit to the program. It also concluded that multicultural education was not practiced to reform the curriculum as a whole. Further, multicultural education practices with regard to Banks's (2004) dimensional model were found to be inadequate in Egne's (2016) study.

Considering the findings of the current study regarding adaptation of educational content, method and material, they are in line with some empirical studies conducted in Turkey and outside of Turkey. For example, Bigatti et al. (2012)

in the US and in Olur and Oguz's (2019) study in Turkey, using materials and methods that are diversified, were found to be among multicultural education practices. Also, it was revealed in Başarır et al. (2014) study conducted in Turkey that establishing a culturally sensitive learning environment in which different perspectives are included and feeling of equality is enabled.

Further, doing research and discussion and brainstorming activities were found to be used by teachers as multicultural education practices in Aslan's (2018) study in Turkey. More specifically, within the context of adult education, in Tisdell et al.' (2013) study conducted in the US, it was found that the adult educators emphasized being aware of the importance of the meanings learners attached culturally toward the provided topic and reported that they do questioning activities to gain this awareness. Further, they indicated that they do discussion and hands-on activities that culturally match with learners' cultures. Additionally, they reported that they design a curriculum that is culturally relatable for learners. On the other hand, however, it was found in Alazzi's (2016) study conducted in Jordan that teachers did not use any instructional strategies related to multicultural education.

#### 5.2.2.7 The difficulties educators encounter

In this study, it was revealed that educators encounter three types of difficulties including learner related difficulties, educator related difficulties and educational resource related difficulties.

Most difficulties mentioned by the educators were found to be learner and educator related difficulties whereas the teaching material related difficulties were mentioned the least. Learners' resistance to not learning as a learner-related one was mostly mentioned as difficulty by the educators. Educator's bias toward learners, not

being able to speak learners' native language and having difficulty to keep boundaries with learners came out to be the educator-related difficulties. Lastly, difficulty with finding a teaching material that is suitable for learners was found related to educational resources.

These findings are in line with the empirical studies conducted by Aslan (2018) and Başarır et al. (2014) in Turkey in the sense that the teachers encountered difficulties mostly related to students. These difficulties encountered by the teachers were about students' prejudices and negative attitudes toward cultural differences but since resisting to learn something may include biases, it can also be said that these findings are also in line with the findings of those studies.

Similarly, In the study administered by Bigatti et al. (2012), resistance shown by students was also mostly reported as difficulty by the teachers.

Further, Aslan's (2018) study also revealed that lack of material was mentioned as a problem by the teachers. Also, in Bigatti et al. (2012) Trower (2012). It was found that educators encounter barriers of insufficient institutional support and resource funding.

In sum, this study concludes that educators do not have adequate training and a lack of awareness of multicultural education. Even though adult educators are able to explain and value multicultural education, have positive opinions toward it and consider learners' cultures and integrate their cultures into their trainings, they do not have a comprehensive understanding of multicultural education. The educators' perceptions of multicultural education are restricted to the coexistence of culturally diverse learners in a learning environment and their practices are limited to the incorporation of multicultural content into their trainings in additive and contribution levels. The educators' definitions and implementations of multicultural education are

deficient in transformative and social reconstructionist elements. The educators mostly do not relate multicultural education to the issues of structural inequalities, social injustice, and power relationship among cultural groups. They do not adopt a more comprehensive approach in multicultural education by associating transformation of the educational institutions and society as an essential aim of multicultural education.

The finding of this study indicates that adult educators working at NGOs perceive multicultural education mostly from the perspective of transformative and social action approach whereas the perceptions of educators working in Public Education Centers and İSMEK reflect a mainstream understanding of multicultural education from the perspective of Turkey's education system, which is based on contribution and additive level, and emphasizes on diversity in ethnicity, language, and religion.

The educators' limited understanding of multicultural education is not independent of the education system in Turkey. Even though multicultural education studies were conducted within the context of K-12 and higher education, adult education is also not separate from the education system in Turkey in general. When looking at the multicultural progress made and studies conducted in Turkey, it can be said that they mostly underline the diversity issues based on ethnicity, language, and religion, and multicultural education practices revolve around cultural differences, respect for cultural differences, and equal treatment toward the differences.

However, multicultural education should not be just confined to the coexistence of culturally different groups and not to ethnic, religious, and linguistic diversity. Multicultural education encompasses issues such as how culture influences learning and attempts to create a transformative learning environment in

which prejudices, discriminations and injustices toward culturally diverse learners are excluded and learners from all cultural groups are provided with equal learning opportunities.

### 5.3 Conclusion

Taking the experiences of learners into account is one of the essential principles of adult education. Culture is regarded as a crucial factor that shapes learners' experiences and learning experiences of adult learners are influenced by the learners' cultural backgrounds. Since not just learners' cultures but also educators' cultures have an impact on the learning and teaching process, it is important to take learners and educators' diverse cultures into consideration in creating an effective multiculturally rich learning environment for adults. When considering the principles of adult education and purposes of multicultural education, multicultural education can offer an educational structure that adult educators utilize to create an adult learning environment in which equality and justice in education are ensured and experienced by all adult learners from diverse cultural backgrounds. Thus, investigating how adult educators perceive and practice multicultural education and think about the impact of their own and the participants' culture on the learning environment and what challenges they encounter while practicing multicultural education is crucial. Although considerable steps have been taken in terms of multiculturalism in Turkey, there is still much to be done in order to realize an effective multicultural education for all culturally diverse learners. Therefore, profound changes are required in educational policies as well as teacher and adult education programs and materials in line with the basic human right principles to

eliminate the problems related to cultural diversity and to achieve true democracy and social peace in Turkey.

#### 5.4 Limitations of the study

One of the limitations of this study is small sample size. Sample of the study constitutes 10 adult educators working at nonformal educational institutions. Due to the time and resource constraints, only 10 adult educators could be reached in addition to the 2 participants for the pilot study.

Consequently, another limitation of this study is conducting the interviews online via Zoom platform due to the COVID-19 conditions. Even though the interview technique was utilized to get in-depth understanding of participants' perceptions toward multicultural education, since the interviews were conducted online the participants might have hesitated to respond to the questions comfortably and they may not discuss the questions thoroughly.

#### 5.5 Suggestions for future studies

Even though the meaning of culture and its impacts on learning and teaching are included in the literature, how culture is perceived by the educators as well as the adult educators' views about the impact of learners' cultures and their own cultures on learning and teaching processes is overlooked. Therefore, future studies can do an in-depth analysis of adult educators' perceptions of culture.

It was observed by the researcher during the interviews that there were similarities and differences in perceptions and practices of adult educators on multicultural education among institutions they work. Yet, comparing and contrasting the findings based on the institutions was not aimed in this study due to

the limited sample size. Therefore, a comparative study can be conducted on adult education institutions such as public education centers and NGOs with a larger sample size in order to conduct an in-depth and comprehensive examination of adult educators' perceptions and practices toward multicultural education.

Beside adult educators' perceptions and practices of multicultural education, future studies can investigate how multicultural education is perceived by adult learners and their learning experiences. Also, perceptions of adult learners and adult educators in the same learning environment can be compared.

Lastly, besides interviews, observations can be done with an ethnographic study to obtain a rich and extensive understanding of educators' perception and practices of multicultural education in different adult education contexts.

## APPENDIX A

### THE ETHICS COMMITTEE FOR MASTER'S AND PHD THESES IN SOCIAL SCIENCES AND HUMANITIES APPROVAL

Evrak Tarih ve Sayısı: 01.11.2021-36415

T.C.  
BOĞAZIÇI ÜNİVERSİTESİ  
SOSYAL VE BEŞERİ BİLİMLER YÜKSEK LİSANS VE DOKTORA TEZLERİ ETİK İNCELEME  
KOMİSYONU  
TOPLANTI KARAR TUTANAĞI

Toplantı Sayısı : 22  
Toplantı Tarihi : 13.10.2021  
Toplantı Saati : 14:00  
Toplantı Yeri : Zoom Sanal Toplantı  
Bulunanlar : Prof. Dr. Ebru Kaya, Prof. Dr. Fatma Nevra Seggie, Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Yasemin Sohtorik İlkmen  
Bulunmayanlar :

Ismail Elçiçek  
Eğitim Bilimleri Bölümü

Sayın Araştırmacı,

"Multiculturalism in Adult Education: Perceptions and Practices of Adult Educators" başlıklı projeniz ile ilgili olarak yaptığımız SBB-EAK 2021/66 sayılı başvuru komisyonumuz tarafından 13 Ekim 2021 tarihli toplantıda incelenmiş ve uygun bulunmuştur.

Bu karar tüm üyelerin toplantıya çevrimiçi olarak katılımı ve oybirliği ile alınmıştır. COVID-19 önlemleri kapsamında kurul üyelerinden ıslak imza alınmadığı için bu onay mektubu üye ve raporör olarak Fatma Nevra Seggie tarafından bütün üyeler adına e-imzalanmıştır.

Prof. Dr. Fatma Nevra SEGGIE  
ÜYE

e-imzalıdır  
Prof. Dr. Fatma Nevra SEGGIE  
Raporör

SOBETİK 22 13.10.2021

Bu belge 5070 sayılı Elektronik İmza Kanununun 5. Maddesi gereğince güvenli elektronik imza ile imzalanmıştır.

## APPENDIX B

### PARTICIPANT INFORMED CONSENT

Supporting Research Institution: Boğaziçi University

Name of the Research: Multiculturalism in Adult Education: Perceptions and Practices of Adult Educators

Project Director: Associate Professor Havva Ayşe Caner

E-mail address: xxxxx@boun.edu.tr

Phone: 05XX XXX XXXX

Name of the Researcher: İsmail Elçiçek

Phone: 05XX XXX XXXX

E-mail address: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX@boun.edu.tr

Dear Participant,

Boğaziçi University Educational Sciences graduate student İsmail Elçiçek, within the scope of master's thesis, is conducting a research project titled "Multiculturalism in Adult Education: Perceptions and Practices of Adult Educators" under the supervision of Assoc. Prof. Havva Ayşe Caner. In this study, it is aimed to examine the perceptions of adult educators towards the concepts of multiculturalism and multicultural education, their perceived practices related to multicultural education and the difficulties encountered by adult educators while implementing multicultural education. If you agree to participate in this study, interview questions will be started to be asked. The interview takes approximately 45 minutes. Due to the Covid-19 outbreak, interviews will be held online. Interviews will be recorded with a voice recorder. If you do not want to approve the audio recording, the interviews will be recorded by taking notes. Your personal information will be kept confidential in this

research. The information obtained from you will be kept in an encrypted file on the researcher's personal computer. Your name will not be taken in the interviews, and you will be given a code name instead of your own name and the data will be analyzed with this code name. Access to the data will be open only to the researcher. The data will be analyzed anonymously. This research will be conducted for a scientific purpose and the data will be presented only in a scientific environment (conference, congress, etc.). Your participation in the study is entirely voluntary. If you participate in the study, you will not be paid any fees. You can opt out of participating in the study at any time. In this case, the data we received from you will be destroyed. This study is not expected to pose any risk to you. This study was reviewed and approved by The Ethics Committee for Master and PhD Theses in Social Sciences and Humanities. Before signing this form, please ask if you have any questions about the study. If you have any questions later, you can reach the research team via e-mail. You can also consult your local ethics committees about your rights regarding the study. If you agree to participate in this study, please sign the form. I understood what was explained to me and what was written above. I have / do not want to receive a copy of this form (in this case the researcher keeps this copy). I agree to participate in the study.

Name and Surname: .....

Signature: .....

E-mail\*: .....

Date (day / month / year): ...../...../.....

If you want to know the result of the research, please share your e-mail address with us.

If you do not have the opportunity to sign this form digitally, in response to the e-mail address to which this form sent to you, write as "I understood what was explained to me and what was written above. I have / do not want to receive a copy of this form (in this case the researcher keeps this copy). I agree to participate in the study."

## APPENDIX C

### PARTICIPANT INFORMED CONSENT (TURKISH)

Arařtırmayı destekleyen kurum: Boęaziçi Üniversitesi

Arařtırmanın adı: Yetiřkin Eęitiminde Çokkültürlülük: Yetiřkin Eęitimcilerin

Algıları ve Pratikleri

Proje Yürütücüsü: Doç. Dr. Ayře Caner

E-mail adresi: XXXXX@boun.edu.tr

Telefon: 05XX XXX XXXX

Arařtırmacının adı: İsmail Elçiçek

E-mail adresi: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX@boun.edu.tr

Telefon: 05XX XXX XXXX

Sayın Katılımcı,

Boęaziçi Üniversitesi Eęitim Bilimleri yüksek lisans öęrencisi İsmail Elçiçek, yüksek lisans tezi kapsamında Öęretim Üyesi Doç. Dr. Havva Ayře Caner'in danıřmanlıęında "Yetiřkin Eęitiminde Çokkültürlülük: Yetiřkin Eęitimcilerin Algıları ve Pratikleri" isimli bir arařtırma projesi yürütmektedir. Bu alıřmada yetiřkin eęitimcilerin çokkültürlülük ve çokkültürlü eęitim kavramlarına yönelik algılarını, çokkültürlü eęitimle ilgili algılanan pratiklerini ve çokkültürlü eęitimi uygularken yetiřkin eęitimcilerin karřılařtıkları zorlukları incelemek amaçlanmaktadır. alıřmaya katılmayı kabul ettięiniz takdirde görüřme sorularına başlanacaktır. Görüřme yaklaşık 45 dakika sürmektedir. Covid-19 salgını nedeniyle görüřmeler çevrimiçi bir ortamda yapılacaktır. Görüřmeler ses kayıt cihazı ile kayıt altına alınacaktır. Ses kaydına onay vermek istemezseniz sizinle yapılacak görüřmeler not tutularak kaydedilecektir. Bu arařtırmada kişisel bilgileriniz gizli

tutulacaktır. Sizden alınan bilgiler arařtırmacının kiřisel bilgisayarında řifreli bir dosyada tutulacaktır. Görüřmelerde isminiz alınmayacak ve kendi isimleriniz yerine size kod isim verilecektir ve veriler bu kod ismiyle analiz edilecektir. Verilere eriřim sadece arařtırmacıya aık olacaktır. Veriler toplu halde ve anonim olarak analiz edilecektir. Bu arařtırma bilimsel bir amala yapılacaktır ve veriler yalnızca bilimsel bir ortamda (konferans, kongre vs.) sunulacaktır. alıřmaya katılmanız tamamen gönüllülük esaslıdır. alıřmaya katılmanız durumunda size herhangi bir ücret ödenmeyecektir. İstedięiniz zaman alıřmaya katılmaktan vazgeçebilirsiniz. Bu durumda sizden almıř olduėumuz örnek imha edilecektir. Yapmak istediėimiz arařtırmanın size risk getirmesi beklenmemektedir. Bu alıřma Boėazii Üniversitesi Sosyal ve Beřeri Bilimler Yüksek Lisans ve Doktora Tezleri Etik İnceleme Komisyonu tarafından incelenmiř ve uygun bulunmuřtur. Bu formu imzalamadan önce, alıřmayla ilgili sorularınız varsa lütfen sorun. Daha sonra sorunuz olursa mail yolu ile arařtırma ekibine ulařabilirsiniz. Arařtırmayla ilgili haklarınız konusunda yerel etik kurullarına da danıřabilirsiniz.

Bana anlatılanları ve yukarıda yazılanları anladım. Bu formun bir örneėini aldım / almak istemiyorum (bu durumda arařtırmacı bu kopyayı saklar). alıřmaya katılmayı kabul ediyorum.

Katılımcı Adı-Soyadı: .....

İmzası: .....

E-mail adresi\*: .....

Tarih (gün/ay/yıl): ...../...../.....

Eėer arařtırma sonucunu öėrenmek istiyorsanız lütfen mail adresinizi bizimle paylařınız.

Eğer bu formu dijital bir şekilde imzalama imkânınız yoksa, bu formun size gönderildiği e-mail adresine cevap olarak “Bana anlatılanları ve yukarıda yazılanları anladım. Bu formun bir örneğini aldım / almak istemiyorum (bu durumda araştırmacı bu kopyayı saklar). Çalışmaya katılmayı kabul ediyorum.” şeklinde yazınız.

APPENDIX D  
INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

1. Could you tell us a little about yourself, what do you do? Can we get to know you briefly?
2. Year of birth
3. What is your educational background?
4. Have you received any training on adult education? If so, how long and where did you get it?
5. Since when have you been working as an adult educator?
6. What kind of student profile do you have? Do you have students from various cultural backgrounds? Do you have any information about the cultural identities of your students? If yes, how knowledgeable do you think you are?
7. What comes to mind when you think of multiculturalism?
8. What comes to mind when you think of multicultural education?
9. Have you ever attended a training on multiculturalism before? If you have attended, could you briefly describe this training(s)?
10. In your opinion, what makes a learning environment multicultural or culturally diverse?
11. Do you find multicultural education important?
12. Are advantages or disadvantages of multicultural education? If so, what are they?
13. In your opinion, what should be the role of the adult educator in a multicultural learning environment? How do you see your own role?

14. In your opinion, do the cultural backgrounds of adults, the culture they come from, and the culture they grew up in affect their learning processes? If so, how does affect it. Could you give concrete examples from your trainings?
15. Does your cultural background affect your teaching processes.
16. Do you consider your adult learners 'culture while creating your educational activity and educational material? Do you integrate their culture into your trainings? If you are integrating, what do you do, could you give some examples?
17. Do you make some adaptations and adjustments as you take into account the cultures of your adult learners and as you get to know them better during the education process? If you do, could you please explain with examples?
18. Do you use any strategies or methods to create an inclusive learning environment? If so, what are they?
19. Do you encounter any difficulties in using multicultural education strategies in your education? What kind of difficulties do you encounter, can you give an example?

## APPENDIX E

### INTERVIEW QUESTIONS (TURKISH)

1. Biraz kendinizden bahsedebilir misiniz neler yapıyorsunuz? Sizi kısaca tanıyabilir miyiz?
2. Doğum yılı ve yeri-Kültürel background hakkında bir bilgi
3. Eğitim düzeyiniz nedir?
4. Yetişkin eğitimi konusunda herhangi bir eğitim aldınız mı? Aldıysanız hangi konuda ne kadar süreli ve nereden aldınız?
5. Bir yetişkin eğitimci olarak hangi tarihten bu yana çalışıyorsunuz?
6. Nasıl bir öğrenci profiliniz var? Çeşitli kültürel arka planlardan gelen öğrencileriniz var mı? Öğrencilerinizin kültürel kimlikleri hakkında bir bilginiz var mı? Varsa ne kadar bilgili olduğunuzu düşünüyorsunuz?
7. Çokkültürlülük dendiğinde aklınıza neler geliyor?
8. Çokkültürlü Eğitim denince aklınıza neler geliyor?
9. Daha önce hiç çokkültürlülükle ilgili bir eğitimine katıldınız mı? Katıldıysanız bu eğitim (ler)den kısaca bahsedebilir misiniz?
10. Sizce bir öğrenme ortamını çokkültürlü veya kültürel olarak çeşitli yapan nedir?
11. Çokkültürlü eğitimi önemli buluyor musunuz?
12. Sizce, çokkültürlü eğitimin avantajları veya dezavantajları var mıdır? Varsa nelerdir?
13. Sizce çokkültürlü bir öğrenme ortamında yetişkin eğitmenin rolü ne olmalıdır? Siz kendi rolünüzü nasıl görüyorsunuz?

14. Sizce yetişkinlerin kültürel arka planları, geldikleri kültür yetiştikleri kültür, onların öğrenme süreçlerinde etkili midir? Etkiliyorsa sizce ne şekilde etkiliyor? Bunu eğitimlerinizden somut örnekler verebilir misiniz? Kendinizde, eğitimler sırasında de örnekler vererek açıklayabilir misiniz?
15. Peki sizin kültürel geçmişiniz bunu etkiliyor mu?
16. Siz eğitim faaliyetinizi ve eğitim materyalinizi oluştururken yetişkin öğrenenlerinizin kültürlerini göz önünde bulunduruyor musunuz? Onların kültürlerini eğitimlerinize entegre ediyor musunuz? Entegre ediyorsanız neler yapıyorsunuz, örnek verebilir misiniz?
17. Eğitim süreci içinde yetişkin öğrenenlerinizin kültürlerini göz önüne alarak/onları daha yakından tanıdıkça bazı uyarlamalar ve düzenlemeler yapıyor musunuz? Yapıyorsanız örnekler vererek açıklar mısınız lütfen?
18. Kapsayıcı bir öğrenme ortamı oluşturmak için herhangi bir strateji, yöntem kullanıyor musunuz? Kullanıyorsanız bunlar nelerdir?
19. Eğitimlerinizde çokkültürlü eğitim stratejilerini kullanmada zorluk yaşıyor musunuz? Ne gibi zorluklarla karşılaşıyorsunuz, örnek verebilir misiniz?

## APPENDIX F

### INTERVIEW NARRATIONS IN TURKISH

<sup>1</sup> Çokkültürlülük dendiğinde aslında sanırım ilk aşamada farklı kültürlerden gelen insanlar geliyor. Farklı kültürler genelde dinle ilişkilendirilebiliyor. Müslümanlık, Hristiyanlık Musevilik olabilir. Ama temel anlamda kişilerin dil din ırk cinsiyet çeşitliliği çokkültürlülük anlamını bize verir. Bu çeşitliliğin kendisi çokkültürlülük. (Hacer)

<sup>2</sup> Çokkültürlülüğü şöyle tanımlıyorum bir alanı paylaşan ve farklı kültürel değerleri kodları yaşanmışlıkları olan kişilerin hepsinin birbirinin üstüne basmadan beraberce yaşayabilecekleri ve herhangi bir kişinin herhangi bir kültürel kodundan özelliğinden ya da taşıdığı bir kimlikten dolayı haklarının erişiminin de kısıtlanmadığı bir yer olarak anlıyorum. (Deniz)

<sup>3</sup> Çokkültürlülük sadece a b c z 5 bunların bir arada yaşamasından öte gerçek anlamda yaşayabiliyorlar mı? Yani eşit adil onurlu bir yaşam var mı orada o kültürler için. Ben İnsan Hakları alanında çalıştığım için ama bana ben bu alanda çalışmasaydım farklı kültürlerin bir arada yaşaması der geçerim ama burada şey ekleniyor yaşamak ama yaşamak hepimiz için aynı şey mi. Birilerinin yaşam hakkının ihlal edilmediği, birilerinin sadece yaşadığı ama hiçbir hakka erişemediği, ya da birilerinin mükemmel yaşadığı bir yer bana göre çokkültürlü değil. Bir kültürün diğer kültürü ezmeye veya asimile etmeye çalıştığı bastırdığı bir yer. (Deniz)

<sup>4</sup> Bir toplumun düşündüğümüzde, burada farklı kültürlerin birbirlerine harmanlanarak yaşamış olması o geliyor aklıma... Toplumda hepsi kendine bir yer bulmuş aslında ve o şekilde ilerliyor sistem o şekilde yaşayabiliyorlar beraber bu benim için çokkültürlülük. Hep beraber bir toplumun parçası, yapbozun parçaları gibi aslında. (Melis)

<sup>5</sup> Kültürel çeşitlilik geliyor aklıma, mesela İstanbul çokkültürlü, kültürel yönden çok çeşitli bir şehir. Özellikle de son yıllarda baya bir göç artışı olduğu için baya bir çokkültürlülük yönünden arttığını düşünüyorum. Boyuna göç alıyor. En basitinden benim sınıfıma gelen öğretmenler insanlar şaşırıyor nasıl bu kadar çeşitli uyruktan insanlar var bu kadar mı karışık sınıfın diyorlar. İstanbul çokkültürlülük açısından zengin bir şehir. Gerçekten birçok ırktan insan görebiliyoruz özellikle de bizim bölgede Şişli'de çok fazla yabancı uyruklu insan var. Yabancı uyruklu insanın çok sayıda olması demek çok fazla kültür var demektir diye düşünüyorum. (Selma)

<sup>6</sup> Farklı kültürlerin bir arada olması aslında çokkültürlülük. Yetişkin eğitiminde örnek veriyorum İstanbul'da yaşıyorsunuz, Urfa'da değiliz. Urfa'da sorsaydınız bu soruyu aynı kültürden insanların daha çok yoğunlukta olduğunu söyledim size, Van ya da Tokat Reşadiye gelen öğrencilerin yüzde 80' i aynı benzer kültürlerdendir. Ama İstanbul olunca farklı kültürlerin olduğu farklı mozaği olduğu bir sınıftan bahsediyoruz. O yüzden de yetişkin eğitimi tamamen farklı kültürlerin bir arada olduğu Sultanbeyli için söylersek çok farklı çünkü 20 öğrencinin 20' side farklı şekilde yaş grupları olan aynı yaş grubunda 3-4 öğrenci vardır. 18-60 Yaş

grubu...Hepsi farklı illerden farklı kültürlerden. Çokkültürlülük derken benim algıladığım farklı şehirlerde doğup büyüüp farklı yaşayış tarzları farklı sosyokültürel ekonomilerden gittiği okullardan hepsi o kültürleşme ile ilgili. (Aslı)

<sup>7</sup> Belli sınırlar içinde yaşayan kültürler farklılıkların hepsi. Irk cinsiyet, din dil gibi birçok adet, gelenek görenek bunların birlikteliği tamda çokkültürlülük. İnsanlar kendi toplumumuza baktığımızda gerçekten çokkültürlü bir toplumuz. Geçen sene ben Mardin'e seyahat ettim oradaki o Çokkültürlülüğü bir arada a görebiliyorsunuz ya da bulunduğunuz sınıflarda da aynı şekilde farklı memleketlerden farklı dinlerden, farklı inanışlardan farklı ailelerden gelen grupların belli sınırlar içerisinde bir arada olması durumu aslında. Mesela bir sınıfta sınıfımda farklı ırklara mensup öğrencilerim olabiliyor ya da farklı dinlere görüşlere, inanışlara sahip öğrencilerim olabiliyor. Farklı cinsiyette öğrencilerim olabiliyor. Çünkü cinsiyetin de getirdiği belli kavramsal farklılıklar da olabiliyor bence bu da kültürel farklılıklardan bir tanesi. Çünkü kız çocuğunun okumasıyla erkek çocuğunun desteklenmesi arasında fark olduğunu düşünüyorum gelenekler görenekler yaptıkları yemekler giydikleri kıyafetler, tercih ettikleri renkler, oturma biçimleri konuşmaları ahlakları bunların hepsi belli bir etnik kökenden gelen bir şey ve bunların hepsi aslında kültürel farklılıklardan bir tanesi. (Gönül)

<sup>8</sup> Çokkültürlü deyince kelimenin ilk insanda yankılandığı şey böyle bir sür bir sürü iyi şey çünkü kültür iyi çok iyi bir araya gelmiş her zaman öyle yankılamıyor da bazen çünkü mesela ben o kimliklerin bir aradalığına dahil benim bir tereddüttüm varsa bazen bir çatışma yaşanabiliyor orada şey yapamıyoruz o dili tutturamayabiliyoruz zorlanabiliyoruz. (Yüksel)

<sup>9</sup> Kesişimsel bir şeyler geliyor. Bir kişinin birden fazla kültürün ve kimliğin bazen doğrudan öznesi bazen taşıyıcısı bazen tanığı olması ve hayattaki duruşunu da politik duruşunu da ona göre şekillendirmesi gibi şeyler geliyor. Daha kesişimsellik geliyor çokkültürlülük deyince aklıma. Kesişimsellik bir kişinin bagajının birden fazla kültür ya da kimlikle yoğurulmuş olması. Bu her zaman birden fazla kimliğin öznesi olması anlamına gelmeyebilir. Bazen o kimliklere çok yakından tanıklık etmiş olabilir o kimliklere, nasıl yaşadığını o kimliklerin. Bazen de tanıklık etmesine bile gerek yok, sahiplenmiş olabilir, ideolojik bir arka planda sahiplenmiş olabilir. Bunların hatta bazen birbirleriyle çelişiyor gibi görünüyor olabilir bize bu. (Yüksel)

<sup>10</sup> Hiç tanımlamadım bu kavramı ama ilk çağırışimsal olarak düşündüğümde etnik köken ilk önce aklıma geliyor, kesişimsellik aklıma geliyor, kültür anlayışımıza göre değişir çokkültürlülük dolayısıyla kültür her şeyle ilgili olabilir bana göre. Yani bir toplumun genel bir kültürü olabilir veya bir aile içindeki kültür olabilir, bir takım alışkanlıklar, gelenekler olabilir. Çok geniş bir şey geliyor aklıma kültür düşünürken. Kesişimsellik etnik köken yönelim, kimlik bütün bunların kesiştiği bir yer hepsini bütün arka planları hesaba katarak. (Gökçe)

<sup>11</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim denince çok farklı kültürlerle ait olan öğretmenlerin olduğu bir okul düşünün bir eğitim yeri düşünün, doğal olarak çokkültürlü bir öğretmen profilinin olduğu bir yerde siz onu ders programınızı müfredatınız, materyallerinizi ona göre hazırlamak zorundasınız (Ali).

<sup>12</sup> Eğitimin çok yönlü olmasını düşündürüyor bana. Bence birçok kültüre hitap edebilmektir. Mesela sadece Türk kültürü değil de örneğin, bir dersi kalkıp da bir Rusya kültürüne ayırabiliriz. Rusya yemekleri olsun halk oyunları olsun, gelenek görenekleri olsun, bunu diğer öğrencilere de anlatabiliriz bence bu çokkültürlü eğitim olmuş olur. Tek yönlü olmamış olur. Çokkültürlü eğitim demek tüm uyruklardan öğrencileri derse aktif katarak onlara konuşturarak verilen eğitim. (Selma)

<sup>13</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim din dil yaş sosyal sınıf, etnik yapı gözetmeden eşit her zümreye her alt yapıdan gelen zümreye eşit şekilde yaklaşmak sanırım çokkültürlü eğitime girebilir. Yani herkesin eşit olduğunu, kendisini diğerlerinden farklı veya ötelenmiş hissetmediği eğitim çokkültürlü eğitimdir. Herkesin orada var olduğunu hissettiğini, yok sayılmadığını orada bir kimlik oluşturduğunu hissettiğinde orada çokkültürlü eğitimden bahsedebiliriz. (Hacer)

<sup>14</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim deyince kapsayıcı eğitim geliyor, dinleyici kitlesinin her yerden her kimlikten her sosyokültürel seviyeden olabileceğini tahayyül edip dilini ve anlattığın şeydeki verdiği örneklere kadar her şeyi biraz daha kapsayıcı kurmak diye geliyor aklıma. (Yüksel)

<sup>15</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim kapsayıcılığı çağrıştırdı bana çokkültürlülük diyoruz çünkü. Farklı kültürleri kapsayabilmek ve onları aslında hesaba katarak bir eğitim planı oluşturmak. Yani aslında farklılığa hitap etmek gibi anlıyorum ben çokkültürlülük deyince. Tek tip bir şeye hitap ederek de bir eğitimi anlatabilirsiniz karşınızdaki kişinin tek tip olduğunu varsayarak anlatabilirsiniz. Buna şey örneği verebilirim bu kültürden ayrı bir şey ama teorik olarak örneklendirirsek, bir eğitim verirken mesela cinsel yönelim ve cinsiyet kimliğinden bahsediyorsam oradaki herkes LGBT olabilir veya olmayabilir şeklinde kapsayarak anlatıyorum. Biz bir grubuz ve dışarıda bir grup var ondan bahsediyoruz diye değil de o grup oraya da dahil bir grup olarak anlatıyorum. Çokkültürlülük bana bunu çağrıştırıyor şu anda. (Gökçe)

<sup>16</sup> Aslında eğitimin dili ortak öğrenmek istediğin şey aynı. Yanındaki arkadaşıyla öğrenmek istediği aynı ama algılayış biçimi çok farklı. Ya da dili farklı ve bunu kavramakta bunu anlamakta zorluk çekebiliyor onun için bence çokkültürlü öğrenmelerde eğitimde tek bir dil olduğunu düşünüyorum. Aslında tek bir dilden de ziyade, mesela temel etek öğreteceğim, ya da etek öğreteceğim, makina kullanmayı öğreteceğim bu evet bu değişmez bir şey ama kişiden kişiye kültürden kültüre bunun farklılık gösterdiğini düşünüyorum yani sizin onun yanına fazla yaklaşmanız ya da onunla olan iletişiminiz bile buradaki öğrenmeleri etkileyebiliyor evet öğrettiğiniz şey tek ama öğrenme biçimleri çok farklı...Mesela siz öğrenciye bir şey öğretmek istiyorsunuz öğretmek istediğiniz şey fermuar dikme diyelim demin söylemişim ya bir fermuarı bazen tek seferde yapabiliyor ya da algı düzeyi de değişebiliyor tek seferde yapabiliyor ya da tek seferde yapamıyor 10 kere deniyor ama siz buna öyle dönütler veriyorsunuz, öğrencinin o kapasitesine göre öğrencinin o bilgiyi öğrenme seviyesine göre bazen defalarca kez aynı şeyi anlatabiliyorsunuz aynı sabır aynı hoşgörülle yapabilirsin başarabilirsin ben sana inanıyorum, bunu yapacağız evet belki bir kerede olmuyor ama bazen elimiz alışmayabiliyor bazen 10 kere olacak ama deneyeceğiz birlikte bun başaracağız onun seviyesine göre onun bulunduğu eğitim kapasitesine göre siz onu ona anlatmaya çalışıyorsunuz.

<sup>17</sup> Irkların sayısının çeşitli olması. Mesela sadece Suriyeli Koreli olması değil de Rusyalısı, Afganistanlısı, Ürdünlüsü hepsinin bir arada karışık olması çok renkli bir sınıf olmasına gerçekten yol açıyor. (Selma)

<sup>18</sup> İşte bir Musevi var bir Hristiyan var, Müslüman var... (Hacer)

<sup>19</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim farklı kültürlerin bir arada olması geliyor. Birçok kültürün bir arada, Amerika'da örnek vereceğim. Amerika birçok farklı ülkeden insanların bir arada toplandığı bir ülkedir en bariz örneği Amerika'dır çokkültürlülüğün onun sınıf versiyonu. Eğitim kurumundaki o versiyon çokkültürlülüğe örnek. Bizim sınıfları Amerika'ya benzetiyorum. Amerikalıdan kasıt oradaki kökeni şeydir İngiliz olabilir, Türk olabilir, Afrikalı olabilir onun gibi. Farklı kültürler, farklı yaşayış tarzları. Bekarlar ve evliler. Evli öğrencilerde kültür olayı ile bekar öğrencilerde kültür olayı farklı. Evlilerde eşlerinden dolayı eşlerinin memleketleri de giriyor devreye. Bir de o kültür devre giriyor bu sefer kültür giriyor devreye. (Aslı)

<sup>20</sup> Bir sınıfı çokkültürlü yapan şey oryaya gelen katılımcılar o katılımcıların çeşitliliği ile alakalı olduğunu düşünüyorum. Yani gelen öğrenci profilinizin ne olduğu çok önemli (Gönül)

<sup>21</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim deyince dinleyici kitlesinin her yerden her kimlikten her sosyokültürel seviyeden olabileceğini tahayyül edip (Yüksel)

<sup>22</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim denince çok farklı kültürlerle ait olan öğretmenlerin olduğu bir okul düşünün bir eğitim yeri düşünün, doğal olarak çokkültürlü bir öğretmen profilinin olduğu bir yerde siz onu ders programınızı müfredatınız, materyallerinizi ona göre hazırlamak zorundasınız. Materyal yetmiyor, çokkültürlü hazırlasanız da yetmiyor, uygulayıcının da çokkültürlü olması gerekiyor çokkültürlü bir yaşam alanı oluşsun. Çokkültürlü eğitim dediğimizde yine bunu Amerika'da, Almanya'da görebiliyoruz, Türkiye'de şu an bu boyuta girmeye başladı mesela şu an okullarımızda Iraklı, Libyalı, Suriyeli öğrenciler sayısı az da olsa görebiliyoruz. Avrupa'da ve Amerika'da göçmenlerin aynı okullarda bulunması bu çokkültürlü bir eğitimidir. Yani hem uygulayıcı tarafı hem eğitim alan tarafı farklı kültürlerle sahip olması gerekiyor. (Ali)

<sup>23</sup> Eğitimin ortamında farklı görüşten insanların farklı kültürel arka planlardan gelen insanların birbirleri ile uyumlanabilmesi konuşma tarzlarında d aynı şekilde birbirlerine hitap şekillerinde de her şekilde aynı ortamda sorunsuz bir şekilde bulunabilmesini sağlamak aslında. (Melis)

<sup>24</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim deyince kapsayıcı eğitim geliyor, dinleyici kitlesinin her yerden her kimlikten her sosyokültürel seviyeden olabileceğini tahayyül edip dilini ve anlattığın şeydeki verdiği örneklere kadar her şeyi biraz daha kapsayıcı kurmak diye geliyor aklıma. (Yüksel)

<sup>25</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim kapsayıcılığı çağrıştırdı bana çokkültürlülük diyoruz çünkü. Farklı kültürleri kapsayabilmek. (Gökçe)

<sup>26</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim din, dil, yaş, sosyal sınıf, etnik yapı gözetmeden eşit her zümreye her alt yapıdan gelen zümreye eşit şekilde yaklaşmak sanırım çokkültürlü eğitime girebilir. Yani herkesin eşit olduğunu, kendisini diğerlerinden farklı veya ötelenmiş hissetmediği eğitim çokkültürlü eğitimdir. Herkesin orada var olduğunu hissettiğini, yok sayılmadığını orada bir kimlik oluşturduğunu hissettiğinde orada çokkültürlü eğitimden bahsedebiliriz (Hacer).

<sup>27</sup> Gerçekten eğitime bütün gruplar erişebiliyor mu dan başlayıp o eğitim ortamına geldiğinde kişilerin kendi kültürlerini tehdit eden riskleri ortadan kaldırmaya odaklanıp bir yandan da her geçen gün yeni gelen kültürel kodu da dahil eden bir yaklaşım ama o kadar zor bir şeyden bahsediyoruz ki özellikle Türkiye konjonktüründe. (Deniz)

<sup>28</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim dediğimizde sizin sahip olduğunuz kültürün içinde eğitim alıyorsanız bir kere çokkültürlü eğitim şu şekilde olabilir, yeni bir dil öğrenirsiniz, yeni bir dil öğrendiğinizde yeni bir kültür öğreniyorsunuz. Her dil bir kültürdür. Siz İngilizce öğreniyorsanız, İngiliz kültürünü öğreniyorsunuz, tanıyorsunuz. Bizde ayıp olan şeyin onlarda olmadığını bizde ayıp olmayan şeyin onlarda ayıp olduğunu yani yeni bir kültür öğreniyorsunuz. (Ali)

<sup>29</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim benim anladığım sadece benim sınıftaki öğrencilerin sınıf arkadaşlarının devletlerinin hakkında bilgiler verebilmektir bence. (Selma)

<sup>30</sup> Bulduğunuz ortamların hepsinde farklı kültürlerden gelmiş insanlarla bir aradayız. Aslında öğrenme yaşam boyu öğrenme sürekli devam eden bir şey sadece sınıf ortamında olan bir şey değil hayatın her alanında öğrenmeye devam ederseniz. Bir Rus'tan öğrenirsiniz belki bir İngiliz'den, İtalyan'dan öğrenirsiniz ama öğrenme yaşam boyu devam eder. Tek bir sınıf kalıp içine almamız gerekiyor (Gönül).

<sup>31</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim bunların tanınması gözlemlenmesi öğrenci tarafından. Herkes tabi kendi branşı için ancak öğrenciye bir kapı açabilir. Ben kendi branşlarım için bunu söyleyebilirim. Lorca'nın bir oyununu oynuyorsa o dönemin İspanya'sı iç savaş onun yarattığı etkiler, konuşma ritmi arasında ilişkiler nasıldır. Oyunun yazıldığı dönemde o ülkenin ekonomik ve siyasal durumu nasıldır. Ya da yazarın vermek istediği mesaj nedir. Tiyatro tarihi üzerinde dururken çokkültürlülüğü eğitim bazında anlatmaya çalışıyoruz. Bunlarda bilgi sahibi oluyor ve araştırma yapıyor öğrenci de. (Poyraz)

<sup>32</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim din dil yaş sosyal sınıf, etnik yapı gözetmeden eşit her zümreye her alt yapıdan gelen zümreye eşit şekilde yaklaşmak sanırım Çokkültürlü eğitime girebilir. (Hacer)

<sup>33</sup> Mesela MEB'e bağlı eğitim sisteminde çokkültürlülük konuşmak bana beyhude geliyor baştan garip bir şey var milli eğitimden bahsediyoruz. Millî olan bir şeyi zaten tanımlamışız onun içerisinde çokkültürlülüğü sadece şöyle tanımlayabiliyoruz "eskiden Ermeniler vardı çok iyi insanlardı" ya da "Ermeniler çok sadık bir toplumdur", "Osmanlıda en çok ayaklanan". Baktığın zaman o kültürel kod grubun adı geçiyor mu ama nasıl ne şekilde ne konumda. Kürtlerin kardeşimiz olması eşit bir şey mi niye büyük abi oluyoruz hala bunların hepsi yaklaşımın bir parçası dolayısıyla

çokkültürlülük hikâyesinde zaten ülke karar alıcıların o çokkültürlülüğü kabul eden ve işleyen bir hale gelmesi lazım. (Deniz)

<sup>34</sup> Birçok ülkenin kültürünü öğrenmekte fayda var diye düşünüyorum. Kişisel zenginlik olabilir. Düşünsenize benim tüm ülkelerin kültürü hakkında bilgim olduğunu düşünün bence insanların kişisel gelişimine büyük bir katkı sağlamış olur. (Selma)

<sup>35</sup> Farklı kültürleri öğrenme her zaman pozitif bir şeyi vardır etkisi vardır. (Ali)

<sup>36</sup> Farklı kültürlerin tanınması hemen hemen her alanda mutlaka bize zenginlik bakış açısı kazandırır. Avantajlı buluyorum. Bir zenginlik kattığına inanıyorum. (Poyraz)

<sup>37</sup> Siz sizden farklı olan sizden farklı inançlara, sosyal altyapıdan gelen etnik yapılara sahip olan kişileri belki sosyal çevrenizde yakalayamazsınız ama bir eğitim öğretim ortamında bunu görebilirsiniz, dolayısıyla farklı kültürleri tanımak bence olanak sağlıyor. Başka kültürleri tanımayı belki de aslında o kültürlerle ilgili yanlış bilgilenmiş olmayı da aslında gideriyor olabilir. Yani kulaktan dolma bilgileri öğrendiğinde öyle olmadığını kişiler görebiliyor ön yargıları da ortadan kaldırabiliyor bence (Hacer)

<sup>38</sup> Yetişkin eğitimi için dersem birincisi farklı sınıftaki herkes birbirinden bir şey öğreniyor ben de öğreniyorum bu size her anlamda bir deneyim katıyor bu sadece mesleki anlamda yani öğrettiğiniz programla alakalı değil. Ne öğretirseniz öğretin ben giyim dikiş öğretmeniyim, bizim programın adları var dış giysi pratik giysi vs. vs. onlardan hangisini veriyorsa fark etmez siz hangi programı veriyorsanız verin ne kadar mozaik örneğini verme sebebim ona mozaığıyla benzettiğim için farklı renk taşların bir arada olduğu için size birincisi aşırı derecede bilgi olarak dönüyor. Her bir birey birbirimize etkileşim yapıyoruz etkileşimde o size diyor ki bizde bu böyledir bizde de böyleydi herkes kendi yeri geliyor gelenek göreneğinden bahsediyor yeri geliyor törelerinden de bahsediyor yeri geliyor farklı aile yapılarından farklı hatta şeyden bir mühendis öğrencim farklı bir şeyden bahsetti bilmiyorduk destekledi bile, o bile farklı kültür aslında. Okullarda çok önemli doktora yapan bir öğrencim vardı biz ondan acayip şeyler öğrendik. Mesela bir öğrencim bir iş yerinde çalışıyor daha önceden çalışmış tekstilde çalışan öğrenciler var biz bunu tekstilde böyle yapıyoruz diyor. A ilk defa görüyorum duyuyorum diyorum. (Aslı)

<sup>39</sup> Başka kültürleri gördüğümde bu besleyici oluyor çünkü zaten günlük hayatta da çok farklı insanlarla kültürlerle tanışıyoruz bu direkt eğitim ortamında hayata da yansıtacak bir şey orada öğrendiğim konuştuğum şey dışarıya çıktığımda işime yarayabilecek bir durum sadece. (Melis)

<sup>40</sup> Bazen öğrenci bulunduğu etnik kökeni, örneğin Suriyeli bir öğrenci şu an mesela Suriyelilere karşı farklı bir bakış açısı var zamanında buradan göç eden Türklere Almanların bakış açıları gibi orada da bakış açılarında farklılık olabiliyor, kabullenmek istemeyebiliyorlar ama tanımaya başlıyorlar yani sadece görünenin ötesini de keşfetmeye başlıyorlar bu bir anlamda dezavantaj ama avantaja da dönebiliyorlar. (Gönül)

<sup>41</sup> Eğer ben ilkokulda ailesinden biri LGBTİ bir kişiyle tanışsam mesela Ayşe'nin iki tane babası varmış duysam üniversiteye gittiğimde o eşcinseller varmış falan demem. Ve bunu sorun edene de niye bunu sorun ediyorsun derim. Biraz şeye de benzetiyorum örneğin İstanbul'da Büyükdalı olan arkadaşlarımın neredeyse hiçbiri etnik köken, dil ayrımcılığı yapmıyor çünkü Ermeniler ve Rumlar ile birlikte yaşamışlar yıllarca. Yani farklı kültürlerle yaşamayla dair ilgili fikirleri var bu okul ortamı için de bence öyle yani okulda elinde kına yakıldığını gördüğün zaman bir çocuğun kültürel bir kod olarak söylüyorum bunu diğer çocuklar artık bunun varlığından haberdar oluyorlar, böyle bir şey olduğundan bunu makyajdan dövme yapmaktan hiçbir farkı olmadığına aydıdığından başka bir kınalı gördüğünde korkup kaçmıyor. Şey yani diyalog tanıma ve anlaşma sürecine giriyor. O yüzden çokkültürlü eğitim tabii ki önemli. (Deniz)

<sup>42</sup> Kişisel zenginlik olabilir. Düşünsenize benim tüm ülkelerin kültürü hakkında bilgim olduğunu düşünün bence insanların kişisel gelişimine büyük bir katkı sağlamış olur. (Selma)

<sup>43</sup> Ciddi bir servet yapıyorsunuz bir şeyleri çokkültürlülük sizin o bilgi servetinizi sağlamanıza yarıyor ve bu bizim özellikle yetişkin eğitiminde ciddi bir hazine ve yıllar geçtikçe ben hazinemi büyütüyorum. (Aslı)

<sup>44</sup> Farklı kültürlerin tanınması hemen hemen her alanda mutlaka bize zenginlik bakış açısı kazandırır. Avantajlı buluyorum. Bir zenginlik kattığına inanıyorum. (Poyraz)

<sup>45</sup> Çokkültürlü sınıflarda gerçekten öğrenmenin çok daha hızlı ve aktif olduğunu görüyorsunuz...Dediğim gibi tek tip sadece belli bir aileye mensup ya da tek inanişaya sahip ya da tek memlekete sahip bir sınıftan ziyade bu tarz daha karma heterojen gruplarda öğrenmenin çok daha hızlı ve aktif olduğunu görüyorsunuz. (Gönül)

<sup>46</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim her zaman sizin için pozitifdir dedim ya merak uyandırır. Merak isteği getirir, istekte öğrenmeyi getirir...Çokkültürlülüğün bizim işimizi daha da kolaylaştırdığını görebiliyoruz. (Ali)

<sup>47</sup> Bazen olumsuzluklar da yaratabiliyor, bazen karşılıklı anlayışsızlıklar yaratabiliyor ama öğrenci bunu da öğrenebiliyor. Bir öğrenci birine neden bu şekilde dikiyorsun öteki ben böyle seviyorum benim yaşam tarzım bunu kabul edebiliyor. O zaman empati duygusunu da geliştirmiş oluyor birçok anlamda kendini geliştirmeye devam ediyor. (Gönül)

<sup>48</sup> Kesinlikle önemli buluyorum çünkü kendi yaşantımdan da örneklenirerek bu kadar farklı ortamda bulunduğumda öğrencilerim içinde bu kadar farklılık dolu bir ortamda bulunmak bir kere bir empati gücünü artırıyor insanlarda. (Melis)

<sup>49</sup> Eğer kişi kendini çok dünyaya kapatmamışsa dezavantajı yoktur. Önyargıları yoksa sorun değildir ama ön yargılı biriyse sorun teşkil edebilir. Birlikte aynı sınıfta eğitim almak istemeyebilirler. (Selma)

<sup>50</sup> Öğrencinin itirazlarıyla olabilir bu benim kültürümde ayıp bu benim kültürümde günah ya da ben bunu yapmam ben bunu söylemem bizde böyle yapılmaz gibi şeylerle belki. Bir ihtimal mümkün olabilir. (Poyraz)

<sup>51</sup> Bazen garip tepkiler gelebiliyor. Mesela “Ben böyle düşünmüyorum, bence böyle bir şey yok” gibi (Yüksel)

<sup>52</sup> Katılımcılardan biri transtı diye bir STK temsilcisi bu benim dini değerlerime aykırı ben bu ortamda kalamam deyip gitti. (Deniz)

<sup>53</sup> Ne zaman eğer böyle birbirleriyle çok çatışan grupları aynı eğitim ortamına alırsanız dezavantaj ortaya çıkıyor. Örneğin, Suriyelilerle Türkiyeliler yani düne kadar Suriyelilerle bir şey yoktu ters durum yoktu ama 7-8 senedir göçmen olarak Türkiye’de bulunuyorsa sosyal bir negatiflik oluştu örneğin mesela tarihi olarak Yunanistan’la sürekli sorunlarımız var şimdi siz Türkiye’deki bir bireyle Yunanistan’daki bir bireyi aynı ortama getirip eğer konuyu tarih yaparsanız ve coğrafya üzerinden yaparsanız dezavantajları olur ama dil üzerinden olursa başka bir şey olsa yeme içme olabilir özellikle dil üzerinden dezavantajlarını yaşamazsınız. Çokkültürlülüğün aslında avantajları her zaman eğitimde daha fazladır. Ama tabii günlük hayatınızdaki negatifler zaten varken onlar doğal olarak eğitim ortamına yansır. Sokakta bir Yunanistanlıyla Türkiyeli anlaşamaz eğer böyle siyasi konular olursa. Eğitim ortamında da aynısı olur tamamen sosyal günlük hayatımızdaki sorunlar neyse eğitim ortamında yaşanabilecek sorunlar onlardır. (Ali)

<sup>54</sup> Şöyle bazı çatışmalar oluyor bana şey demişti yani onu örnek vereceğim hocam dedi cehenneme gideceğiniz için sizin için çok üzülüyorum dedi. Sizi çok seviyorum sizin için çok dua ediyorum Allah hidayet versin keşke bir de kapalı olsanız dedi. Aynı tarikatta olmadıkları için orada dinsel bazlı birkaç çatışmayla karşılaştım ama tek tük şeyler gördüm. (Aslı)

<sup>55</sup> Dediğim gibi gerçek anlamda hazır olduğunda çat diye bir araya getirip bırakırsan fight kim hayatta kalırsa. Dezavantajı şu gruplar hazır olmayabiliyor. (Deniz)

<sup>56</sup> Bazı gruplarda çok sert direnç olabiliyor benim çocuğumun sınıfında Suriyeli öğrenci var ben çocuğumu alıyorum çocuğunda ötesinde yetişkinlerle ilgi bir şey. (Deniz)

<sup>57</sup> Tabi ki dezavantajları olabiliyor. Bazen öğrenmeye çok kapalı insanlar alabiliyor ya da farklı kişilerle bir arada olmayı denemesine rağmen bunu başaramayabilir o zaman farklı şeyler olabiliyor yani dediğim gibi ufak tefek bazen olabiliyor. (Gönül)

<sup>58</sup> Çokkültürlü öğretmenler getirilirse eğer bulmak ve ortama sokmak biraz daha maddi olabilir. (Ali)

<sup>59</sup> Sonuç odaklı değil, sonuç odaklı değilken bizim sistemimizde çok başarı sonuç odaklıyken burada bir sıkıntı var burada eksen farkı var. Bir diğeri bence ilk etapta daha maliyetli şey olarak bunu artık zaten ortadan kalktığı bir yerde maliyetli olmaz ama örneğin bir eğitim yaparken bile Arapça bir tercüman getirmek çokkültürlülüğü desteklemek için çok pahalı bir şey hatta Arapça tercüman iki katı para istiyor. Yani bunlar da hep kısıtları olan ya da eğitim materyali üretirken de. Birden çok ihtiyaca cevap vereceğin için öğrenme alanının nitelikli olması lazım o da bir maliyet zaman. Bunlar ilk aklıma gelen dezavantajlar. (Deniz)

<sup>60</sup> Önceden öğrenmiş oldukları öğrenme deneyimleri onların yeni bilgilere ne kadar açık olup ne kadar kapalı olduklarını ortaya koyuyor. Bilgiye öğrenmeye açıksa ona daha fazla bilgi verebiliyorsunuz öğrenmeyi öğretebiliyorsunuz ama ezberci kapalı bir öğrenme şeyinden geçmişse eğer, eğitim ortamından geçmişse onları açmakta normal bilgi öğrenme ve kullanmaya dönük şeye sevk etmek daha zordur. Özellikle dini olarak mesela Türkiye’de kuran öğretimi var Kur’an öğretimi tamamen ezberci bir öğretilerdir siz bir ayeti okuyabiliyor telaffuz edebiliyorsanız ezbere de söyleyebiliyorsunuz ama onun ne anlama geldiğini bilmiyorsunuz bu tamamen ezberci bir şeydir. (Ali)

<sup>61</sup> Mesela bahsettiğim İngilizce öğrenmenin zorluğu hep İngilizce hayatına zor bir şekilde öğrenmiş büyüdüğü yerde başka bir dil bilen biri yokmuş bunun zor bir şey olduğuna dair çok ikna olmuş şekilde geliyor. Çevresinde o doğduğu büyüdüğü kültürde farklı bir şey görmediğinde yeni bir şey çıktığında yeni bir şey öğrenmeye geliyor 1 dk. ya ne oluyor çok zorlandığını düşünüyor ama o zamana kadar farklı duyguları farklı fikirleri atıyorum farklı yemekleri denemiş bile olsa en küçük bir farklılığa hayatında yer vermiş bile olsa onu hemen anlıyorsunuz oradaki kanal hemen değişiyor başka örneklerle zenginleştirebiliyorsunuz o öğrenme ortamını zenginleştirebilmek için geldikleri kültürün içindeki farklılıkları da görebilmeleri onu aktarabilmeleri çok önemli onların hepsini getirdiklerinde o zaman çokkültürlülüğün öğrenme ortamında çok güzel bir şey oluyor yansıması oluyor. İşte o önyargısını bir kenara bir şey denemiş ya da denemeyi de geçtim gerçekten açık bir kültür daha doğrusu dışarıya açık bir kültürde büyümüşse daha kabullenici görüyorum insanları tamam bunu bir deneyeyim diyor denemekten korkmuyor kendini ifade etmekten korkmuyor çok iyi ifade edebiliyor bazı insanlar kendilerini. (Melis)

<sup>62</sup> Bence etkili oluyor çünkü sizin sahip olduğunuz eğitim bile olaylara ger dönütlerin yorumları farklılaştırabiliyor...Bizim sahip olduğumuz geleneksel alt yapı da bizim düşüncelerimizi etkiliyor. Bazen düşünebiliyorsunuz bu yorumu nasıl çıkarabilirdi buradan nasıl bu sonuca ulaşabilirdi diyorsunuz o da gedildiği altyapıdan kaynaklanıyor. (Hacer)

<sup>63</sup> Bir ilk okul mezunun öğrenme düzeyiyle ya da bir lise lisans mezunun öğrenme düzeyi çok farklı. Mecidiyeköy bölgesinde de çalıştım daha önce lep demeden leblebiyi anlayan sınıflarım oldu ama Beylikdüzü bölgesiyle kıyasladığımda geldikleri aileleri vesaire düşünecek olursak bazen bir şeyi defalarca kez anlatmama gerekiyor daha çok izin istediklerini gördüm mesela o bölgeye baktığımızda hocam bugün bu sebepten gelemeyeceğim, eşimle bunu yapacağız aileme vakit ayırmam gerekiyor ya da zamanım yok diyor ama Mecidiyeköy bölgesindeki devamsızlık oranları çok daha az. Bir lisans mezunuyla ya da görmüş geçirmişliğiyle başka birinin görmüş geçirmişliği arasında çok fark var. Veya ilkokul mezunu olabiliyor kendini çok geliştiriyor hayatta öyle şeyle yaşıyor ki bir bakıyorsunuz bir lisans mezununun düşünemeyeceği şekilde düşünmeye başlıyor çünkü deneyimleri çok fazla bunun çok etkili olduğunu düşünüyorum o yüzden. (Gönül)

<sup>64</sup> Etkili oluyor tabii, biraz herhangi bir şekilde ayrımcılığa maruz kalan bir kültürden geliyorsa herhangi başka ayrımcılığa maruz bırakmamak ya da bir farklılığı yaşatmak için kendisinin bir gündemi oluyor. O konuya odaklanmak tartışma hikayesinden zaten formel olmayan öğrenme yaklaşımının hikayesi deneyimle teorik bilgiyi harmanlamak ya o deneyimi getiriyor o güvenli alanı bulunca onu getiriyor

ortaya aslında hem kendisini ifade etmesini, kendi kültürel değerlerini yaşatma mücadelesi, hem de diğer kişilerle beraber yaşamaya dair bir gündem ediniyor. (Deniz)

<sup>65</sup> Etkilidir sanıyorum yani nereden ne kadar birikimle bilgiyle deneyimine de göre değişebilen bir şey olduğu için bir eğitimde dinleme tarzında nasıl bir soru sorduğun neye dikkat ettiğin o güne kadar getirdiğin şeylerle alakalı o sebeple etkilidir diye düşünüyorum. (Gökçe)

<sup>66</sup> Mesela, pantolon dikim diye bir modelimiz var programda öğrenci diyor ki ben pantolon giyemem hocam giydirmezler ben öğrenmesem bunu olur mu? Ama öğretmek zorundasınız işte orada şey devreye giriyor geldiği yer. Bizde kadın pantolon giyemez diyor. Yani en bariz örnek bu. Orada tabii şöyle o programı anlatırken ben bir yıl artık şey demiştim çarşafly öğrencilerine olduğu eşlerine diktirmiştim mecburen, hocam bizim tarikatla yasak diyorlar. İnançları, geldikleri ilde etkili, inançları, bağlı buldukları mezhepler, tarikatlar... O zaman diyorum ki şöyle yapalım bu konuyu işlemek zorundayız size göre bunu değiştirelim orada değiştirerek yaptırıyorsunuz örnek parça olarak ya da eşine yaptırıyorsun dediğim gibi devreye orada ama zorlarsanız benim dediğim olacak o öğrencilerin hepsini kaybedersiniz. Öğrenciye saygı duymak zorundasınız, inançlarına. (Aslı)

<sup>67</sup> Yani şöyle etkileyebiliyor bagajları olabiliyor. Mesela bir konu bahsedilen bir konu o kişinin bagajına göre daha fazla dikkat vermesini sağlayabiliyor ya da onu tetikliyor ve sıfırlanıyor. Fark ediyorum bunu mesela koştum gitti o. Bir şey çıktı benim ağzımdan ve gitti o oradan başka bir şey düşünmeye başlıyor birden. Mesela şu olabiliyor ben Diyarbakır barosunda bir eğitim vermişim LGBTI+ lar ile ilgili orada oranın o salonda bulunan insanların önem verdiği o sırada çok canlı ve harlı bir gündem varsa ve sen onu kaçırıyorsan o çok etkileyebiliyor şunu fark etmişim benden bir önceki eğitmen çıktı o da benim gibi batıdan gelen ben de İstanbul'dan gitmişim o da batıdan bir şehirden gelen eğitmedi. O gün Tahir Elçi'nin ölüm yıl dönümüydü, avukatta değildi olabilir hatırlamamış olabilir ama baro odasının her yerinde Tahir Elçi var ve bunu hiç anmadı eğitim bitti anlattığı konunun hiç alakası yok bu mevzuyla Tahir elçiyle hiçbir ilgisi yok eğitim bitti ben oradayım hazırlanıyorum. Kendi aralarında konuşuyorlar stajyer avukatlara yönelik bir eğitimdi, bir kişi bile eğitim hakkında konuşmuyorlar herkes sadece şunu konuşuyor nasıl söylemedi Tahir Elçiyi nasıl söylemedi karşısında duruyor fotoğraf bunlar böyle işte batıdan geliyor bize anca bir şey öğretiyorlar falan o şeyleri kaçırmamak yani katılımcıların bazı hassasiyetlerini kaçırmamak, duymak, görmek onu ufakta olsa duyuyorum buradayım farkındayım ne döndüğünü demek çok fark ediliyor diye düşünüyorum. Bir dediğim gibi bazen konuyla kendi hikayesini bağdaştırıyorsa anlattığım şey onun hayatında ya da onun yakınında hiçbir yerde anlattığı şeyin bir resmi yoksa o onun için hiçbir şey ifade etmeyebiliyor. (Yüksel)

<sup>68</sup> Mesela aşk ilişkilerinden bahsediyoruz romantik bir şeylerden bahsediyoruz diyelim ama a-romantik olanı anlatmıyoruz ve a-romantik birisi varsa orada onun şeyini almadık yani ve oradan bir yorum gelebilir, yorum gelip gelmemesi önemli değil de aşk ilişkisi için anlatırken tek tip bir şey anlatıyoruz normu anlatıyoruz aslında gibi oluyor. A-romantik kişinin öğrenme sürecinde benim aşk ilişkiyi aşk ilişkisi olarak saymıyorlar bana ne bilgi verebilirler ki o zaman. Hitap etmemiş

oluyoruz hiçbir şekilde. Bununla ilgili motivasyonu kırılabilir, dışlanmış hissedebilir, bilmiyorum yani. Öfkelenebilir yani. (Gökçe)

<sup>69</sup> Ben şimdi eğitmen değil de öğrenci konumundan söyleyeceğim bunu bir yerde cinsellikle ilgili eğitim almıştım cinsel işlev bozuklukları vesaire anlatılıyor sürekli kadın erkek, erkek anlatılıyor beni çok rahatsız etmişti çünkü o eğitimden ben bir şey almak, bu bakış açısından birinden bir şey dinlerken ne kadar uygun anlatabilir diye sorgulamaya başladım ve benim oranın eğitimine devam etme motivasyonum azaldı. (Gökçe)

<sup>70</sup> Örneğin, programı çift dilli yapıp sonra izlettiğin videoları Türkçe izlettiriyorsan geç. 5 dakika da onun altyazısına ayır. Bir eğitimde video izlettiler bir tane Suriye’de çekilen bir video var ama Türkçe yani şunu düşünebilirsin eğer Suriye’de çekildiyse bunu Arapçası da vardır Kürtçe altyazısı da vardır ve varmış. Aynı videoda ses seçeneklerinden varmış mesela bunu yapmamış. Kürtçe bilmeyen bir gruba Türkçe izletmişler. Ay siz anlamamış olabilirsiniz özet geçelim. Öyle şey mi olur. Siz anlamasanız da olur hissettirecek insanlara. İnsanlara istediğiniz kadar verelim dahil edelim istemediğimiz kadar dahil etmeyelim yine çok güç odaklı bir şey güç sahibi olanın karar verdiği bir şey. (Deniz)

<sup>71</sup> Mesela şöyle söyleyeyim, öğrenci akşam çocuğu hastadır, hastalanmıştır kafası çocuğundadır ama o gün anlattığım hiçbir şeyi algılayamaz, aile ortamı, yetiştiği ortam, geldiği yer, ekonomik sıkıntılar, zorluklar, yani bunların hepsi yansıyor, sizin maddi bir kayınız yoksa kafanızı derse vermenizi daha iyi ama bu akşamda ya işte evde ne yapacağım eşimin daha maaş almasına şu kadar gün var kaygısıyla gelip ders dinleyen bir öğrenciyle karşılaştığınız için bunların hepsi çokkültürlülüğe denk geldiği için hepsinin de algıları bu yüzden farklı oluyor. Yani o öğrencinizin kafası başka bir yerde sizde değil, sizi duymuyor. Şey de diyor zaten hocam kusura bakmayın ama ben bugün hiçbir şey anlamıyorum kafamı size veremiyorum toparlayamıyorum ciddi sıkıntılar yaşıyorum o çokkültürlülüğün verdiği aile ortamı, işte ekonomik durum, evli olup ya da bekar olması, çocuğunun olup olmaması, siz devlet okulunda örgün öğretimde bunlarla karşılaşmazsınız çocuk ekonomiyi düşünmez çocuk bekar, tek derdi o esnada odur o dersi öğrenmek dışında bir sıkıntısı yoktur. (Aslı)

<sup>72</sup> Kesinlikle, şöyle söyleyeyim sabah okula bırakması gerekiyor çocuklarını, geldiğinde çok telaşlı oluyor hadi yerleşeyim başlayayım geç kalmayayım o yüzden yaptığı işlerde bazen heyecandan hızdan aksaklıklar olabiliyor. Ya da evde akşam bir sorun eşiyse bir sorun yaşamış oluyor kızı çocuğu hasta oluyor tedirginliği oluyor o gün yüzüne yaptığı işlere yansıyor yani öğrenmelerini inanılmaz derecede etkiliyor. Çünkü onların hepsinin kendisinin sorumlu aileleri değerleri var ve siz bunların içerisinde kendinize bir yer pay bulmaya çalışıyorsunuz o yüzden gerçekten çok önemli o gün katılıncının ne yaşadığı ne hissettiği ne düşündüğü bir gün önce çok enerjik çok mutlu olan bir öğrenci bir gün sonra çok mutsuz olabiliyor ve bu işe yansıyor. Bir öğrencimin eşi mesela kendisi getirip götürüyor eşini, kendi getirip götürüyor bunun nedenini sorduğumda öğrenciyi kendi anlatmak istedi, hocam erkek olduğu için çok fazla güvenmiyor, Elazığlıydı eşi, çok fazla dışarı güvenmediğini söylüyor o sebeple başıma bir şey gelmesinden çekiniyor o yüzden bana eşlik ediyor. Bir başkasına baktığımızda kendi arabasıyla gelebiliyor bazı öğrenci sadece 1 gün gelmek istiyor diyor ki benim bir günlük vaktim var eşim 1 gün izin veriyor. (Gönül)

<sup>73</sup> Çok etkilidir kesinlikle çok etkili. Konsantrasyon, algılarının ne düzeyde açık olduğu, bir karakteri ne kadar çabuk sağlıklı doğru çözümleyebildiği, karakter analizi yapabildiği, konu başlıklarına göre ne kadar ona ilgi gösterdikleri, çok etkiliyor. Tabii ki çok farklı oluyor algılaması, konsantrasyon, gösterdiği ilgi her şey farklı oluyor. İlerleme düzeyi de farklılık gösterebiliyor. Aynı noktayı hedefliyoruz ama bir öğrenci 6 ayda geliyor ama diğer öğrenci 2.yılda ancak gelebiliyor. İkincisi çevre, gündelik alışkanlıklar, dinlediği müzik, sevdiği sinema film çeşitleri. Okuma alışkanlığı, sosyal etkinliklere katılma düzeyi gibi bütün bunlar faktör ama ilk önce aileden, çevreden ve sonra eğitimden kaynaklanıyor tamamen sosyolojik faktörler bunlar. (Poyraz)

<sup>74</sup> Kadınsanız toplumumuzda da bu şekilde kadınsanız bir tık bir şeyler için birazcık daha fazla çabalamanız gerekiyor erkek tek seferde terfi alabilirken sizin kendinizi çok daha fazla gösteriyor olmanız gerekiyor. Bu anlamda bunun da tabii ki çok önemli olduğunu düşünüyorum. Şöyle söyleyebilirim mesela bizim öyle bölgelerimiz var ki Esenyurt bölgesinde çalışan öğretmenim var mesela erkek öğrenci kaydolmak istemiş kadınların çoğu o kursu bırakmış mesela bu çok önemli bir detay. Çünkü bir erkekle ayı sınıfta olmak istemiyorlar, prova yapabiliyorlar bazen, aynı ortamda bulunmak istemeyebiliyorlar onun önemli olduğunu düşünüyorum. (Gönül)

<sup>75</sup> Neden trans bireyler rahat eğitim alamıyorlar, neden sınıflarımıza giremiyorlar. Biz eğitimciler için de ciddi bir sıkıntı. Bu sağlayabiliriz bunun için ciddi şekilde de her ortamda anlatıyorum çok fazla bize düşen görevler de var. Belki 10 yıl önce söyleseniz şey derdim trans bireyler için yani gelsinler ders alsınlar ama ona ulaşmamız gerek diye düşünüyorum şu an onların kesinlikle her türlü eğitime sokmamız gerektiğini düşünüyorum çünkü ciddi anlamda kanayan bir yara bir bakış açısı var bakış açısının değişmesi gerektiğini düşünüyorum burada yetişkin eğitimcilerin üzerine çok büyük görev düşüyor. Devlet okullarında çocuklar bunu algılayamaz ama yetişkin eğitiminde kadınlar çok geldiği için biz kadınların bakış açısını değiştirirsek toplumun bakışını değiştiririz burada öğretmenlere çok önemli asıl o zaman çokkültürlülük olacak gerçek anlamda. (Aslı)

<sup>76</sup> Neden biz engelliler için bir program yapamıyoruz, bu gerçekten ciddi bir durum...Yıllar önce benim doğuştan tekerlekli sandalyeli olan bir öğrencim vardı yıllar önce bana dedi ki ben bir şey öğrenebilir miyim dedi evet öğrenebilirsin nasıl olacak ben bulacağım bir yöntemini dedim nasıl bulabilirim bu da bir çokkültürlülük onun bir durumu var ama siz ona göre dersiniz oluşturmanız gerekiyor. Çevresindeki bütün insanlar da arkadaşları dernekleri var, engelli olmak onların tercihleri değil engelli olarak doğmuşlar ya da sonradan olmuşlar, bunu hayatlarını idame ettirmeye çalışıyorlar bir şekilde bir şeyler öğrenmek istiyorlar bir şeyler yapmak istiyorlar ve ben şöyle dirsek kısmını nasıl kullanabilirler bunlarla ilgili yapılmış çalışmalar var mı onları araştırdım birkaç örnek yakaladım maalesef destek alabileceğim kimse yoktu. Dikiş makineleri var düğmeye basıyorsunuz kendi dikiyor, kendim bir çözüm buldum makinanın şeyi var pedalı var o normal ayağın basması gerekiyor ben onu dirseğe uyarladım. (Aslı)

<sup>77</sup> Yani 50 yaşındaki iki kadını karşılaştırdığınızda diyelim ki ikisi de üniversite mezunu biri Ankara'dan diğeri İstanbul'dan veya biri ispanyadan biri Amerika'dan geliyor olsun bunların tabii konulara bakış açıları yorumlar daha kendi kültürlerinden bir iz taşıyacağı için farklılık oluşturuyordur muhtemelen. Atıyorum Türk'ün bir

konuya bakışıyla bir Ermeni'nin, mesela Ruslar 'da gelebiliyor orada çok net görebiliyorsunuz bir Rus'un konuya bakışıyla türkün konuyu ele alması aynı değil. (Hacer)

<sup>78</sup> Mesela ilk etapta benim sınıfımda genellikle Ortadoğu ülkelerinden gelen öğrenciler var birden bir tane Nijeryalı geldi o zorlandı baya çünkü herkes Arapça konuşuyordu kendi arasında baya yalnız hissetti kendini. (Selma)

<sup>79</sup> Şöyle söyleyeyim, farklı yaş grupları, çünkü farklı yaş gruplarda öğrenci olmanız 20 yaşındaki bazen 20 yaşındaki birine öğretemediğini 50 yaşındaki birine saniyesinde öğretiyorum. 20 yaşındakine mi öğretirsin 50 yaşındakine mi ben yaşı büyüklerine daha kolay öğretiyorum gençlere göre. Bazen, yaşı büyük insana algı çok önemli kafasını vermesi, işte odaklanması o konuya o kadar çok etken var ki. (Aslı)

<sup>80</sup> Ben de güney doğu kökenli olduğum için onlarla çok rahat onların beden dili olsun çok rahat anlayabiliyorum birbirlerinin ne demek istediklerini, varsa rahatsızlıkları, çok rahat anlayabiliyorum. Ben Ortadoğu kültürüne yakın olduğumu düşünüyorum kendim de İran göçmeniyim çok yabancı değilim onların kültürlerine. (Selma)

<sup>81</sup> Ben Adıyamanlıyım Kâhta'da büyüdüm. Zaten tiyatrosu sineması olmayan yılda bir tiyatro sinema gelen bir yerde olmak zaten şey hissediyorsun gelişmemiş bir şehirdeyim bu ülke iktidarının politik olarak yatırım yapmadığı bir yerdeyim. İki orada genç olarak yaşamak istediği çocuk olarak yaşamak istediğim şeyler var ama erişemiyorum o zaman erişilebilirlikle ilgili bir şey tartışıyorsun bu da kültürel olarak bir şey ve başka gruplar için erişilebilirliği arttırmaya çalışıyorsun. (Deniz)

<sup>82</sup> Geçmiş öğrenmelerime baktığımda ben öğretirken en ufak detayına kadar anlatamaya çalışıyorum. Bir manken alıyorum yanıma buradan 2 cm girdik neden girdik burada bir bel boşluğu var. Öğretmenin farklı dinamiklerini keşfettim ya da bir fermuar dikimi defalarca kez evde deniyorum en basit şekliyle bunu öğrenciye nasıl aktarabilirim bana bu öğretilmedi hep kendim çabaladım. (Gönül)

<sup>83</sup> Şöyle, ben sanatçı bir aileden geliyorum. Ben ilkokuldayken ben ödevlerimi kulislerde yapardım annem beni yanında taşırdı turnede babamın yanında olurdu onlarda devlet tiyatrolarından emekli sanatçılar olduğu için tabiki etkilendim. Konservatuara girip kazandığımda sınıf arkadaşlarımdan daha birinci sınıfta tanıştıkları kitapları ben lisede okumuştum bitirmiştik. Shakespeare'in bildiğimiz bütün oyunlarını lisedeyken okumuştum. Zaten belki 20-30 defa opera seyretmişim 5-10 defa bale seyretmişim. Cumhurbaşkanlığı senfoni orkestrasına zaten defalarca kez gitmişim. Tabi ki geldiğim ortam tabi ki çok etkiledi. Kültürel ortam arka plan, ve ondan sonra tabi ki deneyimler, tecrübeler çok önemli. Yani birçok arkadaşım var mezun olmuş güzel sanatlar ya da konservatuvar tiyatro bölümünden hiç sahneye adım atmadan profesyonel oyunculuk yapmadan hocalığa başlamış. Ben 16-17 yıllık sahne tecrübem var, Türkiye yurtdışı bir sürü turne, oynadığım yabancı yerli yazarlar, klasikleri modernler, komedileri müzikaller anlatabiliyor muyum? Kültürel ortam ve sonraki yaşanmışlık deneyim tabi ki çok önemli. Verdiğim eğitimi zaten bu etkiliyor öğrencim bana inanıyorsa beni seviyorsa zaten bu yüzden seviyor inanıyor ders anlatmama yansıyor, seçtiğim materyallere, verdiğim örneklere yansıyor. Tabi

ki kültürel kimlik ve sonraki yaşanmışlıklar benim verdiğim eğitim materyalleri çok değiştiriyor. (Poyraz)

<sup>84</sup> Mesela toplantı ve gösteri yürüyüşleri ile ilgili eğitim yapacaksam eğer, bu karma bir gruba olsun baroda avukatlar olsun oraya şunun ihtimali yok yani benim mesela Kürt illerindeki yasakları koymamamın ihtimali yok. Ama şunu da koyuyorum Hrant anmalarını bunu da yapmaya çalışıyorum bu bazen mesela slaytın sonundaysa, önce söylediğim bu olmuyor süreye bakıyorum anlatabildim mi diğerini bir tık daha öne alıyorum çünkü benim için muhtemelen bana daha çok degen ve kalbimi daha çok yaralayan ve herkesin daha çok duymasını hatırlamasını istediğim bir şey. (Yüksel)

<sup>85</sup> Hayır etkilemiyor, etkilememeli zaten, kültürel arka planınız aslında bir yana bırakıyor olmalısınız, kendinizi onlardan münezzeh düşünmelisiniz, eğer o etki altında kalırsanız da yeterince diğer kültürlerle açık olamazsınız bence. Eşit ölçüde eşit uzaklıkta olmalısınız yani benim İç Anadolu'dan geliyor olmama ve konulara bir İç Anadolu'nun zihin yapısıyla yaklaşmamı gerektirmez gerektirmemeli, tamamen farklı görüşlere de açık olmalıyım. (Hacer)

<sup>86</sup> Öncelikle objektif bir şekilde tüm kültürleri tanımaya açık olmalıdır, daha sonra o kültürleri sınıfında da anlatmaya istekli olmalıdır. O kültürü gerekirse gündelik hayata döküp yaşatabiliriz de örneğin bir gün Nijerya kültürünü yaşatabiliriz, türküleri, şarkıları halkoyunları dansları vs. etkinlik şeklinde de yapılabilir. (Selma)

<sup>87</sup> Çok iyi tanımanız gerekiyor analiz gücüne sahip olmanız kapsayıcı birleştirici olmanız gerekiyor. Kendinizi sürekli yenilemeniz akşam eve gittiğinizde bugün sınıfta neler yaptım yarın nasıl öğretebilirim bun nasıl daha iyi anlatabilirim bazen sürekli anlattığınız bir yöntem olabilir ama bazen bir öğrenci onu almakta zorlanıyor bun daha iyi nasıl anlatabilirim inanılmaz bir empati yeteneğine sahip olmanız gerekiyor. Yetişkin eğitimi ve çokkültürlü dediğinizde insanların hayatları o kadar çok değişkenlik gösteriyor ki o evde ne yaşadı nasıl bir aileden geldi neler yaşıyor bilmiyorsanız bazen sertlikleri, önyargıları olabiliyor bunu nasıl kırabileceğini bilmek kendini her anlamda geliştirmek bu anlamda gerçekten çok önemli burada yetişkin eğitimciye böyle bir rol düşüyor en azından kendim için bunu söyleyebilirim. (Gönül)

<sup>88</sup> Ben insan hakları eğitimi veriyorum savunuculuk anlatacağım, onu çok iyi çalışacağım yanında bu savunuculuğu konuşmaya gelen insanların ihtiyaçları neyi düşünmek önemli. Romanlar savunuculuğu niye öğreniyor eğer bunu bilmiyorsan anlattığın şeyin hiçbir önemi yok o kitap bilgisi o yüzden eğitmenin gerçek hayat deneyimlerini ve insanların hayatına nasıl dokunduğuna yönelik bir deneyim yaşatması lazım insanlara. (Deniz)

<sup>89</sup> Herkes farklı diyorsak orada gelen sorularla ya d interaktif olan bir şey de ben de eksiği olan öğrenecek olan kişi olarak orada bulunuyorum o kişi de orada bulunuyor belki onun bildiği şeyi de ben bilmiyorum eğitmen olarak yani bilgi alışverişi olarak görüyorum biraz. (Gökçe)

<sup>90</sup> Bir tarafta beraber öğreniyor olduğunu göstermek onların üzerinde bir otoriteymiş gibi bulunmak değil de ben her şeyi bilirim ve sadece benden öğreneceksiniz gibi değil de hep beraber bir yoldayız paylaşmak göstermek çünkü hepsi farklı backgroundlardan geliyor hemen hemen. (Melis)

<sup>91</sup> Eşit davranmak, yani öğrenci yanındaki arkadaşıyla eşit olduğunu hissetmeli hangi görüşe ırka cinsiyete inanışa sahip olursa olursun geldiği sınıfta öğrenme ortamında aynı hizmeti alabildiğini hissetmeli (Gönül)

<sup>92</sup> Bence rolü herkese eşit fırsat sağlamak olmalı, ayrımcılık yapmamak, toleranslı davranmak, kabulleniş ve hoşgörü olmalı bunu siz yapmalısınız ki diğer öğrenciler de sizden görüp aslında bir rol model oluşturmalısınız diğerleri açısından. Siz o hoşgörü ve tolerans eşit fırsatta yaklaşmalısınız ki öğrencelerinizde evet böyle olmalı diye bir anlam çıkarabilmeli sizin davranışlarınızdan. Muhtemel çatışmaları da önlemelisiniz. Yani bir zümreye daha fazla ağırlık verip diğer zümreyi daha az önemseyerek yapamazsınız ve sizin görüşünüz dini inanışınız ne olursa bunu empoze etmeye çalışmamalısınız aslında nötr olmalısınız. (Hacer)

<sup>93</sup> Yani herkese aynı mesafede aynı yaklaşımda, farklı görmeden, yani pozitif anlamda da söyleyebilirim, ötekileştirmeden sen farklısın sen daha üstünsün sen daha aşağıdasın, gibi bir yaklaşımda bulunmadan farklılığı hissettirmeden belirtmeden aynı bakış açısıyla ölçme değerlendirme kriterlerini de baz alarak bu şekilde yaklaşmasıdır öğrencilere. Ötekileştirmeden hiç kimseyi aynı ölçme değerlendirme yöntemlerini baz alarak aynı şekilde eğitimi vermesidir bence. (Poyraz)

<sup>94</sup> Katılımcılara bir yapmak orada şunu vurgulamak burası farklı kimliklerden deneyimlerden gelen insanların hepsinin eşit olduğu bir yer. Zaten en başta şeyi koymak lazım arkadaşlar hepimiz eşitiz burada hem fikir miyiz bun duyalım en azından u önemli bir adım. (Deniz)

<sup>95</sup> Ortamı herkese uygun hale getirmek öğrenme ortamının herkesin faydalanabileceği hale getirmek eğitmenin rol orada. (Melis)

<sup>96</sup> Materyal hazırlarken ders içeriğini görsel dahi olsa mesela nu bir resim koyamazsınız bir yere bizim kültürümüze tamamen karşınıza gelecek kişilerin inançlarını, kültürlerini, etnik kimliklerini, hepsini dikkate almak zorundasınız. (Ali)

<sup>97</sup> Materyalleri oluştururken de aslında mümkün olduğunca tek bir kültüre yönelik olmasından kaçınıyorum aslında. Eğer kültürlere yönelik alıştırmalar cümleler kuracaksam atıyorum bir cümlede camiye yer veriyorsam diğer cümlede kiliseye yer veriyorum ki öğretmenin aslında sadece bir görüşe bu görüşe yakın olduğu görüşünü vermek istemiyorum. Bir okuma parçasında çok fakir birinin yaşantısını, diğer bir şeyde okuma parçasında işte biraz daha gelir düzeyi yüksek birini işleyebiliriz, bunların birbirleriyle etkileşimi olduğu cümleleri işleyebiliriz. (Hacer)

<sup>98</sup> Bir kıyafet giyimden örnek vereceğim, bir etek diktiriyorsunuz modeliniz bariz belli, ama öğrenci diyor ki yine inançtan gireceğim bölgesel olduğu için, ben diyor bu etek modelini giyemem etek giymiyorum ben sadece elbise giyiyorum diyor etek giymem diyor, o yüzden ama işte bu eteği dikmek zorundasın mecbur kalıyor, şey diyemiyorsun zorlama yapamazsınız ama onu esneterek nasıl yapabiliriz, bu yüzden bir öğrencime şöyle yapmıştım yani bu çok spesifik bir örnek ama bu eteği yapalım sonra bluz ünitesine geçtiğimizde bluzunu dik bluz de giymeyecek biliyorum sonra bluzla eteği birleştirip elbise yapalım gibi böyle bir esnetme çünkü çözüm bulmak zorundasın. Öğrenci onu da istemiyor bun da istemiyor ve inat ama bana çözüm bulacaksın diyor ona çözüm bulmak zorundasın. Çok hoşuna gitti bayıldı bu çözüme.

Yoksa kursu bırakacak, belki mesleğe küsecek ve şu anda bununla ilgili bir iş yapıyor. Orada ben yanlış bir davranış gösterseydim onu kaybedecektim. Orada mesela onun getirdiği kültürüyle ilgili esnetme yapmamız gerekiyor. Mesela, pantolon dikim diye bir modelimiz var programda öğrenci diyor ki ben pantolon giyemem hocam giydirmezler ben öğrenmesem bunu olur mu? Ama öğretmek zorundasınız işte orada şey devreye giriyor geldiği yer. Bizde kadın pantolon giyemez diyor. Yani en bariz örnek bu. Orada tabii şöyle o programı anlatırken ben bir yıl artık şey demiştim çarşafli öğrencilerin olduğu eşlerine diktirmiştim mecburen, hocam bizim tarikatla yasak diyorlar. (Aslı)

<sup>99</sup> Yani eğitim materyali hazırlarken bir kere birçok materyal ortaktır tahtadır makinadır ama detaya girdiğinizde kalıptan modelinden vesaire bunlar çok önemli yani siz daha muhafazakâr olan bir öğrenciye kalkıp askılı bir günlük bluz dikiyorsanız ya da tam tersi düşünen bir öğrenciye de kalkıp ferace diktirmiyorsunuz mesela. Hepsinin almak istediği şey de önemli. Mesela daha bol dikmek istiyor daha dar diktiremezsiniz. Ya da daha dar dikmek istiyor daha bol diktiremezsiniz o zaman mutlu olmuyorlar. Öğrencinin ne istediği çok önemli mesela elinize bir kumaş geçiyor hocam ben bundan etek yapacağım siz uzun giyecek birine mini etek yaptırmanız kadar saçma bir şey olamaz. Öğrencinin ne istediği çok önemli bunun da etnik kekenle ilgili olduğunu çok düşünüyorum. (Gönül)

<sup>100</sup> Katılımcıyla ilgili bilgi edindikten sonra gerçekten anlamlı olmasını istiyorsan onun hassasiyetlerini, beklentilerini, kültürel öğelerini dahil etmen gerekiyor. Bazen bunu çok baskın dahil edebiliyorsun örneğin, Kürt katılımcılarla eğitimi ayırıcılık konusunu anadil üzerinden götürebiliyorsunuz belki, çünkü orada daha çok yaşanmışlık ve deneyim var dolayısıyla aslında hem yoğunluğunu belirliyor hem de pratikleri belirtiliyor az önce dediğim gibi çok yakın temas etmemeleri gereken bir grup varsa ona göre davranıyorsun birden çok dil varsa ona göre davranıyorsun, eğitimleri çift dilli yapmak ya da okuma zorluğu görme engelli biri varsa ona göre design etmek ya da örnekler verirken kişilerin geldikleri yerlerden örnekler vermek. (Deniz)

<sup>101</sup> Öğrencim var mesela, İstanbul'da doğmuş büyümüş ama Karadeniz şivesi hala var dilinde aileden çünkü evde sadece ona alışmış ya da doğu şivesi. Böyle öğrencilerim çoksa Shakespeare oynamak mümkün değil. Bir Türk yazarının eserini koymam onları daha gerçek bir şeyde buluşturuyor. Bir Türk yazarını koyabiliyorum, yabancı yazarın oyununu koyabiliyorum, komedi veya dram öğrenci profiline göre ama eğitim değişmiyor. Daha çok zaten öğrencinin yaşı, bakış açısı, boyu kilosu e tabii ki herkeşe Hamlet oynatamam, herkese Juliet oynatamam. Ya da herkese bir gece konu karakteri oynatmam. Öğrencinin fiziksel profili de çok etkili buna. (Poyraz)

<sup>102</sup> Bu sene mesela iki tane Almanya'dan akıtılan öğrencim var bir tanesi üniversite öğrencisi bir tanesi çalışıyor. İngilizce biliyorlar, Almanca biliyorlar, Lazca öğreniyorlar ama Laz değiller. Bir tanesi yine İç Anadolu'dan bir tanesi de Trabzon'dan ve hani Laz arkadaşları varmış sanırım o yüzden merak edip gelmişler. Mesela bu seneki grubum çok küçük onları düşünürken onlarla ders yapacakken hemen şeyi düşünüyorum bir gramer yapısını vereceğim diyelim onların öğrendiği gramerle İngilizce'deki gramerle Almandaki gramerleri birleştiriyorum çünkü bu sefer onların kültürlerine dair bir şey söylesem Trabzon kültüründen bir şeyler

bulmam gerekir onu düşünüyorum. Onlarda tabii şey var Türkçe gramerine hâkim değiller. O yüzden İngilizce gramerinden ortaklaşmaya başlıyorum. (Melis)

<sup>103</sup> Evet biliyorsam evet, mesela bu şeyde yaptım onu. Alevi kadınlarla buluştum dedim ya açtım son 5 yılda alevi kadınlar alevi kültürü içerisinde kadın olmaya dair ne üretmişler yani oranın gündemi ne. Şu denebilir İstanbul Sözleşmesini ver 2 saat 45 dk. soru cevap 1 saat 15 dakika İstanbul Sözleşmesini anlatacağım ama hayır orada bir soru geldiğinde o soruya cevap verirken mesela çok garip bir şekilde o eğitimin en sonu şöyle bir yere bağlandı alevi kadınların ki ben okumuştum bunu bu dönem şeylere ses çıkmaya başlamış mesela pir sultan abdal derneği 64 tane şubesi varmış bu 64 şubenin sadece dört tanesinin başkanı kadın halbuki genel olarak bizim çoğunluğun kafasında da alevi kadınlar şeydir ya güçlü daha direngen böyle bir algı vardı o yazıları falan da okudum ama bu konuda kendini çok eleştirdiklerini alevi kültürünün de mesela dede biz hep dedeyi biliyoruz filmlerden de kendi çevremizdeki Alevilerden de anlatılanlarda ama dedeye eş bir anneanne varmış ama çok uzun bir süredir anneanne yokmuş ortalıkta çünkü en yaşlı kadınlar bile anneanne olmak istemiyorlarmış ben yapamam, dedenin yanında olmaz gibi orada biz mesela İstanbul sözleşmesinden çıkıp kadınların birbirlerini güçlendirmesi üzerine yani benim orada bir tık dinleyici olduğum onların kendi kendine konuştukları ben bunları bilmesem araştırma yapmasam çok yüksek bir ihtimalle şöyle bir refleks gelebilirdi bilmediğim bir konu geliyor ben bunu toparlayayım bildiğim yere çekeyim konuyu ama öncesinde bakmıştım okudum yani. (Deniz)

<sup>104</sup> Yani bir şey söylerseniz evet sizin için doğrudur, herhangi bir şey değildir ama karşınızdaki öğreneneler için yani arada dilini onun kültüründe bu onun için bir hakaret olabilir, ya da onu incitici bir söylem olabiliyor bunları dikkate almak zorundasınız. (Ali)

<sup>105</sup> Ayrımcı olabilecek bir şeyi kullanabiliyorum ama o bana çarpıp dönebiliyor şey olarak ne dedim ben şu an diye bir farkındalıkla bir şey anlatmak olabilir bu yani aslında bu şeyleri yapabileceğimi varsayarak ilerlediğim için belki dilimi sorgulayarak devam ediyorum dil kullanımı derken öyle bir şey. Öğitmenin gündelik dilini nasıl kullandığıyla çok önemli neyi nasıl anlattığı. Şimdi üniversitede bir ders alıyorsun mesela ve sürekli Türklerden bahsediyor Kürtlerden bahsetmiyor örneğin yani ne bileyim yani ilginç bir durum yani. Ben şimdi öğretmen değil de öğrenci konumundan söyleyeceğim bunu bir yerde cinsellikle ilgili eğitim almıştım cinsel işlev bozuklukları vesaire anlatılıyor sürekli kadın erkek anlatılıyor beni çok rahatsız etmişti çünkü o eğitimden ben bir şey almak, bu bakış açısından birinden bir şey dinlerken ne kadar uygun anlatabilir diye sorgulamaya başladım ve benim oranın eğitimine devam etme motivasyonum azaldı demek ki cinselliğe kadın erkek arasından bir şey olarak bakılıyor. (Gökçe)

<sup>106</sup> Yani şöyle bizim amacımız onlara Türk kültürünü tanıtmak Türk dilini öğretmek zaten onların da bizim kursa gelme amacı bu yani Türk dilini ve Türk kültürünü öğrenmek yani açıkçası bizim önceliğimiz Türk dili ve Türk kültürü olduğu için önceliğimiz Türk dili ve Türk kültürü ama sonrasında zaman yettikçe onların kültürü hakkında da ders yapıyoruz sohbet etmeye devam ediyoruz merak ediyoruz sizin ülkenizde bu nasıl bu nasıl bazen haritadan gösteriyor doğduğu köyü kimisi hiç duymadım diyor nerede duydun şuaradan hiç duymadım diyorlar. Bazen sohbet uzayabiliyor ders bile gidebiliyor. Şimdi bizim önceliğimiz modüllerdeki verilmesi

gereken gramer olsun zamanlar olsun onları vermedikten sonra arta kalan zamanlarda birbirimize sohbet ediyoruz bunun da tüm sınıftaki kursiyerlere katkı sağladığını düşünüyorum. (Selma)

<sup>107</sup> Türkiye’den örnekler verdiğimizde mesela tabi dil öğrettiğimiz için mesela Türkiye’deki farklı telaffuzları örneklendiriyoruz. İşte mesela geliyorum, geleyim gibi farklı örneklerle. Şu bölgede bunu söylerler, şu bölgede bunu söylerler. Y ada kültür olarak farklı bölgelerde mesela nesnelere farklı isimler verilebiliyor ya da mesela farklı yemekler vardır, düğün derneklerde, mesela bu farklılıkları konu ediyoruz yani. (Ali)

<sup>108</sup> Materyalleri oluştururken de aslında mümkün olduğunca tek bir kültüre yönelik olmasından kaçınıyorum aslında. Eğer kültürlere yönelik alıştırmalar cümleler kuracaksam atıyorum bir cümlede camiye yer veriyorsam diğer cümlede kiliseye yer veriyorum ki öğretmenin aslında sadece bir görüşe bu görüşe yakın olduğu görüşünü vermek istemiyorum. Bir okuma parçasında çok fakir birinin yaşantısını, diğer bir şeyde okuma parçasında işte biraz daha gelir düzeyi yüksek birini işleyebiliriz, bunların birbirileriyle etkileşimi olduğu cümleleri işleyebiliriz. (Hacer)

<sup>109</sup> Arnavut öğrencileri var Arnavut şalvarı diktiriyorlar düşünlerde öğrenciler o materyalleri getiriyor onun için çok fazla kumaş alıyor ve bir bakıyorsunuz onun kalıbını almak isteyen onu uyarlamak isteyen birçok kişi olabiliyor yani bu anlamda kimi zaman etnik kökenler de ortak bir şekilde öğrenciler arasında payda edildiğini görebiliyorum. Bir etnik kökene ait bir yemek bir kıyafet bir ürün sınıf içerisinde inanılmaz bir etkileşime sahip olabiliyor. Birçok konuda şunu da söyleyeyim alandan alana değişebiliyor mesela nakışta bu çok daha fazla olabilir, çünkü bir Antep, Maraş ya da İngilizlerin kullandığı bir nakış modeli olabilir bunun çok daha sıkı bir şekilde entegre edebilirsiniz ama kıyafetlere baktığımız zaman daha ferace modelleri, daha drapaj modelleri, daha kısa daha uzun birçok şeye bunu entegre edebiliriz aslında ama alanında burada çok önemli bazı alanlarda bu etkileşim çok daha fazla olabiliyor ama bazı alanlarda çok daha kısıtlı olabiliyor ama mümkün olduğunca öğrencilerin etnik kökenlerini sınıf ortamında harmanlayarak kullanmaya çalışıyorum. (Gönül)

<sup>110</sup> Çokkültürlü eğitim bunların tanınması gözlemlenmesi öğrenci tarafından. Herkes tabi kendi branşı için ancak öğrenciye bir kapı açabilir. Ben kendi branşlarım için bunu söyleyebilirim. Lorca'nın bir oyununu oynuyorsa o dönemin İspanya'sı iç savaş onun yarattığı etkiler konuşma ritmi arasında ilişkiler nasıldır. Oyunun yazıldığı dönemde o ülkenin ekonomisi ve siyasal durumu nasıldır. Ya da yazarın vermek istediği mesaj nedir. Tiyatro tarihi üzerinde dururken çokkültürlülüğü eğitim bazında anlatmaya çalışıyoruz. Bunlarda bilgi sahibi oluyor ve araştırma yapıyor öğrencide. (Poyraz)

<sup>111</sup> Yıllar önce mesela şey kullanırdık kadından erkeğe trans zamanla çok şey değişti trans kimlikler vs. şemsiye terimler, kadından erkeğe değil aslında o hep erkekti o kavramın şeyini öğrendikçe kelimeleri değiştirerek eğitimi değiştiriyoruz. Onlardan öğrendikçe bir düzenlemeye gidiyorum. Ek bir şey söyleyebiliyor kişiler ya da orada anlattığım terimi başka bir tarafla daha iyi çalışmış ve biliyor onu getiriyor orada mesela onu katabilirim. Mutlaka katarım. (Gökçe)

<sup>112</sup> İşte bir öğrencim var mesela başka bir diyalekten konuşuyor başka bir diyalekt duymuş ve beni sürekli uyarıyor bizde böyle demiyorlar ben bunu hiç duymamıştım benim ananem hiç böyle konuşmuyordu falan diyor siz de şunu söylüyor olabilirler sizde şu ifadeyi böyle ifade ediyorlar şu deyim sizde şöyle çünkü işte hemen şeyi anlatıyorum mesela Türkiye’de şöyle olaylar olur ya bu olay Lazlarda a genelde şöyle oluyor ve o yüzden biz bunu öyle aktarmışız. İşte babamın anlattığı hikayeler var mesela onları direkt karşılaşıyorum o karşılaştırmayla adapte ediyorum. Ders planını hazırlarken en başta çok şey yapmıyorum şuna gör bunu yapayım buna göre bunu yapayım değil o akışta hemen değiştiriyorum çünkü çok detaylı motomot bir şekilde hazırlamıyorum planı çünkü her an değişebilir, kişi sayısı değişir işte katılımcının profili atıyorum o gün hep gençler katılmışken bir gün 50 yaş üstü katılmıştır onu da dahil etmem gerekir ona göre de çeşitlendireceğim için taslak ve plan çıkarıyorum şunu şunu yapacağız, bunu nasıl yapacağız hemen orada kültürlerine kesinlikle atıfta bulunuyorum bildikleri bir yerden yola çıkmak çok önemli benim için anlayabilmeleri için çok kolay oluyor. (Melis)

<sup>113</sup> Kendi kültürlerini tanıtmaları için kendi gönlü rızasıyla tanıtmasını istiyoruz tanıtmak istiyorsa tanıtıyor ama çekinen kursiyerlerim de oluyor çekinmeyen yok diyemem çekinen kursiyerlerde oluyor onlara da tamam nasıl istersen. Dans yemek gibi entegre etkinlikler oluyor. Mesela geçen bir yemek etkinliği yaptık kursiyerler ve yabancı uyruklu kursiyerlerle birlikte yemek yaptık. Suriye kültürünün ünlü bir salatası var Tabbule diye. Mesela benim öğrencilerim onları yaptı, diğerleri kır pidesi yaptı bu şekilde tüm okula ikram ettik güzel bir etkinlik yaptık. Ya da şiir okuma yaptırabiliyoruz 10 kasımda şiir okutturabiliyoruz tamamen Türk kültürünü öğretmeye çalışıyoruz. (Selma)

<sup>114</sup> Mesela yemek öğle aralarında yemek yapıyorlar herkes kendi yöresinden bir şey getiriyor aa diyor çok güzel o kurutma dolması nerenin, bu memleketten, yaptırabilir miyim oradan kiminle iletişime geçebilirim ya da oradan Özbek pilavı getiriyor Özbekistanlı öğrenci onu kendi içlerinde tarif alıyorlar. (Gönül)

<sup>115</sup> Mesela kendi kültürlerinin tanıtacakları bir eğlence gecesi yapmak, müzik listeleri oluşturmak, birbirlerine hediyelere verebilecekleri hissi arkadaş kurgulamaları yapmak mesela bunu niye yapıyorsun farklı insan şey diyorsun eğer daha çok kültürel öge içersin istiyorsan bence hazırlayacağınız sürprizlerde kendi kültürlerinizden bir şeyler dahil edin diyorsunuz. (Deniz)

<sup>116</sup> Örnekleme çok yapıyorum, çok fazla örnek veriyorum bir şey anlatırken ve çok hikayeleştiriyorum. Yani mesela bir devlet nedir i konuşuyorsak mesela ya da yasa genel olarak anayasa konuşuyoruz mesela devlet nedir anlatacağım üç saniyelik bir şey ya bu söylesem bitecek onu şu şekilde söylüyorum mesela diyorum ki yolda sizi çevirip GBT yapan polistir, hastaneye gittiğinizde sen HIV ile yaşıyorsun seni tedavi etmeyeceğim diyen doktordur devlet. Hrant anmasında şeyi o kaldırımın kenarını çeviren o taşları oraya koyan polistir devlet gibi bu örnekleri böyle çok çeşitli yerlerden bir şeyler söyleyerek vermeye çalışıyorum aslında. Bunu yapmak istiyorum çünkü bu yani bence böyle düşünüyorum da bunu kapsayıcı olmak için yapmıyorum ama bu kapsayıcı oluyor bence yani yaparken kurgularken ki ilk niyetim bu olmuyor ama bunun böyle bir sonuca vardığını gördüğüm için böyle devam ediyorum. (Yüksel)

<sup>117</sup> Gerçekten anlamlı olmasını istiyorsan onun hassasiyetlerini, beklentilerini, kültürel öğelerini dahil etmen gerekiyor. Bazen bunu çok baskın dahil edebiliyorsun örneğin, Kürt katılımcılarlayken, eğitimde ayrımcılık konusunu anadil üzerinden götürebiliyorsunuz belki, çünkü orada daha çok yaşanmışlık ve deneyim var. (Deniz)

<sup>118</sup> Örnek olsun diye söylüyorum, projeleri paylaşırken bir tane mesela bir eğitimin bir oturumunda iyi yazılmış raporları tanıtıyorken romanlara yönelik ayrımcılık raporu aa bizimle ilgili bir rapor varmış aa biz bunu biliyoruz biz de buna katkı sağlamıştık hissiyatı demek önemli hatta zaten katılımcı yöntem dediğimiz şey öyle bir alan açıyorsun ki ya da o eğitim materyalini insanlarla beraber kurguluyorsun ki onlar zaten kültürlerinden birtakım şeyler katıyor oraya. (Deniz)

<sup>119</sup> Son 5 yılda alevi kadınlar alevi kültürü içerisinde kadın olmaya dair ne üretmişler yani oranın gündemi ne. Mesela çok garip bir şekilde o eğitimin en sonu şöyle bir yere bağlandı Alevi kadınların ki ben okumuştum bunu bu dönem şeylere ses çıkmaya başlamış mesela Pir Sultan Abdal Derneği 64 tane şubesi varmış bu 64 şubenin sadece dört tanesinin başkanı kadın halbuki genel olarak bizim çoğunluğun kafasında da alevi kadınlar şeydir ya güçlü daha direngen böyle bir algı vardı o yazıları falan da okudum ama bu konuda kendini çok eleştirdiklerini alevi kültürünün de mesela dede biz hep dedeyi biliyoruz filmlerden de kendi çevremizdeki Alevilerden de anlatılanlarda ama dedeye eş bir anneanne varmış ama çok uzun bir süredir anneanne yokmuş ortalıkta çünkü en yaşlı kadınlar bile anneanne olmak istemiyorlarmış ben yapamam, dedenin yanında olmaz gibi. Orada biz mesela İstanbul sözleşmesinden çıkıp kadınların birbirlerini güçlendirmesi üzerine yani benim orada bir tık dinleyici olduğum onların kendi kendine konuştukları ben bunları bilmesem araştırma yapmasam çok yüksek bir ihtimalle şöyle bir refleks gelebilirdi bilmediğim bir konu geliyor ben bunu toparlayayım bildiğim yere çekeyim konuyu ama öncesinde bakmıştım okudum yani. (Deniz)

<sup>120</sup> Örnek olsun diye söylüyorum, projeleri paylaşırken bir tane mesela bir eğitimin bir oturumunda iyi yazılmış raporları tanıtıyorken romanlara yönelik ayrımcılık raporu “Aa bizimle ilgili bir rapor varmış, aa biz bunu biliyoruz, biz de buna katkı sağlamıştık” hissiyatı demek önemli hatta zaten katılımcı yöntem dediğimiz şey öyle bir alan açıyorsun ki ya da o eğitim materyalini insanlarla beraber kurguluyorsun ki onlar zaten kültürlerinden birtakım şeyler katıyor oraya. (Deniz)

<sup>121</sup> Hiçbir zaman eğitim verirken eğitim verdiğimiz şeyi tamamen biliyor olarak bir yola çıkamayız diye düşünüyorum öğrenerek hazırlamak öğrendiğini paylaşmak, aktarmak onlardan öğrenmek o şekilde bir şey. Mesela orada da sorular sormak önemli olabiliyor yani dışarıda bıraktığımız bir şey var mı eklemek istediğiniz var mı eleştirileriniz var mı diye geri bildirim almak etkili olabilir çünkü dinleyen herkes bir özne ve her şeyi biz sağlayamayabiliriz belki mükemmel bir eğitim sunamayabiliriz ama oradaki konuşma alanını açtığımız zaman tartışmayı açtığımız zaman daha şey olabilir yine alışverişin olduğu bir eğitim olabilir yani her şeyi önceden sağlamamamız gerekmiyor da olabilir diye düşünüyor kendi verdiğimiz eğitimleri anlattığım şeyleri düşünürken. (Gökçe)

<sup>122</sup> Benim için sorgulamam gerekiyor ben bir şeyi öğrenebilmem için onun nedenini kesinlikle bilmem gerekiyor onun nedenini anlatmam gerekiyor, nasıl anlatabilirim insanlara onların yaşadığı ortamda nasıl depreşiyordu bu durum bildiğim bir şeyse onu anlatırım yoksa da sorarım sizde nasıl oluyor. Onlar anlatıyorlar. (Melis)

<sup>123</sup> Yıllar önce benim doğuştan tekerlekli sandalyeli olan bir öğrencim vardı yıllar önce bana dedi ki ben bir şey öğrenebilir miyim dedi evet öğrenebilirsin nasıl olacak ben bulacağım bir yöntemini dedim. Nasıl bulabilirim? Siz ona göre dersinizi oluşturmanız gerekiyor. Çevresindeki bütün insanlar da arkadaşları dernekleri var, engelli olmak onların tercihleri değil engelli olarak doğmuşlar ya da sonradan olmuşlar, bunu hayatlarını idame ettirmeye çalışıyorlar bir şekilde bir şeyler öğrenmek istiyorlar, bir şeyler yapmak istiyorlar ve ben şöyle dirsek kısmını nasıl kullanabilirler, bunlarla ilgili yapılmış çalışmalar var mı onları araştırdım, birkaç örnek yakaladım maalesef destek alabileceğim kimse yoktu. Dikiş makineleri var düğmeye basıyorsunuz kendi dikiyor, kendim bir çözüm buldum makinenin şeyi var pedalı var o normal ayağın basması gerekiyor ben onu dirseğe uyarladım... Hatta mesela normalde çok ödev taraftarı değilim. Sınıfta hereksin dikişin makinası var mı dedim herkes evet var dedi yani sınıfta dikiş makinası olmayan var mı dedim, hayır yok, herkes evinde dikiş makinası kullanıyor mu evet kullanıyoruz o zaman size ödev vermeye karar verdim. Mesela herkesin dikiş makinası olmasaydı sınıfta birkaç öğrenci benim yok deseydi ben vazgeçecektim bu etkinlikten. Sınıfınızdaki maddi durum da çok etken. Malzemeyi alabilen öğrenci sayısı da çok önemli. Ekstra bir şey yaptırmak istiyorum ama sınıftaki bir öğrencimin maddi durumu kötüyse asla, o eklemeyi ona göre yapıyorum zamanla... Mesela Mecidiyeköy’de çalışmışım zenne bir öğrencimiz vardı, mesleği belli erkek bu zennelik yaparak para kazanıyor ve çekinerek geldi. Ben kendi kıyafetlerimi kendim dikmek istiyorum dedi. Gösterilerine davet etti bizi. Bu da çokkültürlülük ona göre ders programımızda, onun asıl gelme nedeni kendi kostümlerini dikmekti, ben mesela kostümle ilgili bir şey yapmamız lazım bir program yapmamız lazım dedim. Ben maske karnavalına gittim Venedik’e, kostümleri araştırdım inceledim, neler yapabiliriz diye kostüm dikimi diye bir program açtım. Ama kostüm dikim programı niye açarsınız, birkaç öğrencinizin gelme nedeniyle onları araştırdım yurtdışında d örneklerine baktım, yurtdışında abu daha da önemli, Türkiye’de daha yeni yeni yapılıyor. Kostüm tasarımcılarıyla birlikte arkadaş olmaya başladım. Çokkültürlülük dediğimizde ihtiyaçları da belirliyor siz o ihtiyaçları belirledikçe ona göre program açıyorsunuz. Sürekli bir şeyler değişiyor, siz de o açığı yakalıyorsunuz bitmiyor, öğrenmeniz de bitmiyor, yeni yeni şeyler çıkıyor ortaya. (Aslı)

<sup>124</sup> Bir üniversiteye gitmişim tıp fakültesi öğrencileri bunlar, psikiyatri bölümüydü çoğunluğu ruh sağlığı doktoruydu. Orada şeyi anlatırken uyum sürecini anlatmaya gitmişim, bir mahpus LGBTI+’nin uyum sürecinde zorlanmasını anlatırken doktor raporlarının işimizi ne kadar zorlaştırdığından bahsetmişim ve doktorlara salladım çok büyük salladım sana söylesem bunu sen gülüp geçebilirsin ama bu orada bir gerilim yarattı direkt yüzlerden anladım bunu sonra şunu fark ettim o dönem doktora şiddetin çok yoğun sürekli gündemde olduğu bir dönem: şey dediğim o kadar çok iş yapıyor ki o kadar çok insan görüyorlar ki o kişinin kendisinden kopuyorlar ve çok matbu bir şey yapıp geçebiliyorlar gibi bir şey dedim. Orada bitti eğitim soru cevap kısmına geçtim şunu fark ettim çok üzücüydü bütün sorular bununla ilgiliydi doktorların böyle insanlar olduğunu mu düşünüyorsunuz anlattığım konunun özünüyle ilgili bir ya da iki soru geldi totalde 10 soru geldiyse hepsi bununla ilgiliydi belli ki

ben orada hata yapmışım. Ve herkes ona kitlenmiş o eğitimden akıllarında kalan muhtemelen o oldu. Bundan sonra bir sürü şeyi değiştirdim bazı yayınları geriye dönüp taradım yazı slaytlarımı taradım salakça bir şey yazmış mıyım gibi. Çünkü çok didaktik anlatmıyorum herhangi bir şey anlattığımda. Onları hepsini gözden geçirdim.

<sup>125</sup> Cümlelerde değişiklik olabiliyor okuma parçalarında dinleme parçalarında değişiklik olabiliyor o kitlenin yani karşınızdaki öğrenci grubunun yaş aralığı veya işte geldiği etnik yapısını göz önünde bulundurarak, tabi bunları öğrenme hızları da aynı değil, yani karşınızdaki kitleyi göz önünde bulundurarak dinleme parçalarını veya diyaloglarını kişilerin birbirleriyle olan iletişimlerini bu şekilde düzenlemeye çalışıyorum. Revize ediyorum. Mesela bir lisede çalışıyordum lisede zaten karşımdaki öğrenci kitlesi hemen hemen birbirine yakın altyapıdan geliyordu dolayısıyla yani çok revize etme ihtiyacı duymuyordum ama burada her dönem her kursta farklı yaş grubunda farklı sosyal yapılardan insanlar geliyordu dolayısıyla siz de alıştırmalarınız ona göre uyarlamak durumunda kalıyorsunuz. (Hacer)

<sup>126</sup> Yani mesela bazen etkinlikler yapıyoruz bazı arkadaşlar fotoğraf çekmek istiyor bazı kursiyerler çekiniyorlar kapalı bir kültürden geldikleri için özellikle Suriyeli bayanlar, fotoğraf çekilme taraftarı değil, ben de gerekirse o etkinlikleri yapmayız diyoruz gerekirse es geçiyorum. (Selma)

<sup>127</sup> Öğrencini ne istediği çok önemli dinlemek ona göre analiz yapıp öğrenciye doğru seçenekleri sunmak çok önemli. Mesela sabah okula kızını bırakacaksa çocuğunu bırakacaksa o öğrenciye 30 dk. opsiyon verebilmelisiniz ya da öğrencinin öğleden sonra dış randevusu varsa ona göre bir opsiyon sağlayabilmelisiniz. İnisiyatif de alabilmek gerekiyor bir öğretmen olarak yani sadece kurumun verdiği belli sınırlar içerisinde değil yine sınıfın içerisinde çok sınırlara yaklaşmadan öğrencinin rahat edebileceği şekilde öğrenciye fırsat verebilecek şekilde bunu sağlayabilmek çok önemli o fırsat eşitliğini sağlayabilmek çok önemli. (Gönül)

<sup>128</sup> Kapsayıcı bir alan haline getirmek için ihtiyaçlarının karşılanıyor olması lazım... birden çok dil varsa ona göre davranıyorsun, eğitimleri çift dilli yapmak ya da okuma zorluğu görme engelli biri varsa ona göre design etmek. (Deniz)

<sup>129</sup> Soru sormak bir strateji olabilir, soru oluşturmak. Mesela interaktif şeyler koymak herkesle ilgili biraz bilgi almak ve nerede duruyorlar nasıl bir arka planları var ne düşünerek gelmişler onu öğrenmek için en iyi yöntem. Belli oyunlar koyuyorum eğitime. Mesela kâğıda herkes bir şey yazar onu toplarsın oradan bakarsın. Tam olarak yapılandırılmış ve ne anlatılacağı belli olan değil de eğitimin içerisinde değişebilen bir şey yapmak belki. (Gökçe)

<sup>130</sup> Eğer çok pasif insanların olduğu bir yer varsa onlara göre daha motomot gidiyorum daha gramer tabanlı gidiyorum çok böyle kültüre çok odaklanan bir grup varsa hemen bir ödev veriyorum haftaya bunu araştırır gibi o anda öğrenebileceğim bir şeyse hemen herkesi içine katarak bir şeyler yapıyorum ki materyalleri ona göre design edeyim bir taraftan da sonraki derste görmüş oluyorum böylelikle...Mesela bu sene daha çok şey vardı kamerasını kapatan açmak istemeyen çok fazla öğrencim var bir yetişkinin bu hakkı var biliyorum onu zorlamakta istemiyorum ama onu dahil etmek için ne yapabilirimi düşündüğümde şeyi fark ettim bu sınıfa aktif bir şekilde

dahil olmayı sevmiyor onlar daha çok dinleyici olmayı seviyorlar kendilerini ifade ederlerken rahat hissetmiyorlar böyle yerlerde onu fark ettiğimde herkesin kendini iyi hissedebileceği materyal geliştiriyorum. Oyunları mesela geçen sene hep beraber oynardık hepsi konuştuğu için hep beraber oynardık şimdi whatsapp üzerinden atıyorum bireysel oynasınlar diye şimdi daha çok bireysel takılıyorum. Çünkü grup çalışmasında aktif olabilecek insanlar değil, kendilerini dışarıda hissetmemeleri gerekiyor öğrendiklerini hissetmeleri gerekiyor onlar daha bireysel insanlar konuşma etkinliklerinde mesela teker teker ben konuşuyorum hepsiyle benimle konuştuklarında daha rahat hissediyorlar birbirleriyle konuştuklarında ön yargıları daha fazla.....Genel olarak tekniğim hepsini gözlemleyip bütün dinamiği gözlemleyip onların isteği yönünde ilerlemek eğer konuşmuyorlarsa da benim algımda onların isteği nedir onu öğrenmeye çalışıyorum ve öyle ilerliyorum. İki senedir online gidiyoruz biliyorum ki mesela Zoom'a alışmaları uzun sürecek Zoom'a hâkim olmayan bir sürü insan var, özellikle büyük yaş grubu büyük yaş grubu gerçekten kontrol etmekte zorlanıyor ilk derste bütün bu ders planlamayı falan filan konuştuktan sonra Zoom u nasıl kullanmalıyız bilgisini veriyorum sadece kullanacağımız şeyleri söylüyorum şimdilik bunları bilmeniz yeterli diyorum. (Melis)

<sup>131</sup> Öğrencim var mesela, İstanbul'da doğmuş büyümüş ama Karadeniz şivesi hala var dilinde aileden çünkü evde sadece ona alışmış ya da doğu şivesi. Böyle öğrencilerim çoksa Shakespeare oynamak mümkün değil. Bir Türk yazarının eserini koymam onları daha gerçek bir şeyde buluşturuyor. Bir Türk yazarını koyabiliyorum, yabancı yazarın oyununu koyabiliyorum, komedi veya dram öğrenci profiline göre ama eğitim değişmiyor. Daha çok zaten öğrencinin yaşı, bakış açısı, boyu kilosuna e tabi ki herkeşe Hamlet oynatmam, herkese Juliet oynatmam. Ya da herkese bir gece konu karakteri oynatmam. Öğrencinin fiziksel profili de çok etkili buna. (Poyraz)

<sup>132</sup> Grubu iyice tanıdıktan sonra sorun olmayacak bazı toplumsal yanlışlar için bizim görevimiz sadece şey değil bir dili öğreteyim geçeyim değil, bizim yetişkinlerle birlikte onları toplumsal yanlışlar varsa onların doğrularını görmesini sağlamak, onlara kaç yaşında olursa olsun topluma entegre uyum sağlamalarını tabu haline gelmiş yanlışları aslında toplumdan topluma farklı olabileceğini ve bunun da değişebileceğini göstermek, geçmişteki tabulardan örnekler verip bakın bu tabu bu hali almış sizin de tabularınız olabilir, o zaman dediğiniz gibi sakıncalı konularda da örnekler verebiliyoruz sohbetler, yani sohbetlere dönüştürebiliyoruz küçük sohbetler olsun ara mola dediğimiz şeylerde sohbetlere dönüştürebiliyoruz. Farklı bölgelerden örnekler verebiliyoruz karşılaştırmalar yapabiliyoruz. (Ali)

<sup>133</sup> Zümre toplantıları yapıyoruz, bu sadece benim tek başıma aldığım karar da olmuyor çünkü sizin kendi öğretmenlerle birlikte mesela 100 öğretmenseniz toplantıda konuşuluyor zümre kararları alınıyor. Arkadaşlar herkes farklı o çokkültürlülükten örnekler veriyor, ona göre biz bu modülü verirken şöyle davranıyoruz esnekliği de yapalım ne kadar yapabilir onu tartışmaya çalışıyorsunuz. Daha sonra onunla ilgili elinizde bir veri oluyor ona göre de o çerçeve de ilerliyorsunuz bu aslında sadece bireysel olarak da bir çalışma olmuyor. Toplu bir çalışma oluyor. (Aslı)

<sup>134</sup> Kabul ettirme en büyük zorluğum kabul ettirme o öğrenci kabul etmezse o zaman şöyle yetişkini zorlayamazsınız. Bunu ben yapmayacağım, bunu öğrenmeyeceğim diyebiliyor pantolon, etek bluz örneği gibi “Ben sadece elbise giyeceğim, bu iki modülü yapmak istemiyorum” gibi pantolon örneğindeki elbise örneğindeki gibi. (Aslı)

<sup>135</sup> Zaman zaman zorluk yaşadığım oluyor bazen bazı öğrenciler çok kapalı kutu olabiliyor, çok sınırlarına yaklaştırmayabiliyor ona göre de bazen sizin de uzak durmanız gereken kimi zaman doğru yerde doğru hamleyi yapabilmemiz gerekiyor. Evet bazı zor noktaları var. Bir, iki sınıfta gerçekten izin vermeyen dersi bırakmayan ama daha pasif takılan, yani ulaşamadığımız kişiler olabiliyor herkes aynı şekilde o fırsatı vermeyebiliyor biraz öğrencinin de o fırsatı size veriyor olması gerekiyor. Siz ne kadar elinizden geleni yaparsanız yapın karşı taraf almak dinlemek istemiyorsa siz bunu ona aktaramazsınız. Daha çok öğrencinin açık olması olmamasıyla ilgili. (Gönül)

<sup>136</sup> Başta dil konusunda zorluk çekiyorum a1 de düşünün yeni gelmiş bazen öyle oluyor ki ülkeye yeni giriş yapmış tek kelime Türkçe bilmiyor ben de tek kelime Arapça bilmiyorum zorlanıyoruz. Dille ilgili daha çok zorluk çekiyorum bazen.

<sup>137</sup> Bazen sınırlarımın bir tık aşıldığını hissedebiliyorum böyle bir zorluk yalayabiliyorum. Birileri gelip bana bir hikâyesini anlatmak isteyebiliyor o eğitim bittikten sonra anlatabildim mi. Bu beni her zaman rahatsız etmiyor ama bazen ediyor. Mesela yorgunum kafamda başka bir gündemim var yani orada keşilecekken onu kesemiyorum bu benimle ilgili bir şey. Sınırlarımı korumakta zorlanıyorum, bir yandan çok insanların hikayelerin ve hayatın içine çekmeye hukuku hayatın içinden bir şey olarak anlatamaya çalışırken sen insanlara kendi hayat hikayeni ve onların hayat hikâyesine dair bir şey anlatıyorsun çünkü gerçek bir bağ ve temas böyle kurulur. Gerçek bir bağ temas kurmadığın birine de çok bir şey öğretebileceğimi düşünmüyorum bir şey alabileceğini de düşünmüyorum. Ama o bağın devamlılığını sağlarken bazen zorlanabiliyorum. (Yüksel)

<sup>138</sup> Ben çok konuşkan ve böyle dışa dönük bir insanım bir ortama alıştığım ilk girdiğimde ben de susarım ama sonrasında aktif olmayı severim ben çok konuştuğumda sınıfta diğerleri susuyor bir şey var bir problem var diyorum ya ben eğer sınıfa uygun olmadığımı düşünüyorsam orada çok rahatsız oluyorum ve bazen derse gitmek istemiyorum dersi açmak istemiyorum.... Aktif olmadıklarını görmek, öğrenmediklerini görmek...Benim de ön yargım olduğu ve ön yardımın beni zorladığı zamanlar oluyor. Belli öğrencilerle frekansım tutuyor ve o frekansta ilerlemeyi çok seviyorum ama bazılarıyla tutmadığı için onlarla sürekli aynı yerden konuşamıyorum. (Melis)

<sup>139</sup> Materyale göre bulmakta bazen istediğiniz görseli bulamayabiliyorsunuz istediğiniz videoyu bulamayabiliyorsunuz genellikle görsel ve video kullandığım için metinden daha çok. Materyal bulmada zorluk yaşıyorum. Bazen bulduğunuz materyaller grubun atmosferine uygun olmayabiliyor mesela sıkıntı olarak o ortaya çıkabiliyor çünkü size göre bu çok ilgi çekici bir konu olabiliyor materyalin konusu ama onların çok böyle tanıdık bir konu ve ilgi alanına girmeyen bir konu olamayabiliyor. (Ali)

## REFERENCES

- Acar Ciftci, Y., & Gurol, M. (2015). A conceptual framework regarding the multicultural education competencies of teachers. *Hacettepe University Journal of Education*, 30(1), 01-14.
- Adams, M. (1992). *Promoting diversity in college classrooms: Innovative responses for the curriculum, faculty, and institutions*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Akbulut, S., Özgül, H., & Tezcan, T. (2014). Mevzuattan uygulamaya engelli hakları izleme raporu 2013. *İstanbul: Toplumsal Haklar ve Araştırmalar Derneği*.
- Akbulut, S., Özgül, H., Ak, İ., & Uslu, E. (2015). *Mevzuattan uygulamaya engelli hakları izleme raporu 2014* [Disability rights monitoring report from legislation to implementation 2014].
- Akcaoglu, M. Ö., & Arsal, Z. (2017). Teacher candidates' views regarding multicultural education: A case study on content integration dimension. *Online Submission*, 6(1), 224-232.
- Akhan, O., & Yalçın, A. (2016). Sosyal bilgiler öğretim programlarında çokkültürlü eğitimin yeri. *Trakya Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 18(2), 23-46.
- Akinlar, A., & Dogan, S. (2017). Investigating multicultural education phenomena in minority and public high schools in Turkey: A multiple case study. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 17(71), 1-20.
- Akkari, A., & Mesquida, P. (2008). Paulo freire: building a multicultural pedagogy for silenced voices. In P. R. Dasen, & A. Akkari (Eds.), *Educational theories and practices from the majority world* (pp. 329-345). SAGE Publications India Pvt Ltd, <https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9788132100683.n15>
- Alanay, H., & Aydin, H. (2016). Multicultural education: The challenges and attitudes of undergraduate students in Turkey. *Egitim ve Bilim*, 41(184).
- Alazzi, K. F. (2017). Teachers' perceptions of multicultural education: a study of middle and high school social studies teachers in Jordan. *Curriculum Perspectives*, 37(1), 3-10.

- Alfred, M. V. (2000). Philosophical foundations of andragogy and self-directed learning: A critical analysis from an Africentric feminist perspective. In *Proceedings of the 19th annual Midwest research to practice conference in adult, continuing, and community education* (pp. 21-26). Madison: University of Wisconsin.
- Alfred, M. V. (2002). Linking the personal and the social for a more critical democratic adult education. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 96(89-95)
- Alfred, M. V. (2003). Sociocultural contexts and learning: Anglophone Caribbean immigrant women in US postsecondary education. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 53(4), 242-260.
- Alfred, M. V. (2009). Nonwestern immigrants in continuing higher education: A sociocultural approach to culturally responsive pedagogy. *The Journal of Continuing Higher Education*, 57(3), 137-148.
- Alismail, H.A. (2016). Multicultural education: Teachers' perceptions and preparation. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7, 139-146.
- Ameny-Dixon, G. M. (2004). Why multicultural education is more important in higher education now than ever: A global perspective. *International Journal of Scholarly Academic Intellectual Diversity*, 8(1), 1-9.
- APA (2002). *Guidelines on multicultural education, training, research, practice, and organizational change for psychologists*. Retrieved from <http://www.apa.org/pi/oema/resources/policy/multiculturalguideline.pdf>
- Aronowitz, S., & Giroux, H. A. (1993). *Education still under siege*. Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Aslan, S. (2019). How is multicultural education perceived in elementary schools in Turkey? A case study. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 8(1), 233-247.
- Aslan, S. (2017). An examination of the opinion of the social studies teachers on multicultural education. *Journal of Kirsehir Education Faculty*, 18(2), 231-253.

- Aydin, H. (2012). Multicultural education curriculum development in Turkey. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 277-277.
- Aydin, H. (2013). A literature-based approaches on multicultural education. *The Anthropologist*, 16(1-2), 31-44.
- Aydin, H., & Tonbuloglu, B. (2014). Graduate students perceptions“ on multicultural education: a qualitative case study. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, (57), 29-50.
- Banks, J. A. (1987). *Teaching strategies for ethnic studies*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon
- Banks, J. A. (1993a). Approaches to multicultural curriculum reform. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*, 2, 195-214.
- Banks, J. A. (1993b). Multicultural education: Historical development, dimensions, and practice. *Review of research in education*, 19, 3-49.
- Banks, J. A. (1993c). The canon debate, knowledge construction, and multicultural education. *Educational Researcher*, 22(5), 4–14.
- Banks, J. (1999). *An introduction to multicultural education* (2nd ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Banks, J. A. (2001). Approaches to multicultural curriculum reform. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*, 4, 225-246.
- Banks, J. A. (2004). Multicultural education: Historical development, dimensions, and practice. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Handbook of research on multicultural education* (2nd ed., pp. 3–29). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Banks, J. A. (2006). Multicultural education and knowledge construction. In J. A. Banks (Ed.), *Race, culture, and education: The selected works of James A. Banks* (pp. 127ñ 164). London: Routledge.
- Banks, J. A. (Ed.). (2009). *The Routledge international companion to multicultural education* (p. 9). New York: Routledge.

- Banks, J. A. (2014). *An introduction to multicultural education* (5th ed.) Pearson Education, Inc.
- Banks, J. A. & Banks, C. A. M. (1997). *Multicultural education Issues and perspectives* (3rd ed.) Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon Press.
- Banks, J.A. & Banks, C.A.M. (2001). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (4th ed.). New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Banks, J. (2010) Multicultural education: characteristics and goals. In J. Banks & C. Banks (Ed.), *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (7th ed.) (pp. 3-30). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Banks, J. & Banks, C. (2010). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (7th ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (Eds.). (2019). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Başarır, F., Sarı, M., & Çetin, A. (2014). Examination of teachers' perceptions of multicultural education. *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction*, 4(2), 91-110.
- Bektaş, Ö. Ş. (2022). *Öğretmenlerin çokkültürlü eğitim algıları ile sınıf yönetimi becerileri arasındaki ilişki* (Doctoral dissertation, Kastamonu Üniversitesi).
- Bennett, C. I. (1999). *Comprehensive multicultural education: Theory and practice*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon Press.
- Bennett, C. (2001). Genres of research in multicultural education. *Review of educational research*, 71(2), 171-217.
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Bigatti, S. M., Gibau, G. S., Boys, S., Grove, K., Ashburn-Nardo, L., Khaja, K., & Springer, J. T. (2012). Faculty perceptions of multicultural teaching in a large urban university. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, 78-93.

- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. C. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society, and culture*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Boyer, J.B. (1985). *Multicultural education: Product or process?* Kansas City, KS: Kansas Urban Education Center.
- Boaler, J. & Sengupta-Irving, T. (2012). Gender and mathematics education. In J. A. Banks (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of diversity in education*. (vol. 2, pp. 972–975). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Brown, A. H., Cervero, R. M., & Johnson-Bailey, J. (2000). Making the invisible visible: Race, gender, and teaching in adult education. *Adult education quarterly*, 50(4), 273-288.
- Bullivant, B. (1993). Culture: Its nature and meaning for educators. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (2nd ed., pp. 29–47). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Castagno, A. E. (2009). Making sense of multicultural education: A synthesis of the various typologies found in the literature. *Multicultural perspectives*, 11(1), 43-48.
- Casto, A. R. (2019). *Exploring elementary teachers' perceptions of multicultural education: A multiple case study* (Order No. 27545149). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (2311918669). Retrieved from <https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/exploring-elementary-teachers-perceptions/docview/2311918669/se-2>
- Chavez, L. (2010, May 24). Focus on U.S. history, not ethnic studies. *Dallas Morning News*. Retrieved April 4, 2011, from <http://www.dallasnews.com/opinion/latest-columns/20100514-Linda-Chavez-Focus-on-U-6265.ece>
- Choi, S., & Lee, S. W. (2020). Enhancing teacher self-efficacy in multicultural classrooms and school climate: The role of professional development in multicultural education in the United States and South Korea. *AERA Open*, 6(4), 2332858420973574.
- Clark, M. C., & Wilson, A. L. (1991). Context and rationality in Mezirow's theory of transformational learning. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 41(2), 75– 91.

- Clewell, B. C. (2002). Breaking the barriers: The critical middle school years. In *The Jossey-Bass reader on gender in education* (pp. 301–313). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research methods in education* (6th ed.). London and New York, NY: Routledge Falmer.
- Cole, M. (1986). Teaching and learning about racism: A critique of multicultural education in Britain. *Multicultural education: The interminable debate*, 123-147.
- Convertino, C., Levinson, B. A., & González, N. (2013). Culture, teaching, and learning. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*, 25-41.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2017). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage publications.
- Cunningham, P. M. (1988) The adult educator and social responsibility. In R. G. Brockett (ed.), *Ethical issues in adult education* (New York : Teachers College Press), 133–145.
- Çavdar, D., & Çok, F. (2016). Türkiye’de LGBT’lerin okul yaşantıları. *KAOS GL Dergisi*, 151, 54-58.
- Çayır, K. (2003). Ders kitaplarında insan hakları ve demokrasi bilinci. In B. Çotuksöken, A. Ersan & O. Silier (Ed.), *Ders kitaplarında insan hakları tarama sonuçları* (pp. 90-105). İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yayınları.
- Celik, B. (2020). The perceptions of foreign language pre-service teachers towards multicultural education: Case of the faculty of education, TIU-Erbil, Iraq. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 10(1).
- Çelik, Z., Gümüş, S., & Gür, B. S. (2017). Moving beyond a monotype education in Turkey: Major reforms in the last decade and challenges ahead. In *Multicultural education in glocal perspectives* (pp. 103-119). Springer, Singapore.

- Damgaci, F. K., & Aydin, H. (2014). An analysis of academicians' perceptions of multicultural education: A Turkish experience. *The Anthropologist*, 18(3), 817-833.
- Demirciođlu, E., & Özdemir, M. (2014). Pedagojik formasyon öğrencilerinin çok kültürlü eğitime yönelik tutumlarının bazı değişkenlere göre incelenmesi. *Ege Eğitim Dergisi*, 15(1), 211-232.
- Diaz-Greenberg, R., & Nevin, A. (2003). Listen to the voices of foreign language student teachers: Implications for foreign language educators. *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 3(3), 213-226.
- Egne, R. M. (2015). *Ethiopia in transition: A multicultural education perspective on teacher education policies, curricula, and practices*. (Doctoral dissertation, University of Oslo, Norway). Retrieved from <https://www.duo.uio.no/bitstream/handle/10852/44815/232-Egne-DUO.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Egne, R. M. (2017). Perceptions and practices of multicultural education among Ethiopian secondary teacher education program officials, teacher educators and prospective teachers. *Teacher Development*, 21(3), 422-444.
- Erbas, Y. H. (2018). The pros, cons and necessity of multicultural education. *Online Submission*.
- Erbas, Y. H. (2019). A qualitative case study of multicultural education in Turkey: definitions of multiculturalism and multicultural education. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 15(1), 23-43.
- Eskici, M., & Çayak, S. (2018). Teachers' personal characteristics and metaphorical perceptions to multicultural education. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 6(n3a), 98-108.
- Girişimi, E. R. (2017). Bir arada yaşamı ve geleceđi kapsayıcı eğitimle inşa etmek. *Erişim adresi: <https://www.egitimreformugirisimi.org/egitimgozlemevi/arastirma/bir-arada-yasami-ve-gelecegi-kapsayici-egitimle-insa-etmek-2>*.
- Fennimore, B.S. (2000). *Talk matters: Refocusing the language of public schooling*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

- Flannery, D. Changing dominant understandings of adults as learners. In E. Hayes and S. Colin (eds.), *Confronting racism and sexism in adult education. New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, no. 61. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1994.
- Francis, B. (2000). *Boys, girls, and achievement: Addressing the classroom issues*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Freire, E (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Seabury Press.
- Freire, E (1973). *Education for critical consciousness*. New York: Seabury Press.
- Freire, E (1976). *Education and the practice of freedom*. London: Writers and Readers Publishing Cooperative.
- Freire, E (1998). *Pedagogy of freedom*. Boulder, CO: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (20th anniversary ed.). New York: Continuum.
- French, Patrice B. (2019). Culturally relevant practice frameworks and application in adult education. *Adult Education Research Conference*.
- Gay, G. (1994). *A synthesis of scholarship in multicultural education*. Urban Monograph Series.
- Gay, G. (1995). Mirror images on common issues: Parallel between multicultural education and critical pedagogy. In C. E. Sleeter & P. L. McLaren (Eds.), *Multicultural education, critical pedagogy, and the politics of difference* (pp. 155-190). New York, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Gay, G. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Gay, G. (2003). The importance of multicultural education. *Educational Leadership*, 61(4), 30–35.

- Gay G 2004. Beyond Brown: Promoting equity through multicultural education. *Educational Leadership*, 19(3): 192-216.
- Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Gay, G. (2018). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Teachers College, Columbia University.
- Gillborn, D. (2008). *Racism and education: Coincidence or conspiracy?* London & New York: Routledge.
- Ginsberg, M. B., & Wlodkowski, R. J. (2009). *Diversity and motivation: Culturally responsive teaching in college* (2nd ed.). Sn Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Giroux, H.A., & McLaren, P. (1994). *Between borders: Pedagogy and the politics of cultural studies*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Gorski, P.C. (2001). Multicultural curriculum and the web: Transformation and integration. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 3(1), 43-50.
- Gorski PC 2004. *Multicultural education and the internet: Intersection and integrations*. 2nd Edition. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill Press.
- Gorski, P. C. (2010). *The challenge of defining multicultural education*. Retrieved from <http://www.edchange.org/multicultural/initial.html>
- Gorski, P. (2011). The unintentional undermining of multicultural education. *White teachers diverse classrooms: Creating inclusive schools, building on students' diversity, and providing true educational equity*, 75-92.
- Grace, A. P. (1996). Taking a critical pose: Andragogy— missing links, missing values. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 15 (5), 382– 392.
- Grant, C. A., & Ladson-Billings, G. (1997). *Dictionary of multicultural education*. Greenwood.

- Grant, C. A., & Sleeter, C. E. (1986). Race, class, and gender in education research: An argument for integrative analysis. *Review of Educational Research*, 56(2), 195-211.
- Grant, C. A., & Sleeter, C. E. (2010). Race, class, gender, and disability in the classroom. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*, 7, 59-78.
- Gravetter, F. J., & Forzano, L. A. B. (2018). *Research methods for the behavioral sciences*. Cengage Learning.
- Guo, S. (2017). Foe or friend of adult education? The paradox of multicultural policy for adult immigrants in Canada. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 49(2), 253-268.
- Guy, T. C. (1999). Culture as context for adult education: The need for culturally relevant adult education. *New directions for adult and continuing education*, 82, 5-18.
- Guy, T. (2009). Culturally relevant curriculum development for teachers of adults: The importance of identity, positionality, and classroom dynamics. In V. C. X. Wang (Ed.), *Curriculum development for adult learners in the global community* (pp. 9-38). Malabar, FL: Krieger.
- Günay, R., & Aslan, D. (2016). Educational faculty members' perceptions on multicultural teacher. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 5(2), 136-148.
- Heath, S. B. (1983). *Ways with words: Language, life, and work in communities and classrooms*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hollins, E. R., King, J. E., & Hayman, W. C. (Eds.). (1994). *Teaching diverse populations: Formulating a knowledge base* (Vol. 1944). Suny Press.
- Johnson-Bailey, J., & Cervero, R. (1998). Power dynamics in teaching and learning practices: An examination of two adult education classrooms. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 17(6), 389-399.
- Johnson-Bailey, J., & Cervero, R. M. (2000). The invisible politics of race in adult education. *Handbook of adult and continuing education*, 147-160.

- Johnson-Bailey, J. (2001). The road less walked: A retrospective of race and ethnicity in adult education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 20(1-2), 89-99.
- Johnson-Bailey, J., & Alfred, M. (2006). Transformational teaching and the practice of Black women adult educators. In E. W. Taylor (Ed.), *Fostering transformative learning in the classroom: Challenges and innovations. New Directions in Adult and Continuing Education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kaplan, İ. (2008). Milli eğitim ideolojisi. In T. Bora and M. Gültekingil (Ed.), *Modern Türkiye’de siyasi düşünce: Milliyetçilik* (pp. 788-799). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
- Karataş, K., & Oral, B. (2015). Teachers’ perceptions on culturally responsiveness in education. *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 2(2), 47-57.
- Kaya, A. (2005). Avrupa Birliği bütünleşme sürecinde yurttaşlık, çokkültürcülük ve azınlık tartışmaları: Bir arada yaşamın siyaseti. In A. Kaya & T. Tarhanlı (Ed.), *Türkiye’de çoğunluk ve azınlık politikaları: AB sürecinde yurttaşlık tartışmaları* (pp.35-63). İstanbul: TESEV Yayınları.
- Kaya, N. (2012). Türkiye’nin eğitim sisteminde azınlıklar ve ayrımcılık: Kavramsal çerçeve ve temel sorunlar. *K. Çayır ve M. Ayan Ceyhan*, 213-229.
- Kaya, A. (2013). Multiculturalism and minorities in Turkey. *Challenging multiculturalism: European models of diversity*, 297-317. Edinburgh University Press.
- Kaya, H. E. (2014). The road ahead: Multicultural adult education. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 8(1), 164, 168.
- Kaya, Y. (2015). The opinions of primary school, Turkish language and social science teachers regarding education in the mother tongue (Kurdish). *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies*, 2(2), 33-46.
- Kaya, İ., & Aydın, H. (2013). Türkiye’de anadilde eğitim sorunu: Zorluklar, deneyimler ve iki dilli eğitim modeli önerileri. *İstanbul: Ukam*.

- Kiely, R. C. (2003). A chameleon with a complex: Searching for social justice in transformational learning. In D. Floers, M. Lee, A. Jalipa, E. Lopez, A. Schelstrate, & V. Sheared (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 44th Annual Adult Education Research Conference* (pp. 217– 222 ). San Francisco: San Francisco State University.
- Knapp, M. S., & Woolverton, S. (2004). Social class and schooling. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Handbook of research on multicultural education* (2nd ed., pp. 656–681). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Knowles, M. *The modern practice of adult education: From pedagogy to andragogy*. Chicago: Association Press, 1980.
- Knowles, M. S., and associates (1984). *Andragogy in action: Applying principles of adult learning*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Koltuk, N., & Kocakaya, S. (2019). Türkiye'de öğretmenlerin kültürel değerlere duyarlı eğitime ilişkin görüşleri: Bir karma yöntem araştırması. *Sakarya Üniversitesi, Eğitim Dergisi*, 9(2), 305-334.
- Konda 2011. *Kürt meselesi'nde algı ve beklentiler (Perceptions and expectations in the Kurdish question)*. Istanbul, Turkey: İletişim Publication.
- Köşker, N., & Erdoğan, E. (2020). Trends in multicultural education research: A five-year content analysis of Turkish and ERIC databases. *International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies*, 8(1), 48-60.
- Kumi-Yeboah, A., & James, W. B. (2011, February). The relevance of multicultural education for adult learners in higher education. In *International Forum of Teaching & Studies* (Vol. 7, No. 1).
- Kuppens, L., Ibrahim, S., & Langer, A. (2020). Unity over diversity? Teachers' perceptions and practices of multicultural education in Kenya. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 50(5), 693-712.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1992). Culturally relevant teaching: The key to making multicultural education work. *Research and multicultural education: From the margins to the mainstream*, 106-121.

- Ladson-Billings, G. (1995). But that's just good teaching! The case for culturally relevant pedagogy. *Theory into Practice*, 34(3), 159–165.
- Levinson, B. A., Foley, D. E., & Holland, D. (Eds.). (1996). *The cultural production of the educated person: Critical ethnographies of schooling and local practice*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Lee E, Menkart D, Okazawa-Rey M. (2002). *Beyond heroes and holidays: A practical guide to K-12 anti-racist, multicultural education and staff development*. Washington, DC: Teaching for Change Press.
- Logvinova, O. K., & Ivanova, G. P. (2016). Pre-service teacher multicultural education in Russia: problems and responses. *Indian Journal of Science and Technology*, 9(29), 99456.
- Manning, M. L., & Baruth, L. G. (2004). *Multicultural education of children and adolescents* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Marchesani, L. S., & Adams, M. (1992). Dynamics of diversity in the teaching–learning process: A faculty development model for analysis and action. In M. Adams (Ed.), *Promoting diversity in college classrooms: Innovative responses for the curriculum, faculty, and institutions* (pp. 9–20). Jossey-Bass/Wiley.
- Mayo, C. (2010). Queer lessons: Multiculturalism and sexual and gender minorities. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (7th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.
- Mayring, P. (2000). Qualitative content analysis. Forum: *Qualitative Social Research*, 2, 1–28. Retrieved March, 31, 2001, from <http://www.qualitative-research.net/fqs-texte/2-00/2-00mayring-e.htm>.
- McDonald, B., Cervero, R. M., & Courtenay, B. C. (1999). An ecological perspective of power in transformational learning: A case study of ethical vegans. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 50(1), 5– 23.
- Meral, B. F. (2015). Obstacles to special education for students with intellectual disabilities in Turkey: A brief report. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 30(1), 93-105.

- Merriam, S. B., Caffarella, R. S., & Baumgartner, L. M. (2006). *Learning in adulthood: A comprehensive guide* by Sharan B. Merriam. Jossey-Bass.
- Merriam, S. B., & Brockett, R. G. (2011). *The profession and practice of adult education: An introduction*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Naisbitt, J. and Aburdene, P. (1990) *Megatrends 2000: Ten new directions for the 1990's*. New York: William Morrow and Company.
- Neuharth-Pritchett, S., Reiff, J. C., & Pearson, C. A. (2001). Through the eyes of preservice teachers: Implications for the multicultural journey from teacher education. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 15(2), 256-269.
- Nelson, C. D. (2009). *Sexual identities in English language education: Classroom conversations*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Nieto, S., Longman, W. P., & Mitchell, D. (1996). Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education. *Cultural Diversity and Mental Health*, 2(2), 139-144. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Nieto, S., & Bode, P. (2008). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education* (5th ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Nieto, S. (2009). Multicultural education in the United States: Historical realities, ongoing challenges, and transformative possibilities. In *The Routledge international companion to multicultural education* (pp. 99-115). Routledge.
- Ntseane, P. G. (2011). Culturally sensitive transformational learning: Incorporating the Afrocentric paradigm and African feminism. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 60, 357–376.
- Oakes, J., Joseph, R., & Muir, K. (2004). Access and achievement in mathematics and science: Inequalities that endure and change. In J. A. Banks & C. A. M. Banks (Eds.), *Handbook of research on multicultural education* (2nd ed., pp. 69–90). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- Olur, B., & Oguz, A. (2019). Qualification perception of prospective teachers on multicultural education: A Need Assessment. *Online Submission*, 8(4), 165-184.
- Özgen, N., & Köşker, N. (2019). An analysis on multicultural attitudes of high school students: The case of Turkey. *Turkish Studies*, 20(1), 69-91.
- Özen, F. (2015). Evaluation of the attitudes of teacher candidates towards democracy and multicultural education. *Uluslararası Beşeri Bilimler ve Eğitim Dergisi*, 1(2), 182-220.
- Palmer, C., & Bolderston, A. (2006). A brief introduction to qualitative research. *Canadian Journal of Medical Radiation Technology*, 37(1), 16-19.
- Parekh, B. (2002). *Çokkültürlülüğü yeniden düşünmek, kültürel çeşitlilik ve siyasi teori [Rethinking multiculturalism-cultural diversity and political theory]* (B. Tanrıseven, Trans.). Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi.
- Parrish, P., & Linder-VanBerschot, J. (2010). Cultural dimensions of learning: Addressing the challenges of multicultural instruction. *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*, 11(2), 1-19.
- Perney, V. H. (1976). Effects of race and sex on field dependence-independence in children. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 42, 975-980.
- Peters-Davis N, Shultz J. (2006). *Challenges of multicultural education: Teaching and taking diversity courses*. Boulder, Colorado: Paradigm Publishers.
- Phoon, H. S., Abdullah, M. N. L. Y., & Abdullah, A. C. (2013). Unveiling Malaysian preschool teachers' perceptions and attitudes in multicultural early childhood education. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 22(4), 427-438.
- Pratt, D. D. (1988). Andragogy as a relational construct. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 38(3), 160-181.
- Pratt, D. D. (1993). Andragogy after twenty-five years. *New directions for adult and continuing education*, 57(57), 15-23.

- Reitz, J. G. (2009). Assessing multiculturalism as a behavioral theory. In *Multiculturalism and Social Cohesion* (pp. 1-47). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Ramsey, P., Williams, L. R., & Vold, E. (2003). *Multicultural education: A source book*. Routledge.
- Rhodes, Christy M. (2015). *Culturally responsive teaching with adult language learners*. Adult Education Research Conference.
- Rhodes, C. M. (2018). Culturally responsive teaching with adult learners. *International Journal of Adult Vocational Education and Technology*, 9(4), 33–41.
- Ribeiro, M. D. (2005). Fostering multicultural and identity development in adult learners through study tours. *Adultspan Journal*, 4(2), 92-104.
- Ross-Gordon, J. M., Martin, L. G., & Briscoe, D. B. (Eds.). (1990). *Serving culturally diverse populations: New directions for adult and continuing education* (No. 48). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Ross-Gordon, J. M. (1991). Needed: A multicultural perspective for adult education research. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 42(1), 1-16.
- Sadker, D., & Zittleman, K. (2007). Gender bias: From colonial America to today's classrooms. *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*, 135-169. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Sandlin, J. (2005). Andragogy and its discontents: An analysis of andragogy from three critical perspectives. *PAACE Journal of Lifelong Learning*, 14, 25– 42.
- Sealey-Ruiz, R. (2007). Wrapping the curriculum around their lives: Using a culturally relevant curriculum with African American women. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 58(1), 44–60. doi:10.1177/0741713607305938.
- Semerci, P. U., Erdoğan, E., & Önal, E. S. (2017). "*Biz*" için aynasından yansıyanlar: Türkiye gençliğinde kimlikler ve ötekileştirme. İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.

- Sharma, S. (2005). Multicultural education: Teachers perceptions and preparation. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning (TLC)*, 2(5).
- Sheared, V. (1994). Giving voice: An inclusive model of instruction—a womanist perspective. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 1994(61), 27-37.
- Sheared, V., & Sissel, P. A. (2001). *Making space: Merging theory and practice in adult education*. Bergin & Garvey, Greenwood Publishing Group.
- Sleeter C.E. (2002). *Culture, difference and power*. New York, NY: Teacher College Press.
- Sleeter, C., & Grant, C. (1987). An analysis of multicultural education in the United States. *Harvard Educational Review*, 57(4), 421-445.
- Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (2007). *Making choices for multicultural education: Five approaches to race, class, and gender* (5th ed.). New York: Wiley
- Sleeter, C. E., & Bernal, D. D. (2004). Critical pedagogy, critical race theory, and antiracist education: Implications for multicultural education. *Handbook of research on multicultural education*, 2, 240-258.
- Somersan, S. (2012). “İrkların olmadığı bir dünyada ırkçılık”. İçinde. Çayır, K. ve Ceyhan, M. A. (Der.), *Ayrımcılık: Çok boyutlu yaklaşımlar*, ss. 199–211. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Steele, C. (2003). Stereotype threat and African-American student achievement. In T. Perry, C. Steele, & A. Hilliard, III, *Young, gifted and black: Promoting high achievement among African-American students* (pp. 109–130). Boston: Beacon.
- Şirin, T., E. Duymaz, and D. Yıldız. *Türkiye’de din ve vicdan özgürlüğü: Sorunlar, tespitler ve çözüm önerileri*. Ankara: Türkiye Barolar Birliği Yayınları, 2016.
- Taylor, E. W. (2000). Analyzing research on transformative learning theory. In J. Mezirow & Associates (Eds.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 285– 328). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- Tisdell, E. J. (1995). *Creating inclusive adult learning environments: Insights from multicultural education and feminist pedagogy* (No. 361). DIANE Publishing.
- Tisdell, E. J. (2003). *Exploring spirituality and culture in adult and higher education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Tisdell, E. J., Taylor, E. W., & Forté, K. S. (2013). Community-based financial literacy education in a cultural context: A study of teacher beliefs and pedagogical practice. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 63(4), 338-356.
- Tiedt, P. & Iris M. Tiedt, I. M. (1999). *Multicultural teaching: A handbook of activities, information and resources* (5th ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Trowers, A. M. (2020). *Teacher self-efficacy in a multicultural alternative education program* (Order No. 28001393). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (2467640800). Retrieved from <https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/teacher-self-efficacy-multicultural-alternative/docview/2467640800/se-2>
- Uçarlar, N., & Derince, M. Ş. (2012). The problem of mother tongue in Turkey: Experiences of Kurdish students. *Eğitim Bilim Toplum*, 10(37), 21-51.
- Ummak, E., Çelik, M., & Sanberk, I. (2014). Eşcinsel yönelime sahip öğrencilerin akranlarından algıladıkları zorbalık ve bu zorbalıkla ilgili başa çıkmada okul psikolojik danışmandan algılanan destek ile ilgili görüşlerin incelenmesi. In *Birinci Avrasya Eğitim Araştırmaları Kongresi [1st Eurasian Educational Research Congress]*, Istanbul. Retrieved from [https://secbir.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/LGBT%C4%B0-Haklar%C4%B1-i%C3%A7in-E%C4%9Fitim-Stratejileri\\_Rapor.pdf](https://secbir.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/LGBT%C4%B0-Haklar%C4%B1-i%C3%A7in-E%C4%9Fitim-Stratejileri_Rapor.pdf)
- Varma-Joshi, M. (2004). Understanding multiculturalism in the social studies classroom. *Challenges and prospects for Canadian social studies*, 150-163.
- Yasemin, A. Ç. (2019). Çokkültürlü eğitim: Öğretmen eğitimi ile ilgili yaklaşımlar. *Adnan Menderes Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 10(2), 36-57.
- Yelich Biniecki, S., & Kang, H. (2014). Examining adult learning through the lens of culture: A US perspective. *Rocznik Andragogiczny*, 21, 133-142.

- Yılmaz, F. (2016). Multiculturalism and multicultural education: A case study of teacher candidates' perceptions. *Cogent Education*, 3(1), 1172394.
- Wlodkowski, R. (2004). Creating motivational learning environments. In M. Galbraith (Ed.), *Adult learning: A guide for effective instruction* (3rd ed., pp. 141–164). Malabar, FL: Krieger.
- Zhou, P. J. (2002). *Students' attitudes, knowledge, and commitment to implementation of multicultural education in a teacher education program* (Order No. 3064615). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305534363). Retrieved from <https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/students-attitudes-knowledge-commitment/docview/305534363/se-2>
- Zammit, J. (2021). Maltese educators' perceptions of democracy, equality and justice in multicultural education. *IAFOR Journal of Education*, 9(1).